PAPERS ON THE COGNITIVE QUEST FOR GOD William H. Bernhardt

I. Religion and the Problem of Knowledge *

The primary task of the minister is not necessarily that of providing technically correct philosophies of religion for a given congregation. The congregation is a congeries of groups of people gathered together, for various reasons, into a loosely organized body. It is, therefore, a manifold rather than a simple organizational entity. Furthermore, the primary religious needs are needs of persons, not necessarily of groups. It is individuals who have guilt-feelings; it is individuals who feel the need for security and significance, even though these desires may be extended, symbolically, to the group. Salvation, no matter how it may be defined, apparently happens to individual persons, even though some participation in group activity may be a prerequisite.

If religion is not an anti-intellectual or non-intellectual experience, these religious needs must be clearly discerned and adequately interpreted. It is in this phase of his activity that the minister as religious leader, faces the problem of knowledge. If religious needs are real needs, which emerge in the process of human living, they may presumably be met more adequately if the interpretations of persons and their needs are adequately discerned and formulated. Furthermore, since man does not live in a vacuum, either social or cosmic, some relationship to the social and cosmic environment is essential. Here again, the problem of knowledge becomes important. Many, if not most of the religious failures are rooted in ignorance either of man and his needs or of the system of conditions within which his destiny must be achieved. The weird theologies developed in the fringe areas of conventional religion constitute a body of evidence which no critical thinker can afford to overlook when he ponders the relevance of right thinking to effective religious living, An intelligent control of religious thinking appears to be indispensable if religion is to make its contribution to adequate human living.

I

There is probably no universal problem of knowledge. All human thinking is relevant to specific problem-areas. This is true even of such abstract fields as mathematics and logistic. Mathematics is a deducative system, or congeries of systems based upon certain "elements, properties, functions and relations." As such, it is perhaps the most general of cognitive enterprises. At the same time, as applied to the investigation of natural menomena, its relevance is always determined by locus and interest. The mathematical problem then becomes specific. Logistics, as Lewis and Langford define it, is restricted in its subject matter to the "principles which govern the validity of inference." When logistics becomes functional in the solution of human problems, it must also become specific.

Even if one grants that in mathematics and logistics the problems are practically universal, it is a universality which is confined to the conceptual level.

^{*} The Hiff Review, Vol VIII, No. 1, Winter, 1951

DAFRES ON THU TOOM BUT SOLUTION OF THE BOLD ON

I. Religion and the Problem of Endwiedge &

The primary lask of the minister is not necessarily that of providing technically correct philosophies of religion for a given congregation. The congregation is a congeries of groups of people gathered together, for various reasons, into a loosely organized dody. It is, therefore, a manifold rather than a simple organizational entity. Furthermore, the primary religious aceds are needs of persons, not necessarily of groups, it is individuals who have guilt-feelings; it is individuals who feel the need for security and significance, even though those desires may be extended, eyencholically, to the group. Salvation, no matter how it may be extended, appearently happens to individual persons, even though some participation are group activity may be a prerequisite.

M religion is not an anti-intellectual or non-intellectual cupationes. these religious needs must be clearly discorned and adequately interpreted. It is in this places of his activity that the minister as religious leader, faces the problem of knowledge. If religious aceds are real seeds, which emerge in the process of human living, they may presume ably he mad more adequately if the interpretations of persons that their seede ese adecuetely discorned and formidiated. Furthermore, since musdoes not live in a vanuum, either social or Sosmic, soma veletionslig to the secial and cestaic eavirentages is essential. Mere kgain, the problem of knowledge bosomes important. Many, if not most of the religious edi lo vo specied in ig**novence** elitha**r o**f **mens and his** neces or of lor system of conditions within which his destiny mast be achieved. The weist theologies develoced in the fringe areas of conventional religion constituer a body of evidence which no critical whinker sen efford to overlook when he ponders the relevance of right thinking to effective religious living, Ap. intelligent control of religious thinking eppears to be indispensed if religion is to make its contribution to adequate human living,

î

There is probably no universal problem of knowledge. All human thinked ing is relevant to specific problem-areas. This is true even of such abstract fields as mathematics and logistic. Mathematics is a deducative system, or congertes of systems based upon cartain "elements, properties, functions and relations." As such, it is perhaps the most general of cognitive enterprises. At the same time, as applied to the investigation of natural menomenation its is always determined by locus and interest. The mathematical problem then becomes specific. Logistics, as Lewis and Laugford define the restricted in the subject matter to the "principles which given the religions of interence." When logistics becomes functional in the solution of human problems, it must also became specific.

Evan if one grants that in mathematics and logistics the problems are practically universal, it is a universality which is confined to the companient lovel.

^{*} The Miff Mariow, Vol VIII, Was to Wiston, 1981

Ar other levels, in the realin of denotation as they described it are no universal problems. Every problem is situational; it has a personal as well as a spatio temporal locus. This is certainly true in the personal social realm where religious problems emerge and where they must find whatever satisfaction is possible. Consequently, the problem of knowledge at the religious level must begin with the location of the problems in the field of religion as such.

Religion is the general name for a complex form of individual and group behavior designed to achieve and conserve specific values by means of a reinterpretation of human beings and determinate situations and the use of certain overt behaviors or techniques. There are at least three specific areas involved in the religious complex. There is, first, a function or functions. Religious institutions, in common withall other human institutions, developed to meet certain needs and continues to maintain itself because these needs still persist and because a sufficient number of persons believe religion serves them. There is, secondly, an interpretative or reinterpretative phase, or theology proper. The history of mankind's search for that in his total environment to which persons might relate themselves helpfully is a long and highly complex one. It is empirical evidence for the suggestion that Aristotle was not wholly wrong when he defined man as a "rational animal," The amount of human ingenuity and hard intellectual labor which has been devoted to the task of defining specifically the nature of man as a religious person, the nature and character of God, and the relations between them is probably second to none other intellectual task to the present at least. There is, thirdly, the area of religious techniques. The term "technique" is used to designate the complex of overt behavious of individuals and groups whereby they seek to realize values religiously. This includes all that is commonly known as worship, both public and private in the broadest meaning of the term. The religious complex, therefore, can be analyzed into (i) function, aim or goal; (ii) interpretation or theology; and (iii) techniques or overt responsibilities.

This three-fold analysis of religion suggests the possibility that the problem of religious knowledge is itself at least a three-fold problem. If we find three distinct phases in a given experience, we may expect to discover differences, either great or small, in the character of the problems which emerge at the intellectual level. As an institutional form of individual and group behavior designed to conserve and achieve values by intellectual and overt means, religion poses for the thoughtful persons problems at three levels.

H

Religion as institutionalized is one of the complex of institutions which constitutes a given culture. It may be defined, functionally, as the attempt to achieve and conserve certain values, individual and social, by specific means. Individual and social attempts to realize values give rise to institutions—defines as established orders, principles, laws and customs. Accordingly, religion is one of the complex of similar institutions developed in cultural history which is coordinate with education, law, the state, medicine, marriage, and any number of other identifiable established forms of human behavior.

The study of religion, at one level, is therefore an investigation at the institutional level of culture. As such, the methods proper to such investigation belong to what is called "social science." One will either use the

. किस्तु के इस देके ने निर्देशनों कि केस वर्ग किस्तुं के बच्चा के निर्देश कर के स्वाप्त कर किस्तु के स्वाप्त के मा कि नेकेंग्रामा के विकास कर है है के किया है कि किया कर कार का कार की किया है है है है कि कार किया है है कि क in many and , there accused the personal could be a required in more analysis the property than a e des six est begins en est surques . There are a surplied for an area for the contraction of the contraction ad har land as least last grown was made a services as as a services as as a macitous. Religious makes come in common withelf suces impan with the Mend describer: ci cerreimos bas abeen destes tepas of begain est appri The 16 Teduses in all these is a present that level in 2000 about the constant ह आहे केले हे तह है है है जिस उन्हर्ण है है जिसकार है जिसकार के कि कार्य के कि कार्य है है है है है है है है ह ar seinterpretaisee plaase, or therlogy proper. The history of mackinsh search for that is his total carly on meet to which persons might refuse themselves beightly is a tong and inguily complex one. It is employed est mader garaner ettaker som som bliggetan famil mulitergyse adt tot aamebken defined when as a "retional comme! The amount of wenness ingentity and pour juicitet le des chief that been devoted to the lask of deficient apon versus to return of men de a solfglous person, the neture cad characte ් වැන්ව පහටස වර් විශාවතම ඉදිරිමක්ට වේ සැපැම්ව සමාජවෙන් මනවැරීමට එහිදී විසුව විස in sector and religional in a mession report to the property of these team ellectric men and services because "featherings" (come will apprendent to appendent the ०९ है १००८ दिस्की प्रतिकेशियां कर्मानगृष्ट केया अधिकार्कियों कि अधिकार करों की पाउनके कि पाउने व -assure on a vincom cook at towarth, outsided with the primary is a relies and tras s orsbig, both and the and projector in the Expedent rach less of the terro. The de mis nother it for pres beautiers se and and the instruction arregiter goell, art incompleten on the dicay; and this techniques as exact trapers. . ROSVII JIJA

Betaliju semia njelog oda sa Prosta priliju od odnika aktiva prijelovih od praviljelogija da sa

कारण केरावित प्रशिक्षितिस्थात् सर्वते **कांद्रव्यक्तुम्भव** भवतिन्तिकः हेन वर्षम्भित्वति द्वितिने वर्षम्भवति द्वितिहा problem of religious knowledge is itself at least a three whole problem. if we find three distant pheace is a given experience, we may vigner to blems which more as the intellected level. As so well-indeed form ceulsves end group being cologiqued to come crice and action or by middlectual and creat means, religion poses for the throughful persons problema al Mres levela.

Religion as maifulnemailmed is one of the complex of theilmoles where constitutes a given culture, stimey be defined, fanctionally, as the buttonic to septere and repeared nertain values, individual and seciet, by specific niceas, legistics in a secie affirmate of commission for legisteric particular andinar los una las latinaria es la contra partirio de la contrata de la contrata de la contrata de la contrata Augerdiegly, religioniss one of the reingies of santing is with the distribute of erser par lucion de la racciona de la racciona de decembro. Le contra de la contraction de la contraction de l इत्यापको निर्माद्यकृष्टीसम्बर्ध होतिको सिक्समार्थ के अध्यादि कि प्रमानिकाल स्वतः केलाइ । अध्योगप्रसाद , अध्योगकीकाक

करोत्रीको हो। त्राकृतिको कर्ता कर क्षणको कर्तिको १००० । अस्तर १००० । अस्तिकार वेट क्षणिक वेट क्षणिक अस्ति । वि ්දිය මෙන් නැතිවූ වෙම්කු අපද මෙනෙන්නෙක් ඉසිරි කිරීමට මෙම කත් කිරීමට මිනිසි මෙන් මිනිසි මෙන් මිනිසි මෙන්නියි කිර The state of the second section of the second secon methods previously developed, or invent new ones which he believes are more efficient. The problem at this level belongs in the general area of philosophy of religion which should precede all other investigation in the field. This is based on the conviction that one must first determine the general area to which the term religion refers. The first course in the philosophy of religion will normally be devoted to the task of defining the extension of the term religion, or the functions which religion at the institutional level performs. Religious thinking, then, begins at the institutional level. At this level it will use methodology appropriate to social studies, namely, some of the complex methods known as "social science."

III

The next level of religious thinking belongs to what we have called the Reinterpretational Level. This is the area normally spoken of all theological or metaphysical. It is called "theological" primarily be those who accept revelation as authoritative. It becomes metaphysics particularly among those who approach religious thinking from the philosophical point of view. The term "metaphysics" is defined variously by these several thinkers, but in general it designates the study of the more inclusive factors involved in the Existential Medium, namely, the totality of entities, events, behavious, and whatever else may effect man directly or indirectly More technically, it may be defined as the investigation of the categories, i.e. the most pervasive characteristics of the Existential Medium.

The primary problem at this level is the problem of God. Familiarity with discussions of this problem may lead to the conclusion that the problem involved here is simple. Discussions of the conception of God are normally confined to one or more of the following subjects: the nature of God; the existence of God as defined; the relation of God as defined to the world and man, Attempts have been made occasionally to dismiss some or all of these questions as irrelevant. George Santayana ingisted that "religions as such will be better or worse, never true or false." Religion for him was an imaginative search for value, and its God -- concepts were based upon imaginative rather than factual data. Others seek to obviate the problem of God's existence by defining God in such terms that existence is a necessary corollary. Wieman defined God, in an early work, as that "Something upon which human life is most dependent for its security, welfare and increasing abundance." It is obvious that human life enjoys some security, welfare and increasing abundance. Consequently, it is unnecessary to prove that the basis for these exists. In his next volume, however, he defined God more specifically, and then he did so, faced the necessity of "testing" the concept. This 'testing' consisted in the attempt to prove that God as defined actually existed. It may be stated categorically that when God is defined in specific terms, the question of the existence of God-as-defined must be faced. To the present, at least, it appears to be impossible to evade the three-fold question of nature-existence relation when one considers the problem of God.

There is a preliminary question, however, which must be answered before these three related matters may be considered intelligently. This preliminary question may be stated thus: To what class of realities does God belong? An analogy from physics may clarify the meaning of this question. When thephysicist is asked about the nature of his basic material, he may answer that "physics" is mainly the science of the transformations of Energy (Energetics). "The physicist, in other words, has selected some phase of the universe about him and subjects it to critical examination. He confines his attention to energy and its transformations, and attempts to answer the questions which emerge from its consideration.

eneric is estable to the control of the control instrugation in general and process of the control of process of the control of process of the control of th

The next level of religious thinking delongs to what we have selled the Reinferpretational Level. This is the area normally speken of althouse logical or metaphysical. It is called "theological" primarily he three who accept revelation as authoritative. It becomes metaphysics particularly accept accept the approach religious thinking from the philosophical solution of view. The term "metaphysics" is defined variously by these several thinkers, but in general it designess the study of the more includive factors involved in the Existential Medium, namely, the totality of religious events, behaviors, and whatever else may effect man directly or indirectly events. More technically, it may be defined as the investigation of the outegories, i.e. the most pervesive characteristics of the Existential Medium.

The primary problem at this level is the problem of God. Franklering which discretions of the problem may lead to the constant on the first the star that bere is sirryic. Discussions of the conception of God and normally confined ්ය සහභාගර් දේස්ත්ව කණ්ඩ දිර්පති සිත කරන්නෙන් සිතින කරන්නෙන් සිතින සිතින සිතින සිතින සිතින සිතින සිතින සිතින සිත God as definal; the relation of Cod as defined to the world and than. Attornal as in the contract of the cont trotted ad live done as empigitar isait total; in a service and each will be before or wouse), notwe thus or delos, " " Religion has been was each magginality a sparat inedis sealist evidencingsinal mode beased speed speed and hot sit has the transplanting the titles the transplanting to the tenth of the transplanting to the transplanting tran tackiel Color, Colorer acolorie do obvisco de problema of <math>Godb amigrable cfining find in our's forms that anistence is a mecoposty coreliary. Wishney defined Wed, in an early work, as that "Something upon which became, life to model depression for the security, welfare and harroscing abundance, $^{0.6}$ gr is shyions that inpana iffe enjoye same security, wellsne and increasing abundement Compequently, it is unappeared in prove the prove that the basis for foor ළැක්ෂරණය මින මින්ස කළෙන් හන්සෙන්නේ එ**රහලහණ, එම ප්රෝහස්ස් වීම**න් සතුරුණ **සතුර**රණින්න්වන්සිල්, සතය වර්තය එක ජීම්ස් මෙල, නිමාසස් වීම්ස මෙසෙසෙන්වේගු නේ වර්ණ**ස්වානුවී විසිස් පරාණුණ**ුර් ස්ව**්රණ්ණ**්රීසේම්නානුව සහයා sisted in the stigmet to prove that wed as defined activally eniated. A may be stated categorically that when God to defined to specific terms, the greation. of the existence of God-an doffmed must be faced. To the present, at least, it appears to be impresible to evode the three-fold question of makurs controcurs. , boil do meldono edra erabletoo eno nedy nodeler

There related is a preliminary question, however, which must be answered below three three related inatters may be considered intelligently. This preliminary question what he efficiently the preliminary question may be effect three. It what chass of realtities does fied belong? An analogy from physics menting of this question. When the previous to an active the maining the makes the maining the maining the maining the transformations of this paragraphics. The payent of a cities words, and the transformation of the consider words, and consequent of the active about him and subjects it to exities anemalism. He considered his attention to analy main the cases fit to exities and consider. We carry and the guestions which can exactly consider the considered which

He does not question the existence of energy, but begins with common sense experiences of movement, actual and potential, and subjects them to increasingly refined and complex analysis. The other sciences follow a similar procedure: they select given areas of the world in which they live, and investigae these areas as thoroughly as possible.

The religious thinker has no such clearly defined field. He may not assume that the object of his study exists: no other inference may be drawn from the fact that he must prove its existence. Furthermore, religious thinkers disagree as to the data which may be admitted as valid for such prof. Some contemporary religious thinkers believe that Deity is a member of a class of essentially and absoluetly non-sensible or imperceptible realities; others that Deity belongs to the category of perceptible objects. The latter group may be divided into those who consider Deity the creative source of value, and those who consider Him the dominant phase of reality or controlling factor in all reality. Each group selects a different phase of reality as its referent for Deity. As a result it accepts a different body of data as admissible in the investigation of this reality's nature.

The various schools of theological thought with their several divergent conceptions of God are thus the logical consequences of the selection of different categories for Deity. If one accepts as data only that which points to or is expressive of a realm of subsistent objects, he has by that choice determined in advance the general character of the conception of God which he will develop. Likewise, if he selects for observation and examination that which denotes or represents the dominant or controlling phase or phases of reality, he has by the selection of data likewise predetermined the basic character of the God-concept which will result from his investigations.

The answer which is made to the preliminary question of general class or category to which all God-concepts belong is thus of major importance in any investigation of the problem of God. The specific significance of such choice may become more evident by an analysis of some possible categories.

Two basic categories for Deity may be discerned in the literature of all religions. The first we shall name the Agathonic. The term 'agathonic' is derived from the Greek word (to agathon), which means good in its kind or admirable, as that which is the source of value, worth or goodness. By agathonic we shall mean either that which is of use to or enjoyment by human beings or the source of that which is of use and enjoyment. There are many specific types of God-concepts derived and derivable from the adoption of this general class or category for Deity. Plato stated that God himself was One of Plato's numerous successors perfect and changeless in character. in this tradition is C.E.M. Joad. According to Joad's early metaphysics. reality consisted in three levels. The first and lowest was matter, defined as an entity devoid of life or mind and exhoustively explicable in physico-chemical terms. The second level was Life, described as an indefinable principle which appeared in matter in some mysterious manner at an indeterminable time. Its basic character consists in a Protean thrust or impulsion. third level consists in value, defined in Platonie terms as that which is permanent, perfect and changeless. It contains all that may be designated, at its lowest levels, by the terms God may be used to symbolize this realm of value when conceived as one and individuated.

From this point of view, knowledge of God cannot be obtained by an examination of either matter or life. Knowledge, according to Joad, is a matter of awareness, and awareness is defined as the directional activity of living beings accompanied by the convistion of immediate certainty.

The dispersion of a characteristic of the control of the characteristic between the control of the characteristic of the characteris

The religious thinks the no such exactly defined held. He may not secure that the object of his study existes no other inference may be drawn from the day that the chart the mast prove its existence. Furthermove, religious thinkers dissigned as valid for one beref. Some contemporary religious thinkers believe that hely is a mamber of a clear of escentially and absolutely non-seasible or imperceptible relities; believe that Defiy belongs to the catagory of parespilole objects. The latter group may be divided into those who consider Daily the exceptive source of value, "and those who consider limit the dominant phase of reality or controlling factors in all reality. Each group selectes a different planes of reality as its referent for Defiy. As a result it accepts a different body of data as admissible in the investigation of this reality a nature.

The various ochools of theological thought with their several divergent conceptions of Cod are thus the logical consequences of the selection of different entegories for Deity. If one accepts as data only that which points to or is expressive of a realm of subsistent objects, he has by that object determined in advance the general character of the conception of the will develop. Likewise, if he related for observation and scanning that that which denotes or represents the dominant or controlling place or places of realtry, inchase by the selection of data likewise predetermined the border character of the Cod-concept which will result from his investigations.

The samewer which is made to the preliminary question of general class or estegocy to which all God-concepts helong is thus of major importance in any investigation of the problem of Got. The openitie rightformus of such choice may became more evidential analysis of some possible categories.

of value when conceived as one and individuated. at its lowest levels, by the terms God may be used to symbolize this weed m permanent, perfect and changeless. It contains all that may be deadywated. third level consists in value, defined in Platonic terms he that which is time. Me besic character consists in a Frotean thrust or toppitation. which appeared in matter in nome taysterious manner at an indeterminable terms. The second level was Life, described as an indefinable publicities entity devoid of life or mind and erhoustively explicable in playsing wheming in this tradition is C. E. M. Joad. Mocording to Load's early metrolic of reality consisted in three levels. The first and lowers was matter, desired so an perfect and changeless in character. T. One of Plato's namerous anchessors this general class or category for Beith. Plate stated that God binnell was specifie types of God-concepts derived and deriveble from the adoption of beings or the source of that which is of use and enjoyment. There ere many agathonic we shall mean either that which is of use to or enjoyment by harners admirable, as that which is the source of value, worth or goodness. My derived from the Oreck word (to egathon), which means good in its bind or religions. The Brot we shall name the Agathonic. The term inguithmain is Two basis categories for Deity may be discerned to the literature of all

From this point of view, knowledge of God cannot be obtained by an error ination of either matter or life. Macwindge, soccording to Food, in a nation of awareness is defined or the directional activity of life goings accompanist by the convisting of limits of limits.

Thus all forms of knowing are forms of awareness: awareness of matter is called sensation; awareness of subsistent objects, such as thoughts, is called thinking. Awareness at its highest level is called mysticism or the vision of God. It is a much rarer form of awareness than the two preceding types and those who possess it may be called sports whose vision may guide lesser folk in their groping quest for light.

Some persons, in other words, may catch glimpses of God directly in the mystic vision. Others may glimpse him indirectly and momentarily in the esthetic experience. The major source of information concerning God comes, however, from the experience of the mystics, or in more prosaic language, from awareness of the third level of reality, the realm of value. No information concerning God is directly attainable through sensation or cognition. To all logical intents and purposes, the whole spatio-temporal world is irrelavant in the cognitive quest for God.

Perhaps the most significant American theological exponent of the again thonic category is Henry Nelson Wieman. Like Plato, he insists that God did not create and cannot be held responsible for the creation of the physical universe. In one of his numerous public debates, he specifically denied that God created mechanisms. He defined a mechanism as whatever "has its parts externally related to one another," or as that in which " the natures of the several parts are not determined by their relations to one another." According to Wieman at that time, God may use mechanisms for the creation or the furtherance of values, but he is not responsible for mechanisms as such. This means that for him information concerning the nature of God is not devivable from the study of the astronomical universe as pure fact, or in its existential dimension. He believes that one must seek in the realm of value and value-making processes in reality for date concerning the nature of God.

The Agathonic approach to the problem of God thus presupposes that the term Deity refers to that in one's total environment which is the source of that which is of use, spoyment and appreciation to humanity. The agathonic thinkers have accepted an answer to the preliminary question which determines, in a large measure, the specific answers they will make to the problems of the nature of God, his existence, and his relations to man and the world.

The second category for Deity which has found expression in the mythology and literature of religion may be called the Dynamic. This term is likewise a Greek deriviative and meant, originally, "to be able." As a category for Deity, it may be defined in terms of the power or powers responsible for human life and for its varied experiences. This category dominated the thought of primitive peoples. The Melanesians have a term, "mana", which they use to denote the power or influence which conditions buman existence and which must be considered seriously if life is to be lived safely and significantly. "Mana," like the burning bush in the Moses saga, had to be approached cautiously At a much higher level of human thought, Aristotle adopted the same category. In his search for an adequate metaphysics, he began with the observable facts of motion. He concluded that motion implied change or movement, and that movement implied both that which moved or underwent change and that which was responsible for movement or change. The distinction which Aristotle drew between motion and its source involved him in a process of infinite regression. In his attempt to break this interminable cause-effect sequence he posited an ultimate Unmoved Mover as the final source of all movement. He then identified God with this ultimate power whose existence was implied, according to Aristotle's logic, in the facts of immediate experience.

Building a new structure, but with Aristotle's theory as its foundation, F. S.

Thus all forms of hearthy, eve has a colorated to be as a manager of the box is called sometime, every access of colorated to be called the acception, is called the first of the access of the access of the colorate to the called investigation of the violation of the violation of the violation of the violation of the called the called the color two preveoling types and there who preveoling types and there who preveoling types and there who preveoling types and there were preveoling types and there were preveoling types and the called to the called to the color to the called to the color to the col

Some persons, in other wards, may eath glimpses of God directly in the mystic vision. Others may glimper him indirectly and momentarily in the esthetic experience. The major names of information constraints God consent, however, train the experience of the mystics, or in more present from awareness of the third level of reality, the realm of value. No information concerning God is directly attainable through sometion or cognition. To all logical intents and purposes, the whole spatio-temporal world is irrelevant in the cognitive quest for God.

Perhaps the most significant American theological exponent of the agnitionic category is Henry Nelson Wieman. Like Plato, he insists that God did not create and compot be held responsible for the creation of the physical universe. In one of his numerous public debates, he specifically deried that code created mechanisms. He defined a mechanism as whatever these its partice externally related to one another, to or as that in which the natures of the several partic are not determined by their relations to one another, to according to Wieman as that time, God may use mechanisms for the creation or the furtherance of values, but he is not responsible for mechanisms as such. This means that for him information concerning the nature of God is not devertivable from the straig of the astronomical universe as pure fact, or in its existantial dimension. We believed that one must seek in the nesting of value existantial dimension. We believed that one must seek in the nature of God.

The Againonic caproach to the problem of God thus presupposes that the term Deity refers to that in one is total onvircament which is the source of the which is against the against of the which is the against of the which is use, ejequinent and appreciation to humanity. The against of thinkens have accepted an answer to the preliminary question vision of the mines, in a large measure, the specific anamers they will make to the problems of the mature of God, his emistance, and his relations to man and the world,

according to Aristotle's legic, in the facts of immediate experience. Me then identified God with this ultimate power whose existence was implied, posited an ultimate Unracved Mover as the final source of all movement. gression. In his attempt to break this interminable cause effect sequence, drew between metica and its source involved him in a process of inflaits rewas responsible for movement or change. The distinction which Aristothe movement implied both that which thered or enderwent change and that when He concluded that motion implied change or movement, and that In his search for an adequate metaphysica, he began with the observable favio At a much higher level of human ittright, Artistotle adopted the same extensive "Mana," like the burning bush in the Moses saga, had to be approached or affected must be considered seriously if life is to be lived exiety and significantly. to denote the power or influence with conditions buman existence and which of primitive progles. The Melanesians have a term, "mana", which fany nee human life and for its varied experiences. This estegery douninated the the the uper Deity, it may be defined in terms of the power or powers responsible for a Greek deraviative sad mesat, originally, "to be able," he a category for and literature of religiou may be called the Dynamic. This term is likewide The second eltegony for Detty which has found expression in the mythetell

Northrop believes that the facts educed by modern physics and the theories in which these facts are generalized compel us to accept the existence of a Macroscopic Atom, perfectly spherical in form, which encloses the vast field of micoscopic atoms itself and impresses upon them the order, intelligibility and other characteristics which they exhibit. This Macroscopic Atom is then identified with God. God is thus the dominant or determining phase, atomic in character, of one's total environment, social and cosmic. He is finally responsible for the behavior of the microscopic atoms individually and for their various, if temporary, forms of structuralized relationships. James Bisett Pratt has populatized the term "Determiner of Destiny" for his version of this general category.

The effect of the adoption of the Dynamic category upon the character of the religious thinking is readily discernible. If God is the power which conditions existence, then the nature of that basic power is a matter of primary concern. The Melanesian natives were especially sensitive to all forms of power, especially that which was mysterious and little understood. Aristotle based his metaphysical structure upon the conclusions reached in his "Physics. Northrop presents his definition of God as the culmination of his study of science and first principles. The adoption of the dynamic category has as a logical consequence acceptance of a different body of data from that accepted in the Agathonic approach in the attempt to determine the specific nature of God.

This preliminary examination of basic categories has several important implications. In the first place, the category which one adopts governs the choice of date considered admissible in determining thenature of God. From the agathonic approach, the world-as-valued or the world-experienced-as-value constitutes the primary source of data. This realm of value may constitute a large or small portion of the world-as-known. No matter what its size, it constitutes the source of admissible data. All else is more or less irrelevant. From the dynamic approach, it is the world-as-experienced or the world-as-known which constitutes the source of data. The thinker who accepts this approach may not impose any value criterion as test of data-admissibility. His task is that of determining the nature of the dominant or determinate phase of his total cosmic medium. Consequently, the category which he has adopted does not permit him to exclude from consideration as admissible data any fact which presents itself. The only limit to his potential source of data are the boundaries which circumscribe the total realm of existential entities.

Both positions are subject to criticism at this point. Those who adopt the agathonic category are accused of being too highly selective in their choice of data. The criticism levelled at Kant and Kantians by Walter Lippmann is relevant here. Kant failed to find an adequate basis for his belief in God in his analysis of experience by means of pure reason. Rather than change his belief in God, he accepted man's moral experience as absolute to provide him with the date required to support his belief. The more recent agathonic thinkers modify Kant's principle of selectivity somewhat, but the practical epistemological consequences are the same. Kant confined himself to man's moral needs; the contemporary agathonic philosophers extend this to include man's value experiences and the source of such experiences. Both, however, accept highly selective bodies of data.

The dynamic category is subject to precisely the opposite criticism. It includes such a vast body of data that the task of reducing it to meaningful proportions appears to some thinkers to be impossible. This criticism was voiced some years ago by Harry Elmer Barnes who maintained that any attempt to find a tenable cosmology or ontology in terms of scientific data was beyond

Mershow, believes also a compact the stay increase pleasing and the Coeperation wilder the Missission of a Missission of American Ame

the effect of the adoption of the Dynamic category upon the character of the religious thinking is readily discrimible. If God to the power which nambitions existence, then the nature of their basis power is a matter of primary concern. The Melanesten natives were especially sensitive to all forms of power, especially that which was injectatives and little understood. Aristotic bases his metaphysical attracture upon the conclusions reached in his "Physics Dyerthrop presents his definition of field as the culmination of his study of actions and first principles. The adoption of the dynamic category has as a logical consequence acceptance of a different body of data from that accepted in the Agastionic approach in the stiempt to determine the specific matter of God.

Uniq predictions. In the first place, the categories has cavered important templications. In the first place, the category which one adopts governe the obstee of fatt cansidered adiotective in determining therefore adopts governe the the against of the vertical on-valued or the verification of the principle of a category south ended or the vertical of value and the categories of the categories of the vertical of the vertical of the vertical of the categories and the categories and the categories of the categories and committee the categories and categories the categories and categories the categories and categories and categories and categories and the categories and categori

Both positions are subject to articion at this point. Those who adopt the agathoric outsigns are subject to articion at this point, Those who adopt the data. The existing an isvelled at Early and Martin by Walter Lippinator is relevant berg. The existing interest and state to the date of the calculate by intendation by Martin Lippinator is the first analysis of experience by intend_of provide the belief in the date required in any range that the case. Rether this electric him with the date required to support his belief. The more recent appropriate thinkers include the grinciple of calculativity somewhat, but the provide spicturological consequences are the corac, find on the district the include manie value experiences and the ethics of erol experiences. Here is include manie value experiences and the ethics of erol experiences. Here, downward

The dynamen caleg**ory** is arkisent to preclassly the expectes existatene. In includes a vest bedry of data that the task of reducing at to a secretified properties on the fedical of the task of the artification and wellosed notice peans as a little principal follows a constitution of the fedical natural participal forms are expensed to a constitution of the fedical of the artification of the first order of the constitution of the federal data and become to the first order of the constitution of the co

the capacity of the humanmind. Whether or not the criticisms levelled at the two categories are valid will concern us later; their primary importance at the moment is that they indicate the prescriptive function of categories. The adoption of a given category determines the nature and extent of the data considered admissible in the cognitive enterprise. The agathonic appears to be too restrictive; the dynamic too inclusive.

The second consequence which flows from the adoption of a given category fro Deity pertains to its effect upon religious values. The traditional attributes of God may be divided into two general classes: the moral-personal and the absolute or existential. The first class includes those which belong to the realm of value, goodness, and character. The second class consists of those which belong to the realm of power, structure, being or existence. It is obvious of course, that the attributes of God which will eventually emerge from the agathonic approach belong to the moral-personal group. God will be so defined, specifically, as to become the most valuable object of human aspiration or contemplation, or as the primary sourceof such objects. There can be no question concerning this result. When one places God in the category of the most worthful objects known or knowable to man, the only admissible data are those which point to such object or objects. This means that God must be defined in value-categories since only value-data are considered admissible.

The attributes of God which emerge from the approach of the dynamic category are more absolute or existential in character. God as dominant phase or determinant behavior pattern of the existential medium 24 may not possess the list of value or character attributes which are found in the agathonic approach. Analysis of the total environing medium may prove that God possesses some or all of the moral-personal attributes which many consider essential to the nature of God. If critical analysis of admissible data warrants such conclusion, it will be accepted gratefully by those who adopt the dynamic approach. If, on the other hand, the facts which emerge from observation lead one to conclude that human values, as generally understood, are relatively unimportant in the local scheme of things, this conclusion may also have to be accepted. It will than be necessary for the contemporary thinker to adjust himself to a regorious theology, one reminiscent of John Calvin and the Westminster Confession. It may be necessary for hi m to face the fact of God in much the same fashion that he contemplates the atomic bonb, with awe rather than sentimentality. It should be remembered, however, that religious values have been found in both approaches to God; they have not always been the same values, but they have served deep human needs.

The third implication is methodological in character. The adoption of a basic category for Deity determines, in the main, the method or methods which may be used inthe investigation of the remaining questions pertaining to the general problem of God. The prolonged discussion of the possible relevance of empirical methodology to philosophy of religion loses much of its significance in the light of this analysis. If God as possible object of investigation belongs to the category of perceptible entities, his nature is subject to investigation by empirical methods. The specific type of empirical method which may be used will have to be determined by further analysis of the dimensional factors involved, but the revelance of empiricism as such is no longer subject o question. If, on the other hand, one adopts Joad's category for Deity -- as general name for an absolutely impercestible Realm -empiricism as method becomes impossible. God's specific nature will have to be determined by non-empirical methods -- be rationalism, mysticism, intuitionism or revelationsm. This will be sufficient to indicate that the category for Deity which one adopts may preclude all use of empirical methodology and the perceptive processes upon which it rests, 25

sine arresting all to a later and the Proof of the 128 fear and class of either as the arresting all to a later and the Proof of the Property Contactive Conference as the former and a later a later and a later a later and a later a la

The sacrad consequence which flows from the adoption of a given category attributes of God may be divided into two general classes: the morel personal and the absolute or existential. The first class includes those which belong to the realm of value, goodness, and character. The accorded class consists of those which belong to the realm of power, structure, being or existence, it is obvious of course, that the aftributes of God which personal group. God will be so defined, specifically, as to become the most valuable object of numan aspiration or contemplation, or as the primary gourceof such objects. There can be no question concerning this result. When one places (ind in the category of the most worthful objects known or knowable to man, the only admissible data are those which point to such object or objects. This means that God must be defined in value-categories since only value-data are considered admissible.

always been the same values, but they have served deep human needs. religious values have been found in both approaches to God; they have not awe rather than sentimentality. It should be remembered, however, that of Cod in much the same faction that he contemplates the atomic bonks, wills the Westminster Confession. It may be necessary for him to face the fact to adjust himself to a regorbus theology, one reminiscent of Icha Catrix and have to be accepted. It will than be necessary for the contemporary chicker rolatively unimpostant in the local scheme of Chings, this conclusion may also observation dead one to conclude that burnan values, as generally undevelond that adopt the dynamic approach. B, as the other band, the facts winds amenge from data warranta sach comolecion, it will be accepted gratefully by focse who consider essential to the nature of Cod, of artifical analysis of actacoustic Cod possesses same or all of the morel-parsens, attributes which many agathoric approach. Analysis of the total curinosing medium may prove that not possess the Mat divalue or character attributes which are found in the phase or determinant behavior posterm of the extenential medium in may category are move absolute or existential in cleracter. Cod as deminant The attributed of Cod which emerge from the approach of the dynamic

enethod denote the paraecties asones say open refort it reason. eategory for Desily which one adopts that preside all use of supported intuitioniem or revelationem. This will be safficient to indicate that for to be determined by non-empirical methods---be retionalisms, myeficiam, empirioham an method becomes impossible. God's apecitic asture will have gory for Delip--as general name for an absolutely impercassible Realm --longer audject a question. M, on the other bend, one adopts lead's catadimencional factore involved, but the revelance of emplaiciam as such it so which may be used will have to be determined by further analyzin of the to investigation by empirical methods. The specific type of empirical method gation belongs to the category of percoptible entities, his attend in ambient significance in the light of this analysis. If God as possible object of incast relevance of empirical methodology to philosophy of religion losses much of the to the general problem of God. The prolonged discussion of the possible which may be used in the investigation of the remaining questions performed banic category for Deity determines, in the main, the method or methods The third implication is methodological in character. The adeption of a

The messing of the ferm category which was implicit throughout the preceding discussion may not be defined. Categories, as indicated by the preceding analysis, denote comprehensive classes of entities, existent or subsistent, actual or ideal, real or imaginary, every member of which shares in a sufficient number of common characteristics to be grouped with others in some definite sense. Thus the category Deity means the general class to which all actual or possible entities or realities acknowledged to be divine belong.

Categories as this defined, are date-determinants, hypothesis-determinants and method-determinants because they define the general characteristics which all members of a given class must exhibit in order to be granted status in that class. When one classifies a given plant as a shrub, he circumscribes the areas he will investigate for data; he determines the nature of the hypotheses he will entertain; and, because of the two preceding commitments, he determines the character of the methods of investigation he may use. When one classifies endocrinology as a phase of physiology, he determines the nature and the extension his data—the human organisms and those related to it; he limits himself to certain hypotheses—those which pertain to the possible effects of glandular action upon given phases of organic structure; he likewise limits himself to certain methodologoes—those which can be used effectively with the data accepted as admissible to investigate the possible validity of the hypothesis considered possibly or probably true.

Categories then, as we are using the term, are data-determinants, hypothesis-determinants and method determinants. They are not to be identified with the Kantan categories defined as inherent psychic structures chich determine how we must preceive or conceive because human sensorium or understanding. They are, rather, methodaligical or linguistic devices which contribute to efficient definition and communication of meanings. As such, they serve both thought and action.

In the light of these considerations, it is evident that one must first clarify and vindicate the basic category for Deity if his further consideration of the nature of God is to be controlled by something other than unexamined and uncriticized assumptions. Important as categories may be in the connection, they are not sufficient in themselves. They determine, among other things, the data considered admissible. After one has arrived at his basic category, it is then possible to collect and examine the relevant data. The results of such examination are normally made explicit in some concept. Concepts are thus general terms, but they belong to a different level of thinking than the categorical. Concepts may be defined as data-explicands: they denote, present, or make explicit the meaning or meanings derivable from the date circumscribed by categories.

Finally, there is still another level of thinking in the Reinterpretave area beyond the categorical and conceptual. It is concerned with the religious value or "availability" of the concept which emerges from the data made admissible by the category adopted. Stated in religious terms, it is the meaning of God for a worshipping individual or group. The God of each worshipper or worshipping group will be derived from some conceptual Deity, but will not be completely identical with the particular conception of every other person or group adopting the same general concept. An examination of the various God-concepts belonging to several philosophical traditions presented by Wieman and Meland some years ago will indicate the relevance of this observation.

The continues of the condition of the mind was interestable of the second of the conditions of the con

Categorica as this defined, and dute-deter niname. hypothesis determination and mathematical determinant because they define the general than the propertion of the status the dich all members of a given class over the status in that class. When one classifier a given plant as a church of the status the need he will entertiate for data that he determines the will entertain; and, because of the frequencies the return of the nethods of interstigation of the nethods of interstigation of the status the meture and the return of the nethods of physiclegy, be determined the nature and the extractional his data the human organism and those the related to it he limit the lateral to estain appoint physics which return the likewise then the limit birnsoil to detain appoint physics of organic stream of the with the data ancepted as almissible to investigate the passible validity of the hypothesis considered passible of orthesis the probably tree.

Categories then, as we are using the term, are determinants, discrimination, to be hypothesis-determinants. There ere not to be identified which the Marian categories defined as inherent payothe structure thich determine how we must preceive or openeding forming how we must preceive or openeding forming the continuous must problem in the continuous forming the continuous definition and continuous formings and arch, they serve both thought and and continuous lost or manings.

in the light of these considerations, it is evident that one must first such and vindicate the besic estegory for Deliy if his inther consideration of the nature of God is to be controlled by something other that anexaminal and uncriticized assymptions. Important as categories may be in the corporationable and the data considered admissible. After one has arrived at his back careful in the data considered admissible. After one has arrived at his back careful in the semicolities of the character of the remains of such examination are normally made explicit in some concept. Corrects thus thus general terms but they belong to a different level of thirdusty that the categorical of make explicit the mention of mention of mention of the categories. Overland the mention of make explicit the mentions of mestings certivals of our the later and the categories.

The problem of the set of the problem level of the grant of the charteness of the set of the companies of th

The third phase of religion suggested above consisted of Techniques. This term is used to denote the behaviors of persons and groups engaged in by them to achieve the values sought in religion. In traditional theological language, techniques include "ways of salvation," or "means of grace," Viewed in the light of the total religious life of mankind, some more inclusive term such as technique appears preferable to those developed in a given religious tradition It likewise suggests skill in religious living, something which would appear to be of primary importance. The list of techniques the world over is almost inexhaustible. 4 The knowledge problems at this level belong to the fields of individual and social psychologies. When one has defined the values to be sought religiously, and has accepted specific interpretations of man and God, then the question of efficient ways-, modes of behavior -- whereby these values may be realized, is before him. (The specific types of behavior which are selected are determined first by the tradition to which one belongs, and secondly, to the success which attends their use. We are here in the practical realm of religious living, controlled of course by one's understanding of humannature and thenature of God. This is an area which has not been developed among the more liberal or recent movements in Christianity, but is nevertheless one of the most essential.

V

The cognitive quest for God is thus a complex one. It is too involved to be considered as a whole in one brief volume. We have considered the first, the function of religion in several articles, 28 and will have to content ourselves with the conclusions reached there for the present. We have considered the analysis of the religious problem at the categorical level of the Reinter-pretative phase in a preliminary fashion in three articles which may be consulted for the approach to the problem of categories for Deity. This analysis of the problem of knowledge in religion should clarify the issues which confront those who would "see religion steadily and see it whole." When we say, "I believe in God," we are making an affirmation whose complexity we overlook at our peril.

uncit you it beganges equally has andernay in a cotivation and etailable of beas of miret to achieve the values scuget in religios. In traditional theological language. kechniq cae ieclinic "weye of salvetion," or "rozach of grace, ". Viewei in the light of the lotal religious like of manhind, come more inclusive term such as technique appears proferable to those developed in a given raligione traffilion It likevdee oversots skill in religious living, constiting which would appear to be of primary importance. The list of techniques the world over is almost increasing the knowledge problems at this level belong to the fields of individual and social paychologies. When one has defined the values to be sought religiously, and has accepted specific interpretations of man and God, then the question of efficient wave-impdes of behavior-whereby these values may be realized, is before him. -The specific types of behavior which are selected are determined first by the predition to which one belonge, and secondly, to the success which attends their use. We are here in the practical realm of religious living, controlled of course by one's understanding of humannature and thenoture of God. This is an area which has not been developed among the mare liberal or recent movements in Christianity, but is nevertheless one of the most essential.

*(1

The regultive quest for God is thus a complex one. It is too involved to be considered on a vincle in one brief volume. We have considered the first, the function of religion in several articles. We have considered the foreing our solves with the consisting usaging the considered the samily of the consistered the analysis of the Relative parety of the Relative parety in a preliminary function in three articles, which may be consulted for the appreciate the parety of consulted for the appreciation of cetegoties for Detty. Whis entire of the pareties of the problem of the whole it is the action of the whole. When we are making on all who we are making on all whole. When we are making on all on the partie.

1. Lewis, G. I., and Langford, C.H., Symbolic Logic, New York and London; The Century Co., 1932, p 3.

This analysis of religion is developed more fully in my "Preface to

Theology," Religion in Life, Fall issue, 1932

3. A good summary of methods in this area may be found in Methods in Social Science, Stuart A. Rice, editor. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1931; or in the Fields and Methods of Sociology, L. L. Bernard, editor. New York: Ray Long and Richard R. Smith, inc., 1934. Burgess, Ernest W., "Research Methods in Sociology," Twentieth Gentury Sociology, (ed) Gurvitch, G., and Moore, Wilbert E. New York The Philosophical Library, 1945.

4. An analysis of methods used in this attempt by contemporary students of the philosophy of religion was sketched some years ago in two articles: "Concerning Definitition," The Crozer Quarterly, X No. 4, Oct., 1933, 459 - 469; and "God as Dynamic Determinant," The Journal of Religion,

XXIII, No. v. October 1943, 276-285.

Among those who approach the Reinterpretational Level in this manner must be included most of the important philosophers from Plate and Aristotle in the ancient world to C. Lloyd Morgan, Samuel Alexander, A. N. Whitehead, F. S. C. Northrop, E. S. Brightman, J. E. Boodin, Charles -Hartshorne and many others. Theologians who adopt this approach would include F. R. Tennant, H. N. Wieman and others

6. Santayana, George. Reason in Religion, New York, Charles Scribner's

Sons, 1933, p 14.

Wieman, H.N. Religious Experience and Scientific Method, New York Macmillan Co., 1926, p 9.

8. Wieman, H. N. The Wrestle of Religion with Truth, New York; Mac-

millan Co., 1927.

Thomson, J. Arthur, Introduction to Science, New York, Henry Holt and Co., 1911 p 105.

10. Cf. Joad, C.E.M. Matter, Life and Value, New York: Oxford University

Press, 1929.

11. Cf. Wieman, H.N., in several of his works, and especially in "Can God Be Perceived?" The Journal of Religion, Jan 1943, and "Power and Goodness of God." Ibid., Oct 1943, The Source of Human Good, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1946.

12. Cf, Northrop, F.S.C. Science and First Principles, New York: Macmillan Co

13 Plato, The Republic bk II, P 380

14 Matter, Life and Value pp. 375 ff

15 Joad, Present and Future of Christianity, New York, Macmillian Co. 1930 p 37

16 Matter, Life and Value, P 378

17 Ibid., pp 363 ff

18 Cf. "Faith and Knowledge," Christendom, I (Autumn, 1936) p. 774

19 The Physics, bks, vii and viii

20 Science and First Principles, New York, Macmillan Co., 1931 pp 120 ff., and 249 ff.

21 A Preface to Morals, New York: Macmillan Co., 1929, pp 136 ff.

22 The Twilight of Christianity. New York: Richard R. Smith 1931 pp 249 ff 23. Cf Brown, William Adams, An Outline of Ghristian Theology, New York:

Charles Scribner's Sons, 1906, pp 102 ff. 24 By Existential Medium we refer to all that affects human beings either

directly or indirectly. It is used throughout to designate all that in which men live, move, and have their being.

25 This fact was recognized by some of the men who participated in the discussion of Edwin R. Walker's article "Can Philosophy of Religion be Empirical?" which appeared in the Jounal of Religion, April 1939, but they did not take full advantage of it.

i, Lawis, G. i., and sungert, G. i. Gyadada Lagi, Kew Kerkanda ingi., Kew Kerkanda. Tire Gaustury Co., 1932, p. i.

2. Time analysis of religion to devoloped mone fully in my "Freince to

Theology, " Religion in Life, Fall lerne, 1932

3. A good summary of motheds in this area may be found in Medices in Special Schonce, Smooth A. Rice, editor. Chicago: The University of Chicago Franc. 1931; or in the Fields and Methods of Nociology. I., I., Bernard, editor. New York: Ray Long and Hichard R., Gorish, Fue., 1924. Burgess, Ernest W., "Freezoch Methods in Sociology, "Twentield Gantury Sociology, (ed) Carvitch, 2., and Moore, Wilhert H. New York The Fig. Canthology Carvitch, 2., and Moore, Wilhert H. New York

4. An apalysis of methods used in this attempt by contemporary students of the philosophy of religion was elected some years ago in two articles? "Concerting Definition," The Crosser Querterly, X No. 4, Oct., 1933, 459 - 469; and "God as Dynamic Determinant," The Journal of Religion.

XXIII, No. v. October 1943, 276-285.

5. Among those who approach the Reinterpretational Level in this manner must be included most of the important philosophers from Plate and Arietotic in the socient world to C. Lloyd Morgan, Samuel Alexander, A. N. Whitchesé, F. S. C. Northrup, E. S. Brightman, J. E. Buckie, Charles Hertshorme and many others. Theologians who adopt this approach would include F. R. Temant, H. N. Wieman and others

6. Sardayana, George, Reason in Religion, New York, Charles Seribner's

Sects, 1959, p.14.

V. Wisman, R.W. Religious Especience and Scientific Method, New York Mechalika Co., 1936, p 9.

L. Wieman, -H. N. The Wrestie of Roligion with Trail, Wer Fork; Mess Mess-

9. Thomson, J. Arthur, Introduction to Science, New York, Moury Mail and Co., 1911 p 105.

io. Cf. Read, C.E.M. Matter, Life and Value, New York: Onford University Prais, 1929.

11. Ci. Wieman. II.W., in gaveral of his works, and enperially in "Fun fied he Perceived?" The Journal of Religion, Jan 1943, and "Power and Good ness of fied." thid., Oct 1942, "The Source of Human Good, Gairages The University of Chicago Press, 1946.

12. Cf. Northrop, F.S.C. Schence and First Frinciples, New Fork: Macaullian dir

"TEST

13 Plate, The Republic M. P. 380

14 Mader, Life and Value pp. 375 ff

is José, Fresent and Future of Christianity, New York, Maetolikhun Co. 1980 : W 16 Mauter, Like and Value, Pe78

M the quashing TI

18 Cf. "Faith and Enowledge," Christendom, I (Autumn, 1936) p. 774

if The Physics, blue, wit and with

20 Science and First Principles, New York, Macmillen Co., 1939 pp 120 ff., contact 249 ff.

21 A Fredere to Morals, New York: Macmillan Co., 1929, pp 134 ff.

I The Twilight of Chrickianity, New York: Richard 2. Smith 1921 pp 249 W

23, Of Ecows, Villers Adence, Agithm of Christian Theology, New York: Charles Sorthace & Sons, 1996, op 102 M.

24 By Enterthal Medium we refer to all that affects human beings eftion of the condition of tractions of the mile of the condition and have their being.

24 Time fact were recognized by some of the man who participated in the discussion of Edwin E. Walker's article "Can Philosophy of Religion be Empirical?" which appeared in the Journal of Religion. April 1939, but they did not take fall advantage of E.

26. Wieman, H. N. and Meland, B. E., American Philosophies of Religion, New York; Harper and Brothers, Publishers, 1926.

29 Cf. "An Analytic Approach to the God-Concept," Religion in the Making, II.
No. 3, March 1942, 252. 263; "The Cognitive Quest for God," The Journal
of Religion, XXIII, no. 2, April 1943, 91-102; and "God as Dynamic
Determinant," Ibid., 276-285

27 Heiler, Friedrich, Das Gebet, 5. Auflage, Muenchen; Verlag von Ernst Reinhardt, 1919, is an exhaustive study of one technique. The articles in The Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics, New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1921, on such topics as "prayer" and "worship" also provide much

material on various types of techniques.

28 Gf. my "The Significance of the Changing Function of Religion." The Tournal of Religion, XII, No. 4, Oct., 1932, 556-570; "Concerning Definition," The Grozer Quarterly, X, No. 4, Oct., 1933, 458-479; "Where Are We In Our Religious Thinking?" The Hiff Review, II No. 2 Spring, 1945, 224-234.

26, Wienczy II II, end bielesii, I, i., Amerikant II iipeophies of Religion. - New Forld Hurpes and Eneligers, Poblishars, 1946,

29 CL. "An Asclytic Approach to the Code Codespt." Kaligina in the Making. II.
No. 'A. March 1962, 252. 265; "The Cognitive Outestior Cod." The Journal
of Religion. MIMA. no. 2, April 1963, 91-102; and "Ced so Dynamic
Determinant." Did., (276-255

27 Heikov, Friedrick, Dec Gebet, S. Addlege, Mucacken, Verleg von Ernet Reinbardt, 1919, is an exhanctive study of ose technique. The articles in The Encyclopedia of Religion and Eghlee, New York: Charles Beribasett Sons, 1921, on such topics as Perayer! and "worship! also provide much

meierial on various types of techniques.

28 Cf. my "The Significance of the Changing Function of Religion." The Tearmal of Religion, Kil. No. 4, Oct., 1932, 556-570; "Concerning Definition." The Grozer Quarterly, K. No. 4, Oct., 1933, 455-479; "Where Are We in Oct Religious Thinking?" The Riff Review, M No. 6 Spring. 1945, 224-224.

Josiah Royce, American Idealist of the past generation, proposed an analysis of religion and the place of philosophy in its study in an early volume entitled "The Religious Aspects of Philosophy" (1885). The primary task of religion was that of defining for men their duty; next, it must motivate them to do it; finally, it must "point out to them such things in the real world as shall help them to be steadfast in their devotion to duty. "I He then defined philosophy as "a purely theoretic" discipline whose concern was that of defining for itself the nature of the real world, and to do so "it has to be perfectly indifferent to consequences ... Theoretic philosophy knows no passion save the passion for truth, has no fear save the fear of error, cherishes no hope save the hope of theoretic success." (p.8). Religious philosophy shares with theoretic philosophy this interest in truth but accepts an additional responsibility, namely, that of exploring the nature of value. As he stated it, "It seeks not merely the truth, but the inspiring truth." (p.8). In its search for the inspiring truth concerning reality, it seeks first for that in the universe which may be of "Infinite Worth." If this cannot be found, it then seeks for that in this world which is "worth most." "It cannot make realities, but is determined to judge them. "(p.9)

Royce located the philosophical interests in religion with reference to this analysis of religion. If religion's primary function is that of defining for men their duties, then it shares with philosophy an interest in "a moral come." If, furthermore, religion seeks for that in the universe which is of Infinite Worth or at least of highest worth, it shares with philosophy this quest for the "real" whose value may be determined once its nature has been discovered. With this analysis in mind, Royce organized his study of the religious aspects of philosophy about two problems: "The Search for a Moral Ideal," and "The Search for a Religious Truth."

From a sociological point of view, the late Dmile Durkheim presented an analysis of religion similar to that of Royce. Religion, he wrote, "is a unified system of beliefs and practices relative to sacred things, which is to say, things set apart and forbidden—beliefs and practices which unite into one single moral community called a Church, all those who adhere to them." Durkheim stressed two elements in his analysis: beliefs and practices. In the later phases of his discussion, however, he emphasized the function or significance of these beliefs and practices. All religions have one thing in common: the distinction between the profane and the sacred. "This division of the world into two domains, the one containing all that is sacred, the other all that is profane, is the distinctive trait of religious thought." "

The function of beliefs and practices was for Durkheim that of "upholding and reaffirming at regular intervals the collective sentiments and collective ideas which make its (society's) unity and personality."4 He believed society to be

^{*} The Iliff Review, Vol IX, No. 2, Spring 1952

The content of the first in the second of the first in the form of the first in the

HOLDIEST BI SECTORE 1 189 EGGESCIENG SIN BOTANCE CONTRACTOR OF CANAGE SINCE AND STREETS OF THE SECTION OF CANAGE SINCE SINCE OF CANAGE SINCE OF CONTRACTOR OF CANAGE SINCE SINCE

The million of the formation of the control of a sent to the control of the contr

400 P niedling rol sec centicent has selled in moifocul end end siempoint curbi sylmuthiser in gaidichur in a sòl siem goims curbi switceiled in a winemitues switte. 1,...

an essentially self-constituting and self-creative being.

Leligion was one of primary institutions whereby this creative process was maintained at levels of high efficiency. Leligious behavior was thus a compley form of group behavior designed to create and maintain social values by means of belief in the sacred and the performance of certain practices.

Consideration of analyses such as these, and many others, suggested the relevance of a formal analysis of religion which may serve as an analytic approach to the study of religion. The formal definition follows: Leligion is a complex form of human behavior whose function or aim is that of achieving or conserving value or values by means of a reinterpretation of one's cosmic environment (Existential Medium) in whole or in part, and by means of overt or somatic activities or techniques. This formal definition includes three elements or phases which appear to be invariants in religious experience at all levels. Such formal definitions provide the student of religion with a convenient approach to the analysis of what is admittedly a complex and difficult problem.

I

For convenience, we may designate each of the three invariant phases of religion by a single term. The first is Function: The ends, aims, goals, purposes or values realized or believed to be realized religiously. The second is Reinterpretation, or the intellectual reworking of experience and the experienced world under the impulse of religious needs in order to define for oneself the nature of the objective referent -assuming its existence -- of the religious response. Inasmuch as this intellectual reworking presupposes a common-sense of scientific understanding or interpretation of oneself and his world, it is better to speak of it has a reinterpretation. In this reinterpretation, many concepts emerge, from the "churinga" of the Australians studied by Durkheim to the "mana" of the Melanesians studied by Codrington and others, and to the Gods of the higher religions; from the "interior being" of the primitive Australian to the soul of modern man; from the protective and saving qualities to the primitive's "churinga" to the saviors of high religions. The reinterpretative phase of religions contains a large number of concepts believed to denote or designate available realities.

The third phase of religion consists of Techniques. Techniques may be defined as overt behaviors or somatic responses of persons to God or the functional equivalents in other religions. It is this phase of religion which includes the whole ritual or routine of religion; which made necessary, among other things, the development of the "holy man," priest or minister. Out of the necessity for correct technique and for collective support of one's beliefs, the specific institution known as the church grew. Heinterpretation and technique, designed to achieve, conserve, or promote religious values, may be viewed as the religious roots of the various religious institutions and the whole complex of relations with secular institutions so well presented in Joachim Wach's thoroughly documented "Sociology of Religion." The various fields which

భాగత మందిని ఉన్న కుంటే మందిని ఉన్న ఉంది. మందుకు అందు మందుకు అనికి ఉన్నాయి. కింటేంద్రులు కొంటేందు కోందిని క్రామం కోందుకు కొంటులు కోంటుకు ఈ ఉయ్యామ్తు, కోతుపూర్ కూడి వృశ్ధాన్ను క్రామం కోటిందు అయినే మందుక్రామం. కోంటా ఉమ్యే ఉన్న ఉమ్మే కారుకు కోటా మందుకు మంది. కాడుకు అంది కోట్లో ముందుకుండా ఉమ్మే క్రామం కోమ్ కోమ్ కోందుకు ఉ ఉందిందిని అయినే త్యేత కారుకు ముందుకు మందుకు అంది. కలుకు తమ్మ ఖ్యాంతక్ తెలంది.

Consideration of analyses these, and many others, suggested the religion which regressed the religion which regressed the religion of religion which regressed to the study of religion which regressed definition follows. Lehigion is a specifical of and the follows burner to be added to the state of addition of human telegraphs of addition of consisting raids or whites by resint a reinterprecision of out of consists and ty recent (inferential hedice) in which in party and ty recent of overt or sometic activities or technique folds formal definition includes three siements or pheres which appear to be invariants in religious experience at all levels. Such formal definitions provide the student of religion with a conventer apparent to the analysis of what is admittently occupied and difficult problem.

1

low convenience, we may designate each of the three tayers ent phases of religion by a single frame. The first is Teacher The enda, abuse goals, purposes or values realized or bellevich to be realised religiously. The second is Neinserprotucion or the intellectual reporking of emperionee and the empani-enced world ander the impulse of religious needs in order to delime for oneself the neture of the objective referent-assuming its existence--of the religious responses the same enough a secongueoug grainfower Laure Hadila idd as sid bas liegero "to notisterquetai do gathasterebau dilitudios world, it is better to speak of it has a relative proceedings this releterprotetion, many consepts charge, from the belowing of the Australians studied by Lurkheim to the "mane" of the Melanesians studied by Godrington and others. and to the Gods of the higher religious; from the "interior being" of the print itive dustralian to the soul of modern man; from the protective and savion qualities to the primitive a constitue polyme bus saviors of high religions. The reinterpresurive ponce of religions contains a large mader of concepts believed to denote or designate available realities.

The third place of religion consists of Toconiques. Techniques may be defined as overt behaviors or complic responses of persons to God or the functional equivalents in other religions. It is this place of religion which includes the whole risusd or routine of religion; which made necessary, among other things, the development of the "holy man," priest or minister. Out of the accessity for correct technique and for collective support of one; beliefs, the specific instinction and feathead of the church grew. Neinterpretation and technique and feathead to the church grew. Neinterpretation and technique, designed to design to the church grew. Neinterpretation and technique, designed to design the religious rotots of the earliest as religious to the chart as the religious rotots of the earliest as chart as of the religious of the r

now some the acquiral characters make the sergest first to set of the first when our of each give, set into the interpretation they now exhibit the selves.

The investigation of religion, then, may be approached in terms of a formal analysis of the field. Some men are temperamentally fitted for the investigation of one area, others another area. Then one views the field in its total complexity, he may well conclude that there is room for all types of temperament and for many kinds of intellectual interest.

Furthermore, the three-fold analysis of religion apparently forces one to a decision concerning the cognitive approach to the study of religion. When religion is viewed as a simple, that is, non-complex form of experience, it is legitimate to ask the question: "What method or logic shall be used in religious thinking?" But when one confronts a complex form of human and cosmic behavior, he can no longer ask that question. He must first seek to analyse his subject into its several parts, and then determine what specific methodology is most appropriate in each area.

II

The cognitive problems of religion may be approached from the point of view of any one of the three phases of the formal definition. At the same time, there appears to be some value in approaching them from the point of view of function. All human institutions exist, or did exist, for the purpose of serving some human need or needs. Thus specific needs have given rise to institutions called legal, medical, political, religious, to mention a few. They exist side by side in our various cultures. They may be distinguished variously. Thus one could distinguish the legal from the medical profession by observing that one uses precedents whereas the other uses drugged a more natural distinction would be that of determining to what end or for what purpose precedents and drugs are used. This is, in my judgment, a proper mode of procedure in approaching the cognitive areas in religion.

Accepting under "acknowledgement," to use Iloyd Forgan's term, the institution--established orders, principles, laws and usages--called religion, we then investigate its specific nature to determine what specific contribution or contributions it has made and is making to those who practice it. This means that the problems at the functional level are normally confined to the broad field of social science, especially those areas named history, sociology and anthropology. The methods used in contemporary philosophy of religion are those normally used in the broad field denoted by the term "social sciences." The adequacy or inadequacy of the several methods used, and the ways in which they are employed thus becomes one of the major methodological problems in the philosophy of religion.

The significance of this problem may be observed by a

brief excursion into the psychology of religion. William James began his study of the psychology of religion by defining religion as "the feelings, acts, and experiences of individual men in their solitude, so far as they apprehend themselves to stand in relation to whatever they may consider the divine." This theory of the nature of religion controlled his selection of data in his Gifford Lectures and led many others to adopt his method of "extreme cases," which tends to isolate individuals from tradition and society. Knight Dunlap defines religion as "man's attempt to do what he did not know how to do," and "to know that which it was impossible for him to know at the time." These two instances are perhaps sufficient to indicate the determinative effect which the acceptance of a given definition of religion may have upon the several areas in theological education, and the consequent significance of proper methodology in the investigation of the nature of religion itself.

III

Reinterpretation, or the intellectual reworking of experience and the experienced world under the impulse of religious needs, represents the second phase of religion. It should be observed that the results of previous intellectual reworkings are constitutive elements in one's present religious experience, and that the interpretation of any given religious experience, significant or insignificant, will doubtless become a constituent factor in subsequent religious experiences. This represents probably the most inclusive and technical phase, from the cognitive point of view, of the whole religious complex. The significance of this statement may be indicated by the consideration of one of the problems which emerge here, namely, the problem of God.

The problem of God occurs at three levels: Categorial, Conceptual, and individual-particular. The term "category" as used here may be defined as "a comprehensive class of entities, existent or subsistent, actual or ideal, real or imaginary, every member of which shares in a sufficient number of common characteristics to be classified with the others in some definite sense. "10 Categories, so defined, are data-determinants: they determine the general area within which one may select admissible data in a given investigation. When one adopts "uebernatuerliche Maechte," as his category for Deity, as does Carl Clemen, he has by that choice circumscribed the area from which data may be gathered and considered admissible. Everything relevant to supernatural Power is admissible; nothing else is. 12

The relevance of categories to the cognitive quest for God may be further illustrated by examining a few contemporary theories. According to G. E. M. Joad, Deity belongs to the category of essentially and ultimately imperceptible realities. The reality which he would apply the name God is completely and irrevocably separated from matter and life and remains so eternally. Henry Nelson Wieman, on the other hand, identifies God with the "creative event, which is "immediately accessible"

Define the state of the transfer of a collection of the second of the se

777

Relaterprotation, or the intellectual rewerking of experneeds, represents the eccond phase of religion. It should be cheerred that the results of provious intellectual reworkings are constitutive elements in one's present religious emerience, and that the interpretation of any given religious experience, adminimist or insignificant, will doubtless become a conatituent factor in embacquant religious experiences. This represents probably the most inclusive and technical phase, from the organitive point of view, of the whole religious conpler. The stguificance of this statement may be incleased by the constaction of one of the problems which emerge hove, whenchy, the problem of God.

One problem of God occurs at three levils: Godegowiels Generation, and individual particular. The text "observiols" or incident, and individual particular. The text "observiol" or incident, or interpreted of antivides, or incident or unatterity, or incorporate or antivides, or emperation or unatterity or incorporate in a some of the content of the content of common derinite sense. "It designified with the others in some definite and they determine the general error within which one may select admissible date in a given investigation. When one adopts Treat the care they be has by that choice circumswribed the area from which date may be gathered and considered admissible area from which date may be gathered and considered admissible. Everything relevant to subcreatural Power is admissible; anothing size is is

The relevance of sategories to the cognitive quest for God may be further illustrated by examining a few contamporary theories. According to 0. H. M. Josd, beity belongs to the sategory of essentially and altimately imperophible realities. The result which he would apply the name dot it desplaishes and irreweaply separated from matter and life and remains so eternily. The result felces lieses, on the other band, identifies ded with the "erentive event, which in limitative accessible

to human living and human feeling in all the fulness of his concrete reality. "14 It is evident that Vieman and Joad have adopted quite different data-determinants as categories for God. One seeks for God in the concrete fulness of human living here and now; the other strives so to refine his highest form of awareness, namely mysticism, that he may catch an occasional glimpse of "the permanent, perfect and changeless" real to which he applies the name God. Still others, as for example, F. S. C. Northrop, adopt a dynamic category and views leity as the dominant phase of the total Existential Medium. One of the reasons, then, for the fifty-seven varieties of Godconcepts found in America today is the adoption by different investigators of different categories for Deity.

Categories, then, serve as linguistic and methodological instruments whereby the extension of the term Deity is made specific and the data accepted as admissible for the further investigation of the problem are prescribed. But this is only the first step in the process whereby man's relationship with God is intellectually clarified and understood. The second level in the cognitive quest for God may be called the conceptual. We shall define concepts as general terms, less inclusive than categories, whose function is that of denoting, designating, presenting or making explicit the meaning or meanings which emerge from the investigation and comprehension of the data prescribed by the categories. Categories were defined as data-determinants; concepts may be defined as dataexplicands. Categories prescribe data; concepts explicate them. 16 Thus the meaning of God which is implicit in the data prescribed by the category Deity becomes explicit in the conceptual formulations of the conceptions of God.

At the conceptual level one may change terms. At the categorial level, we have used the term Deity to designate the widest extension of the religious object. There is no real justification for making this distinction except linguistic convenience. There are many divine beings in the thought and practice of religious persons and groups the world over. In seeking for the greatest extensionality of the meanings which may be common to all of these conceptions, we need some inclusive term. Inasmuch as Deity is seldom used in the worship experience of the Christian whereas the term God is, it may be preferable to use Deity at the categorial level and God at the conceptual level.

whereas many problems find their source at this level, two of them appear, at the moment, of primary significance. The first is epistemological, and is usually discussed in terms of "faith" and "reason," or "matural" and "revelational" theology. 17 Closely associated with this epistemological problem is the cosmological problem of the relation of Nature and the Supernatural. It is possible that these two problems are but two facets of the same basic issue, the initial attitude with which one approaches human society and the more immediate phases of his cosmic medium. It may not be a mere coincidence that Plato and Aristotle began their work shortly after the Atomic view of nature had been formulated by Democritus

The second of the control of the con

Labigo following and the molare are when when the objects of the control of the solution and the solution of the control o

Survey Serve and the several agreed than one level frudgeonce and the secretary of the features and severalized at vited must entitled over level following the feature that feature the feature the feature of the several as monmosmi ames evienion; nathermo on it in sometrogra the voted oen or elderelear _ 0% 6]. a

on's elevel and to source then's built amelions when a test of the sufficient of the surface of

and Leucippus, or that modern Idealism took its rise shortly after Sir Isaac Newton formulated his mechanistic theory of nature. In the Platonic and in the Kantian tradition, knowledge gained experimentally was given a much lower rating than that gained by reason uncontaminated by too much observational data. In both traditions, nature was considered a human and divine footstool, and little more. Is

The prescriptive character of the categories becomes operative at this level. If the category Deity includes within its extension only the "permanent, perfect and changeless" in reality, then certain God-concepts are precluded by definition. God as "creative event" cannot qualify; God as "Macrocosmic 19 Atom" impressing order and form upon the world cannot qualify; nor can God as "Dynamic Determinant," my own view, qualify. Furthermore, Niebuhr's view of "The Holy Spirit as the spirit of God indwelling in man," cannot qualify. Only that which may be included within the extension of the "permanent, perfect and changeless" can qualify.

The problem of the relation of God and the world, or nature, and the Supernatural, is likewise controlled, in part, by the prescriptive character of the categories. If, as it is assumed by some, Deity refers to that in the cosmic environment upon whom one is dependent for his religious values, then interest in the supernatural declines. Twenty-five years ago a revered teacher who had accepted this category could write: "The unknowablemess of a transcendent being has now become a philosophical commonplace."22 Now, with the current flowing in another direction, Erich Frank can close his study of philosophical understanding and religious truth with the statement that since God is not "of this world, it is not through reason, but through faith that we can have access to the Absolute." The determinative nature of the categories is without doubt one of the primary problems in the study of the reinterpretative phase of religion.

No matter what the current interest may be at the conceptual level, the task is ever that of formulating the data considered to be admissible by the category adopted in a conception of maximal comprehensibility. This conception will be based upon a selection from among the mass of data made available under a given category. Furthermore, the selection actually made will be determined, in the main, by certain basic ontological assumptions. It is sufficient here to note that a given category normally provides a basis for development of many Godconcepts having a given structure and reference, each of which may claim to provide maximal comprehensibility.

This brings us to the third or individual-particular level in the cognitive quest for God at the reinterpretive phase of religion. It is the level of psychsomatic or psychophysical prehension of God by the individual worshipped under the impulse of his religious needs. Eventually, the question of the "religious availability" of God must be raised with reference to every formulation at the conceptual level. There come times in the lives of men when they no longer speak of Deity or God, but

and the subjection of the subject of the subject to the subject of a subject of a subject of a subject of a subject of the sub

The prescriptive character of the category for the the categories to come a operative as this level. If the category leity includes within its extension only the "permenent, porfect and chargeless" in reality, then cardein Cod. concepts are precluded by definition. God as "creative event" cannot qualify; Cod as "Macrocosmic him tom" impressing order and form upon the world cannot qualify; nor can God as "Dymanic Determinant," my own view, qualify; nor definition of God inducting in man," cannot qualify. In Cod included within the extension of the "permanent, perfect and changeless" can qualify.

The problem of the relation of God and the world, or nature, and the Supernatural, is likewise controlled, in part, by the prescriptive character of the estogories. If, as it is assumed by some, Delty refere to that in the cosmic environment uyen by some, Delty refere to that in the cosmic environment uyen by the cut in the capendary is desented then interest in the capendary could write: "The severed complement that accepted this category could write: "The writed the capendary being has new recome a phile capendary of a transcendent being has new recome a phile another direction, Erich Frank can close his study of phile character direction, Erich Frank can close his study of phile that accepted this world, it is not through resign, but through faith that we can have access to the Absolute. Figure of the primary problems in the study of the reinterpretative of the primary problems in the study of the reinterpretative

No matter what the current interest may be at the conceptual level, the task is ever that of formulating the data conceptioned to be admissible by the category adopted in a conception of maximal comprehensibility. This conception will be based upon a selection from among the mass of data made evallable under a given category. Furthermore, the estection actually made till be determined, in the main, by certain basic onto-logical assumptions. It is sufficient here to note that a given category normally provides a besis for development of many God-concepts having a given etructure and reference, each of which may claim to provide maximal comprehensibility.

This brings us to the third or individual-particular level in the cognitive cuest for God at the reinterpretive phase of religion. It is the level of psychecartic or psychophysical prehension of God by the individual wership so under the inpulse of his religious needs. Eventually, the question of the "religious spallability" of God must be relised with reference to erery framulation at the conceptabl level. These dense times is the lives of men stantally, no linear specific of Bods but

of "my God." It is this phase of the reinterpretive problem which is normally of greatest interest in the church and least interest in the schools! Nevertheless, it is a problem which has a legitimate place in the study of religion analogous to that in medicine when a new theory of diagnosis or treatment is ready to be applied in actual situations.

It may be noted here that the God whom the individual prehends in worship 24 (or by whom the individual is prehended), is always conceived selectively with reference to the God conceptually defined. When the religious problem facing an individual is the oppressive weight of knowledge relevant to some vital issue, much of which he cannot comprehend, then God conceived in terms of maximal intellectual comprehensibility (God as omniscient, in traditional terms) is primary. He who has lost a beloved companion on life's highway will find God as the conserver of values, as a companion of the lonely way, the God whom he seeks. This is indicative of the tendency, necessary it would seem, to select or to emphasize different phases of the life of God as richly defined conceptually.

The process whereby we have moved from the categorial to the individual-particular level is one of increasing selectivity. The categories seek maximal extensionality so as to include all that belongs within the extension of the category Deity; concepts seek maximal comprehensibility of God defined in terms of the data prescribed by the categories, but conditioned by epistemological considerations which do not appear to be relevant at the categorial level; the particular-individual level seeks maximal availability of God in terms of personal need and aspirations. In the light of an analysis such as this, the exfoliation of concepts presented in the various histories of the philosophy of religion is understandable.

IV

This will be sufficient to indicate the nature of the cognitive levels in the reinterpretive phase of religion. We need to glance briefly at the third phase of the formal analysis, namely, the Technique phase. We defined techniques as evert responses or somatic behaviours. We refer, of course, to what are normally called "practices," worship, and the ritual or routine of religion. It is believed by many that this area is the most underdeveloped area in theological education. A recent survey of the ten theological schools of the Methodist church indicates that this is the case in that church.

The practical problem of providing better trained technicians for our churches and the development of better techniques both for public worship or private devotion is of high importance to all interested in the religious life of our times. The student of religion sees this as a problem in the area of individual and group psychology. Techniques are related to the function of religion—the goals which may be sought religiously as well as to the conceptions of God which one holds. If the goal of religion is that enhancing or enriching human

81

of "my God." It is this phase of the reinterpretive problem which is normally of greatest interest in the church and least interest in the schools! Nevertheless, it is a problem which has a legitimate place in the study of religion analogous to that in medicine when a new theory of diagnosis or treatment is ready to be applied in actual situations.

It may be noted here that the God whom the individual prehends in worship (or by whom the individual is prehended),
is always conceived selectively with reference to the God conceptually defined. When the religious problem facing an individual is the oppressive weight of knowledge relevant to some
vital issue, much of which he cannot comprehend, then God conceived in terms of meximal intellectual comprehensibility
(God as omniscient, in traditional terms) is primary. He who
has lost a beloved companion on life's highway will find God
as the conserver of values, as a companion of the lonely way,
the God whom he seeks. This is indicative of the tendency,
necessary it would seem, to select or to emphasize different
phases of the life of God as richly defined conceptually.

The process whereby we have moved from the categorial to the individual-particular level is one of increasing selectivity. The categories seek maximal extensionality so as to include all that belongs within the extension of the category Deity; concepts seek maximal comprehensibility of God defined in terms of the data prescribed by the categories, but conditioned by epistemological considerations which do not appear to be relevant at the categorial level; the particular individual level seeks maximal svailability of God in terms of personal need and aspirations. In the light of an analysis such as this, the exfoliation of concepts presented in the various histories of the philosophy of religion is understandable.

VI

This will be sufficient to indicate the nature of the cognitive levels in the reinterpretive phase of religion. We need to glance briefly at the third phase of the formal analysis, namely, the Technique phase. We defined techniques as overt responses or somatic behaviours. We refer, of course, to what are normally called "practices," worship, and the ritual or routine of religion. It is believed by many that this creatistic the most underdeveloped area in theological education. A recent survey of the ten theological schools of the Methodist church indicates that this is the case in that church.

The practical problem of providing better trained technicians for our churches and the development of better techniques both for public worship or private devotion is of high importance to all interested in the religious life of our times. The student of religion sees this as a problem in the area of individual and group psychology. Techniques are related to the function of religion—the goals which may be sought religiously as well as to the conceptions of God which one holds. If the goal of religion is that enhancing or enriching human

life in terms of a shared quest for the highest values, then the general nature of the religious techniques will be predetermined. If, on the other hand, religion is concerned to relate individuals to God as "the Wholly Other," a different set of techniques may be indicated. This means that the study of the third phase of religion cannot be undertaking without careful consideration of the other two. The formal analysis of religion thus serves as a corrective and guide in the exploration of the several phases of this subject.

V

The study of religion means, then, the investigation of religion in each of its three phases: Function, reinterpretation, and techniques. The philosophy of religion will find its place in one or more of these several areas and their historical and sociological implications or expressions. Fefore its place can be determined, however, some conception of the meaning of the philosophy of religion must be developed.

In the thought of Josiah Royce, philosophy of religion was that phase of philosophy which was concerned with truth, and particularly with the "inspiring truth."25 In this definition of the field, he was following the pattern established by Immanuel Kant, whose preface to the first edition of his "Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone," (1793) is still worth reading. Kant distinguished Biblical theology from "philosophical" theology. The former had two functions: That of caring "for the soul's welfare alone," and that of caring both for the soul's welfare and for "the welfare of the sciences." 26 But neither of these disciplines consisted in what for him was "philosophical theology." "Among the sciences, however, there is, over and against Biblical theology, a philosophical theclogy, which is an estate entrusted to another faculty. So long as this philosophical theology remains within the limits of reason alone, and for the confirmation and exposition makes use of history, sayings, books of all peoples, even the Bible, but only for itself, without wishing to carry these propositions into Biblical theology or to change the latter's public doctrines -- a privilege of divines -- it must have complete freedom to expand as far as its science reaches."27 Kant thus distinguished philosophical theology from Biblical theology, which was much more inclusive then than now, in terms of the basic interests of each. Philosophy of religion or philosophical theology must serve reason: Biblical theology must serve the soul and the institutions of society. In more recent terminology, this means that theology and perhaps other phases of theological education owe their primary allegiance to the welfare of the individual person and the religious institutions, whereas the philosophy of religion must concern itself primarily with the investigation of the cognitive adequacy of the religious life. 28 The philosophy of religion may be based upon data gathered from many religions, including one's own, but it must not be determined in its conclusions, by either personal or institutional considerations, in so far as these can be excluded from one's consideration. Philosophy of religions must

ij,

The study of religion means, then, the invostigation of the three pheases Eugotion, and techniques. The philosophy of religion will sind is placed in one or more of these several areas and their historical and sociological implications or engressions. Here its place can be determined, however, some conception of the massing of the philosophy of religion by developed.

In the thought of Josiel Royce, philesophy of religious a there of philosophy which were concerned titl thriting well parti bolasly vith the lingoining truth, "25 la this delicities of the field, he was following the pattern certificity for Lamenus Mant, whose prefere to the first efilier of this Religion Within the Linibe of Arceus Llons," (1792) is still words reading. Rant distinguished Diblical Charley Fred Contressonteal" theology. The forest had two furetiles a liver of earing "for the soul o welfare blone," and that of mates. Doth for the **soul'n w**elfare and for "the welfare of the adout But will wolk dade of Ledelanos configionis ecold le colliss dul Tokilotophical thaclogeth tames the seiesce, however, there is over and against hiblical shoology, a philosophical forplosy, which is an entere entrusted to enoties induly. So long to this philogophical theology remains which the living of reason alone, and for the confirmation and asposifien mittee use of bistery, sayings, books of til peoples, even the little ber cally for theolf, without whether to carry these proper sistems toto Piblical theology or to shampe the latter's pelite. dock ince--a privilego of divines --it mark have complete freetom to expend as far as its salence reschess to Hent thus its tingulahed philosophical theology from Biblical theology, this was week more inclusive then the law in ferms of the basic interests of the basic interests of tech. Thilosophy of wellslop or philosophy of elle over must ceres recomme Tilbellest bloodes ver mode pale nowl and the institutions of society. In more season tolering in seadin modes sperime factonesis this veriments which the contract of the sead of of th -Pas sub et equelgalla grandro chonà eve noltuerba Lankella est ture of the individual percon and the wallerions incidence rmoroco the philosopiy is rotterius avet poscers litedia of reconstant of the constant of the constant of the end at a regular brack the control of the reference of the angles of the control of the control

be philosophical, that is, interested in a dispassionate quest)

"philosophical," it is recognized that there is much disagreement concerning precisely what is "philosophical". Our present purpose will be served if we may assume that philosophical thinking is that which is done by philosophers when engaged with the problems which are normally acknowledged to be "philosophical problems." This does not mean that all "philosophers" acknowledge the same set of problems as "philosophical" problems, but that any deviation from the historic pattern of philosophical problems must begin with that pattern, and that the area of problems cannot be said to have changed until a sufficient number of persons in the field who are acknowledged to be competent have accepted the changes, at least in principle.

Among the basic interests normally acknowledged to be philosophical, three appear to have especial relevance to religious thought. They are epistemology, or the problem of knowledge; metaphysics or cosmology, or the nature of the "real" and its relations to the world and man; and axiology, often used for the problem of value. Every philosopher of religion may find himself, sooner or later, involved with each of these problems in his investigation of the several phases of the religious complex.

1. The epistemological problems emerge for the philosophy of religion at the functional level. As one examined various investigations in religion -- in the Biblical, theological, historical or psychological fields -- he discovers that each investigator finds it necessary to accept some theory of the nature of religion. If his work is religious in its orientation, it is evident that he must have some general conception of what comes within the bounds of his investigation. He needs a category as data-determinant to block out the area or areas which may contain admissible facts. Differences in the theories of the nature of religion soon become evident. The philosophically inclined investigator wonders why one student confines his attention to the lowest possible form of religions (Durkheim) whereas another examined the most extreme cases (William James, Wobbermin); why some insist that that only can be called religious which has a supernatural reference (Ott, Clemen), whereas others would say that religion must have a natural referent (Mathews, Smith, Vieman).

This leads him directly into the search for the methods used by these several competent investigators in substantiating or validating the views they have adopted. He soon learns that the methods used can be reduced, probably, to four: The Method of Agreement or Simple Emumeration; the method of Extreme Cases: the method of the Religio-psychological circle; and the method of Tunctional Analysis. He observes, also, that these methods are sometimes used under the vague generalization of "scientific method," without recognition of the fact that there are many "scientific" methods, and that some of them have little

Then it is estd that the philosophy of milkion mast be specificated to the constitution of the cinese is much district and the complication of the cinese is much district and constituted the cinese that the constitution of the cinese that the constitution is constituted to be considered to be a constituted by college which is probleme. This does not mean that all "philosophers" acknowledge the same est of probleme as "philosophical" probleme, but that any deviation from the historic pattern of philosophical problems leave deviation from the historic pattern of philosophical problems is not considered to be said to have changed until a sufficient number of persons in the field who are acknowledged to be competent have accepted the changes, at least in principle.

Among the besic interests normally acknowledged to be philosophical, three appear to have especial relevance to religious thought. They are epistemology, or the problem of knowledge, motaphysics or desmology, or the mature of the "scal" and its relations to the world and many and ardology, often used for the problem of ralue. Mysay philosopher of religion may find himself, somer or later, involved with each of these problems in his investigation of the several phases of the religious complem.

(Hasheec, Smith, Momen). others would say that religion must have a natural referent gions thich has a supermaintel rolevence (Ott, Oleson), wherede Wobbemain); why some inclos that that only can be called reliattention to the lewest possible form of religious (Duskheim) whereas another examined the most extreme coses (Valifam James, inclined investigator wonders why one student confines his nature of religion scon become brident. The philosophically contain admissible fects. Differences in the thectics of the as data-determinant to block out the area or ereas which may withing the bounds of his investigation. He needs a categoly evident that he must have some general conception of what comes If his work is religious in its oriontation, it is gruda at neceseary to eccept some theory of the neture of reiosi or psychological fleids--he discovers that each investigator investigations in religion-in the Hiblical, theological, historreligion at the functional lovel. As one examined revious i. The epistemological problems emerge for the philosophy of

unto lesses him directio into the secret for the actions are the secret for the action of th

cogency whereas others have a great deal. 30

2. In the reinterpretive phase of religion the area wherein many contemporary philosophers of religion find their deepest interest, the problems are related to a cluster of concepts: God, Jesus Christ, nature and the supernatural, man and society, reason and faith. In this area, one is plunged into the basic problems in epistemology and ontology, and here also, the relations between theology and philosophy of religion may become It is possible, however, in the light of the analysis confused. of the three levels in the cognitive quest presented above, to draw a rather useful line of demarcation. I We noted the problem at the categorial level was that of finding the extension of a given term, Deity. We may restate the task as that of finding the maximal extension of a term which would include the Godconcept of the Christians and its functional equivalent in all the religions of the world. The problem at the conceptual level may be restated as that of finding the maximal comprehensivility in the God-concept of a given religion; and the problem at the level of the individual-particular is the maximal personal availability of the God defined conceptually. In this analysis of the general problem, the normal place to begin is at the conceptual level, the level of God-as-defined. One's interest may then lead him in the direction of the categorial level to determine whether or not the concept is based upon data which are drawn from a given category, and to question the validity of the category adopted. This is essentially a philosophical quest; as Kant stated it, an interest in the reasonableness of the conception without specific reference to its religious or institutional values. On the other hand, one may begin with the concept, and after satisfying himself as to its validity, may move toward the problem of its maximal availability to those in whose religious welfare he is interested. This is essentially the theological interest. It relates itself more directly with the needs of the pastor and people. The other interest is more philosophical. This does not mean it is necessarily divorced from value-considerations, but does mean that its effects are less immediate. As Whitehead observed, it may take hundreds, yes, even a thousand years for an idea of profound generality to become effective in human life. 32 The theologian, then, seeks maximal comprehensibility and maximal personal availability in his approach to God-concepts; the philosopher of religion seeks maximal comprehensibility and maximal extension or datainclusiveness in his approach to the problem.

The philosopher of religion feels it to be his primary responsibility to move in the direction of maximal extensionability, to check his conclusions against the experiences of mankind, not only or merely against that of his own religious culture. The theologian shares this conceptual interest with the philosopher of religion, but recognizes it as his duty to move in the direction of maximal value to those whom he serves.

Perhaps the primary reason for the tendency in philosophy of religion to move from the conceptual to the categorial level is found in the way in which categories are "deduced." If

tionand acus off soiglion to sacing prisoners of aligion the stock with the nong contemporary pail scaphers of religion flad their tempera interest, the prolimanters of selected to a cluster of concepts God, Ferne Christ, paters and the supermountal, men and society resson and faith. In this area, one is plunged into the basic problems in epistemelogy and ontology, and here also, the relations between theelegy and philosophy of religion may become confused. It is possible, however, in the light of the analysic of the three levels in the cognitive quest presented above, to draw a rather useful line of demarcation. The roted the problem st the eategorial level was that of finding the extension of a given term, Deity. We may restate the task as thet of finding the maximal datematen of a term which would include the Codeconcept of the Uhristians and its functional equivalent in all the religions of the world. The problem at the conceptual level may be resteted as the services the maximal comprehensionity in the God-concept of a given religious and the problem of the level of the individual-particular is the maximal personal svellability of the Goffined conceptually. In this enelysis of the general problem, the normal place to begin to at the conceptual level, the level of God-as-defined. One's interest may than lead him in the direction of the categorial level to defermine whether or not the concept is based upon data which are drawn from a given estegony, and to question the walldity of the opticeory shopted. This is essentially a philosophical quest; an Kant stated it, on interest in the reasoneblenese of the compaction without specific reference to its religious or institutionel values. On the other hand, one may begin with the concept, and efter satisfying bimself as to its validity, may move toward the problem of its maximal availability to those in whose religious walfare he is interested. This is essentially the theological interest. It related itself more directly with the needs of the pastor and people. The other interest is more philosophical. This does not mean it is necessarily divorced from value-considerations, but does mean that its effects are less immediate. As Unitehead observed, it may take hundreds. yes, even a thousand years for an idea of profound generality to become effective in human life, 22 The theologism, then, seeks maximul comprehensibility and maximal personal availability in his approach to Cod-concepte; the philosopher of religion seeks meximal comprehensibility and waximal extension or datainclusiveness in his approach ic the problem.

The philosopher of religion feels if to be his primery responsibility to move in the direction of maximal entension-shility, to check his conclusions against the argeriences of markind, not only or merely against that of his own religious culture. The theologian shares this conceptual interest with the philosopher of religion, but recognizes it as his duty to nove in the direction of maximal value to those when he serves.

Perfect the printer; revent for the variety in philosoph; of veligion to move from the consequence of the ferital level to found in the copy is chief arrivation are left; if the copy is chief arrivation are left; if the copy is chief arrivation are left;

categories are "data-determinants," that is to say, mark out the limits of data-admissibility, they are, in one sense of the word, apriori. They are presupposed when one begins to collect data, thus they must precede the utilization of empirical data. The category for deity, defined as the data-determinant which governs the admissibility of data which may be used at the conceptual level, cannot be supported, directly, by the examination of specific instances. It may be adopted either by postulation or deduction. If by postulation, then the question of its validity has merely been postponed, and may later have to be faced. If by deduction, then that from which it is deduced must first be established. In the case of the category for deity, we suggest that it is deduced, normally, from one's conception of the nature of religion. If religion is an attitude appropriate to some supernatural power (Otto, Clemen), then the category for deity will confine the search for data to the supernatural; if religion is devotion to the source of human good, conceived in terms of absolute immanence, (Meman, Meland), then the data considered admissible in terms of this category will be found in the world of men and events.

It will be evident that these problems are closely related, on the one hand, to history, sociology and culture—in the attempt to determine the functional nature of religion as a cultural institution, and to metaphysics and epistemology—in the criticism of methodology and the development of metaphysics and cosmology. Furthermore they impinge consistently upon the problem of value. This is true because, hypothetically and provisionally, it appears possible to correlate one's interest in nature and the supernatural, reason and faith, with certain basic conceptions of and attitudes toward the more immediate aspects of one's Existential Medium, to which the name nature may be given.

The philosophy of religion, then, will find its place in the study of religion at those points where the methodological phases of epistemology becomes critical; where the cosmological interests are at stake, where men like Whitchead and Hartshorne in America and Alexander and Morgan in England have served so well in the development of systems worthy of utmost attention; and where problems of value emerge and demand attention. Here Urban, Perry, and Wieman deserve attention for their contributions to value theory in its relation to the Christian quest for the good life.

The relationship of the philosophy of religion to the other interests in the study of religion is another problem. We have indicated the way in which the relationship of philosophy and theology may be conceived. We have also noted by implication the way in which this discipline draws upon history and sociology for materials and guidance, and how in turn it may serve them by viewing their methods in the light of the epistemological field as such. The specific relationships to these and other fields requires further consideration. The present paper will serve, however, to indicate the general nature of the approach to such problems. It will have indicated, also, that the study of religion is itself so wast that the fullest cooperation of all fields will still leave much information to be gained.

An even additionable of restrictions of the constant of the co

It will be evident that these problems are diosaly related, on the land, to history, seciology and culture-win the attempt to determine the functional mature of religion as a cultural institution. On the appearance and epistemology—in the exitician of metaphysics and compley. Furtheast that they had the five developentity upon the problem of value. This is the teaching the headly and provisionally, it appears possible to conceive and follow of the appears possible to conceive actions of the appears possible to conception of the appears the fire more amore to conception of and attitudes toward the more amore and the conceive and the second and follows and appears of one's lixistential Hedium, to which the name maker as and attempt of the conception of the same maker as and attempt of the conception.

The philosophy of religion, then, will find ata place in the solution et those points where the methodological phases of spirationary becomes oritical; where the methodological interests are st state, where men like thitchead and Hartshorne in America and Alexander and lorgen in England have served so well in the development of eyetems worthy of utmost attention; and where problems of value casego and carend actention. Here Urban, Perry, and haman decayed attention for their contributions to value theory in its relation attention.

The relationship of the philosophy of religion to the other dult reats in the study of religion is another problem. We have dult anied the ray in which the relationship of philosophy and theology anay be conceived. We have also noted by implication the very in this closipline draws aron history and sociology for declar the solads and how in the solation if new carse than by viewing that a solation in the colation of the colation field as such. The operation of the colation of the colation of the colation of the colation of a such that care, however, to indicate the conditional and a sector if a such case if the colation of a such of such the colation of a such the colation to a colation of all fields will add to each the colation of all fields will addition to account the colation of all fields will addite the care of all fields will addite and the colation of all fields will addite and the colation of all fields will addite and all alleged the colation of all fields will addite and account and all fields will addite the colation of all fields will addite and account and all fields will addite and a such that the colation of all fields will addite and account and all fields will addite and a such that a such a such a such a such a such a such as a such as a such a such as a s

Boston, 1855, p. 7 The Elementary Forms of The Religious Life, (Eng. trans. J. V. Swein; Glencoe, Ills. 1947, p. 47. First ed. 1915)

Thid., p.37

Thid, p.427

"Cognitive" is used here to mean broadly what is generally known as "knowing" in its most inclusive sense. Cf. Lewis, An Analysis of Knowledge and Valuation, (1946), ch.I; Whitehead, A. N., The Function of Reason, (1929); Ledger Wood, The Analysis of Knowledge (1940), pp.16-24

We are using the term methodology as "the systematic analysis and organization of the rational and experimental principles and process which must guide" an inquiry which deals with existent realities of functions of such realities. Greenwood, "Methodology" Dictionary of Philosophy, (1941) from whose definition the quotation comes, would confine methodology to sciences, or "the special sciences more particularly." This limitation is not necessarily valid. Analysis and organization of principles and processes, "rational and experimental" appear necessary in all investigations of man and his existential medium. Methodology is thus closely associated with "the ways of knowing," D. C. Macintosh,

this manner.
The Varieties of Religious Experience, (1902), p. 31

Religion: Its Functions in Human Life, (1946), pp. 287f. Whereas he calls this "proto-religion," it still controls both his selection of data and their interpretation.

The Problem of Religious Knowledge, pp. 9 passim employs the term in

OBernhardt, "The Cognitive Quest for God," The Journal of Religion,

XXIII, Ap. 1943, p. 92

llGrundriss der Religionsphilosophic (1934), p.3
l2This use of the term "category" is similar to that of Ledger Wood, The Analysis of Knowledge, (1940), Chapter VIII. He defines a category as "a concept of high generality and wide application fabricated by the mind with direct or indirect reference to the experiential world and employed by the mind in the interpretation of that world." (Ibid., p152).

An inspection of my definition, developed before I became acquainted with his, will show various differences but general agreement.

13Cf, his Matter, Life and Value, (1929) 14The Source of Human Good., (1946) p. 306. 15Cf. Science and First Principles, (1931)

Ouest for God, "The Journal of Religion, KXIII, Ap. 1943, pp. 92f. The relevance of categories to the problem of God was presented, in preliminary fashion, in "An Analytic Approach to the God-concept." Religion in the Making, II, March 1942, pp. 252-263. Ledger Wood, The Analysis of Knowledge (1940), chapter VIII, defines concepts similarly. However, we differ in the matter of the "deduction" of categories, and in the distinction between the "prescriptive" and the "explicative" roles attributed to them.

27Cf. Ferre, Nels F.S., Faith and Reason, (1946): Burtt, Types of Religious Philosophy (1939); Frank, Erich, Philosophical Understanding and Religious Truth, (1945). The writings of the men associated with the Neo-orthodox school may be consulted for discussion of the relevance of faith and revelation.

18 This distinction may be noted in Broad, C. D. Scientific Thought, (1923), (pp. 155ff., and also in Whitehead, A. N., Process and Reality, (1929), (pp. 180ff; Adventures of Ideas (1933), part II.

19This is Northrop's conception of God presented in the last chapter of his Science and First Principles, (1931).

\$P\$ \$\$\$ \$\$\$\$\$\$\$ 医皮肤结合变形。 Abited the transport of the Fill strict fills the many to be a superior side er spops, littel 236V, g. 69. Sizet et. 36X5) indegminative is used here to sean broading when is gurosully imore to income iog" in the need includence seame. (i. lesis, An Analysis of Energias of Parties and Valuation. (1968), ca.fr Valuation. (1968), ca.fr Valuation. (1968), ca.fr Valuation. (1968), ca.fr Valuation. (1968), pp. 16-28.
Ledger Took, Min Analysis of Minoulatics (1960), pp. 16-28.
Ledger Took, Minoulation of Minoulation (1960), pp. 16-28. No the gustong has selfibered Leissettegre bus Lossiter with the molifering mpet grifte" am inquivy vhirleh doule with existatent resilitifo of fraction w of each rechtrics. Greanwood, "Methodology" Marionary of Philosophy (1941) from whose Softmitton the quaterion comes, would confice method ology to saisnose, or "the special solonesy more particularly." This limitation is not necessarily walid. Analysis and organization of principies and processes, "rutional and emperimental" appear northern in all investigations of man and bis existential medima. Hethodolas is time closely associated with "the ways of knowing," D. C. Macintones. The Problem of Raligious Knowledge, pp. 9 passin employs the tema in inis mamer. The Varieties of Religious Erperisace, (1902), p. 51 Told., p. 8 Rie Functions in Euman Life, (1946), pp. 287f. Wherens he Religion: calla this "proto-religion," it still controls both his relaction of data and their interprevation. Command: "The degnisive Quest for God," The Journal of heligions halles and Indigions and India (1945) of heligions and III. Apt 1945, p. 92 Prais vec of the term "category" is similar to that of Eccept Book. The traiyets of Erowledge, (1840), Chaoter VIII. He dofines a capquer of To concept of high generality and wide emplication fabricated by the mind with direct or indirect reference to the experiential world and employed by the mind in the interpretation of that would." (Indee, plan An inspection of my definition, developed before I become squakntsk with his, will show verious differences but general agreement. (1929) Man Methor, Life and Value, (1929) låThe Source of Human Cock., (1946) p. 306. ågdf. Seience ond Firet Principles, (1951) idrals vice of the cotapories and depospie was proceeded in The Committee Spans for each " whe formul of heilelin, Bully's an Italy you that relievence of integration to the problem of God venture recession. ាន ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត នៅ**នេះ ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត** នៅ ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត ខេត្ត នៅ និ in the hatchest II, Maret 1942, op. 252-255. Ledyer tood, his suring to at inotage. to differ in the metter of the "deduction" of estagorism, and in the distinction between the "presentative" and the "amiliantive" waller ្សាស់ខ្លុំ ១៩ ស្នងក្រៅជំនួនប្រ of Februar Meis N.C., Initia and Massem: (1947): Tyrife Ife of the Control group Frankli (1926). File walkings at the property and the secondary un ann mulan selv in de marrèrelle velt Sobievause se typer Acedes mulaced de incivelevor bom Milst ikaka distration may so motel in broad, s. i. betantuta Wissam of the opp. 1552ff.) and aloo do phakdmest. 1. H. H. Hr. esso and kosting. (keek). Tool 1601ff advertors of literal (1935), para 12. The varigouis court edit with

Dernhardt, "God as Dynamic Determinant," The Journal of Leligion, MMIII, Oct, 1943, p. 276-285. Niebuhr, R., The Nature and Destiny of Man II, p.99 Smith, G. B., Dictionary of Religion and Ethics, (1924) Philosophical Understanding and Religious Truth (1945), p. 164. 4Cf. Whitehead, Process and Reality, (1929), pp. 334ff., for the way in which he are using the term "prehends," in a modified way. It is a term denoting a relationship between the worshipper and God which seems more appropriate than any other available.

5cf. p. 68 above. 6Eng. trans. and notes by T. M. Greene and H. H. Hudson, (1934), pp. 7 ff.

7 Ibid., p.8 8This general understanding of the nature of the philosophy of religion dominated the thought of many historians of the field: Pfleiderer, Otto, The Philosophy of Religion on the Basis of Its History (sed. ed. 1883), I., lf. Caldecott, A., The Philosophy of Religion in England and America (1901); Wach, J., "Religionsphilosophie," in Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart, (1930); H. N. Wieman and B. E. Meland, American Philosophies of Religion, (1936). It is also characteristic of individual writers in various countries: Burtt, E. A. Types of Religious Philosophy, (1930). Take Caird. Textucduation to the Philosophy of Religious Philosophy, (1930). (1939); John Caird, Introduction to the Philosophy of Religion, (1880); Carl Clemen, Grundriss der Religionsphilosophie (1934).

9Ayer, A. J., Language, Truth and Logic, (1936) proposes a sharp delimitation of the field. Other points of view are presented in Collingwood, R. G., An Essay on Metaphysics, (1940); Emmett, D. M. The Nature of Metaphysical Thinking, (1945); J. Maritain, A Preface to Metaphysics (1941); Bergson, H., The Creative Mind, (1946); Whitehead, A. N.,

Process and Reality, (1929).

**OBernhardt, Vm. H., "Concerning Definition," The Crozer Quarterly, Vol. A (Oct., 1933), pp. 458-479; ibid., "The Cognitive Quest for God," The Journal of Religion, XXIII, No. 2, Ap. 1943, pp. 91ff, and "God as Dynamic Determinant," ibid., Oct., 1943, pp. 276ff.

51cf. pp. 70f. 2Adventures of Ideas, (1932), p.220.

33It is interesting that both Kant and Whitehead reached conclusions concerning this phase of the work of the philosopher of religion at approximately the same age. Kant was 69 when he wrote Religion Within the Limits of Reason Alone (1793), and Whitehead was 71 when he wrote The Adventures of Ideas (1932), which contains in the chapter on "The New Reformation, " a good charter for the philosophy of religion.

gover apply countries to them east of her extential teratred te ame deing the term 'prehence," in a modified way. It is terms term denoting a releasionship between the worshipper and God which cerms The state of the s

New Agreember 1 and the Control of the first and the control of th

dominated the thought of many historiens of the freed Fractions of enthing general understanding of the nature of the philosophy of religion hang thrans, and moves by T. M. Crosue and H. H. Fuduon, (1974), pp. 7 2. CIP-P 108 oppare

(1939); John Caird, Introduction to the Philosophy of Religion, (1880) wanters in wantous countries: Durte, H. A. Types of Deligious Philosoph The Caldecour, A., The Philosophy of Religion in Angland and Laser of (2001); theh, T., "Religionsphilosophie," in Die Religion in Genebland and Genebland in Gen The Philosophy of Heligion on the Besis of Its Matory (sed, ed. Adda)

Annald in the same tent on Mercarion (1940); Limbert De Et Pre Westre Alaisation of the field. Other points of Wiew are presented in Collins Pager, a. J., Language, Truth and Logic, (1936), proposes a sharp de-Cant Clemen. Grandziss der Religionsphilosophie (1984).

(1941); Bergrad II, The Creative Mind; (1946); Universe to Helepay, the desired to Helepay, (1941); Bergrad II, The Creative Mind; (1946); Universe to Helepay, (1941); Bergrad II, (1999), (1942); Profess and Helling, (1999), (1942); Profess and Helling, (1942); The Croker II, (1942), (

Advertores of Tames. (1932); p.320

Hew Heformation," a good charter for the philosophy of religion. The Adventures of Ideas (1932), which contains in the chapter on "The th the Limits of Reason Alone (1793), and Unitabend was 71 when he was genderning this phase of the vork of the philosopher of religious has one is inversating that both gant and thitelead resched conclusions

《社会》(1916年),1916年),1918年(1918年),1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年,1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年(1918年),1918年

the TERM absolute Transcendence is used to designate a widley held theology which stresses the otherness of God. Using the cosmos as a frame of reference, God is defined in terms which indicate his transcendence to the natural world, and to all that it contains. This transcendence may mean (1) spatial transcendence, (2) temporal transcendence, (3) qualitative transcendence or (4) epistemological transcendence. In every instance, the relation between the natural and the supernatural is one of discontinuity rather than continuity.

It is sometimes asserted that only one of these meanings is employed when God is said to be transcendent. Thus Emil Brunner stated that the transcendence which he attributes to God is primarily epistemological. Thus God may be present to both nature and history, but he cannot be known through any study of either or both. However, when one examines his view of human destiny, he is convinced that temporal and qualitative transcendence are implied. Furthermore, when we examine the basic assumptions upon which the logic of Absolute Transcendence is based, these differentiations in the meaning of transcendence will prove to be more or less insignificant.

To designate more specifically the type of religious thought we propose to examine, we shall list some of the better known men whose theology we have in mind. The Barthian group in Europe and their Neo-Orthodox adherents in America are both the best known and most extreme. Their writings are, in the main, extensive and excursive. Their obsession with the need for scriptural support for every statement they make, and their insistence that scriptural and traditional language is the only language in which theology can be written, makes their style prolix and diffuse. If one will spend an evening with the volumes produced by Karl Barth this tendency toward circumlocution will become painfully evident. Barth, Brunner and Paul Tillich are prhaps the best known Europeans; 2 Reinlold Niebuhr is the most prolific of the American exponets of Absolute Transcendence, but he has many followers both in Great Britain and the United States. It is these men, then, whom we shall have in mind when we discuss the logic of Absolute Transcendence. Nels F. S. Ferre, though born in Sweden, was educated in the United States and is attempting to maintain the essential elements of Absolute Transcendence while at the same time using the language of Partial Immanence. How successful he will be remains to be seen. The outlook is decidedly dark on the basis of what he has thus far produced. Gustav Aulen and Anders Nygren of the Luncensian school in Sweded are becoming better known to English students. Their divergencies from the positions of the men listed above is not significant so far as the logic of Absolute Transcendence is concerned.

It may appear paradoxical to attempt an analysis of the logic of Absolute Transcendence when its primary emphasis is a denial of the capacity of reason to reach truth in important fields.

^{*} The Iliff Review Vol VII, No. 1 Winter, 1950

Lengther the grant of the control of

caployed when God is said to be transcandent. Thus Eatl Distance stated that the transcendence which he attributes to Cod is parter arily epistemological. Thus God may be present to both nature and history, but he capnot be known through any study of either or both. However, when one expaines! Mis view of human destiny, he is cantined that temporal and qualitative transcendence and in lied. Furthernore, when we examine the basic accumpations upon which the Lagic of Absolute Pranscendence will prove to be more entiations in the meaning of Transcendence will prove to be more or less insignificant.

from the postutions of the ach lighted showed to not standing as the logic of Absolute fransbendence is collegined. moun to inglish students. Thoir divergendies Hygren of the Lun enslan school in Sweded are because, barter basis of what he has thus far produced. Gustav Anlow and Anderse will be remains to be seen. Mis outlook is dooldedly dark on the time using the language of Partial Imanance, How successful he the essential elements of Absolute Transcendence While at the space was educated in the United States and is attempting to maintain of Absolute Transcendence. Nels F. S. Ferre, though born in Bwenner Lovers both in Great pritain and the United Steves, it is where non; then, whom we shall have in mind when we discuss the logic in Great pritain and tho United Status. It is incre Ameracan exponets of Absolute Transcendence, but he has man fol known haropeans;2 Retaiold Bisbuhr is the most prolific of the evident. Barth, Brunner and Paul Millich are p shaps the beat Barth this tendency tourid circumicouples will become painfally If one will spend an evening with the volumes produced by Kara theology can be written, makes their style prolinged Cliffes. sortytural and traditional language is the anly language in which support for every statement they make, and that what stence that Melr obsession with the most for southfurst try oxerrarae. smorring from big impaints - Their writings are, in the main, extensing men whose theology we have in mind. The Earthian group in waroles and their Mec-Orthodox adherents the America are both the bent we propose to exemine, we shall list some of the better known To designate more specifically the type of religious thought

It may appear paradoxical to titempt an enalysis of the logic of Absolute Transcendence when its primary emchasts is a domist of the capacity of reason to reach truth is incortant the like. In fact, D. C. Macintach discussed this theology as a phase of "reactionary irrationalism." Butthereis a "logic" characteristic of Absolute Transcendence more closely related to other schools of theological though than one imagines at first glance. It is this logic which we now examine.

The logic of Absolute Immuneste rests upon the Law of Excluded Middle. This law as used here may be formulated as follows:
Human life must behieve its pre-Fall status. If it cannot do so in "natural" terms, then its only recourse is to the supernatural. With this basic assumption, the method used in Absolute Transcendence is comparatively simple. Every evil found in personal life or society is attributed to human sin. All attempts at social reconstruction which stem from human or natural sources are judged by an absolute standard: I f they fail to reach perfection at any point, they are condemned. Finally, recourse is had to the scripture as a source of Knowledge of God and as a guide to human action.

This type of logic comes to clear expression in Reinhold Niebuhr's work on the philosophy of history. 4 He begins with a refutation of the idea of history as a redemptive process, an idea held by many thinkers in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth centuries. It was believed that change was under way, and that all change was for the better. What this "better" meant underwent some change, of course. Niebuhr notes the following definitions of the term: To some it meant "increasing physical comfort and well-being;" to others it meant the unification of all mankind: To still others it meant the progressive democratization of all areas of life, and life in all areas: to still others it meant the growth of reason as dominant over natural impulses.5 More recently, there has been some agreement that freedom and rationality are the essential goals of history as a redemptive process. The growth of educational statistics and the spreading interest in the "common man" are indicative of this consensus. Virtue was believed to be a consequence of the achievement of democracyand intelligence. 6

We have observed an increase in educationin de nocratization. What are the results? Niebuhr answers this in his own inimitable way. Look at the mess in which the world now finds itself! What more is needed to provide absolute and complete refutation of the theory that history is a redemptive process? History for Niebuhr, is "not a realm of conflict." The conflict results from the rise of new forces and forms of life, " Which challenge the old and established. There is also another conflict indicated by miebuhr. It is that which grows out of man's relations to two worlds: the world of common sense, science and technology, and the world of thought, feelings and imagination. The first is the public world of events; the second the realm of personal appreciation and decision. There has been a steady development of knowledge and control in the realm of nature, but this has not been paralleled by comparable control in the sphere of the moral. Thus man finds it possible to do more things without at the same time reaching any clearer conceptions of the reason for so doing. He meets more people without at the same time entering into deeper fellowship with them. This is a suggestion presented with clarity and precision by E. G. Lee, in "Mass Man and Religion. >

is it of the control of the control

The logic of Absolute Manuello restrance in Secinded Middle. This law as used bere way be formulated as follows: Human life must cohieve its present status. If it cancet is so in "natural" terms, then its coly resourse is to the supernatural. With this basic escumption, the method used in Absolute Transcanded is comparatively simple. Every cvil found in personal life or society is catality to eathouse to human sin. All attempts at social reconstruction which stem from human or natural sources are judged by an absolute standard: I f they fail to reach perfection at any point, they are condemned. Finelly, recourse is bed to the scripture as a source of Knowledge of God and as a guide to has action.

This type of logic comes to clear expression in Relabold Bieboby's work on the philosophy of history. A. He begins with a reduction of the idea of history as a redemptive process, an idea hald by many thinkers in the lighteenth and Wireteenth centuries. It was believed that change was under way, and that all change was for the better. What this "better" meant underwent some change, of course. Wisher notes the following defluitions of the total of the some it meant "increasing physical comfort and well-being? to course the meant the undilabition of all sombind: To atlif to meant the progressive democratication of all areas of life; and it meant the progressive democratication of all areas of life; and life in all areas: to still others it meant the growth of reason life in all areas: to still others it meant the growth of reason ocan some corresponds of history as a redomptive process. The growth of constitutional the statistics and the spreading interest is the "conson and are seeded as a testical forces to the conson and the spreading interest is the "conson and are are sequence of the consoner of democracy and intelligence. C

We have observed an increase in educationin deporatization.
What are the results? Hebuhr answers this in his con inhaltable
way. Loot at the mess in which the world now finds itself!
What more is needed to provide absolute and complete releastion
of the theory that history is a redemptive process? History
for Hisbuhr, is "not a realm of conflict." The conflict results
challenge the old and established. The conflict results
flict indicated by the bubr. It is that which grove octor
flict indicated by the worlds: the world of conformation of and and
and technology, and the vorld of thought, feelings and inclination.
The first is the public world of events; the second the realm
of personal appreciation and decision. The realm of nature
development of knowledge and control in the realm of nature,
but this has not been paralleled by comparable obtained at
things without at the sens time reaching my observe conceptions
of the reason for so doing. He meets mare paceled with clarity
is a suggestion presented with clarity.

The sene time entering into deeper fellowship with there.

and precision by 5. G. Lee, in "Mass dan and delicion."

History is the realm of the ambigious: It gives evidence itself of no final goal, although it is ever the scene of goals claiming finality. Meaning in history, for Niebuhr and the Absolute Transcendental school in general, means ultimate meaning. Since there is no ultimate meaning in history, and since it contains no final goal, history is rejected as non-redsmptive) There is no redemption without finality and ultimacy for Absolute Transcendence. With this as the test of history, the result is not unexpected. History is dismissed as relative, unfinished, imperfect, and inadequate.

If history is not redemptive, where is salvation to be found? The answer is stated clearly by the men under consideration. There are but two possible sources from which help can come: From man and nature itself, or from God or the Absolutely Transendent. Man and nature having been proven inadequate, our hope is confined to God. And the God whom Niebuhr means is the God of the Bible. More than half of "Faith and History" is devoted to the presentation and application of the "Biblical" faith.

Barth, Brunner and others of this school use similar logics. They assume that perfection—the replization of unlimited possibilities—constitutes the goal of life. They observe, in the mean time, that everthing is permeated with imperfections. Knowledge is relative; metaphysical systems are many, each claiming to be true and each asserting that without its use further knowledge is impossible. They observe the plans formulated which are presented as approaches to a higher life for mankind: The League of Nations, The United Nations, the Marshall Plan, the Atlantic Pact; they see various forms of government—monarchy, democracy, fascism and communism, each claiming to be superior to all of the others, and yet each bearing the marks of its own imperfections where every one may see them. Mankind, so they assume, was made for perfection, yet imperiection and worse abound.

This is also the logic of Recent Humanism. If God is, argue the Humanists, then man must be absolutely certain of His existence, and all evils must be removable within the foreseeable future. Yet when they look about themselves, what do they discover? Knowledge of God is impossible because of its very bulk, according to Harry Elmer Barnes; or man's knowledge of God is hypotheticl and therfore relative, according to Walter Lippmann; or man stands in no need of God anyway, according to A. E. Haydon. Thus both the religious Absolutists and the religious Humanists agree that if God exists, the final fulfillment of human hopes is not only possible but inevitable.

But at this point agreement ceases. The Religious Humanist concludes that since absolutes are unavailable, there is no truth in the system of ideas presented. We noted the basis of this in a recent issue of this journal. We hat does the fieligious Absolutists do in the face of similar evidence?

Account to the section of the subligious: It gares evices to the state of the state of the section of the secti

If history is not rederptive, where is salvation to be found? The answer is stated clearly by the men noner consideration. There are but two possible sources from which help can come: brom men and netwer itself, or from God or the Absolutely Transendent. Men and nature having been proven inadequate, our hope is confined to God. And the God whom Miebuhr means is the God of the Bible. More than half of "Faith and "Mistory" is devoted to the presentation and application of the "Biblical" faith.

Harth, Brunner and others of this school use similar logics. They assume that perfection. The roulisation of unlimited possibilities.—consistutes the goal of lise. They observe, in the mean time, that everthing is permeated with imperfections. Endwiedge is relative; metaphysical systems are many, cach claiming to be true and each asserting that without its use further knowledge is impossible. They observe the plans formulated which are presented as approaches to a higher life for menkind: The Lergue of Nations, The United Eatlons, the Marshall Flan, the Atlantic Fact; they see various forms of government—monarchy, democracy, fascism and communitan, each claiming to be superior to all of the others, and yet each bearing the marks of its own imperfections where every one may see then. Menkind, so they assume, was made for perfection, yet imperfection and worse abound.

This is also the logic of Recent Humanian. If 704 is, ergue the Humanists, then man must be absolutely certain of this existence, and all evils must be removable within the foreseeable future. Yet when they look about themselves, what do they discover? Knowledge of God is impossible because of its very belt, amording to Harry Elmer Barnesior man's mowledge of God is hypotheticl and therfore relative, according to walter hippmans; or man stands in no need of God anyway, according to A. E. Haydon. Thus both the religious anyway, according the religious Hamanists agree that if God exists; the final fulfillment of human hopes is not only possible but inevitable.

But at this point agreement ceases. The Rell jous Humanist concludes that since absolutes are unavallable, there is no truth in the system of ideas presented. We noted the basis of this in a recent issue of this journal. We what does the Religious Absolutists on in the face of similar evidence?

He assumes that the goals of God must find fulfillment. and that these goals include what we have here carled perfection. If it cannot be found in historic processes, then it must be found in some tranhistorical situation. The same thing obtains in the case of truth. If there is absolute truth, an assumption made by the Absolutist, and if it cannot be found by means of human research and other methods of discovery, then God must provide men access to it in some other way. The way which these men accept as God's other method is revelation, and more specifically, the Biblical revelation. But method is not the fundamental question: Why assume that there is absolute truth, and that this absolute truth is a prerequisite to human salvation? Until this question is raised and insisted upon, the logic of Absolute Transcendence will maintain itself. If it is driven out of the scriptural stronghold. it will take refuse in the creeds; when these fall, it will take refuge in the "religious value of Jesus Christ," with the Ritschlians. Finally, with the Roman Catholic Church, is can take refuge in an infallible Pope. (The basic factor in the logic of Absolute Transcendence is the assumption that there is an absolute truth without which life cannot achieve its higher levels, and that justice demands that it be available to us in some way. All other matters are secondary and perioheral.

why assume the possibility of Absolute truth? The Absolutist believes he can just by this belief. In a recent book by E. G. Lee, "Mass Man and Religion," a book that won the United Nations Competition Prize of ten thousand pounds, a dirge is sung over the loss of absolutism in religion. Lee asserts that this loss has shaken life to its depths. With its removal, man lost his sense of worth, his feeling of individuality, and his personal dignity. He became "massmam." He no longer lives, works and thinks as an individual; he thinks en masse, works en masse, lives, en masse. The individual per se is becoming extinct; the mass is absorbing his meaning and his significance.ll

These things have happened to man, according to Lee, because he has lost faith in any final direction for human living. Without an absolute goal of life, no moral demand can be absolute. If we do not know where we are going, how can we assume that any given change is absolutely right or necessary? Man no longer knows why he is here, why the world exists, or what his final destiny may be. That is to say, he may have theories which he accepts as half or more than half true, but no one of them is accepted as finally, ultimately, absolutely true. Under such circumstances, he takes refuge in the mass. At least, if he is headed the wrong way, he will not be alone in so doing! This is the situation, and this the reasoning which bee believes produced mass man. What such men overlook, of course, is that those with whom they join themselves are as irrevocably lost as they are. The mass like the single individual, is also lost.

The solution which Lee offers is that it is necessary to restore faith in some Absolute. He does not believe we can restore the Absolute proposed by Earth, Brunner, Niebuhr and others since this assumes a world-view impossible for mordern man.

Toneral. to wa in some way. All other matters are secondary and perhigher levels, and that justice demands that it be available there is an absolute trash without which life cannot sobleve lis the legic of Absolute Transcendence is the Essumption that can take refuge in an infallible Pope. The basic factor in Finally, with the Roman Gatholic Oh roh, MO the Riceollians. hold, it will take refuse in the creeds; when these fall, it will take refuse in the "religious value of desus Carlab," with and insisted upon, the logic of absolute Transcendence will maintain liself. If it is driven out of the sort tural strongprerequialte to human salvetion? Until this question is raised there is absolute truth, and that this absolute truth is a But arthoc is not the fandamental question: Why assume that reveletion, and more specifically, the Mabileal revelation. er portros zerro e 1909 es edecte de centra apres serrica de es en esta de esta de esta de esta de esta de esta Checovery, ther God mast provide men access to it in some chier he found by means of homen research and other motheds of trach, or essamption made by the Absolutist, and if it canact same thing obtains in the case of truth. If there is absolute It many be found in some translatories situation. The rug puns (anac Tours ruchase who e no have bero central pers and bear tapes goals include who e no have bero central pers He base the thirt ame justs not lot apple along that hatelevers

Defloves he can just by this beilef. In a recent book by E. Q. Lee, "Mass Man and Religion," a book that won the United Mattons Composition Prize of ten thousand pounds, a dirie is sung over the loss of absolutism in religion. Lee asserts that this loss has shaken life to its depths. With its remaindal, man lost his sense of worth, his feeling of individuelity, and his personal dignity. He became "massamm" he no longer lives, works and thinks as an individual; he thinks an masse, works en masse, lives, en masse. The individual per so is becoming extinct; the mass is absorbing his meaning and his selunitance. Il

These things have happened to man, according to Lee, because he has lost faith in any final direction for human living.

Without an absclute soal of life, no moral demand can be absolute. If we do not know where we are going, how can we assume that any given change is absolutely right or necessary? Man no longer knows why he is here, why the world exists, or what his final destiny may be. That is to say, he may have theories which he accepts as half or more than half true, but no one of them is accepted as finally, ultimately, absolutely true. Under such circumstances, he takes refuge in the mass. At least, if he is headed the wrong way, he will not be alone in so doing? This is the sltuation, and this the reasoning which hee believes produced mass man. What such men everlook, o. course, to that those with whom they join themselves are as irrevocably lost as they are. The mass line the single individual, is also lost.

The solution with the outern to that it is necessary to analysis falls solution of the solutio

It must be an absolute which lies back of and beyond the myths and stories men tell to make moral demands meaningful to themselves. "What is the way out? The present spiritual difficulty, in the name of faith, demands a new exercise offaith. It demands that men should fight their way out of absolute claims, to an acknowledged truth above them." 12 There appear to be two affirmations in Lee's proposals. First, that men must have an absolute faith; but secondly, they dare not believe that they know what this absolute faith is, or what its source is. What men need is a "poise of spirit, a withholding of conviction from what is obviously temporal, and yet a reserve of conviction flunginto what is eternal and universal." 13

Stated in other language, the justification which is offered for the assumption that there is absolute truth and absolute justice is that men need such belief if they are to remain men. It constitutes an absolute claim made by men upon the sources of their being for that which will permit them to remain human and humane. Despite any criticism one may offer of those who hold to the theory of Absolute Transcendence, he must admit that they are concerned with what they firmly believe to be the "crisis of our age." Any sttempt tosweep them aside as "reactionary irrationalists" cannot be taken seriously, at least not with reference to the leadership if the movement. They are thoroughly convinced that humanity is lost, in a personal and ultimate sense, and that its recovery of an absolute sense of moral direction. Relativity, so they claim, in so far as knowledge of the ultimate nature of things is concerned, is an ompossible basis for the maintenance of human dignity and worth.

It is possible to understand this logic of Absolute Transcendence. It is recognized that human life at a relatively high level assumes the possession by persons of a given quantum of security and sighificance. These values were possible to men in a rural society in close and intimate relationships of family and community life. Families themselves were large; they supplied most if not all of their own food, clothing, shelter and even their own social life. In the neighborhood where they lived was the cemetery, its crude stones marking the passing generations, and the babes in arms symbolizing the coming and future generations. Security and significiance were there. There was continuity in the land one owned and cultivated; in the stable community life; in the family life spanning the three or more generations living under one roof. The very of form of human existence made possible a rather high degree of security.

There was significance, also. The family had often cut its own farm out of the wilderness, or dug out the stones and built fences with them which encircled their livestock or protected their gardens. It was "our" family which did this; which built the homes, and dug the wills, and built the fences. Next door, half a mile or so away, dwelt another family which had done similar things on a comparable piece of ground. Together they built the school-house, the church, and the roads leading to them and to the markets.

distributed, to the second in the second of the contract of th

Stricd in other language, the justification which is offered for the assumption that there is subsolute truth and absolute justifuct an need such belief if they are to remain men. It consitutes an absolute claim made by men upon the sources of their being for that which will permit them to remain human and humans. Despite any criticism one may offer of those who hold to the theory of Absolute Transcendence, he must admit that they are concerned with what they itemly believe to the crists of our age. Any strengt tosweep them aside as "reactionary irrationalists" cannot be taken seriously, at lesst not with reference to the leadership if the movement. They are thoroughly convinced that humanity is lost, in a personal and ultimate sense, and that has recovery of an absolute sense of moral direction. Helstvity, a they claim, in so tax as knowledge of the ultimate mature of things is concerned, is an empossible bests for the mature of things is concerned, is an empossible bests for the mature of things is concerned, as an empossible bests for the mature

It is possible to undersized this logic of Absolute Erruscendence. It is recognized that human like at a relatively
high level assumes the possession by parsons of a given quantum
of security and sightificance. These values nere cossible to
men in a rural sockety in close and intimate relationships of
family and community life. Families themselves nere large;
they sup lied most if not all of their own food, clothing,
shelter and even their own social life. In the neighborhood
where they lived was the cemetary, its crude stones marking
where they lived was the cemetary, its crude stones marking
the passing generations, and the bebos in arms cymbolising the
coning and future generations. Security and significiance were
there. There was continuity in the land one owned and chitivated
in the stable community life; in the land one owned and chitivated
in the stable community life; in the family life spanning the
three or more generations living under one roof. The very
form of human existence made possible a rather high degree of
security,

There was significance, also. The family had often out its own farm out of the wilderness, or dug out the stones and built fences with them which encircled their livestook or protected their livestook or protected their gendens. It was "our" family which did this; which built the homes, and dug the wills, and built the fences. Hert door, half a mile or so away, dwelt another lamily which had done similar things on a comparable place of ground. Hogether they built the school-house, the church, and the reading to the markets.

Each individual and each family had a place in the community; each had literally built itself into the life and landscape about it. (Significance, defined as status in the life and thought of others, found a natural home in such a culture.)

This type of social life served as a matrix, also, for the growth and maintenance of the conception of an ultimate and unchanging goal for human life. The unchanging, or at least hardly perceptable changing of life of the times produced a mentality adjusted to permanence and finality. Thus the idea of an absolute truth embedded in a revealed Scripture, could maintain itself with little difficulty. It was the change to a dynamic culture by the industrial revolution in the past two centuries, and the consequent mobility of mankind, which produced the "new mentality," A mentality which accepts change, modification, revision, and invention as the basic characteristic ofreality. It is this change, with the concomitant expansion of the areas of tension in the modern world, which present to the Absolutist his problem. We can now reformulate it: How can one find the poise and serenity presumably normal in a static culture in a highly dynamic and competitive society? Like the ancient prophets, modern Absolutists would call men back to the ancient ways.

The Absolutist is fighting a real battle. Any man who fails to recognize the reality of the difficulty which they confront is actually more blind than they are. They are not concerned, primarily, with saving either the authority of scripture or the finality of traditional doctrines. They seek to save them becouse they believe that only through the Biblical tradition can individuals find security and significance, and cultures rise out of the morass engulfing them. To miss this interest of Absolutism in religious thought is to miss what is essential to it.

The rise of modern Absolute Transcendence and its growth f followed rather closely upon the rise and spread of absolutism in economic and political fields. Karl Marx devoted himself to the development of an absolute ethic for the poor and dispossessed when the effects of industrialization and increasing mobility became evident in the late nineteenth century. The loss of security and significance was felt more quickly in these realms than in the ethical and religious, and the reaction to it occurred earlier. Fascism in Italy and National Socialism in Germany, as well as Communism in Russia, were later and overt responses to the same situation. Even the progressive socialization of western Europe and England appear to be oriented toward the same problem. The distinctive characteristic in each case is the same: The economic security and the sense of personal worth found in large families and an agricultural economy were gone or going rapidly, and men sought desperately for some new foundations for human life.15

The logic of Absolute Transcendence is the logic of every absolutism of the present day. As such, it cannot be met by "logic-chopping," by purely academic criticism, or by pointing to more adequate interpretations of the crisis and to more efficient ways of meeting it.

Not served the actabacture is an electrical consistency of the plant of the probacture of the control of the co

The Absolution is fighting a real babile. Any was the fells to receptate the reality of the difficulty which they confront is schooling accounty which they concern to reality, which they see ack concerns, primarily, which maying either the anthoxity of corty or the finality of traditional doctrines. They even to cortetion become they believe that doctrines. They even to cortetion can individuals find only through the Diblical testition on a individuals find the segment the rise of a corses enguliing them. He miss this intercet of the religious they them. He miss this intercet of the responsibility the second of the second of

The rise of modern Absolute Fransoendopee and tes growth f Kollowed rether closely upon the rise and appead of abundantian in economic and political fields. Kart Mary devoted bluepill to the development of an absolute state for the pres was also gethemore of bug, most sailaigteubul lo sigotte ent denn bessessen nobility became ovident in the late mideteenth certury. The loss of security and significance were felt more quickly has these realms than in the othical and religious, and the resuring to it occurred coriller. Heschen in Lialy and Mathunai Bogishises in Carmany, as well so Communism in Russia, nere labar and aviscospore ode mora modiscusita ensa odi oe ecanopaer inevo socialization of vestern turope and Ingland appace to be are lented toward the same problem. The distinctive characteristic in esch case in the same: The economic security and the sense issufficient found in large families and the eguleriturel economy were game or going repidity, and gen non-jur descension for some men foundeflone for brown life. If

The logic of Absolute Transcendence is the logic of every absolution of the prosent day. As such, it created by actify "logic-coopping," by warely seadente cristociam, or by polaring to more edequate interpretations of the crists and to nore edequate therefore.

That mankind is facing a major crisis as a result of the emergence of new and revolutionary forces which are shaking the foundations of personal security and personal worth is evident to ever observant person. But this observation of itself does not justify the logic of Absolute Transcendence, or for that matter, of any other absolutism of our day. (The adequacy of the Absolutist logic may be determined by raising two questions: (1) Is the specific logic of Absolute Transcendence necessary? (11) If so, how feasible or possible is it? The second question may need some explication or justification. Granted that cancer is a source of danger to human survival. at least, at certain ages, and that a cure for it is necessary, if we are to live long and well, we still face the question: Can we find a cure for it, or must we adjust ourselves to relatively adequate healthand happiness in a world where cancer obtains? 16 One may thus agree with the Absolutists that some further basis for human life meeds to be found in this highly dynamic age without at the same time accepting their specific solution to the problem. It is not enough to point to a desired goal. One must then consider the possibility of its achievement in whole or in significant part.

The first assertion of Absolute Transcendence concerns the nature of man's historical experience. They assume that neither nature nor history offer men any hope of a successful attack upon the present crisis. Hope for them is found only in non-historical or trans-historical forces and goals. How much truth is there in this assertion?

It may be observed that the progress which has occured in human history has resulted from pursuit of proximate goals with limited but definitely human knowledge. The lengthening of the span of haman life from an estimated twenty-five years at the beginning of the Christian era to more than sixty years in the west today did not depend upon absolute truth nor upon final goals. Physicians battle diseases despite the fact that they know each individual has a limited life-expectancy. The change from an economy of scarcity in agriculture to one of abundundance did not result from the possession of absolute knowledge. It was the result of piece-meal attack upon specific problems such as soil sterility, transportation, improvement of Grains and stocks and similar interests.

It may be observed that the assumptions basic to scientific work are sometimes believed to be absolute presuppositions. These assumptions may be treated by some scientists as final, at the same time, they are subject to change without prior notice whenever the results of experimental or theoretical invertigations suggests the advisability of so doing. Thus nature is believed to be orderly. But this conception has been under attack for some time. This statement from the science editor of a highly respected newspaper presents one phase of this. "It is an humble and unpretentious science which now faces the world, for all its startling discoveries about stars and atoms. Most of the cocksure laws that once served to explain everthing, from the wheeling of the planets to the constitution of matter, have been swept away. In their stead we have statistical averages, statements of probabilities, theorems in higher geometries.

The control of the co

The first sesertion of Absolute Transcendence concorns the nature of man's bistorical experience. They assuce that Reliber assuce nor history offer men any hope of a successful criseck upon the present artists. More for then found only an now-historical or trans-historical forces and goals, for the first feath for the table to the these in this assertion?

Lt may be observed that the progress witch has connected an name history has resulted from purents of provide to positive with 11. Lanted but definitely human knowledge. The longthenth, or the span of head line from an estimated ineath-fire years at the beginning of the Okristian era to mere than shall never to he beginning of the Okristian era to mere than shall never the line of the peaks of the stations bettle diseases despite the free true from grace each individual has a limited lifter-expectancy. The chance from the posmession of also into the line from the posmession of absolute moviedge. It was the result of place-meal attack upon special or problems sack stone and stations and stations and claims and claims.

It may be observed that the assumptions beste to solentiste work are sometimes believed to be absolute presuppositions. I these easumptions hay be tracted by some solentists as three; the same time, they are subject to change without prior solice whenever the results of experimental or theoretical invertigitions suggests the advisability of so colange. Thus mature is boliceved to be orderly, but this conception has been under attack for some time. This statement from the science editor of a bighty respected nowspaper presents one phase of this. "It is an about maple and unpretentious colence which now faces the world, for all like startling discoveries about stars and stons. Hest of the cocksure laws that once served to emplain everthing, from the observed of the places to the problem. In their stead we have substitutions income, have been suc the probabilistics, where the the probabilistics, where

Gone is ether of Maxwell, that extraordinary complex of gears, squirts, jellies, vortices, tenuities and rigidities which once served to explain the transmission of light, heat and magnetism. Gone is the 'force' that made stones fall to the ground. Gone, too, are cause and effect. This is a cosmos in which chance rules, in which there is room for free will—and hence for the poet, artist and mystic as an interpreter of reality."18 This appeared in 1933, nine years before the achievement of the first chain reaction which resulted in the atom bomb. Scientific assumptions are regulative principles which control investigations. Their validity 1 s canstantly under question. They determine the methods men use in the investigation of nature; they do not determine the conclusions which men will reach as a result of these investigations.

This means that the advances made in modern science with the consequent developments in modern technology are not dependent either upon final goals nor upon absolute truth. It may be necessary, as Absolutists assert, to have ultimate truth and transhistorical goals to guide and stimulate men in their quest for security and significance in moral and religious realms, but they are not necessary for those who investigate the pain-producing factors in life, and devise means whereby the incedence of such factors is reduced. This is a solid body of evidence which denies the assertions of the Absolutists, a body of evidence which cannot be swept carelessly to one side. If those of us who seek to alleviate the social and political ills of mankind cannot function efficiently in terms of proximate goals and relative knowledge, we must confess that we are lesser men than those who function in matters of health, food production, and related values. This is a conclusion theologians and philosophers should be slow to accept.

We should investigate the possibility of adopting proximate goals and partial truth in our quest for a just and orderly society. There are no priori reasons why this approach will not achieve comparable goals in the ethical and religious fields. It has had comparatively good results in our treatment of criminals, we have been becoming progressively more humane in our treatment of those who for various reasons engage in activities which "impair and endanger its (the community's) internal peace and security."19 When absolute or supernatural standards obtained in a society, little progress occured in the treatment of the criminal. When psychological and sociological factors bearing upon criminal behavior were subjected to critical investigation, it became possible to establish proximate goals and to work toward their achievement with the knowledge and skills available. The criminal became a person with problems for which society was believed to be in part responsible rather than a deviator from absolute standards. So far as the treatment of criminals is concerned, history has been, in part, a redemptive process. This is a fast which can be documented, and which has been so established. 20

If this is true, then the logic of absolute transcendence must be modified. Its logic rests, as plinted out above, upon the Law of Excluded Hiddle: There is no middle ground between absolute truth and ultimate goals and no truth and no goals.

The state of the control of the cont

Whis is a conclusion theologians and philosophers should be obser function in matters of mealth, food production, and redució refor and a sing the wastern of the course of the office extractoring in terms of proximate godie and malabile for allowing the social and politican filts of monicing connected The asparthons of the Absolutility as pody of evidence district TROGOTA TO ESPECIOS . ADTO DE SE SOLITO DOGA OT CATOSIAS ATTOM OF gelejoure yn gyfa' sug dellifel gante brokep's gige gwêre eele ey ei ei ဗာနားမှာ အတွင့် အာဏမစ္စစ္စစ်နည်း **ဥာမနာ နည္းမာနာ နည္းမာနာနည္းပါတည္။ ဥာမ** အတွင္အမည္းမည္။ ၁၅၂၈ security and algaitiennes in marai and relidious vesting in value gradokitovy Voceta io Sarbe suce astinlako mėji iu sauvi daral med eseuni, su absolutuos orgion whom thurs Corys now offen apsorage imager the beside the pro consecuent competence of the consecuent at a consecuent of the GOTTE BUTCH WATCHOU BY BEING BERGE PUR BUTCH WOLLD IN BUTCH

redamptive process. This is a fast which can be decimenable, and writch has been so established.20 ment of criminals is concerned, history has been, in wart, a -altera one of Mot og "somd und confosde medt detallage e und tous match society was believed to be in part reconnible well all was auffir avaitable. The critinal became a person with problems and to work toward their achievement with the knowledge and vestagution, it became possible to cutablish proximate gosla beering uon original behavior were subjected to oritiael the of the extainal. When paychological and sociological decreas talmed in a society, little progress occured in the fractions and securiff." 19 Mhom absolute or supermitations and sade above walch "impair suo cadenger les (the community/s) laternal pance ment of those who lar versons respons engly e in rectivities He have been becoming progressively more hunans in our trashpad comparatively good results in our treatment of extannels. There are no priori rescons who take approach will and achieve comparable goals in the ethical and religious liakes. It has goels and perthal truth in our quest for a junt and erderly soons Re should investigate the possibility of adopting prospacto

Li tang lo true, then the logic of choolete frommenderes nast **le modiniel. L'ola logic rouste,** re labeld rum (1917), com tae have el **Mroladsé** lifédier labele follocità del la grande recorde re chealtae frathe esdeultura to joils and comparte recorde recorde. History contains no absolute truth and no ultimate goals. Therefore, history contains no truth and no goals. It is not enough to prove that history contains no goals, proximate or ultimate, and no truth , proximate or ultimate. The evidence from the fields of agriculture and medicine indicates that history has contained proximate goals and proximate truth. In fact, the evidence available indicates that only in historic processes are there any significant goals and any usable truth. It was in historic situations that men learned the causes of suffering and untimely death, and discovered, piece-meal, how to avoid the first and postpone the second. It was in historic processes that men learned how to investigate the processes of nature and to turn them to human use: it was in historic processes that some steps have been taken to divert "man's inhumanity to man," in not all arears, certainly in some areas and to some degree. The evidence available does not support the thesis of Niebuhr and does not support others that only in absolute truth and in transhistory may we hope torealize some of the goals of human living.

The second question raised above concerning the logic of Absolute Transcendence may now be raised: Assuming that absolute truth and a final, transhistorical goal would be helpful in the realization of the ideals maintained by Absolute Transcendence, what are the chances that either is possible? In other words, how feasible are the proposals of the exponents of Absolute Transcendence? A brief glance at cultural development should enable us to answer these questions. Religion has always been oriented toward non-manipulative aspects of human experience. It has faced death, unpredictable disasters, incurable diseases; it has guided nations faced by others with superior power and aggressive tendencies, and has helped meet the conflicts and frustrations witch result from human impulses checked by limiting environmental factors. These situations have meant the difference between happiness and unhappiness, between successful and unsuccessful living, between poise and serenity on the one hand and anxiety and distress on the other. Facing such conflicts and frustrations, men have sought in religion for ways whereby the non-manipulative conditions could be removed, or for compensation in a larger environment for the conflicts and frustrations here. It was in situations such as this that men have engaged in what John Dewey calls "the quest for certainty," and which he has documented at length. 21

Since all knowledge which grows out of "action," Dewey's word for what we call behavioral verification, is relative knowledge or proximate knowledge and is therefore subject to change in the light of new experiences or deeper analysis of past experience, the "quest for certainty" has normally taken an other direction. The ancient Greeks used the device of depreciating the world of nature, the realm of action and behavioral verification. Thus the uncertainty which characterized "natural" knowledge was an uncertainty confined to the realm of Being. Knowledge of Being had to be achieved by non-empirical means. The Platonic Theory of Reminiscences which assumes the presence in the zoul at birth of all truth represents one such attempt to justify confidence in absolute truth. 22

CONTROLLED CONTROLLED

To older and watersonce evods beater activesup baces and stated at the state of the vone van some baces of the state of th

a "yews" "at the tro avory ablance of the sollow and an any sering a sylvast and the sollow and the collow and collow and the collow and the collow and collow and the collow and coll

The division of reality into levels is still characteristic of the "Great Tradition" in philosophy and in Absolutistic theologies.

Among primitive and savage peoples, this quest for certainty took the form of "Metanossis." By metanossis we mean the attempt to arrive at reliable knowledge by other than normal means, 23 Such peoples have used metanoesis at every point in human experience where the situation appeared to be presentous or nonmanipulative. The story of augury, divinity, and other devices in the ancient world in the attempt to diagnose diseases is a pathetic tale, one which serves to refuteconclusively any attempted defense of metanoesis. The use of these and similar methods to forecast the results of impending battles, and most propitious times for initiating important ventures, and other matters of equal interest with similar failure or indifferent success attributable to coincidence, is well known. Certainly the evidence from man's long flightagainst disease and famine is sufficient to prove that truth is found by the questing mind of man in ways which can be charted, and whose results can be predicted with some accuracy. The quest for absolute certainty has been, to the present at least, a misguided quest. We have access to proximate truth, and possess methods and instruments whereby we may correct and refine it progressively. For better or worse, we must live with and by proximate, not absolute truth.

The basis uponwhich the theology of Absolute Transcendence rests is thus suject to serious criticism. Granted that a man can make absolute demands upon himself and his environment, this fact alone does nor guarantee him sucess in either situation. Nor is it possible to assume that since he can make absolute demands, and since neither man nor nature can fulfill them, that therefore there must be a supernatural realm where they may find fulfillment. Men have lived thus far in terms of proximate goals and proximate truth. They have won relief from many forms of pain-producing situations, and release from many forms of superstition and error by utilizing to the full the knowledge and idealism available. We are finite, and accordingly must be content with finite results. The logic of absolute demand presupposes that we are not. Whether in the acons to come man may grow out of his finiteness is a matter which for the present must remain unknown. Honest, demands that we recognize our limitations, and then do our best within them to realize desirable proximate goals in terms of the most adequate information available tous. Time and energy devoted to the quest for absolute juliillment apparently has little more chance for success than that devoted to the search for perpetual motion.

ាលប្រជាពល ប្រធាន បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្ បានបង្ហើញ សមានី បានប្រជាពល ស្រាប់ ប្រធានសមាន បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល សមានី បានប ក្រុមក្រុមហ៊ុន សមានប្រជាពល ស្រាជាពល ប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល ប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល បាន dush yeo pica have saud water call at avant polet in human en-ាធាលា បាន ខាមមនិយាធម្មាយ ម៉ូស្ ១៩ ១៩ ម៉ែងបាងសម្បន ប្រជាពិធីសេសស៊ីនិង ១៩៣ សហសុវិយ ១០៣៦និយាពញ om of onletter of the stars of enging, divide in other devines of the same of the same of the start of the same vale, ore which mayres to refuledoncheskyely any ofvenythe Leienes or motencesie. Who was of these ast staties methods to forecast the yearlies of impending betailes, and most projections times for initiating important variety and biler metters of equal interest with cindler inline or indifficace with accordal Laupe butable to coinsidence, is well impus. Gartairly the arkforce iron and a long titybongoines discass ond fantne is nulfellens s prove that trade le reading por the guesting making of the trade which can be charted, and whose results oan be prodicted at the od jusež ech läblskavas sänlosts val äsenj tär - "seruhea carbalati the present at least, a missuided quest. We have necess to prove imate truth, and posseso methods and instruments whereby we may correct and retine it progressively. For better or worse, we must live with and by proximate, not absolute trubb.

The basis apparhich the theology of Absolute Iransvendence rests is thus suject to serious eriticism. Granted that a men can make absolute demands upon himself and bla environment, this fact slone does nor guerentee him sucess in either situation. Mor is it possible to assume that since he can make absolute demands, and since neither man nor nature can fulfill them, that therefore there must be a supernatural realm where they may find fulfillment. Hen have lived thus far in terms of proximate goals and proximate truth. They have won relief from many forms of pain-producing situations, and release from many forms of superstition and error by utilizing to the full the knowledge and idealism available. We are finite, and arcordingly must be content with finite results. The logic of absolute demand presupposes that we are not. Thether in the acons to come men may grow out of his finiteness is a metter which for the present mast remain Honosty cenerals that we recognize our Madischlous, and then do our boot within them to realize desireble proxime te goeth in terms of the most edequate information available tokks. That and energy devoted to the quest for absolute sulfillment appare ently has little more chance for success than that develod to the search for perputation.

Sons, 1989, p 28.

Dillich has been an American citizen since 1940, but his background training and much of his teaching and writing are Continental

- Macintosh, D. C., The Problem of Religious Knowledge, New York and London, Harper and Brothers, 1940, Chapter XIX
- Faith and History, New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1949
- Ibid. Po 4 ff Ibid., pp 70 ff 6.
- Ibid., pp 224 It is worth observing that Emil Brunner has practically the same conception of history. "no decisions are made in nature; history is the sphere of decision." Bronner, E. LRevelation and Reason, Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1946, p 403

Published at New York: Harper and Brothers, (undated)

10. The Hiff Review III No. 2 Spring 1946, pp 71 ff

- II. Lee, E. G., Mass Man and Religion, New York; Harper and Brothers, (undated), Chapter iv.
- 12. Ibid., p 156
- 13. Ibid., p 152 15. Fascism may now be studied as a completed episode. It indicates the way in which an absolutist philosphy emerges from unsatisfactory and apparently non-manipulative situations. Cf. Giovanni Genile, "The Philosophy of Fascism, " Foreign Affairs, Jan., 1929, pp 290-304; Spencer H. R. Government and Politics of Italy, New York 1932, Schoeide H. W., The Fascist Government of Italy, New York, 1936; Laski, H. The State in Theory and Practice, New York, 1935; Chamberlain, IWm H., The World's From Age, New York, 1941

16. This is said despite the fact that cancer is now being cured, especially under certain circumstances. Before a more adequate method of treating it is found, men will be compelled to live in a world where cancer

is ever a possibility.

17. Collingwood, R. G., An Essay on Metaphysics,

18. Kaempifert, W., "An Humbled Science Faces the World," New York Times Book Review, Nov. 19, 1933.

19. Kirckwey, G. W., "Criminal Law," The Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1931, IV, 569

20. Hocking, W. E. in Human Nature and Its Remaking, New Haven: Yale University Press, rev. ed., 1923, pp 188ff., traces this process in

21. Dewey, J., The Quest for Certainty, New York: Minton, Baich and Co. 1935

22, Meno, 81ff

This is developed at some length in my "Reason and Religion," The Journal of Bible and Religion," Vol XV, No. 3, July 1947 ppl33f

W. Daylogla of Second That may be

Theists Declesiastical Humanists and boolute Immanentalists. They agree that theology must be based upon experience, but differ prefoundly in the meanings which they attribute to different types of experience and in the significance which they are prepared to give to these different types. The result is, of course, the development of widely divergent theories in theology and philosophy of religion. Many reasons may be offered to account for these differences we propose, however, to investigate the hypothesis that the differences among these schools is due primarily to the adoption of different sets of initial assumptions. Involved in every theology - or philosophy of religion - is a logical method; basic to every method are certain assumptions, epistemological and often metaphysical in nature, which determine the degree of relevancy assigned to various types of data, and prescribe the test of truth which is believed to be applicable in the situation at hand. These basic assumptions are the water-sheds which determine the direction in which the theological stream shall flow. Until they have discovered and critically evaluated, it is doubtful that a given system is fairly universtood or legically examined.

In the previous volume of this journal, the logic of Ecclesiastical Humanism was presented and criticised. We propose now to subject recent below to the same type of examination and evaluation.

The term Their is used with at least two connectations today. In its more popular and inclusive meaning is may be defined as belief in God or Gods. Its antithesis in this case is atheism, defined as disbelief in God or Gods. In its more technical recent definition it may be said to mean that form of philosophy of religion in which the concept "person" is used as organizing principle; which conceives of God as esentially personal who not only transcends the world as its creator and sustainer, but who also dwells within it as its dynamic guide, inspirer, and empowerer in the development of ideal persons in an ideal society. This recent or "typical theistic personalism", to use Dean A. C. Knudson's term, probably derives from the philosophical thought of Leibniz (1646-1716), Berkeley (1685-1753), Kant (1724-1804), and Letze (1817-1881). It is this more recent theism we shall have in mind whenever we use the term, unless otherwise stated.

Involved in this form of Theism are at least three positive affirmations. The first defines the nature of God, the second the relation of God to man and the world, and the third the purposes of God for both man and the world. We shall examine these three affirmations in the writings of several well-known American theists. The men whose writings we shall consult are: W. Adams Brown, D. C. Macintesh, A. C. Knudson, H. F. Rall, H. P. Van Dusen, Walter Marshall Horton, Edgar Sheffield Brightman, R. T. Flewelling, and one whe died some years ago, but who has had great influence upon this form of theism, the late Borden Parker Bowne. Many others might be listed, but these men are representative enough of the general approach to serve as typical examples.

The Nature of God -

Theism maintains that God is personal. As Bowne stated it years ago, "A world of persons with a Supreme Person at the head is the conception to which we comas a result of our critical reflections." In various ways this conclusion is stated by contemporary Theists. "To us of the Western World, taught by Jesue to think of God as Father, the Werd God suggests a personal spirit, in some true sense akin to us, though infinitely superior, who has revealed himself

^{*} The Iliff Review, Vol. IV, No. 1, Winter, 1967

to us through the Cross of Christ as redemptive love."3 Brightman defines God as "a Supreme Person who embodies the highest goodness; that is, he is the source both of existence and value." 4 H.P. Van Dusen approaches this problem from the point of view of value. He believes that values are impossible apart from persons; that they are "themselves the expressions of the life and vision and intent of persons, "5 and therefore, if they are objective to individual persons or even the whole human race, they presuppose as the basis of their existence that "the Source and Purposer of the cosmic process in which our values appear must be thought of as personal."6 Walter Marshall Morton, after defining God as fully as the empirically-derived definition, "is a vast cosmic drift or trend toward harmony, fellowship, and mutual aid, whereby our efforts to create a just equilibrium in human affairs are supported or sustained."7 But this conception fails to satisfy what he believes to be the demands of religious faith, so he selects two great Christian figures, the late Baron Von Huegel and the late Studdert-Kennedy, who are noted for their emphasis upon certain aspects of deity. Studdert-kennedy is selected because of his insistence upon the Christ-likeness of God. God, for him, was essentially a Cosmic Christ, and so such, profoundly personal. On the basis of Kennedy's 'insight,' Horton affirmed the personality of God. 8 Harris Franklyn Ball, in his more recent works as well as his earlier ones, insists upon the personal nature of God. Approaching thas problem from the point of view of moral values, he believes God must be personal if these moral values are not to be subject to the destructivesness of things or brute force. "To believe in God means to believe that the final being and power in this world is not things or brute force, but a personal Spirit that is good. For these ideals and values cannot live as mere abstractions. Beauty exists only for minds that see and appreciate. Love and righteousness are mere abstractions except as they live in beings that can love and follow what is just and true. The world of moral experience points to God and depends on him. And in history, when men have ceased to believe in God the world of moral ideals has lost its reality for man and its authority for his life; and then human socie y moves on to collapse."9

There can be little doubt, in the light of any adequate examination of the writings of the men suggested, that they agree that God must be personal in some real sense. God is, in his essential nature, personal; so at least say the recent Theists.

Since the concept "personality" is so important in recent Theism, it is necessary to determine as precisely as possible the meaning conveyed by it. According to Bowne, "The essential meaning of personality is self-hood, self-consciousness, self-control, and power to know. These elements have no corporeal significance or limitation. Any being, finite or infinite, which has knowledge and self-consciousness and self-control is personal; for the term has no other meaning. "10 Furthermore, this entity entitled personality is incommensurable with those entities called "things." Il Brightman, a former student and sympathetic interpreter of Bowne, defines this general position as follows: "A self, then, is any conscious experience or process taken as a whole and as experiencing itself." And, as such, it is the "synthesizer of unity and multiplicity... Selfhood, then, is unity in variety, the true synthesis of the manifold. "12 The same position is held, with minor variations, by other Personalists such as Knudson and Flewelling. 13

e ja višaku teriku viševilja veloviju diali višak terilije traditi veloka izije teori viševit višekla u po Prakovje u višivi ja sektora izije tijak viji ja viševilik tradita. Prakovijak iš kontralis i teori viševili s Prakovijak ingresem vijak je sektalio stak višak se višaksio viševiliki i iš kilo sektorijak sektorijak te ing the state of t යන සංවත වෙන අතර මෙය. මෙය යන සංවත සංවත පත්වය වෙන පත්ව වෙන මෙය වෙන වෙන මේ වතාසම යන වෙන මේස්ත මෙයි වන වේෂණය වෙනස්සුවේ පත්ව වෙන සමුව මේස්ම් වෙන වෙන විසිණිය මේ විසිණිය මේ මේම්ම් මේ මේස් පත්ව වෙනව වන සූවීම් වෙනව සංවේඛ පුවුණයේ සිසිණින් සමුව විසිණු දුන්සෙනයක් විවිධිවණය සිය සාවේඛ්ම්ව් විසිණි මේම් මේ ound browns from the above become up were a LAR production to wire the latter by the on the a literary of elastics are given the title linear bun epidensities agree when with the To hardrades to bedrocom era entaits thered it maindiffice north light le chammad with an of operabled od does yealthe of allet scalings Saibh, ao ha colcobr hao greab Chebridan Sigures, bho lobo Papon has ing geri and the late foundant-Kennady, the are seted for their cachesis are assets as especia, of dative. Studiert dispert is calcoted because of his fixed brosts. upon the tindet-libraten of God. God, for bin, was assentiable a fe said Christ, and so such, profoundly personal. On the backs of Hearthre tansigut; Horbon attinned the personality of And. Brands transler tails. in his word recent works as well as his outlier ches, include the circulation sonal nature of Cot. Approaching this problem from the potent of view of to be subject to the destructivesness of things or brate large. The ballion to the manual of the bill the Sing bull boiling and parent is blick or whom both the bings or bigide for a personal spirit dirical factories and combined to by bings from or d velices carrot live as mare abstractions. Branky exicts only for ad the that see wid approciate. Nove and righteomeness ere more restrictions or Tops as they like in deings that tove over more bushes and in the last will be an entered and no sine of heart had belt as couldness some leader larger to be on sift eletory, then son have consed to believe in Cod the roald dr morel to ele has lost the roality for mon and its authority for his life; and then have encie y moves on to collegee. By

There can be libble touch, in the light of any adequate erostration of the writings of the reasonal that they agree that for must be paraously in some real name. One is in the escantial rature, personally so at least our the recent libbles.

Since the concord "personality" is so impertent in recently the consequence of the continue to determine as predictly as possible the assaing consequences at the consequence of personality is cultiment to be a consequence, at the consequence of this consequence of this significance of this is the consequence of this is a consequence of this is a consequence of this sequence of a consequence of self-consequence and self-control is personal; for the termination with the consequence of this sequence of this sequence of the consequence of the consequence of the consequence of this sequence of the consequence of the co

്ടെ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായത്ത് പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായിലെ വിശ്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായത്ത് പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യാ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായത്ത്ത് പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യം പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യം പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യം പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യം പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യായ പ്രത്യം പ്രത്യ From a somewhat different metaphysical approach, Horton reaches similar conclusions. He apparently has the same difficulty with the concept soul that he has with the concept God, namely, discontent with what the empirically-derived data permits him to hold. Personality may be defined, he states, "as a complex aggregate 'built up' out of simpler elements."14 These simpler elements are reflexes, which, when conditioned by the experiences of life, combine to form habits. The self or personality is a function of the psychophysical organization, or more specifically, of the habits in whose terms the fundamental biological impulses find expression. Thus far, Morton appears to have a monistic view of the human person; at least, he has so defined the self that the dualism of body-mind seems impossible. But he finds himself dissatisfied with this empirically-derived conception, especially when the problem of immortality is before him. Unable to find a basis for personal immortality in this view, he proceeds to add to it. He now defines personality somewhat differently. "Personality is not the product of the individual organism alone, but of a process of interaction bet een a group of organisms -- a process into which the whole cosmic environment ultimately enters as a supreme determining factor. Personality, as it grows, becomes less and less demendent unon its physical taproot, and more and more dependent upon social and cosmic sustenance. "15 In this way, Horton attempts to pave the way for belief in the persistence of the personality or self a ter the death or dissolution of the body

This leaves us, in effect, precisely where Bowne insisted one had to be. The celf is an entity separate and separable from the body, and characterized by intelligence, will, purpose, and some degree of self-direction or freedom. And God as personal must have these characteristics, at least. He has intelligence, self-consciousness, will, and purpose in his relations to our next problems.

Important as the term person is in the thinking of recent Theism, it does not exhaust the meaning which they assign to the term God. He is also transcendent and immanent.

God and the World

A.C. Knudson believes that the Theistic conception of God involves these three attributes: absoluteness, personality, and goodness. By absolute he means "the independent and self-existent cause or ground of a dependent world."16 This Absolute God is the creator of the world.17 As independent and self-existent cause, ground, or creator of the cosmos, God is of necessity transcendent to it. He must be more than that which he created, especially if he is believed to exist independently of it. The essential element in transcendence as emphasized by recent Theism is separation from the natural world in which human beings live, move and have their being. God must be other-than and more-than the world precisely because without being this he cannot help man in his difficulties. Professor Horton relates an incident which took place in a nonacademic group to which he was apparently speaking. A woman in the group remarked, "I wish that you would talk to us some time about "the impotence of God."18 The woman was referring to the recent conceptions of God, or cosmic deities which do not hold God to be a transcendent reality interpenetrating the world of nature; the gods to whom one would not pray for rain, for health, or for a job. If this element of transcendence is maintained, and Cod is believed to be a being who is free from the control and irreversibility of natural processes, then there is the possibility that he may step in and help in

time of need. This is the point which one may find if he examines carefully W. Adam Brown's study of the suprenatural, "God at Work." In discussing four characteristics of 'miracle faith' he mentions (i) man's sense of wonder aroused by various events; (ii) his consciousness of enlightenment, that is, his discovery of meaning in these events; (iii) his consciousness of enlargement of his resources, and (iv) his desire for certainty. Concerning the third characteristic, namely, man's counsciousness of an enlargement of his resources, Professor Brown wrote: "Here we reach the very heart of the religious man's belief in miracles. It is the way he confesses his faith in a God who can do new things, and who is doing them. The questions of religion are never the 0retical merely. They spring from a practical interest. Conscious of a hundred needs, outward and inward, the need of healing, of comfort, of forgineness, of renewal, of enfranchisement, man looks about him for some source of help adequate to his necessity. Is there or is there not some power that can meet his needs, heal his sickness, assuage his sorrow, bot out his guilt, renew his vitality, lift him above the limitations of his environment? Is God, or is he not, alive and free, able to meet present needs as well as the needs of the past, to act here and to act today? Miracle answers this question in the affirmative."19 And it is precisely this point of view that Horton stressed in his discussion entitled "The Future of Theism," printed as an epilogue to his "Theism and the Scientific Spirit." Whereas he believes we must have smaller and more human Gods, he is interested in a God who is other than the system of conditions called 'the natural world.' God, to be practically useful, must, according to Horton, be able to do things in the physical as well as in the moral and spiritual world.20 In other cases, the help sought is not physical. God is required as transcendent in order to help us understand the natural world. In his attempt to support his view that God is personal, Kaudson insisted that "the only rational ground for affirming an Absolute is that its existence helps us to explain the world of appearances, and if it is in itself entirely unknowable, it manifestly cannot serve as a principle of explanation."21 At this point Knudson was following in the footsteps of Borden Parker Bowne who found it impossible to form 'clear notions' about the world without positing God as personal and transcendent. Transcendence, from this point of view, is demanded by the inadequaces of the individual or of the world in which he lives, or by both.

As transcendent, then, God is conceived to be a Being who is not identifiable either with man, society, or the natural cosmos. He is a separate and free being, able to affect man, society, and the natural world as he may will to do.

Immanence is always united with transcendence in the thought of recent Theism.

The emphasis upon the immanence of God in the thought of Borden Parker Bowne reached the point where it approached pantheism. Bishop McConnell, in his biography of Bowne, says:22

"The questioner now asks if Bowne did not, after all, glide into pantheism in the teaching that the physical organisms are flowing forms of the divine activity. Can we hold the curious position that the body is from God while activity. Can we hold the curious position that the body is from God while activity. To which Bowne always replied that his view of the mater-the self is not? To which Bowne always replied that his view of the material world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that all comes casually from God. The self, ial world was pantheistic, in that the body is from

ు కార్యంలో కారుకు కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కారించిన కార్యంలో కారి అన్నా మారుక్కి మహేం కారివిడ్డారుకున్ని కార్యంలో అన్నారుకున్నారు. అన్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారు. అన్నే కార్ కార్యంలో కార్యంలో మంది కార్యంలో కార్యంలో మారుకున్నారుకున్నారు. అన్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారు కార్యంలో కార్యంలో కార్యంలో మంది మీది మీదినాయి. మీదినారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారుకున్నారు to note the table of diving which removed note to good with on the contract in the finest now blings, and who is doing blem. For quarkings of triligion are saved brain vekiteal morely. They spotes from a neutilised interest. For entres of a hunch neads, onbestd and invoted, who nead of healthey, of destined, all forginalists, all renewal, of entrapsidasement, as looks about him for sees someer of help wasquake to his neccestiy. Is there or is blere not some moved that one rose had needs; heat his sickness; costage his servow, bot out his guilt, rener els vitality, lift him stove who Heitsticas of his environment? He Dod, or is be ast, alive and fire, able to meet present needs as well as the needs of the in add of molderes with energy sicurity typica can od has even don of class ilimative. "19 and it is precisely this noint of view that lighten are sent in bis discussion ambibled wills future of Theisu." origied as an apide, so has Tholes ere several and supposed to the believes of the several of and more human Gods, he in interposed in a God who is other bits of some sundicione called the matural marks. Cod, to be practically restal, muns, and an all so as Isolaydo asi ai agaist ob of alor on another of galarious consult of the sould could be cheer the has held nought in you physical ard is required as branspendent in order to help as underwand that entare t th the appearance of bed ded agie via the personal of squares and the and said on adultoadh an anhardles to havor Lunckes yine mis dund bedair Teacher to the teachers we the of appearances, and the teachers of an article countries red escriptor to officialize a se crise connecty (sections if estimated as a significant At this goint Mandaon was fellowing in the fosteteps of Bearles Person is one the found it impossible to form 'clear notions' about the contraction which was led as personal and brunscendent. Transcendence, from this pound of the demonded by the inadequates of the individual or of the savid to see the demonded edited tel no

As Apareokarioni, then, tim is conceived to be a Reing the is not said while in a service of the a state of the said the said and the state of the action of the polyment total as (so ear will no de a said to de able to all the best total to as and the said to all the said to as a said to de and the said to all the said the said

Lamanence is always united with transcendence in the trompit of vecent Thiskyr The dwonasis when the Amanence of God in the thrught of Borden Person House reached the point Riero it approached mantheless. Bishor Reformally in the biography of Boune, says: 22

The questioner now asks if Sowne did not, after all, glide into partitional in the teaching that the physical organisms are flowing forms of the distribution that the body is from Ged water activity. Can be hold the curious nosition that the body is from Ged water the self is not? To which Bowne always replied that his wish of the self in the all comes casually from Ged. The self in a self with its measure of self-consciousness and self-determination, status or with its measure of self-consciousness and self-determination, status or against Ged in enough independence to scape from punthelsm, as the free choice slightly though really influence or affect even the influence of dealings it; the material world. If penthelsm scome more embryches is seen expansive than personalism, bowne had at hand the raphy that there is seen expansive than personalism, bowne had at hand the raphy that there is seen reliable in an expansiveness which expands sod into all the evelone.

Van Dusen finds God "in the immanent force or drive which appears to be pushing, or pulling, the process of evolution onward and upward toward ever more signidicant forms of reality in the direction of a Realm of Values. This upward nisus is God's purpose."23 Knudson remains closer to Bowne's point of view regarding immanence. The subject is treated by him in connection with God as absolute under the heading of 'omnipresence.' "It means that space constitutes no barrier or limitation to the divine power. The divine activity extends to all parts of the universe, and is as controlling in one part as in another."24 He uses the term 'devine agency' to express the activity of God in the world, and identifies the 'ultimate cosmic energy,' whatever it may be, with God's will.25 In this way, nature and its physical products become 'flowing forms of the divine activity.' D. C. Macintosh, while insisting upon God's presence in the world, yet insists upon a differential presence. "Experimental, religion, on the contrary, is based upon the assumption that God is not equally present in all phases of the universe, but becomes more fully immanent as he is revealed in the promotion of the spiritual life in response to man's right religious adjustment."26 This does not deny the presence of God in all the universe, his omnipresence, but stresses his presence in the moral and spiritual aspects of existence, namely, in man and society.

The significance of this emphasis upon the immanence of God who is transcendent as well is probably three-fold. (i) It enables this group of religious leaders to come to terms with science. This is clearly evident in a study of the work of the late Borden Parker Bowne. Bowne was born in 1847, and graduated from New York University in 1871. These were eventful years, for as Bishop McConnell points out," it was " from 1867 to 1871 that the view of the universe brought about by the scientific temper generated by Darwin's "Origin of Species" was beginning to make itself felt in American colleges. Darwin's book had been in circulation for seven or eight years when Bowne entered college, and was causing a good deal of terror among those who held the old orthodox views of the method of creation. Practically from the outset Bowne seized the truth that evolution as a theory of methods is harmless and as a theory of causes is worthless. It is from the quickness and certainty with which he grasped this essential that the temper of his criticism of the Darwinian movement is to be understood."27 Bowne, by dividing causes into primary and secondary, and identifying the will and activity of God with primary causation, reduced secondary causes, those operative in the phenomenal world-that with which science had to do--to relative insignificance. In so far as they were significant it was as expressions of the divine will. It is no wonder that one of Bowne's most influential students could say that the Royce-Bowne influence undoubtedly stunted my interest in natural science for some time; the teadhing that science is merely phenomenal left me with a feeling of the exalted superiority of purely met aphysical knowledge and the relative unimportance of science. "28 As the transcendence of God thus enabled men to face nature with the conviction that there existed a power other-than and more-than nature which could protect them against its impersonal power, so the immanence of God enabled them to approach nature with a more 'companionable interest,' to use one of Hocking's happy phrases, because they viewed it as in some fashion directly attributable to God. (ii). The immanence of God serves also to validate man's subjective experience of communion with deity. H. F. Rall defines religion as "a personal fellowship morally conditioned."29 This fellowship with God means not only companionship in a given task in which the overt activity of the individual is important, but it also means private prayer, communion, and what Daniel Evans called 'intrasubjective intercourse. This emphasis upon immanence, the presence of God within man and within the natural world, solves, by definition at least, one of the significant problems in religion today, namely, the problem of the relationship of the God subjectively experienced with the God objectively defined. It is comparatively simple, so far as such metaphysical problems go, to define God in terms of man's subjective experience with 'an other.' It is also relatively

And the control of th

ාස් කොහොත් මේ මත්ව සිටේ සිත තතුනයකතුමේ නමුතු අදහස වෙනවත්තුවේ සමුත් වල සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටුවේ සිටු and the teacher and continue to the design of the continue of To face the destrict of the selection of the control of the contro mentinal, francisco de composito de la composito della composito de la composito de la composi an fill of the second full-filler engage secolification of patients of the second second of the seco Serve by and he well and fond food of Vill seril 7 per di 9,200 states it serve? organismis and an enter our more value of succession of the contract of the co and have always to the state of rander og kligt filler berke ber erriglik mille romen filler av klover av klovet i filler berkette i filler be Det og kligt filler berke ber erriglik mille romen filler av klovet miller berkette filler berkette filler fil en de combre promotiva bila amb bilan asmo escolo parametros de la seria de se promotiva Tad (Kasa) eria kalikan servat seladan atik apale gilibakikangan kalikanas Terbesia p to a stock feature to greatly a ne bus sand coast of about he to greate a so en entitle to r Trans Eld. Jegusch di Foline dalle vieb duse bus seemenleg til 1977, st til 1977 nest there has been of his ordinates of the Dereinfess meremon is so he had not the shood. "27 Brane, by dividing causes into orimary and secondary, and identified ing the vill and workvity of God with primary causabion, reduced secon any carge , three operative in the phenomenal world-thus viet which entence and to do to relative insignificance. In so for as they were elignificant it was as expressions of the divine will. It is no nonder that one of Howne's most inc Cluentiel chadents could say that the Moyes-Boune influence undoubtedly started piessa, si especies dedd ga**irbusd sad temid sass tal ssacto**s frysdag ai dareadai ta this of the self-bed to the self-bed out the self-bed with the first temperate The was and the City meaning to about the evidence and into a fer laws footened a restablishment of the second tendena mada daeromy Miner India, amerika produceran fun haddespende en den der der ार प्रमाण सम्बद्धान्त्रम् वृति क्रिकिन विद्योग्यामा केल्या है। एक क्षण्यान स्थापन क्षण्या प्रमाणक सम्बद्धान स And of alleging the organisms of the court of the second and and the second sec Transformer in 1940 page Citeres of Chiller of wells servers but to but to be west will be a A CONTRACTOR AND AND THE RESIDENCE OF THE CONTRACTOR OF THE CONTRA mel geldermenn bil skumbrikk is selv de mendaka kotra mid fakte bik dred verti, best j The service from the service of the

easy to find evidence for God as a given phase or behavior of one's existential medium. But the problem then faced is that of identifying G the God of subject tive experience with the God objectively defined. Recent Theiem, by caphasizing the immanence of God, has been in position to deal with this question in more or less satisfactory fashion. Van Dusen states the proposition clearly. "The conception of God to which a study of reality in its factual aspects points is that of a Cosmic Power, purposing god, Creator of a steadily advancing world-process which has found its present culmination in our planet in the emergence of free, intelligent, moral creatures whom he invites to join with him in the further creation of an ideal world." 30 Thus the same purposive Pewer which is shaping the external world and society at large is also the Cosmic Power which created us and invites us to share with him in the task under way. That is to say, evidence points to the conclusion that the same type of activity is at work in the cosmic creative process as is at work in the life of man. The experience of God is creative, constructive, and purposive in both places, and may therefore be presumed to be the same. (iii) Finally, the conception of God as immanent brings cleser to man the possibility of cosmic support of human values. One of the values sought in religion is such support in the struffle for the good things of life. With God as the basic energy of which all is made, as Bowne, Knudson and others maintain or as casually effective everywhere (omnipresent, as Macintosh, Rall, and others believe), there is grounds for believing that man has divine support in his struggle for the best. These three values, then, must be included in any attempt to estimate the significance of the conception of God's relation to the world called immanence.

The Purpose of God

In so far as religion concerns itself with the problem of the cosmic significance of human values, it must reach some conclusions as to the purposes of God, especially as they impinge upon man and his world. Theism, along with all other philosophies of religion which deal positively with the concept of God, involves a conception of God's purposes for the world. Briefly stated, Theism believes that the purpose of God, so far as it affects this planet, is the creation or development of ideal persons in an ideal society. According to William Adams Brown, "when you ask a religious man the meaning of the world in which he lives, he will tell you that it is a scene in which God is revealing his presence. If he is a Christian, he will tell you that it is the school in which he is fitting men for fellowship with himself."31 God is then defined as the being in whom the values for which man strives-truth, justice, goodness, and beauty-are already fully realized. Furthermore, God is seeking to make their realization possible for men.32 The social aspect of this purpose was likewise clearly affirmed by Brown. "Whether it come soon or late, by sudden crisis or through slow development, the Kingdom of God will be a society in which men and women live as children of God should live. When we see social relationships everywhere controlled by the principles which Jesus illustrated in his own life-the principles of trust, of love, of generous and unselfish service -- we shall know that the Kingdom is here."33 Horton believes religion's peculiar nature may be defined as "the art and science of the ideal life."34 H. F. Rall discusses the purposes of God for the world in a significant chapter on the "Democracy of God." He believes that both God and democracy view humanity as sacred; that God's purpose as well as his method in dealin with men is freedom; men are persuaded, not coerced; and that the ideal of the free life applies to the group as well as to individuals. In a sentence he summarizes the heart of this view: "The goal of God is a free humanity, men who believe because the truth of God has spoken to their minds, men who love and obey because the law is within their hearts, men who have found a free life and the fullest life in fellowship with God."35 Van Dusen stated it just as definitely in his discussion of God in terms of an interpretation of values. The summary of his conclusions begins with this remark:

్రార్లో ఎందుకు కారుకు కారుకు కుండు కారుకు. అంటు ఎందుకు కుండు ఎందుకు కారుకు కారుకు కారుకు ఉంది. ఈ కారుకు ప్రార్ ప్రార్లో ఎందుకు కారుకు కారుకు కారుకుండి ఎందుకు ఎరక్ ఇవారుకు ప్రార్లో త్రిక్షులో మెట్టింది. మార్క్ అంటించిన స్ట ఎక్కుకు ఎందుకు కారుకు ప్రార్లో అమెట్ బాట్ట్రా మంది దారుకులో ఎందుకు ప్రార్లో అమెట్ స్టార్లు మండియాలు ఉంది. మార్క్ కార్కు కారుకు కారుకు కారుకు కారుకు కారుకు కార్లుకు మార్క్ కార్లుకోవింది. మార్క్ కార్లుకోవింది. మార్క్ కారికి మండియాలు మండియాలు మండియాలు మండియాలు మండియాలు మండియాలు మంది మంది మందియాలు మంది మండియాలు మంది మందియాలు మండియాలు మండియాలు మండియాలు మందియాలు మ The property of the second data as a completion with the property of the second of second of wooding to be seen and proposed to both where the contemposed on it would be to be seen at become the second second to the second to the second to the second and second the second to t source in religion is such support in the abrustle is the good whise a life save bee nested service co seben at the debit to parent observed on how details maintain or as casually effective everythams (emainmeach), as Sacinbers, and object believe), there is grounds for believing that rem has divide during the contact in the contact that his enrughly for the bonk. These three values, then, seet be included in the struggly for the contact that were the contact that the contact the contact the contact that the contact the contact the contact the contact that the contact the cont attempt to setimate the significance of the consciption of forts eclavion to world called ismenance.

The Parteon of Cad

The section of the section of the substance of the problem of the country of the To local de lecel de la come como como como esta los estas de la contra del la contra della cont pocietiz se they impinge upon who and his would. Theises along with all cal realist the property of the purposes for the world. Defectly should be the last the last the sound of the purposes for the world bills plant the connection of the property of the streets A del or the ed bilines and to Christon odd than smothering a fee boy moder throat to said test you that is is a some in which God to worselike for the officer The second section of Coolog and al di can't you like all the second and the second section of the second sect the collection and the handless media is been dealers and the collection of the the state of the property of the place of the place of the state of th fully realised. Furthernore, God is sosking to eater their realisables vertical for any 32 the sought sapedy of this business and Tribos of the formal to the sought of the sought o The same of the same of the same at the same of the sa en only were one one deid: of victors and illy bod in motorial and whom Chara at God chould live, binds as one moths activities assignment velolimine of the pill more aid at badenmulit exect dotte seletoning edd w that is to level of generanc and enseiliah service of the land that the to the fight of the property religions a profile representation of the fight of the com to convert the the thest life." H. F. Soll Steemen by Overen ded for the cories of the chapter on the "Democratic of Olds" and the lieves that both sod and demoracy view humanity as shored; that that lieves as well as his method in dealin with mon is freedom; son are percussed as coerced; and that the ideal of the free life amplies to the group ac well ionividuals. Is a scatence he summittee the heart of this view Cad is a free hearnity, men who believe because the truth of God tue spot a their minds, men who love and obey because the les in mithin bhoir hearth one said white white and shi solly sold but sail sext a basel over one Deep stated it just as definitely in his discussion of Cod in topes of description of values with summer of this completions begins with this constitutions

"It tells us of One whose nature in its outreach toward man is deeply personal; whose desire for our humanity is two-fold—the perfecting of individual human spirits and the gradual development on earth of a perfect society."36 According to contemporary Theism, therefore, in so far as God has purposes for his creation, these purposes focus in man and society upon this planet.

This view of the purposes of God answers positively two important human questions the first is this: What is the goal or end of human existence? If God's purpose can be stated exhaustively in terms of the development of ideal persons in an ideal society, then the answer to this first question is, obviously, that the goal of human existence is the perfecting of individual and social life.37 The second question is this: How important is man, a denizen of a small planet circling about a second rate sun, in the total scheme of things? The answer is that he is the most important factor in all creation, that for which everything else exists. For, as the late Gerald Birney Smith stated it, Theism "assumes that all the vared processes in the evolution of the universe can be gathered up into a single divine purpose, "38 namely, the perfection of man. Thus man becomes the chief actor on the cosmic stage whose setting is as pointed out by Van Dusen, 39 relatively unimportant even though it is fixed.

Recent Theism is, thus, a form of religious philosophy in which the concept person is central: God is essentially personal and all creation exists for personal ends. The two foci in the cosmic scene are personal, God as Supreme Person and man as a finite, growing, and perfectible person. Furthermore, God is both transcendent and immanent: transcendent as creator and controller, immanent as guide, inspirer, and empowerer. The world, finally, is anthropocentric. It exists for personal ends, and may be called the theater of human activities, the stage on which man plays his part in response to Divine promptings.

these purposes found in man and not in the control about the plansh.

The control the control the control of the tent of the control of the control of the control to the control of the c

This view of the numposes of God answers positively two important hazan questions the first is this: That is the need or and of huran endetence? If God's purpose can be stated esdiaustively in terms of the development of ideal persons in an ideal acciety, then the answer to this first question is, obviously, then the second of human existence is the perfecting of individual and accial life. If the second question is this: Now important is man, a denize of a small planet circling above a second rate sun, in the total scheme of things! The answer is that he is the most important factor in all creation, that for which everything class exists. The as the late Gerald Birney Smith stated it, Theism "assumes that all the versal processes in the evolution of the universe can be gathered up into a single divine purpose,"36 namely, the perfection of man. Thus man becomes the chief actor on the cosmic stage whose sating is as pointed out by Van Dusen, 39 relatively solve portant even though it is lixed.

Recent Theism is, thus, a form of veligious philosophy in which the concept personal is central: God is essentially personal and all creation exists for personal, ends. The two feet in the cosmic scene are personal, God as Supreme Person and men as a finite, growing, and perfectible person. Furthermore, God is both and condent and immenent: transcendent as creator and controller, immanent as greatering inspirer, and empowerer. The world, finally, is anthropocentific. It easters personal ends, and may be called the theater of human activities, the stage on which man plays his part in response to Divine promptings.

- Cf. Knudson, A. C., "The Doctrine of God," New York, Cincinnati, Chicago. 1930. The Abingdon Press. p. 291.
- "Personalism." Boston and New York, 1908. Houghton Mifflin Co., pp. 277f 2.
- 3. Brown, W. Adams, "God at Work." New York and London, 1933. Charles Scribner's Sons, p. 133.
- "Introduction to Philosophy." New York, 1925. Henry Holt and Co., p. 329. 4.
- 5. "The Plain Man Seeks for God." New York and London, 1933. Charles Scribner's Sons, p. 129.
- 6. "Op. cit.," p. 129.
- 7. "Theism and the Modern Mood," New York and London, 1930. Harper and Brother, p.117.
- 8. Cf. also, Horton: "A Psychological Approach to Theology." New York and London, 1931. Harper and Brothers, pp. 207f.
- 9. Rall, H. F., " A Faith for Today." New York, Cincinnati, Chicago, 1936. The Abingdon Press, pp. 57f; "Christianity," 1940, p. 151.
- "Op. cit.," p. 266. 10.
- 11. Bowne, B. P., "Metaphysics," New York and London, 1898 (revised edition). Harper and Brothers, pp. 345f.
- 12. "Op. cit.," pp. 191-192.
- 13. Cf. Knudson, op. cit., pp. 293f.; Flewelling, R. T., "Creative Personality," New York, 1926. The Macmillan Co., pp. 283f.
- "A Psychological Approach to Theology." p. 52. 14.
- 15. "Ibid., p. 256. (Italics in text).
- 16. "The Doctrine of God," p. 245.
- 17. "Ibid.," p. 261.
- 18. "Theism and the Scientific Spirit," New York and London 1933, Harper and Brothers, p. 207.
- 19. P. 90.
- 20. Cf. "Theism and the Scientific Spirit," p. 211.
- 21. "The Doctrine of God." p. 301.
- 22. F. J McConnell, "Borden Parker Bowne," New York, Cincinnati, Chicago, 1929. The Abingdon Press, p. 146.
- 23. "The Plain Man Seeks For God," p. 105. Cf. also, his "God in These Times, New York, 1935, pp. 71 ff.
- 240 The Doctrine of God, p 275
- 25. Ibid., p 278
- 26. Theology as an Empirical Science, New York, 1919, Macmillan Co., p 188
- 27. McConnell, Borden Parker Browne, p 26.
- 28. Edgar Sheffield Brightman, "Religion as Truth"in Contemporary American Theology, edited by Vergilius Ferm, New York 1932, The Round Table Press, Inc., p 57.
- The Meaning of God, Nashville, 1935. Cokesbury Press, p 137 29.
- 30. The Plain Man Seeks for God. p 105
- 31. Beliefs That Matter, New York 1928. p 77
- 32. Ibid., p 77
- 33. Ibid., p 59
- Psychological Approach to Theology, p.71 340
- The Meaning of God, p 69 35.
- 36. The Plain Man Seeks for God, p 142
- Cf.E. S. Brightman, Moral Laws, New York, Cincinnati, Chicago, 1933, pp242ff. 37.
- Current Christian Thinking, Chicago, 1928. 38.
- The Plain Man Seeks for God, pp 143ff. 39.

G.C. Sand Ary I. C., Theo Reserving of Co., "Fire Part Carty Consideration of the policy of the Constant Areas of the C

harmonalists - Rashon and May Kork, 1986. Goeghton billin Co., on. 27/6

5 - Grown, W. Adams, "God at Mark." New York and Kandon, 1939. Charles Sortioner - Cons., J. 1939.

As "Introduction to Philosophy." Few Tork, 1925. Menry holt and Co., p. 929.

Withe Flain Lin Seeks for God." Yew Nork and London, 1933. Charles Sertbner a Sons, p. 129.

6. ™Op. eit.," p. 129.

7. "Theism and the Modern Mood," New York and London, 1930. Harper and Brother, p. 117.

3. Cf. also, Morton: "A Psychological Approach to Theology." Hen York and Comber.

1931. Harper and Brothers, pp. 2071.

9. Rell, H. F., " A Faith for Today." New York, Cincinnati, Chicago. 1936. The Abingdon Press, pp. 572; "Christianity," 1940, p. 151.

le: "Op. cit.," p. 266.

11. Bowne, B. P., "Mataphyaica," Mew Mork and London, 1896 (revised edition). Tarper and Brothers, pp. 345f.

12. "Cp. cit.," pp. 191-192.

13. Of Mandson, op. cit., pp. 2931.; Flowelling, R. T., "Creative Personality," New York, 1926. The Macmillan Go., pp. 2831.

14. AA Paychological Appreach to Theology, n p. 52.

15. "Ibid., p. 296. (Italics in text).

16. The Cockeins of God, p. 245.

17. "IMAG.," p. 1511.

18. "Theise and the Schentific Spirit," New York and London 1933, Harper and Erothers, p. 207.

19. P. 90.

20. Cf. "Theism and the Seientific Spirit," p. 211.

21. "The Beetshup of God." p. 301.

22. T. J McConnell, "Porden Parker Bowns," New Tork, Cincinnati, Chicago, 1929. The Abingdon Frese, p. 186.

23. "The Plain Man Seeks Vor Cod," p. 105. Cf. also, his "Cod in These Times,

. New York, 1935, pp. 71 ff.

24. The Dockrine of God, p 275

25. Ibid. p 276

26. The lags as an Empirical Science, New York, 1919, Macmillan Co., p 163

27. McConsil, Borden Parker Browns, p 26.

28. Edger Sheffield Brightman, "Religion as Truth"in Contemporary American Theology.

edited by Vergilius Form, New York 1932, The Round Table Press, Inc., p 57.

29. The Weaning of God, Rashville, 1935. Cokesbury Press, p 137

30. The Plain Man Seeks for God. p 105

32. Boliefs Thet Matter, Now York 1928. p 77

32. Ibid., p W

Red "midl off

365 Paychological Approach to Theology, p.71

35. The Meaning of God, p 69

35. The Plain Len Seeks for God, p 142

37. Of.E. S. Brightman, Moral Laws, New York, Cindianati, Chicago, 1933, pp242ff.

28. Surrent Civi Midal Thinking, Chiese, 1928.

39. The Flain Han Seeks its Cod, pp 1401ff.

As a Philosophy of religion, revent Theism scales to justify the conclusions which it present. In so doing, it has developed a type of reasonable which may be called, for convenience, the logic of theism. This logic is based on certain postplates or assumptions. Whitehead speaks of these assumptions as "instinctive convictions" such as undergind every living science. "In the first place, there can be no living science unless them a widespread instinctive conviction in the existence of an Order of Tryagand, in particular, of an Order of Nature. I have used the word "instinctivative advisedly. It does not matter what men say in words, so long as their activities are controlled by settled instincted, "100 It is these "settled consictions." more or less consciously held, which are designed by the words "basic assumptions" in this discussion. They are basic since they provide the foundations upon which systems are built, and they are assumptions in that they provide the court of last appeal to the thinker was uses them. As such, they are normally assumed rather than justified.

Basic assumptions, as courts of final appeal, are not beyond unique analysis and evaluation. They are accepted as a basis upon which to prodevery step in the resultant cognitive venture then becomes a form of order evaluation. Our present interest is that of presenting as adequately as possible the basic assumptions of recent theism. In the next section, we shall present our evaluation.

Probably the clearest statement of the basic assumption of resent Theism was made by Borden Parker Bowne. He stated it in this manner "Whatever our total nature calls for may be assumed as a real in default of positive disproof. " 41 The meaning which Bownegut into these words as suggested by a statement in the preceding pages of the same wolume. This is will, conscience, emotion, aspiration; and these are far more power: factors than the logical interest. Hence, in its practical unfolding the man makes a great variety of practical postulates and assumptions which are the logical deducations or speculative necessities, but a kind of modus vivenue They represent the conditions of our fullest live; and enwith the universe. at bottom expressions of our practical and ideal interests or necessities. And these are reached as articulate principles by which we live. The law the logician lays down is this: Nothing may be believed which is not proved The law the mind actually follows is this: Whatever the mind demands for the satisfaction of its subjective interests and tendencies may be assumed as real in default of positive disproof. " This criterion, namely, that will ever ministers to man's needs, intellectual, aesthetic, moral, and religion may be held as true until pisitively disproved, was used by Bowne in his discussions of religious problems.

This is, as one may readily observe, a form of religious proximation, and was used by Bowne in all of his later studies of religious beliefs. Christianity were not a world-power, a great spiritual force have a doow, its origin and history would be a matter of profound indifference to all had a few antiquarians. The miracles, too, are to be studied in consection as history, and not as isolated and detached wonders. Miracles without many meaning and religious bearings have as little credibility as the exploits of Jack the Giant Killer, or the story of Aladdin's Lamp. The Bowne

^{*} The Biff Review. Vol. IV. No. 1, Winter, 194?

is basing which we will be a considered to be such a sold to the considered on certain positives of a considered on certain positives of a considered on certain positives of a considered on the first place, there are be no interests to the considered of and and and as particular, of an Order of Manney, is away saw the word, and is a continuitied are nontrolled by solved method in the controlled by solved instinction of the controlled by solved instinction of the controlled by solved instinction of the designed by the words basic near options of the discussion. They are basic that the provide the foundations upon which systems are basic that the assumptions in that they provide the court of last appeal to the finate were a stem. As such, they provide the court of last appeal to the finate were a them. As such, they provide the court of last appeal to the finate were a them. As such, they provide the court of last appeal to the finate were a them. As such, they are normally assumed rether there have provided the court of their court of them in the finate contracts.

B_sele assemptions, as equite of final appeal, ore not beyond criminal appeal. Ore and cold criminal analysis and cold pellon. They are excepted as a basis upon which is upon the cold cold and Every orea is the residual cold or are satisfied by a present interest is that of presenting as acceptaint or possible the best pession upon a research in the cold cold of the line of the basic cold or as a finite cold. The cold of the last of the cold of

Problem la configer were great to the free reserve of the past past past of a configuration. To account the little of the contract of the c The control of the control and the control of vacuation of the control of the con ala in almadan emine eda io engagigi Dobano ada hi degmogsia a yo besnaggara ्रिया । एक्स् केर २ वर्षा है केस्क समस्य है किस्सी है किस्सी काईक्य में अक्स स्थापिक असकित है केस्सी कर असी सी ការ ។ តែការប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមានក្នុង មាន នេះបានក្នុង ប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមាន ប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមាន ប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមាន បាននៅនេះបាន ំបន្ទាប់ថា រាមបំពេញ ប៉ាន់ ស្ថិតនៅ នៃ ដោយី ប្តែទៅនាងសមានមនានៃ ប្រទិនបើប្រមុខនៅ ប្តេ គង់បំពេញប្រឹក្សា (នេះបន្តប្ a har told device that to retold be able the property total and the second because the second by at bottom especial to the first literal and ideals are easily suger a marketing expectation to ver end in a filme and the helpharmore and endage en bedreen the area week back र्ता है कर के किए को किए के बार के किए को के किए को में हैं कि को में किए किए के किए के किए के किए के किए के क किए के किए के किए के किए के किए को किए की में किए के किए के किए के किए की किए की किए की किए की किए की किए की क of abrances to be an englassian factor - the character of all out to ा हर रहिन्द्र तर्वत वृक्षका राजकेक्षण रिवस्य केवल संविधायनका, । ५ विकासूर्वाम निवेत्र केव अवस्थायनका समाव the factor to the tent to a section and the land of the tent to the tent to the tent to ever militares in medela medel (arreligation) databas policies de la composicione de la composición de la comp and the state of the management of the continue of the state of the st central dong and give to exclusive to

This is as one may read to discreat denotes to this in a property of the second of the

The state of the state of the second of the

suggests his pragmatic or instrumentalistic approach. Dortrines which have no moral value or religious significance are not candidates for credibility. If, on the other hand, they have moral and religious significance, then they are presumably true.

This assumption was restated by A. C. Knudson in this manner: "Personalism finds the ontologically real only in personality." 44 K, as he believes, one has direct contact with ultimate reality only in personality, it is not far to the cotollary that the one criterion for determining the truth of metaphysical theories is personality and its needs. Whatever is in harmony with personality, and whatever contributes to the satisfaction of personal interests may be held as true until it is positively disproved. Any change in such views must be compelled by the logic of events. This makes it possible for the Theists to study man and his needs, and to assume that what is true for man—that is, what satisfies man's interests—is true for reality as a whole.

A further word concerning Knudson's restatement of thisposition may be in order. Whereas Bowne's statement is epistemological—a test of truth, or a method of thinking about metaphysical problems, Knudson's statement is metaphysical. If, according to him, "Personalism finds the ontologically real only in personality," then a conclusion has already been reached regarding the nature of ultimate reality. Ultimate reality is personal, jand therefore we human beings find ontological reality only in personality. From this it is but a short step to the test of truth, namely, whatever personality demands may be assumed as real in default of positive disproof. As we shall point out in our evaluation of the Theistic logic, every criticism of the Theistic logic pragmatism finally comes face to face with this metaphysical assumption. Failure to take this into consideration is probably the reason for the failure of critics to make much impression upon this school of thought. Theists believe that their critics have failed to meet the vital point of their argument and so long as they believe this, they have little reason to worry.

We shall now examine the writings of several representative American Theists to discover whether or lnot they make significant use of this criterion of truth.

In his debate on God with H. N. Wieman and M. C. Otto, D. C. Macintosh stated his basic assumption in one sentence: "We have the moral right to believe as we must in order to live as we ought -- if we can (logically and physi psychologically) and, more particularly, if we do. "46 This proposition will be much easier to hunderstand, il balieve, if we view it in the light of the analysis presented by Bowne than by following the unnecessarily complex analysis presented by Macintosh in his debate. Bowne's statement, let us repeat, is this: "Whatever our total nature calls for may be assumed as real in default of positive disproof." Without suggesting that Macintosh was influenced by Bowne, we draw attention to the fact that these two statements have essentially the same meaning. According to both men, all men have some basic, vital, and significant needs; certain beliefs about God, the world, and man are essential if these needs are to be fully satisfied; these necessary (morally and religiously necessary, not logically or scientifically necessary) beliefs may be held, and must be held, unless they are positively disproved. Macintosh is quite specific at this point. If you cannot hold them logically, psychologically, or practically (which is what I understand him to mean by the last few words for his basic assumption, "and more particularly, if we do") then of course you do not. Both men, therefore, say that the theologicus must begin with man's religious, and perhaps moral needs. These needs will suggest the most valuable beliefs about existents and the existentian medium

ang Artoka lake gradungan na maligrasine ng palaketanan anasisk tyok na kulululanda signilangan sa kingkan pan Nakhitopo - Ko manakan sa masa na maligrasis na panda kanan naka sa sa malikanda signilangan si masa sa malika Bakan phay naka prakanan naka nakan sa manan nakasisk tyok nakan sa malikanda si gnilangan si manan sa manan n

Colo assumption was restered by A. C. Finalson in this mather These somethers the decreasing mather than the constitution of the colonical value of the personality of the it is not far to the colonical with alternate reality only in personality. In the it is not far to the colonical theories to personality and its needs. Whatever is to harmony with personality, and whatever contributes to the astisfaction of personal interests may be theid as true until it is positively dispressed in allocates in such views must be compelled by the logic of events. This makes it possible for the Theists to study man and his needs, and to assume that what is true for man-had is, what satisfies man's interests wis for the for reality as a whole, is

A further word concerning finalson's restatement of this position may be in order. Whereas Bowne's statement is epistemological—a test of trash, or a method of thinking about metaphysical problems. Knudson's statement is metaphycical. If, according to him, "Personalism finds the entological, real culy la personality," then a conclusion has already been reached required the nature of ultimate reality. Ultimate reality is personal, jand therefore we human beings find entological reality only in personality. From this to but a short step to the test of truth, namely, whatever personality demands in our evaluation of the Theistic legic, every criticism of the Theistic legic to have with this metaphysical accurage pregnatism finally comes have to face with this metaphysical accurage of all the fighture to take this into consideration is probably the reason for the driving of critics to make much impression upon this school of thought. Theistics is lieve that their critics have falled to meet the vital point of than anyward and so long as they believe this, they have little reason to worky.

We chall now examine the writings of several representative American Theists to discover whether or inot they make significant use of this extransfer of truth.

anggest the mast valuable belief, sisted es datemar mot the entain estatos. then of course you do not. Both men, thanefore, say that the theological last for words for his besic assemption, "and more paydorlarly, if we foll psychologically, or practically (which is what a understand him to mean by the Macintosh is quite specific at this point. If you cannot hold than, logically beliefs may be held, and must be held, unless they are plottively dispress? (morally and religiously necessary, not logically or actantifically necessary, and man are essential if these needs are to be fully satisfied; these necessa some basic, vital, and significant needs; certain beliefs about Ged, the worker have espeatifily the same meaning. According to both men, all men have fluenced by Bowne, we draw attention to the fact that these two statements in default of positive disproof. " Without suggesting that Macintosh was inrepeat, is this: "Whatever our total nature calls for may be assumed as well analysis presented by Machitoch in his debate. Sowne's statement, let an analysis presented by Sowne than by following the unnecessarily complex be much easter to understand, it bilieve, if we view it in the light of the psychologically) and, more particularly, if we do. "66 This preposition with lieve an we must in order to live as we ought -- if we can (logically and physic atated his basic assumption in one sentence: WWo have the monel right to he In his debate on God with M. M. Wieman and M. C. Otto, D. C. Monthable

Such beliefs must then be subjected to two tests: (i) Are they contradicted by scientific or other types of positive knowledge? (ii) Do they help us realize the values they were developed to serve? If the beliefs meet both of these tests satisfactorily, they are held to be true.

It will be observed that these beliefs are subjected, in fact, to but one positive test. namely, that of man's religious and moral experience. They must meet man's religious needs satisfactorily. The other, or speculative test, is negative. The given beliefs need not find positive support in contemporavy science and philosophy; they need but be of such nature as to be permitted by contemporary science and philosophy. In Bowne's language, they must not be positively disproved by science and philosophy. Thus recent Theism, as exemplified in Bowne and Macintosh, is a form of religious pragmatism or instrumentalism. Ideas are instruments in the achievements of the highest religious and moral values; their validity or truth is determined by their practical value for the religious and moral life.

Macintosh has used this method in several of his studies in theology in 1919, in a discussion of the unity of God, he argues as follows: "Practical experience in religion not only demands, but at its best it is assured of at least one God. But granted that this God is k he absolute One, absolutely sufficient for man's needs, it follows that no more than one is needed. Unless there is adequate empirical evidence of the existence of more than one God, jor unless monotheism should prove to be metaphysically indefensible, this suggestion of one and only one God should be allowed to stand. The burden of proof rests upon the person who affirms polytheism as against monotheism." Here again we note the reliance upon religious experience, with the provision that the theory suggested mustnot be proved untrue by other positive evidence. In a later book, after stating that belief in God depends primarily upon religious experience and not upon philosophical argument, Macintosh raised the question of the nature or character of God. He believed that faith in God and faith in Moral optimism are in extricably bound together. By "Moral Optimism" he means "a fundamental attitude of confidence in the cosmos, together with a full sense of man's moral responsibility. "48 For Moral Optimism, however, God must have a certain character, "What is meant is that the God of moral optimism, however superpersonal he may possibly be in some unknown and unimaginable sense, is most reasonably thought of as at least personal in the sense of being conscious, intelligent, purposive, working consciously and rationally toward an end in which the conservation of human personality and values is included. Furthermore, such an essentially personal God, working dependably for such an ideal and always adequate for man's absolute dependence and trust, must be regarded as completely moral, perfect in holiness and in self-giving love. "49 That is to say, Macintosh discovers certain moral and religious needs in man. He next raises the questin: What type of God is necessary if these needs are to meet their highest satisfaction? His conclusion is that the Theistic view is the most adequate for these demands. He then asks: Can we hold to this conception in view of the facts of experience? He answers this by considering the objections to the theory based upon the (i) the presence of evil, and (ii) the nature of revelation. He finds that it is possible so to interpret evil that it does not positively negate the Theistic conception. This attempt positively to disprove the Theistic view is thus refuted. He believes it possible to reinterpret or redefine the concept of revelation so that it becomes equivalent to the discovery of God in human experience. Since men can and do live 'personally' with something or somewhat in their existential medium, this is considered validation of the view that God reveals himself to man. Thus he disposes of a second attempted disproof.

duch ledicio mest shee de solice pel ector canter di encestas pel este pela cel encellante la esta de la procesa de la constituit de colles de la co

It will be observed that those beliefe are subjected, in fact, to but one positive test namely, that of man's religious and moval experience. They must meet man's religious needs satisfactorily. The other, on spot ulative test, is negative. The given beliefs need not find positive support in contemporary science and philosophy; they need but be of such nature as to be permitted by contemporary science and philosophy. In Bowne's language, they must not be positively disproved by science and philosophy. Thus recent Theism, as exemplified in Bowne and Macintosh, is a form religious pragmatism or instrumentalism. Ideas are instruments in the achievements of the highest religious and moral values; their validity or achievements of the highest religious and moral values; their validity or

Macintosh has used this method in several of his studies in theology in 1919, in a discussion of the unity of God, he argues as followed "Fraction" experience in religion not only demands, but at its best it is assured of at least one God. But granted that this God isk he absolute One, absolutely sufficient for man's needs, it follows that no more than one is needed. Un. less there is adequate empirical evidence of the existence of move than one God, jor unless monotheism should prove to be metaphysically indefendible. this saggestion of one and only one God should be allowed to stand. The bardon of proof rests upon the person who affirms polytheism as against moneyless. Merc again we note the reliance upon religious emperience, with the provision that the theory suggested mustnot be proved entrue by other postition evidence. In a later book, efter stating that belief in God depends prins visc upon religious experience and not upon philosophical argument, Machalisa raised the question of the nature or character of God. He believed that faith in God and faith in Moral optimism are in extricably bound ingether. By "Morel Optimism" he means "a fundamental efficule of confidence in the cosmos, together with a full sense of men's moral responsibility. For Moral Optimism, however, God must have a certain character, which is meant is that the God of moral optimism, however superpersonal he may possibly be in some unknown and unimaginable sense, is most reasonable thought of as at least personal in the sense of being constitues, intelligent, purposive, working consciously and rationally toward an end in which the conservation of human personality and values is included. Furthermore, such an essentially personal God, working dependably for such an ideal end always adequate for man's absolute dependence and trust, must be regulabled or completely moral, perfect in holiness and in self-giving love, who Thur is to say. Macintosh discovers certain moral and religious needs in man. He ware raises the questim: What type of God is necessary if these reeds are to movel. their highest satisfaction? his conclusion is that the Theistic view is the const adequate for these demands. He then asks: Can we hold to this conception on view of the facts of experience? He answers whis by considering the objection to the theory based upon the (i) the presence of evil, and (ii) the rature of revelation. He finds that it is possible so to interpret evil that it does not positively negate the Theistic conception. This attempt positively to dispense the Theistic view is thus refuted. He believes it possible to remerprot or redefine the concept of revelation so that it becomes equivalent to the discours Since men can and do live 'personally' with of God in human experience. something or somewhat in their existential medium, this is considered volun-ation of the view that God reveals himself to man. Thus he disposes of a second sitempted disproof.

The position of Macintosh is thus similar to that of Bowne. He begins with man's needs, particularly man's religio-moral needs. He then states that whatever beliefs are demanded if these needs are to be adequately met may be held in default of positive disproof. His next step is that of examining the attempted disproofs. If he can show they are not necessarily fatal to his position, he rests his case. Stated as an opponent in debate might state it, his method is this: I need this type of God. Until somebody disproves his existence, I propose to believe in him.

The basic logic of Thism is also discoverable in the writings of Walter Marshall Horton. In an early book, he proposed the following partial definition of God. "God is a vast cosmic drift or trend toward harmony, fellowship, and mutual aid, whereby our efforts to create a just equilibrium in human affairs are supported and sustained."50 He insisted that this conception was not based upon faith, but that "it is an empirical fact, capable of social verification -- a fact as objective asthose great star drifts which astronomers are able to chart after years of patient observation. This is a fact of tremendous religious significance, if true." 51 Thus far he relied upon positive evidence of a complex type and not merely upon religious experience. But he refused to stop with this provisional definition. He insisted the Christian faith demanded more in its God than that, and he added two attributes to the definition proposed. The first was Divine Greatness, by which he meant "transcendente, prior initiative, self -- sufficiency, (as) emphasized by Von Huegel, the Catholic mystic. 5Z God as transcendent is above the world, "surveying and controlling the cosmic process from a point of rest lying above and beyond it." 53 But, as the late Gerald Birney Smith pointed out, God as transcendent in this sense is kunknowable. 54 Thus God, lying above and beyond the cosmic process, is lying above and beyond the possibility of proof or disproof.

Horton was fully aware of this fact, and sought to buttress this weak beam in his theological structure by means of an analogue taken from organic evolution. According to biological theory, changes in organic life are responses to changes in the environment. If, according to Horton, changes in organic life are responses to prior changes in the environment, then we may well argue that the changes in the environment are responses to prior changes in an environment of the evolutionary environment. He thus explained changes in the environment of organic life by positing a second environment. God, as transcendent, is this extra-environment. It is his prior initiative which has produced life its Myriad forms.

There appear to be certain difficulties involved in this effort to addressonableness to Hornton's conception of the transcendence of God. The first of the transcendence of God is found in the fact that evolutionary thought is based upon the theory of "resident forces." This means that the energy and initiative responsible for changes in any process are to be sought in the process itself rather than inaany transcendent realm. Thus changes in the environment serve as occasions rathernthan causes of organic change. Furthermore, then Horton begins to discuss geological changes he has left the field of organic evolution, in its strictest sense, and has entered the field of geology. In that field, he will find the reasons suggested for the changes which have had definite, but contributory effects in the organic realm. But more important than this difficulty is the one which is known as "infinite regress." When he assumes that everything must have a prior cause, it is logically impossible for him to stop this side of infinity, unless he limits the cause-effect sequence. There is general recognition of the fact, which would appear obvious, that certain concepts are of limited applicability onl. This principle of limited applicability would suggest that the cause-effect

The production of the characters to these characters to the collection of the verse. We have a like the characters with manage more to, perchapters of research means are the characters of the

process, is lying above and beyond the possibility of proof or disproof it, no page as the late Gereld Birney Smith pointed out, Ged as transcented in this sense is funknowable. By Thus God, lying above and beyond the country and equivolling the cosmic process from a point of rest tying above and became the Catholic mystic. DZ God as manscendent is above the world, "soxverging cendente, pricr initiative, self--sufficiency, lack emphasized by Non Manacal Ition proposed. The first was Divine Greatnese, by which he meant Harabs demanded more in its God than that, and he added two attributes to the definrefused to stop with this provisional definition. He insisted the Cantofare label dence of a complex type and not merely upon religious experience. Dut he dous religious significance, if true." 51 Thus far be relied upon positive oviare able to chart after years of pation observation. This is a fact of branch we verification -- a fact an objective asthose great star drifts which astronom me was not based upon faith, but that "it is an empirical fact, capable of social ship, and mutual sid, whereby our efforts to greate a just equilibrium in human affairs are supported and sustained, who insisted that take consideraition of God. "God is a wast cosmic drift or trend toward beautocay, follo-Marshall Horica. In an early book, he propped the following partial defin-The basic logic of Thism is also discoverable in the writings of Walley.

Rorton was fully aware of this fact, and sought to buttrens this week beam in his theological structure by means of an analogue taken from oxyging evolution. According to biological theory, changes in pryamic life are responses to the environment. If, according to Morton, changes in an organic life are responses to prior changes in the environment, then we are well argue that the changes in the environment are responses to prior changes in an environment of the evolutionary environment. He thus explained changes in the environment of organic life by positing a second environment. God, the transcendent, is this extra-environment. It is his prior initialize which had produced life its myriad forms.

This price spie of cimited applicability would auppers that in a consequention world appasar charlone, that certain concepts one of thurted applies ability out o the cause-effect sequence. There is governed nevertions of the fact, which togically impeasible for him to atep this side of infinity, unloss he limits regress." When he assumes that overything must have a prior cause, it is more important than this difficulty is the one which is known as windings which have had definite, but contributory effects in the organic realmy . Man of geology. In that fiold, he will find the reasons suggested for the changes field of organic evolution, En its strictest cense, and has entered the field ermore, then Morton begins to discuss geological changes he had better environment serve as occasions rathernthan cauces of organic classics. and initiative responsible for changes in any process are to be sauged in the process itself rather than insany transcendent realm. Do Thus changes in the is based upon the theory of "resident forces." This means that the many present the contract of the contract o first of the transcendence of God is found in the fact that evolutionary thought reasonableness in Moraton's conception of the transcendence of God. The There appear to be certain difficulties involved in this effort to add

sequence is one which applies within the existential world, and that any attempt apply it beyond the existential world leads to confusion. Thus it is true that all life lives by eating, or by incorporating bits of its environment. While this is true, one cannot make this a universal principle. One can say that most of that which man eats, likewise eats, that is, incorporates part of the environment within itself. But in only two or three removes, the statement loses its significance. One comes to electfons and protons, and one does not find incorporation, even in a very broad sense, applicable there. Furthern ore to attempt to apply this principle to the total universe would be ludicrous. It is the recognition of this obvious fact which suggests that the principle of limited applicability must be kept in mind when one is discussing fundamental issues. We must conclude therefore, that Hortons attempt to validate this conception of transcendence is a failure, and admission made that the sole reason for adding this attribute to his empirically—derived conception of God is that man's religious needs apparently demand it.

The seemed attribute suggested by Horton is likewise affirmed without adequate evidential support. It is that God is Christ-like. He considers it to be one of the great intuitions of the race, and believes that it knust be affirmed if we are to find in God that which will meet adequately the demands of our religions and moral natures. It must be noted that the type of reasoning found with reference to this two attributes, transcendence and Christ-likeness, is religious pragmatism and instrumentalism. Man's religious and moral nature demand a certain type of God. Unless belief in such God is fundamentally unreasonable, jor is positively disproved, one may assume its truth. That the concept of transcendence is not unreasonable, and therefore is permissible, Horton tried to show by his analogy from organic evolution. Since we need that type of God, and since neither science nor philosophy positively disprove this view, we may accept it as true on the basis of religious pragmatism. It satisfies our religious and moral interests.

The logic of recent Theism is thus based upon the assumption that reality including God, must be such as to satisfy our deepest and highest needs. Every theory concerning the nature of God which fails to meet the test of human satisfaction is viewed with suspicion; every theory which meets this test is accepted as true in default of positive disproof. It may be observed that this is a logic which has high interest value, and that the theories validated by it will have much socially-cohesive significance. The fact remains, however, that there is a difference in cognitive quality between theories which are socially-cohesive and those which are validated by comparison with objective data. It is this fact which makes necessary critical examination of the former type of theories for their probably truth-value. To this we shall return in a future issue.

acquemos is one which applies within the existential world, and that any accompany to beyond the existential world leads to conficient. Thus is is two that any accompany if beyond the existential world leads to conficient. Thus is is two that a life lives by enting, or by incorporating bits of its exvironment. While this is true, one cannot make this a universal principle. One can may that accompany the can may that is incorporates part of the anyther onement within itself. But in only two or three removes, the statement lower its significance. One comes to elections and protons, and one does not find incorporation, even in a very broad sense, applicable there. Furthern ove to attempt to apply this principle to the total universe would be ludiced to the is the recognition of this obvices heat which suggests that the principle of limited applicability must be kept in mind when one is discussing familians and issues. We must conclude therefore, that Mortons attempt to validate the conception of transcendence is a failure, and admission made that the solid recessor for adding this attribute to his empirically demand it.

The seamd attribute suggested by Morton is Morwise affix med without adequate evidential support. It is that God is Christ-like. The conclusive is to be one of the great intuitions of the race, and believes that it knows is affirmed if we are to find in God that which will meet adequately the decreasing tour religious and moral natures. It must be noted that the type of reasoning found with reference to this two attributes, transcendence and Christian ing noted with reference to this two attributes, transcendence and Christian and moral nature demand a certain type of God. Unless celled in such field fundamentally unreasonable, for its positively disproved, one may as unitarity truth. That the concept of transcendence is not unreasonable, and there permissible, Morton tried to show by his analogy from organic evolution. Since we need that type of God, and since neither ecience nor philosophy positively disprove this view, we may accept it as true on the basis of we pregmanism. It satisfies our religious and moral interests.

The logic of meent Theirs is the based upon the accomplise this would be included the controlise the controlise to accepted and highest need to accepted as true in default of positive disproaf. It may be characted that this to a logic which has high interest value, and that the theory which meets the that this to a logic which has high interest value, and that the theory of validated by it will have much accielly cohesive (significance. The fact remains, however, that there is a difference in cognitive quality between theories which are socially-cohesive and those which are validated by comparison with objective data. It is this fact which makes necessary critical examination of the former type of theories for their probably truth value. To this we shall return in a faiture issue.

40. Science and the Modern World, New York, 1925, p 5

41. The philosophy of Theism, New York, 1887, p 25

42. Cf. his The Divine Immanence, Boston and New York, 1905. The Houghton Mifflin Company.

* Ibid, pp 13-14

43. Ibid., p 85. Dr. E. T. R. msdell in three discussions of "The Religious Pragmatism of Bowne," which appeared in the Autumn of "The Personalist," deals with the pragmatic elements in Bowne's philosophical and religious thought although my own position regarding Bowne was developed many years before, this recent study supports the conclusions reached. Cfr. Abstracts of Theses, The University of Chicago, Humanist Series, Vol. VI 1927-1928, pp. 417f. for abstract of my doctoral thesis on "The Influence of Borden Parker Bowne upon Theological Thought in the Methodist Episcopal Church."

The Philosophy of Personalism, New York and Gincinnati, 1927, p 66
 Cf. Ramsdell, "The Religious Pragmatism of Borden Parker Bowne, (1847--1910) The Personalist. Vol 15, No. 4 (Autumn 1934) pp 308 ffl.,

for development of the theme that 'interest satisfaction' was Bowne's test of religious truth.

46. "The Christian Century", April 20 1932, p 511

47. Theology as an Impirical Science, New York, 1919, pp 190 f.

18. The Reasonableness of Christianity, p 46.

49. Ibid., p 78

50 Theism and the Modern Mood, p 117

51. Ibid., p 117

52. Ibid., p 161

53. Ibid., p 162

54. Cf. "God" in The Dictionary of Religion and Ethics, edited Shailer Mathews and G. B. Smith, New York, 1923, p 186

55. Gr. Theism and the Modern Mood, p 163f

56. Cf. G. P. Conger New Views of Evolution, New York, 1929, pp 17-18

Field of the letter of the exact in the case of the case from a tilled the letter of this letter for the field of the fiel ්ය සිටව කියම රහස්තිපූත් වෙයින්තු ක්ෂකහන්නි කට අතිපතනයට වෙනියකතුයකනු සත්ව වර්ග එර tioneget attioned may over profition regarding Boven was developed more අවස්ථාව විශ්යවර්ග විශ්ය විශ්ය විශ්ය අදහස් සොමුද්ද විශ්ය සහසා සම්බන්ධ විශ්ය විශ්ය විශ්යවර්ග විශ්යවර විශ්යවර්ග විශ්යවර k betweeteigt Vieeces, The Walvertity of Chiteage, Etchesist Nouten, 1927-1928, pp. 41711 for abstract of any doctoral thesis on The delication Sheron, "

The Fillespin of Ferenalism, they York and Chadanatt, Mit (p 56 Cl. Mamedell, "The Religious Fragmations of Borden Pavilde Borde 27

(1847--1919) The Moreconellet. Vol 15, No. 4 (Autoria 1920) pp 356 To for development of the themse that indexest entialection) we a bowned or

of religious trails.

"The Christian Centery", April 20 1932, p 511 بلياني

The closy as an implated Science, New York, 1919, up 199 d. 18° \$ 63-

The Rescombledess of Christianity, p 46.

, (...

50 Theioxa and the Modera Mood, p 117

Vii q .. bidi

. 32 Idia, . Shall

.€3 Inid., pill

Of "God" in The Dictionary of Religion and Bickies, edited Chadisa , A. ... Mothern and G. B. Smith, Wew York, 1923, p 185

E.S. Gr. Theism and the Modern Mood, p 1614

Cf. C. F. Conger New Views of Evolution, New York, 1929, pp 17 48 . 32 In preceding issues of this journal, we have sketched two phases of the philosophy of religion known as recent Theism. We considered its structural ideas and its pragmatic, instrumentalistic or voluntaristic logic. Granted that this philosophy of religion has high interest-value for many persons, the questions of its possible truth-value must be considered. It should be observed that negative conclusions concerning the adequacy of its logic does not in itself condemn a system. It its present logic is discovered to be inadequate, a more adequate logic may be found to support it. Unless this is done, however, the system is suspect.

The use of the terms 'pragmatism', 'instrumentalism', and 'voluntarism' in the preceding paragraph may give rise to interminable discussions. If any of the persons considered object to these names, the effort required to prove either that they do or do not belong where we have placed them would hardly be worth the making. We are concerned with the basic reasoning used by them in supporting their philosophies of religion, not in classifying them in some neat category. The basic logic underlying recent Theism was stated specifically by the late Borden Parker Bowne: "Whatever our total nature calls for may be assumed as real in default of positive disproof." If by one's total nature is meant the rational, emotional, esthetic and voluntary interests or capacities, then this test would include everything, both cognitive and noncognitive, in our experience. But Bowne meant something much more specific than that. By way of introduction to his basic assumption, he wrote: "Man is will, conscience, emotion, aspiration; and these are far more powerful factors than the logical interest. Hence, in its practical unfolding the mind makes a great variety of practical postulates and assumptions which are not logical deductions or speculative necessities, but a kind of "modus vivendi" with the universe. They represent the conditions of our fullest life; and are at bottom expressions of our practical interests or necessities. And these are reached as articulate principles, not by speculative construction, but by analysis of practical life. Life is richer and deeper than speculation, and contains implicitly the principles by which we live." The basic logic of Theism, therefore, is a logic reared upon beliefs which find their justification in human value-considerations. The important cognitive problem is not that of deriving these pictures of reality; it is that of so relating onself to environing conditions that life is preserved and enriched.

That this is the basic logic of recent Theism has been indicated in the two preceding parts of this study. It may be worth while to consider two examples selected more or less at random from the available literature to remind our selves of this. In his discussion of the nature of God, E. S. Brightman considered pantheism as a possible theory. He rejected it summarily, not be-

the objective facts failed to support it, but because it implied a God who sinned in our sinning. Such a God could not serve the needs of Christians as Brightman conceives them. God defined in pantheistic terms loses his moral and spiritual values according to Brightman and to that extent becomes objectionable to man in his quest for more significant living. The same argument is to be found in Walter Marshall Horton's earlier writings. In "Theism and the Modern Mood," (1930), he defined God in empirical terms, and then proceeded to add the two attributes of Christlikeness and transcendence

^{*} The Bliff Review, Vol. V, No. 1, Winter, 1948

Frequency of restriction broses on a second fine for a factor of two absents of the public of property of restriction broses on a respect to a relative of restriction broses. In a resolution of respect to a relative politic object of respect to a relative of the property of respect to a relative resolution of the relative relative resolution of the relative relative resolution of the relative relative relative relative resolution of the relative rel

4

tions that life is preserved and enriched. these pictures of reality; it is that of so relating onself to savironing acadifore, is a logic reared upon beliefs which find their justification in human yalue-considerations. The important cognitive problem is not tast of devicing plicitly the principles by which we live, " 2 The basic logic of Theism, thenpractical life. Life is richer and deeper than apeculation, and containd the as articulate principles, nut by speculative construction, but by analysis of empressions of our practical interests or necestifies. And these are resolved universe. They represent the conditions of our fullest life; and are at bettook deductions or speculative necessities, but a hind of "modus vivands" with the a great variety of puactical gostulates and assumptions which see not logical tore than the logical interest. Mence, in ito practical unfolding the tains too are will, conscience, emotion, aspiretion; and these are far more powerful fan than that. By way of introduction to his basic assumption, he whotes (Man to cognitive, in our emericade. But howne meant comething ranch more appointed capacities, then this test would include everything, both cognitive and nonnature is meant the rational, emotional, esthetic and voluntary interests to may be assumed as real in default of positive disproof. " If by one's total cally by the late Borden Farker Bowne: "Whatever our total nature calls for nest category. The basic logic underlying recent Tuelsm was stated opening in supporting their philosophies of religion, not in classifying them in some be worth the making. We are concarned with the basic reasoning ased by thousand either that they do or do not belong where we have placed them would bardly of the persons considered object to these names, the effort required to page of in the preceding paragraph may give rise to interminable discussions. Many The use of the terms "pragmatism", "instrumentalism", and "voluntarism"

That this is the basic logic of recent Theiam has been indicated in the two preceding parts of this study. It may be worth while to consider two examples selected more or less at random from the available liferature to remaind our selves of this. In his discussion of the mature of God. E. S. Brightman considered pantheism as a possible theory. He rejected it summarity, not be-

the objective facts falled to support it, but because it implied a God who sinned in our simplied a God who brightman conceives them. Cod defined in pantheistic terms loses his more and spiritual values according to Brightman and to that extent becomes objectionable to man in his quest for more significant living. The same argument is to be found in Walter Marshall Florton's earlier writings, in Wilhelm and the Modern Mood, " (1930), he defined God in empirical terms, and then are ceeded to add the two attributes of Christificaness and transcendence.

[#] The MM Review, Vol. V. Mo. 1, Winter, 1945

to his empirically derived conception. These attributes were not added because the relevant objective data made them necessary; they were added because Horton believed that the most effective idea of God should include them. These two illustrations suggest the way in which recent Theism uses value considerations as the basis of its logic.

There are several forms of this "life-is-deeper-than-logic" type of thinking. We shall consider two of them. The first is presented concisely in William James famous lecture on "The Will to Believe," (1896). According to James, it is legitimate to adopt a faith which one has voluntarily accepted. This is especially true in the case of certain propositions called "live options". He analyzed hypotheses into those which were "living" and those which were "dead". Those which represented real possibilities were "living", whereas those which had no such appeal were "dead," He used the illustration of belief in the Mahdi ir Imam. To an Arab, belief in the Mahdi was a live possibility; to a Christian, it was not. "This shows that deadness and aliveness in an hypothesis are not intrinsic properties, but relations to the individual thinker. (The maximum of aliveness in an hypothesis means a willingness to act irrevocably. " 4 The next step in his argument consisted in an analysis of options. An option is a decision between two hypotheses. Options may be living or dead, 'forced' or 'avoidable', 'momentous' or 'trivial'. The options represented by the first of these paired terms - forced, living and momentous are genuine options.

James decided that whenever one faces a genuine option which cannot be decided upon intellectual grounds, he must decide it in terms of his 'passional' nature. In Bowne's language - whatever is required by our total nature may, and James would say 'must', be accepted in default of positive disproof, or according to James, in default of positive verifiability. James further stated that a living and momentous option is 'forced' whenever failure to decide itself constitutes a negative decision. Thus failure to act when some worthy cause is at stake may result in the loss of the cause. In this case, the failure to act was a vote of no confidence and contributed to the defeat of the cause. Thus we "make" some things true by accepting them and acting 'as if' they were true.

To the extent that live, momentous options are forced, and for which the objective evidence is insufficient to compel an 'intellectual' decision, the will to believe may be well accepted. We turn now to the structural ideas of recent Theism to determine whether or not they constitute live options which force us to decide for or against them in default of positive evidence.

TT

Recent theism consists in three closely integrated structural ideas: God as personal; man as self and body; the teleological destiny of man and the world. Each of these conceptions may be of concern to the contemporary. What one believes about the nature of God and man will have its effects, presumably, upon his choices relative to the "cold" war between the U.S. and the U.S.S.R. What one believes about the relation of this earth to the being and purposes of God may also effect man's enthusiasm for things here and now. Thus the problems posed by recent Theism may be considered living and perhaps momentous. The question may be asked, however, whether or not they are 'forced.'

The continuent of the continue

Lames decided that whenever one faces a genuine option which connot be due cided upon intellectual grounds. Se must decide it in terms of his spaces tools nature, in Nownels language - whatever is required by our jotal nature as and lames would say manner, be accepted in defeath of positive disputed accounting to Names, in default of positive verifiability, " James further that a living and meanentous option is forced whenever failure to decide it cense it at an examinate a negative decision. Thus failure to not whom rouns would be cense to at stake may result in the loss of the cause. In this daily one, to act was a vote of us confidence and contributed to the defeat of the cause. Into act we we have the things true by accepting them and acting has if the vote were true.

To the extent that live, momentous options are forced, and for which the objective evidence is insufficient to compet en 'antellectual' decision, the will to believe may be well accepted. We torn now to the structural ideas of recent Theirm to determine whether or not they constitute live options which force up to decide for or against them in default of positive and and.

5

Recent theism consists in three closely integrated structural ideas: God as personal; man as self and body; the teleological destiny of man and the world. Each of these conceptions may be of concern to the consemposary. What one believes about the nature of God and man will have its effects, passumably, upon his choices relative to the "cold" was between the W.S. and the W.S. S.R. What one believes risout the relation of this card to the being and purposes of God may also effect man's enthusiant for things have now. Thus the problems posed by recent Theisen may be considered investigant perhaps momentous. The question may be school, however, whether an action they are "forced."

It will be remembered that a "forced option" is one which cannot be decided upon "intellectual grounds," but which nevertheless must be decided. "Our passionalmature not only lawfully may, but must, decide an option between propositions, whenever it is a genuine option that cannot by its nature be decided on intellectual grounds; for to say, under such circumstances, 'Do not decide, but leave the question open,' is itself a passional decision—just like deciding yes or no—and is attended with the same risk of losing the truth." Granted then that the structural ideas of recent Theism represent genuine options and that in some degree at least failure to decide itself constitutes a dicision, is it true that these problems cannot, be decided upon intellectual grounds and that accordingly they must be subjected to pragmatic decision?

Some recent Theists would deny this. Brightman is ready to rest his case upon the test of coherence. He believes that the pragmatic test actually becomes the coherence test, i.e.., that that idea is presumably true which is at once self-consistent -- free from internal contradictions -- and which may also be integrated harmoniously with all other true ideas as well as the relevant facts. He adds that it must serve to "establish explanatory and interpretative relag tions between various parts of experience" when this is defined inclusively. It may be observed however, that the test of coherence may itself have a pragmatic basis. If one accepts Bowne's basic assumption, then the coherence test consists in the possibility of so interpreting the data of science and common-sense in such terms as will satisfy the demands of the western in-Every culture will have its own terpretation of Imankind's religious needs. test of coherence. Bowne was prepared to consider the moral consequences of a doctrine determinative of its truth. "If Christianity were not a worldpower, a great spiritual force here andnow, its origins and history would be a matter of profound indifference to all but a few antiquarians. The miracles, too, are to be studied in connection with the history, and not as isolated and detached wonders. Miracles without moral and religious bearing have as little credibility as the exploits of Jack, the Giant Killer, or the story of Aladdin's Lamp" 10 Bowne was very much interested in a coherent system of thought, but saw no possibility of arriving at "clear notions" without primary reliance upon the practical demands of life. Thus both Bowne and Brightman appear to rely rather heavily upon the practical rather than the theoretical 'reason') And the same thing is true of other members of the recent theistic group.

It is necessary therefore to examine critically the view that recent Theism actually presents us with a live option in its conception of God. It should be observed that Bowne maintained that only "relevant" ideas are worthy of consideration. He based his interest in Christianity upon the fact that it was a "great spiritual force here and now." If God is acutally personal, transcendent, and immanent, and seeks to develop ideal persons inan ideal society, then there should be empirical evidence to support this conception both in history and in contemporary society. Furthermore, the physical envir onment should give unquestioned support to this enterprise. By implication, therefore, we may say that recent Theism, is, according to some of its spokesmen, an hypothesis or series of integrated hypotheses which are, and must be, subject to empirical verification. We do not confront a "forced" option for the reason that the hypothes is, by definition, one for which objective evidence must be available. If no affirmations were made concerning living persons and cultural evolution, then the ogtion might be 'foced' in the sense that it could not be resolved intellectually. But in this case, primary reliance is placed upon "experience," and experience is primary in empiricism.

The control of the second production of the control of the control

the seme thing is true of other members of the recent Metatic (many). rely sether heavily upon the practical rather than the thecreatival freader uppen the practical demands of this. They both Bower and Brigh interempt to dub ears de goeskaliky of armiring at folear mathemat without pridatily velicies to Bowne was very much interested in a coherent operors of the eff eredibility as the emploits of Neet, the Clast Killer, or the chary of Aladia detached wendeze. Mirestes whhout moral and rabilions bearing by very 10000 tan, are to be stadied in councetion with the blotomy, and mot or included the a makes of profound indifference to all but a few antiquentions. The subsection power, a gress spinitres force bere undnove, too origins and bildical vestil in ed a decimina determinative of its innah, "M Claristianity were ned a woold. tout at coherence. Bowns was propared to comutater the morest come species in compression of Imaginal o religious needs. - **Meery collines** will baye the own common-sense in such terms as will sationly the derrands of the mechanicatest complais in the poscability of so interpreting the data of prisper and pragmette basis. If one accepts howne's basic assumption, then the coherence of It may be observed however, that the test of coherence may steak have a tions between various parts of experience" when this is defined inclusively. He adds that it must serve to "establish explanatory and interpressitive rate. integrated hazmeniously with all other true ideas as well as the retevent factor. self-consistent--free from internal contradictions -- and which may also be the coherence test, i.e. . , that that idea is presumably true which in at any a apon the test of coherence. He bolieves that the pragmatic tost actually becomes Some recent Weisto would deny this. Brightman is ready to rest los cone

experience is primary in empiricism. ually. But in this case, primary reliance is placed apor "emperiesce," and the option might be staced in the sense that it could not be resolved intellers affirmations were made concerning living persons and cultural evolution, thou is, by definition, one for which objective evidence must be available. verification. We do not confront a "forced" option for the reazon that the hyperina or series of integrated hypotheses which are, and must be, subject to emplaced say that recent Theism, is, according to some of its spokesmen, an hypothesis unquestioned support to this enterprise. By implication, therefore, we may contemporary society. Furthermore, the physical envir orment should give should be empiriscal evidence to support this conception both in bintery and in and immanent, and seeks to develop ideal persons inan ideal society, then there-"great spiritual force here and now." If God is acutally personal, examenant and sidenation. He based his interest in Christianity upon the fact that it was a observed that Bowne maintained that only "relovant" ideas and would of the actually presents us with a live option in its conception of Mod. A charle be-M is necessary therefore to examine oritically the view that reason Windo

When this hypothesis is approached empirically, the evidence for it is by no means conclusive. One of the most incisive thinkersoof the group, E. S. Brightman, recognized this fact nearly twenty years ago, and attempted to meet it by the development of "The Given" as an explanation of God's slowness in realizing his goals. By the "Civen" Brightman means certain restrictions within the nature of God which hinder Him from achieving His goals as rapidly as He desires. Evil, then, is due in part to certain necessary limitations within the nature of God. Thus God conforms to the structural ideas of recent Theism, but is prevented or hindered by internal conflict from shoing by His deeds what He purposes to do, at least he cannot show His purposes so clearly that they can be discerned by impartial observers. The reliance upon values—considerations, in their attempts to validate their theories is eloquent evidence of their acceptance of the judgment that empirical data do not make these theories necessary.

But recent Theists are not ready to accept this conclusion. At this point they turn to the logic of Ecclesiastical Humanism as presented in this journal in the Spring, 1946 issue. Echlesiastical Humanism rested its case upon the Law of Excluded Middle, namely, that between contradictories there is no middle ground. Traditional Theism and Ecclesiastical Humanism were presented as contradictories. Contradictory terms are such that if A is true, the B is necessarily false, and, if A is false, then B is necessarily true. After disproving—to their own satisfaction—that traditional Theism could not be true, they accepted Ecclesiastical Humanism as true.

Recent Theists use muchthe same type of test, Accepting mechanism as a non-teleological or anti-teleological explanation of the total universe on the one hand, and recent Theism as a teleological explanation of it on the other, recent Theists believe the issue here presented is a 'live' or'forced' option. There is evidence for both mechanism and purpose, but there is not sufficient evidence for either to compel universal assent. With the evidence so divided, one should choose the 'higher' or most 'useful' explanation. So stated, there appears to be little choice, and teleology is accepted. 12

But the validity of this argument depends upon the question of the applicability of the Law of Excluded Middle in this case. We found that the logic of Ecclesiastical Humanism failed at this point because several other possible explanations were available. It appears true also in the case of recent Theism that there are other possibilities. Many years ago, the late W. G. Everett observed that the universe appeared to be a "kingdom of many ends," and human destiny was doubtless one of them. According to his hypothesis, mechanism and teleology and perhaps other interests could find a place in a comprehensive view of reality as a whole. The point of view called Absolute Immanence to be presented in a future issue suggests another possibility. Consequently, the choice between mechanism on the one thand and teleological Theism on the other is by no means a 'forced' option. There are other hypotheses available. Accordingly, the conditions which James laid down asnecessary before one could legitamately use "the will to believe" do not obtain in the case of recent Theism's God-concept. It does not face a forced option between mechanism and its view of God, There are other possibilities at hand. This means that the issue must be fought out in the 'intellectual' rather than the 'passional' realm.

III

The second form of pragmatic logic which is often employed by recent Theists is the voluntaristic logic of the late E.S.C. Schiller (1864-1937). As a student at Oxford University when Darwin's theories on evolution were gaining populari support, he became profoundly impressed by the fact that life was purposive and engaged in the constant struggle for more efficient living. At the same time,

The second secon

But recent Theists are not ready to accept this constusion, At this point they term to the logic of Ecolosiastical Humanism as presented in the foring, 1946 issue. Ecilesiastical Humanism rested to compare upon the Law of Excluded Middle, namely, that between contradictories depression to middle ground. Traditional Theism and Ecclesiastical Rumanism was presented as contradictories. Contradictory terms are such that if A is true, the B is necessarily false, and, if A is false, then B is necessarily true, and, if A is false, then B is necessarily true. After disproving—to their own satisfaction—that traditional Theism could not be true, they accepted Ecclesiastical Mumanism as true.

Recent Theisto use muchthe same type of toot, Accepting mechanism or a probablentogical or anti-teleological combination of the total universe on the case hand, end recent Theism as a teleological emplanation of it on the other, recent Theists believe the issue here presented is a live or floated, to the Thore is evidence for both mechanism and perpasse, but there is not autificate evidence for either to compal universal ascent. With the evidence accidence one should choose the thigher or most tuseful emplanation. To stated, then appears to be little choice, and taloology is accepted.

out in the fintellectual' rather than the "passional" realm. There are other possibilities at hand. This means that the issue must be dony for cept. It does not face a forced option between medianism and its view of Conuse "the will to believe" do not obtain in the case of vecent Theism's God-cost the conditions which James laid down aspecessary before one sould legitures to no means a forced option. There are other hypotheses available, Adeovations between mechanism on the one thand and teleclogical Theism on the officer is by scated in a future isome suggests another possibility. Consequently, the abstract reality as a whole. The point of view called Absolute immenesce to be predoubtlees one of them. According to his hypotheese, mechanism and telecions and perhaps other interests could find a place in a comprehensive view of the universe appeared to be a "kingdom of many ends," and lauman deciding "end other possibilities. Many years ago, the late W. C. Everatt observed that were avoitable. Mappears true also in the case of recent libeton that though the sastical Mumerism failed at this point because several other genelals employed of of the Lew of Excluded Middle in this case. We found that the logic of Berlins-But the validity of this argument depends upon the quastion of the application.

£ EF

The second form of pragmatic logic which is often employed by recent Thatche is the voluntaristic logic of the late F.S.C., Schiller (1864-1937). As a student at Onford University when Darwin's theories on evolution were gaining popularie sumport, he became profoundly impressed by the fact that life was purposed and engaged in the constant straighte for more efficient living. At the some then

he was taught classical logic in his courses which appeared to him to be completely divorced from living issues. The result was the development of a "humanistic" logic, one in which the hyman worth of ideas was emphasized. Later, he moved toward a "voluntaristic" logic in which the significance of man's choices was given a dominant place. He was, until the end of his life, profoundly concerned with a dominant efficiency of thinking. His impatience with formal logic and his continued polemic against it is but another expression of his interest in a logic of efficiency.

Schiller deserves much credit for his emphasis. Religion is admittedly one of mankind's major interests. As such, it utilizes thinking in the furtherance of its quests. If one considers religion to be the means whereby individuals and groups find significant meaning even and especially in unsatisfactory and inescapable situations, then the practical efficiency of thinking is essential to intelligent and efficient religious living. If, furthermore, God is the name which religious persons give to the Dynamic Determinant of their total Existential Medium, gious persons give to the Dynamic Determinant of thinking must be given high rating. Schiller's emphasis upon the human worth of thinking must be given high rating. Religion is one of lmankind's most serious concerns. As such, it can have little to do with verbalisms and logical legerdemain.

Granted, then, that the primary interest of Schiller is important, det us see what it means for the logic of Theism, (Truth, according to Schiller, means the successful conclusion of a purposive cognitive quest. "For in point of fact our thinking is volitional through and through. It is set going by desizes and purposes; it is driven onwards by the urgency of problems. It pursues ends which appear to it as good and is pervaded and steered by values of all kinds. Truth itself moved us, not because it is distant and unattainable, disinterested and dispassionat but becauseeit is near and dear to our hearts; it is felt to be a value and worth achieving, even at the sacrifice of ignobler aims and lesser values." 13 This indicates the trend of Schiller's thought; truth is equivalent to the successful conclusion of a cognitive venture. It is the possible satisfaction of basic and felt n which impels us to think, and our thinking is successful and efficient if it helps uz reach the desired culmination . Thinking is thus one phase of man's quest for values It is successful to the extent that it eventuates in satisfactory ways of believing and acting; it is unsuccessful to the extent that it does not. This accounts for Schiller's persistent attack upon formal logic: it bore no human

This phase of Schiller's voluntaristic logic is subject to serious question, a fact of which he was aware. He insisted that choices must be made which are favorable to the interestsof the thinker. At the same time, he insisted that whether or not they would prove to be favorable in practice had to be determined by 'application' to specific situations. Indeterminism, for example, at the human level is verified in the actual practice of acting "freely". The process whereby a truth-claim becomes a truth was described in the following way. Whereby a truth-claim becomes a truth-claim. Thinking thus begins with a problematic situation confronting some person. Secondly, the truth sought is problematic situation confronting some person. Secondly, the truth sought is and is preferred by its formulator to all the other possibilities of which he is aware. Thirdly, verification is a matter of continued practice or application of the truth to living situations. If the hypothesis functions as it should, so that its formulator finds it preferable to all other possibilities, it is considered to be true, at least for the time being.

Truth is thus equated with satisfactory outcomes or consummations. It is at this point that most recent Theists become interested in volunaristic logic. They, too, seek the most satisfactory outcomes in their quest for God and for optimistic attitudes toward the consummation of human enterprises. But this demand for "preferable" outcomes is an intellectual hazard for the religious

្រុំក្នុង ខែ នៅ និះ ១០៩៩នៅ នៅនី និង សមានប្រជាពល ១៤០ ២០ នៅមេខាង ១៩៩ ២៩ និង និងនៅឈ្មោះ ១៩៣១៤៦ ភូមិការប្រាវិទី

Schiller duseuwes vrzel ouwitt for is owegients. Teithich to educited of manistrate analyse interesting. As each, it millers thrulang is the level constraint of its greate. If one considers religion in he fire uners which in a the constant groups itsels significant meaning even and eoperally in mostificat or an income cepsible attuations, then the practical afficionar of this bring is essential to a igant and ellisteine voltying living. If herings of Cai is the city of the color of la de la compania del compania de la compania de la compania del compania de la compania del compania de la compania de la compania del compania de la compania del com

minumobregal ischyni has smalledvov dibv ob or

Granted, then, that the primary interest of Schiller is imperieve, det en er what it means for the logic of Theism. Truth, according to Bakiner, moreous successful constitution of a purpositive cognitive quast. There in paid the first thicking is volitional through and through. It is set going by don's sond pully the it is driven cawards by the argancy of problems. It purches eads with a second to it as good and is perveded and steeced by values of all ideals. Vertile the moved no, not because it is distant and unattainable, distanceressed and dispense but becameceis is mear and dank to our hearts; it is fait to be a seem at the comment but achieving, even at the sacrifice of ignobler sime and lesser values. The indicates the trend of Schiller's thought; truth is equivalent to the aucestern conclusion of a cognitive venture. It is the preciple entialection of leading rec which impels up to think, and our thinking it enought and officient if it is to us reach the desired autmination . Thinking is thus one place of man's gravit values. He is successful to the extent that it eventuates in antipheter were very believing and acting; it is unouccessful to the extent that it does not, this ancount for Schiller's permistant aftack upon formal legic: it deem no busses

This phase of Schiller's voluntaristic logic is subject to serious question test of which he was aware. He insisted that choices must be worde which he favorable to the interestrof the thinker. At the same time, he insisted the whether or sot they would prove to be favorable in practice bad to be determined by 'spikestion' to specific situations, indeterminism, for example, of the human level is verified in the actual practice of acting "freely". The previous whereby a truth-clotin becomes a truth was described in the following way First, some person must make a truth-claim. Thinking thus begins with a problemetic situation confronting some person. Secondly, the truth rought or become in clways "the most valuable judgment possible under the conditions of ite most and is preferred by its formulator to all the other pensibilities of which he aware, we Thirdly, verification is a matter of continued practice as applicable of the truth to living structions. If the typothesis functions as it should no test its formulator finds it preferable to all other possibilities, it is constituted a cana, at least for the thing being.

මධ්ය විශ්යා මත්ත්ව මත් වර්ගය සම්බන්ධ වෙන්න මුත්ත්ව වෙන්න වෙන් වෙන්න වෙන on had Et 19 self sacas whole of a semeration where he had saces will know out of the egidar lekig eksku-der torsand iko opromansek un et magat u erdentuklent. But kole Parkagi lan 1900 yiki sebengi dikinda Manadi Asama na nanahasa kedidahahaha kederakan

thinker. He may develop the most satisfactory hypothesis concerning God and hyman destiny, and accept the satisfaction derived from the contemplation of this hypothesis rather than from psychosomatic experience, as proof of the truth of the theory. This, as we noted above, apparently prompted Brightman to deny pantheism and Horton to deny absolute immanence. Thinking must be prepared to accept actual conditions, whether ornot a given thinker 'prefers' them.

This principle—that preference is no substitute for objective verification is readily recognized in other fields. The physician who examines a patient seeks to determine the source of illness and to reach the most hopeful prognosis. If, however, he is a physician worthy of his profession, he must diagnoze the conditions he observes whether or not either he or the patient 'prefers' this. Intelligent treatment is possible only when the 'facts' in the case have been determined. Among these, the 'fact' that the patient prefers to recover must be accepted. At the same time, it is not a relevant fact in trying to decide whether the patient has an infected appendix or an inoperable cancer. Truth, as a factual report of existent conditions, is a highly—prized commodity in medicine. It should also be in philosophy and religion.

The definition of God as personal and partially immanent may be preferable to many Occidentals. This is a psychological fact to the extent that it is a verifiable report of our preferences. As such, it may lead us into long and involve processes of reasoning in the endeavor to find grounds for believing it. As a candidate for truth, however, this hypothesis lmust be verified, first, by asking how it may be proved, and then by making the tests specified. Our "preference" for this view of God will serve as a motiviational factor compelling us to explore every possibility; it must not be accepted in place of actual verificatory operations.

Schiller drew attention to this danger in an article under the intriguing title.
"Truthseekers and Soothsayers." 15 "Truthseekers" were defined as those who approached the cognitive situation seeking for lithe best possible solution. Their interest was the most advantageous resolution of the difficulty in hand. Truthseekers are not absolutists since they are ever on the alert for better solutions than those held at present. Truth is for the truthseekers something which is essentially progressive and based upon selections of the relevant data.

"Soothsayers" approach the problem of truth with essentially different interests. They seek to satisfy or 'sooth' themselves and others emotionally rather than to reach conclusions based upon experimentation or practice. In this connection, Schiller regretted that the connection between "sooth" and "soothe" had been lost, and would have welcomed its re-establishment. "It would serve to indicate a very important sentimental function of absolute truth as a sort of 'paregorical imperative, 'and would distinguish it very neatly from its humdrum everyday uses."

This distinction between "truthseekers" and "soothsayers" was made by Schiller to call attention to truth as a human instrument in the quest for actual and preferable consummations. It was thus something different in principle from the "truths" which were believed to be 'absolute' and inapplicable to the human situation of everyday living.



A COLOR OF THE COL

This principle what preference is no embersum for objective with a nurse readily recognized in other dielie. The physician who examence i patient seeks to determine the source of illuses and to reach the most hope in property of alagnosa the conditions he to a physician worthy of his profession. In motify diagnosa the conditions he observes whether or not either he or was paried prefers this, intelligent treatment is possible only when the "later" of the condition he determined. Among these, the "fact" that the patient profession recover must be accepted. At the same time, it is not a reisyer the laying to devide whether the patient has an infected appendix or an including the came the period of the patient of an anish as a tracky procession cancer. Truth, as a factual report of existent conditions, is a tracky prime commodity in medicine. It should also be in philosophy and religion.

The definition of Cod as parsonal ad partially immortant and he partially immortant and he partially in any Confidentials. This is a payanological fact to the entent tion of the result to be a confidential of and partial confidences. As such, is may lead as at a fact, and as at a confidence of the responding in the andes as to find grounds for believed to the last and the result of the last and the result of the last and the result of the last and the last at the last and the last at the last and the last at a confidence of an and a last and the result of the last and the result of the last and the result of an analysis of the result of the result of the result of an analysis.

The following the second of the complete of th

Socians years approach the prisate training to the continued of a second of a

Tips distinction between the class result and spotisepets was made to a post sepend was made to any for an establism to deliver to the constant and preference to the constant and preference to make the constant and preference to the constant and preference to the constant and to be constant as a post of a

56

We may approach the evaluation of voluntaristic logic by an examination of its applicability to the several problems in religious thinking. The primary contention involved in pragmatic and voluntaristic logic in this connection is that certain ideas may be "made true" by human choices and human activity. William James stated that sometimes it is our faith "in a fact which helps to create the fact." Schiller believed that "true" and "false" were "valuations," and that truth is "made" in the process of verification. Is Thus both James and Schiller view the cognitive process as a phase of markind's struggle for survival and life—enrichment. If one succeeds in making an idea come true which enables him to achieve his goals, this is the truth in the specific situation. If he fails to make the idea yield good results, whatever other significance it may have is presumably irrelevant,

This is in essence the logic of efficiency, and is basic to British and American pragmatism, instrumentalism, humanism and voluntarism. It has been used by American theologians and philosophers of religion who may not care to call themselvesbby these names. The point is that they consider the "value" of an idea as its primary validation. As indicated in the previous discussions of "The Logic of Recent Theism," this type of thinking is utilized in whole or in part by most of them.

Let us admit at once that this form of thinking is valid in some areas of religious thinking. Religion represents the attempt to achieve specific values by means of a reinterpretation of man and his cosmic Environment and through the use of various techniques. Techniques are defined as overt behaviors engaged in by individuals and groups for the purpose of achieving values believed to be religious. The Logic of Efficiency appears to be perfectly adapted to the solution of the problems posed by techniques. Is prayer more effective than meditation? or sacramentalism than ethical and social activity interpreted as cooperation with God in the realization of the good life? The answer must be determined in actual practice. What is the effect of the persistent use of certain techniques upon the lives of those who employ them? Here truth is 'made' in the actual practice of the implications of specific hypotheses. To the extent the recent Theists rely upon the logic of efficiency innthe area of the techniques of religion, they are to be commended for their insight.

When we face the problem of God, however, the situation is quite different. The term God emerges from the second or reinterpretive phase of religious experience.) When men find it impossible to change external conditions to meet their subjective interests, some reference is normally made to the Existential Medium, the more inclusive Environment upon which they have relied for the conservation of their religious values, and in cooperation with whice they have sought these values. In so far as this is true, the reality called God must be subjected to two tests: (1) the test of objective existence, and (2) that of relie gious value or availability.) The logic of efficiency of recent Theists appara ently ignores the first of these two tests. There is profound interest in the religious significance of various God-concepts, but there does not appear to be a correspondingly deep interest in their truth-values. It should be obvious that a non-existent reality is not actually 'available, ' and to the extent that persons rely upon such non-existent reality they may find "comfort" in their beliefs, but it is a comfort derived from fiction rather than fact. Eventually, when some crucial test is made, the fictional character of such a non-existent Deity will become evident. This is but to say that it is impossible to ignore the test of objective existence no matterhow deep our concern for "religious values" in a given conception of God may be.

This means that the test called "the right to believe" if any idea of God

of the applicability as its productive of articularity is in an evacularity of the applicability as its proposed productive and returnations in this control of the articles of interpolation of the articles are increased in progression in the articles and broken articles. William flatters etacled that connectioned it is our fourth time a fact which helps to present the facts, "If fabriller believed that there and Walso' were trained to present the fact in the process of vertification. It fine both flames and Schiller view the cognitive process as a please of manking's struggle for curvival and life--enviountent. If one succeeds in the truth is the specific situation. If he fails to make the idea yield good the truth is the specific situation. If he fails to make the idea yield good the truth is the specific situation. If he fails to make the idea yield good.

This is in essence the logic of efficiency, and is basic to British and American progradism, instrumentalism, humanism and voluntarism. At has been used by American theologians and philosophers of religion who used not care to call themselvesby those names. The point is that they contained the Evalue of an idea as its primary validation. As indicated in the previous discussions of "The Logic of Recent Theism," this type of thinking is ublished in whole or in part by most of them.

Lest us admit at once that this form of thinking is valid in some areas of religious thinking. Religion represents the astempt to achieve specific value of by means of a reinterpretation of man and the cosmic dinvironment and through the use of various techniques. The Logic of Efficienty appears to be perfectly values by liaved to be religious. The Logic of Efficienty appears to be perfectly adapped to the solution of the problems posed by techniques. Its proper more alternatives from meditation? or sacramentalism than ethical and sould antivity interpretate cooperation with God in the realization of the good life? The answer man be determined in actual practice. What is the effect of the persistent man of anately in the actual practice of the test is the effect of the persistent man of made in the actual practice of the test into the logic of sixticienty limites area of the extent the recent Theists rely upon the logic of sixticienty limits area of the techniques of religion, they are to be commended for their limight.

values" in a given conception of God may be. twe test of objective emisters no matterial now deco end concert is " ಸಾಗ್ರೆಯಿಂದು Daily will become evident. This is but to say that to in impossible to ignore when some crucial seet is made, the fintional character of such a non-remote of beliefs, but it is a comfort devived from flation rather than fast. Eventually, persons rely upon such nea-existent reality they may that transact in their that a mon-existent reality is not actually "available," and to the enters that be a correspondingly deep interest in their stuth-values. It should be obvious religions significance of various Cod-concepts, but there does not appear to ently ignores the first of these two tests. There is profound interest in the gious value or availability. The logic of efficiency of recent Thetate appear subjected to two tests: (1) the test of objective anistence, and (2) that of relisought these values. In co far as this is true, the needity called God must be conservation of their religious values, and in cooperation with whice they have Medium, the more taclusive Environment upon which they have relied for the their subjective interests, some reference is normally made to the Emistandian experience. When men find it impossible to change external conditions to meet The term God amerges from the second or reinterpretive phase of religious When we face the problem of God, however, the situation to guite different

satisfies given religious demands may not be considered legitimate. One has "the right to believe" in the God defined by recent Theism when the objective evidence supports this view, butmuot otherwise.

The next question follows normally: can we "make" the Theistic congeption of God true by voluntarily accepting it and then acting on that basis?

Let us suppose that a given group of philosophers were determined to "make" Hegel's theory of the dialectical development of history true. Would their determination to believe this, and their subsequent behavior as though it were true actually remake history to conform to this theory? The answer appears clear: if history actually developed as Hegel has affirmed, the question of whether or not we believed it is irrelevant. If it did not, then all the affirmations of persons would make no difference to it. The past remains what it was. Our understanding of it may change with growing information and new hypotheses. These newer hypotheses may approximate more closely what actually occurred, but they do not make or un make what has been.

It is rather difficult to understand how our beliefs would change the nature or structure of reality. If the Idealistic conception of reality is approximately true—if reality is essentially non-spatial, suprasensuous or valuational—then it would appear impossible to change it by acting as if it were different. Conversely, if the organic view of reality is a more approximate view of it, then all the denials of the Idealists would appear to be irrelevant. It does not appear possible to "remake" reality either by thinking about it or even by acting as if the more desired view were correct.

Schiller, it should be observed, recognized the limitations of the "truthmaking" function of thought. When he considered the problem of metaphysics, he concluded that no system had "coercive" qualities. It was an individual "creation," and as such might be 'useful' to its creator, but not to others. "In the last resort every genuine and heartfelt metaphysic is a poem, and derives its unity and aesthetic appeal from the personal vision and imagination of its 'maker' or poet. 20 The human mind cannot transform reality into any form itchooses, nor can human activity transform more than the superficial phases of the world, even with atomic fission. The volumaristic logic of Schiller is excellent within the limits set for it, namely, the sphere in which we can transform or "make" things conform to our desires by means of our actions. It is obvious, or should be, that the basic characteristics or characteristics of the totality within which we live, move and have our being cannot be so changed. They may be understood, and we may continuously revise our conceptions as our knowledge grows, but some consideration should be given to the difference between changing reality and changing our understanding of it.

We may summarize this phase of our discussion briefly. The logic of efficiency is certainly applicable to the area of religious techniques. We may determine the efficacy of prayer, mysticism, formal worship and asceticism in the field of religion by testing them out in actual experience, and probably in no other way. But this should not lead to the assumption that because voluntarism is operationally effective in one area it is the same in all. When we change the nature of the problems with which we deal, we must consider the changes in our methods which may be required. An examination indicates that thenature of God—defining God in objective rather than subjective terms—is not "made" or "remade" by thinking or even by acting. The logic which appears most adequate here will be presented in a future issue when we consider the logic of Absolute Immanence. Here we must be content to point out the difficulties in the logic based upon "the will to believe"

Banks a commence engineers of the relation by the commence of the commence of

The acm greed to follows as an interest to the Macistic conception of the act greed to the Macistic conception of the distribution of philosophers a ser actemized to taske defend a theory of the distribution of their concequent for the distribution of their determination to believe this, and their concequent behavior as though it were true actually remains bistory to conform to this theory? The answer appears piears if history actually developed as Hegel has affirmed, the question of whether or not we believed it is irrelevant. If it did not, then all the affirmations of persons would make no difference to it. The past remains what it was. Our understanding of it may change with growing into mation and new hypotheses. These newer hypotheses may approximate accreasely what actually occurred, but they do not make or un make what has been,

It is rather difficult to understand how our beliefs would change the matter or structure of reality. If the Idealistic conception of reality is approximate true--if reality is essentially non-spatial, suprasensuous or valuational discrete would appear impossible to change it by acting as if it were different. Conversely, if the organic view of reality is a more approximate view of it, then all the denials of the Idealists would appear to be irrelevant. It does not appear possible to "remake" reality either by thinking about it or even by acting as if the more desired view were correct.

our understanding of it. ation should be given to the difference between changing reality and changing uously revise our conceptions as our knowledge grows, but some consider being cannot be so changed. They may be understood, and we may constant or characteristics of the totality within which we live, move and have our of our actions. It is obvious, or should be, that the basic characteristics which we can transform or "make" taings conform to our desires by means of Schiller is excellent within the family set for it, namely, the sphere in ficial phases of the world, even with atomic flasion, The volumarichic logic any form ischooses, nor can human activity transform more than the exper derives its unity and aesthetic appeal from the personal vision and imagination of its "maker" or post, 20 The human mind camet transform resisty into "In the last record every genuine and heartfalt metaphyaic is a posur, and "creation," and an amal might be lunedal' to its prestor, but not to athere. he concluded that so system had "cosrcive" qualities. It was an individual making" function of thought. When he considered the problem of metaphysics Schiller, it should be cheerved, recognized the limitations of the "trust

We may summarize this phase of our discussion briefly. The logic of efficiency is certainly applicable to the area of religious techniques. We may determine the efficacy of prayer, mysticism, formal worship and asceticism in the field of religion by testing them out in actual experience, and probably in no other way. But this should not lead to the assumption the because volutiarism is operationally effective in one area it is the same in all. When we change the nature of the problems with which we deal, we consider the changes in our methods which may be required. An examination indicates that thenature of God-admining Cod in objective rather than subjective terms—is not "made" or "remade" by thinking on even by acting jective terms—is not adequate here will be presented in a future issue to then we consider the logic of Absolute Ammenance. Mere we must be done then to point out the difficulties in the logic besed upon the will to believe?

Tr

Another phase of the logic of recent Theism deserves attention. It is the basic assumption upon which some of its logic is abased. In Bowners terms, as quoted above, "Whatever our total nature calls for may be assumed as real in default of positive disprosf, "21 It may be granted that this is the way in which common-sense thinking is done, as Bowne affirmed, but this does not mean such thinking must be accepted uncritically, if at all. If one accepts this view, the result may be a logic of wishes, or urges or basic drives. The organism has no desire for extinction: one may say, therefore, that our total nature "calls for" continued existence upon this planet, or in some "erotic paradise" of the Trobriand Islanders, or even in the most sacred heaven of the medieval Christian. This may be accepted, if the facts justify it, as a correct reading of man as a biological creature, except in so far as he fails to achieve satisfactory adjustments and turns "against himself." At the same time, this biological or even axiological demand cannot be accepted as legislative for the universe. Man lives and man dies. The fact that he does not wish to die must be given consideration, but cannot be accepted as proving his immortality sithout considerable of additional support.

It may be true that many people wish to believe in God as defined by recent Theism. The fact that this is the case must be accepted as a commentary upon man andhis interests, but it cannot be accepted as proof that this theory is true. It may be accepted as the driving force or impelling motive back of much theological thinking, but may not be accepted as a substitute for the "active" persistent, andcareful consideration of any belief or supposed form of knowledge in the light of the grounds which support it, and the further conclusions to which it leads, " which John Dewey believes is the essence of reflective thought. 22 If one begins with the assumption that reality must be such as to satisfy our "total natures," we may, already, have accepted our conclusions before the cognitive process is actually under way. It would appear more reasonable to examine a human being to determine what his needs and interests may be, and then examine his environment to determine whether or not it is such as to satisfy these needs and interests fully. This is, of course, the method which is used in other than theological fields. There appears to be no grounds upon which theology can adopt a method which gives it such an advantage over all others. The sociologist must study man and his sociophysical environment; the political scientist must do the same. Upon what grounds can we excuse the theologian from examining the total environment within which man is found if he wishes to define thenature of that environment, or especially that phase of it which is Divine?

Among recent Theists, thisquestion is answered in terms of the view that man is organic to nature. As such, he reflects nature inhhimself and is reflected therein. To the extent that man is organic to nature—continuous with and immanent in—he may be examined as a "fair sample" of what this reality is. Thus the problems of ontology or being may be resolved by beginning with man as the datum. What, then, is true of man is true of nature.

But this conception is subject to further analysis. It is doubtless true that man is organic to nature, i.e., that he is immanent in and continuous with the organic life on this planet and is dependent upon both the planet and the sum for sis sustenance. If one wishes to investigate the life of this planet, it is essential that man be given serious consideration. He is part and a product of a long evolutionary process which goes back at least to the simplest forms of life empirically recoverable. Furthermore, he is one of the more complex of the existing forms, and is perhaps the most complex which has ever existed

Another phase of the logic of recent Theism deserves attention. It is the basic assumption upon which some of its logic is abased. In Bowas's terms, as quoted above, "Whatever our total nature calls for may be assumed as real in default of positive disprobf, util It may be granted that this is the wey in which common-sense thinking is done, as Bowne affirmed, but this does not mean such thinking must be accepted uncritically, if at all. If one accepts this view, the result may be a logic of whees, or urges or basic drives. The organism has no desire for extinction; one may say, therefore, that our total nature "calls for" centinued existence upon this planet, or in some "crotic paradise" of the Trobriand Islanders, or even in the most sacred heaven of the medieval Christian. This may be accepted, if the facts justify it, as a cerrect reading of man as a biological creature, except in so far as he fails to achieve satisfactory adjustments and turns "against himself." At the same time, this biological or even axiological demand cannot be accepted as legislative for the universe. Man lives and man dies. The fact that he does not wish to die must be given considerable of additional support.

It may be true that many people wish to believe in God as defined by recent Theism. The fact that this is the case must be accepted as a commentary un persistent, andcareful consideration of any belief or supposed form of long ledge in the light of the grounds which support it, and the further conclusions to which it leads, " which John Dewey believes is the essence of reflective thought, 22 If one begins with the assumption that reality must be such as to satisfy our "total natures," wimay, already, have accepted our conclusions before the cognitive process is actually under way. It would appear more reasonable to examine a human being to determine what his needs and interests may be, and then examine his environment to determine whether or not it is such as to satisfy these needs and interests fully. This is, of course the method which is used in other than theological fields. There appears to be no grounds apon which theology can adopt a method which gives it such an advantage over all others. The sociologist must study man and his sociophysical environment; the political scientist must do the same. Upon what grounds can we excuse the theologien from examining the total environment within which man is found if he wishes to define thenature of that environment, or especially that phase of it which is Divine?

Among recent Theists, thisquestion is answered in terms of the view that man is organic to nature. As such, be reflects nature inhhimself and is reflected therein. To the extent that man is organic to nature—continuous with and immanent in—he may be examined as a "fair sample" of what this reality is. Thus the problems of ontology or being may be resolved by beginning with man as the datum. What, then, is true of man is true of nature

But this conception is subject to further analysis, it is doubtless true that man is organic to nature, i.e., that he is immanent in and continuous with the organic life on this planet and is dependent upon both the planet and the sum for sis sustenance. If one wishes to investigate the life of this planet, it is essential that man be given serious consideration. He is part and a product of a long evolutionary process which goes back at least to the simplest forms of life empirically recoverable. Furthermore, he is one of the more complex of the existing forms, and is perhaps the most complex which has ever existed

on the earth. Granted all this, how much relevance should be given to the study of man when our concern is with astronomy or even geology? Man, in these studies, becomes a minor factor as a datum. He may be important, epistemologically, as the one who is thinking, but he is not important as a datum. This is but to say that whereas man is organic to part of nature, the life on the earth, he is by no means organic to all of nature.

This means that if we begin with the assumption that men is the basic datum in terms of which we shall understand God as the basic factor in all reality, we have practically begged the question at the start. This may be a conclusion we reach at the end of our thinking. We must not begin with assumptions which preclude us from reaching any other conclusions.

VI

We are left, then, with the view that recent Theism appears to be a brave attempt to interpret man and his total environment, jincluding God. It provides the foundation for many beliefs which would be quite serviceable for anxious and troubled persons. At the same time, its basic logic isnot above suspicion. Its primary defect lies in the attempt to rely upon human choices or decisions as legislative for reality.) William James was careful to insist that we had the "right to believe" only in such areas where our choices vitally affected the truth of our propositions; where failure to choose meant a negative choice. Schiller also confined himself to such human and social situations where the individual's choice actually served to "make" true the proposition he had accepted. When it came to metaphysical questions, he was unwilling to think of systematic metaphysics as more than "poems," whose appeal lay in the personal vision and imagination of their "makers."

The logic of recent Theism is excellent in the area of religious techniques, in the areas where we seek to find more efficient methods of relating ourselves to God. It does not appear to be nearly as effective when we seek to understand the nature of God, unless indeed, God is nor more than an idea or poem which may prove satisfying to us.

entral de la composition del la composition de la composition de la composition del la composition de la composition de

ිමුන්ම කාසයෙන රණ්ණ වී රාජ කළේවන නටට එබල අවපසරුවට යුතු නිවුණ සහජා විය දිරිස් සිතාණීම සහජාව එම අමෙයන්ම සේව්මේ ඇම ඉදිර සේනමා පැවැත්තට වෙනස් මිස මේසේ වියම්ස්ත සිටුණ්ස්ත විය අවස් විය එමේ පැවැත්තිවන මෙස් පිතිපති පුරාම සේව්මේවී මිසලුලුමේ එවන අප පත්තය මිසි ජීම්භ ස්මාධ්ර වීම්මේස්ත අපදාද සිත සහජාව සහජාව එම ජනයෙන්ම සර එබිල වෙන් ක්රී ආයම එබ්බෝඩ් සසුව මීම කාහසරේ කරේ මිසල්මා ඉර්නස් සහජාපතුරාසියක් සහජාව වියම්පතිවේදී මුණ්ණ්ඩන්ම සිසි ජනතාන සංසෙක්වේස්දී සේවු සේවාව දෙනස්ථාසමෙනාසයි.

• 1

We are left, then, with the view that reading finds appears appears to be heard elemny to be incorporated man and his tetal environmental, jimolociing their their view of the tetal specialistics and the control of the same their view of the same and the same of the same

The ingiv of secent Thairm is accoding to the event is even of withing as a first gius to abstract the is the asset where we are to be the asset where we are to be the control of the asset of the solution of the control of the event of the event of the anishes in the accuration we are the accurate of the event of the accurate of the

The Philosophy of Theism, (1887) p 25. 2. Ibid., pp 13f 4. James, W., The Will to Believeland Other Essays in Popular Philosophy, (New York: Longmans, Green and Co., 1896) pp 2f Brightman, E. S., A Philosophy of Religion, (New York: Prentice-Hall, 1940), pp 126-219. 5. Ibid., pll 6. Vide, The Hiff Review, Winter, 1947, pp 35ff The Will to Believe, pll 8. Brightman, A Philosophy of Religion, p 128. 9. F. C. S. Schiller, Logic for Use, (1930), pp 137 -- 144, presents a drastic criticism of coherence as a test of truth. Since he was an adherentof

recent Theism, this criticism may well be given serious consideration. 10. Bowne, B. P. The Immanchet of God, (1905) p 85. In his Theory of Thought and Knowledge (1897) he placed great emphasis upon the practical in antithesis to the speculative and logical. Vide especially pp 367-385.

11. Brightman, The Problem of God, (1930), for a first discussion of "The Given". A good summary of his early statement is published as "The Given and Its Critics" in Religion in Life, I Winter, 1932, 1, pp 134-145. Brightman h

he here attempts to meet the first criticisms of his theory. 12. Vide Brightman, A Philosophy of Religion, Chapter 12.

13. Schiller, Our Human Truths, (New York, 1939) pp 292f.

14. Schiller, Logic for Use, pp 106ff

15. The Personalist, July, 1934, pp 209-218

16. Ibid., p 215

17. The Will to Believe, p 25

18. "Truthseekers and Soothsayers," The Personalist, XV, p 213

19. This analysis of religion was presented in "Where Are We In Our Religious Thinking?" The Hiff Review, Vol If, No. 2 Spring 1945 pp 233ff

20. Logic for Use, pp453f.

21. Vide p 35, above

22. How We Think, (1910) p 6. In his voluminous work Logic: The Theory of Inquiry, (1938), Dewey has elaborated this definition at some length.

23. Vide, A. Seth Pringle-Pattison, The Idea of God in the Light of Recent Philosophy. (second ed., 1920) pp 178f., and 210f., for a restrained statement of thisposition. A. C. Knudson, The Philosophy of Personalism, (1927), p 66, states one view of it specifically.

- Priling the free free property general states and the states of the states 3 The Will in Belteve, o it Brightman, A Pallicopty of Amigin. pill. F. C. C. Artiller. Logi: Sur Lev. Afric. 29 13: 144. proceests a dry solu-eritioigan of coherence as a tore of toeth. Since he was an ackerénica reneral Parlara, dicina a adicina renera mall de given consumi decire a las rations 10, Bound, B. F. The incomment of Col. 1993 o file of big Timory of Transport and dilea at Isolinare sil rope alastiqua roots brain of (1991) egisteratif bas to the apacelactic and legical (1966 exectedity of 267-165.) Brigatosa, The Puchlets of Let., (1986), for a firtut discussion of the Cived . A good summary of the early etchemon is published as The Char and Ma Culiforn in Religion to Luke. (Winter 1986), to position the Market of the Properties. jyvaside aka jo amarakaliten en ult elik abem an esgmeste eres el vide Irightman, A Philosophy of Religiou. Chepter 12. Schiller, Our Husen Thurs, (they Forth, 1939) op 2522. Schiller, Logic for Use. pp .96M The Farmonellon, July, 1976, pp 209-218 idd, päli The Will to Bulleve, 925 Truckecekers and Sections out The Remailer, MV, g 200 මෙන ඉවිදුම් නම්ව නැත්වී අතර අතර අතර විසිට සේ මිමේසල්ස්සේ වෙන මෙම්පූර්ණක විස මේස්තුර්ණක සම්මේධී Thinking of The The This Review, Vol 70, No. 2 Cover 1945 on 2 225 Logica for Man. ppd5M. Vide a 25, share Have the foton, 1990) p & the minuminum wark impier The Theory of hapeiry, 1938). Devey bas eleborated this definition of actual imagely 23. Vide, A. Sech Pringio-Petricon. The idea of God in the fright of it re-Egilesephy, jusquad cd., 192 jap 1725., and 2125. for a recembered statement of thingosition. A. C. Egudson, the Egulosophy of Psyspecials (1927), p 66, states one view of it specifically.

The philosophy of religion called Absolute Immanence is a relatively new development in American religious thinking. God is defined in wholly immanent terms. This does not mean that God does not transcent a given individual, or the whole human race, or even the world as now known. It does mean that no positive affirmations are made concerning God as a reality presumably transcending the Existential Medium, namely, that in which we live and move and have our being. If God is known, he must be a knowable reality. As such, nothing can be said about God as transcendent to the universe, or as suprarational. Gof as defined by this school of religious thought is wholly, completely or absolutely immanent. It may not be correct to speak of God as "immanent", so far as some members of the group are concerned. "Immanence" suggests a transcendent Reality which is in whole or part indentifiable with something else. Immanence as here used is rather an epistemological than a metaphysical term. It indicates the direction which cognition must take if it is investigate the nature of God.

The growth of this theory can be sketched quite briefly. In 1859, when Darwin published "The Origin of Species," many Protestant thinkers recognized some of the implications of his conclusions. The Issue centered in the authority of the Bible. It was evident to many that one must adopy the evolutionary viewpoint and reject the special creation theory presented variously in the Old Testament. There appeared to be no way of reconciling the two conceptions. Those those faith was linked up inextricably with the inerrant Scripture fought the new theory bitterly. But one is inclined to think that the basic issue lay elsewhere. It was faith in a miracle-working God which was threatened by the evolutionary theory, and this belief presupposed the transcendence and free activity of God. If the present world and man were results of determinable factors such as Darwin indicated, then men were at the mercy of these causes rather than, through God's help, master of them. This conception of God needed some support, which these men found in the doctrine of an inerrant Scripture. Once this was shaken, belief in God as supernatural miracle-worker became difficult to maintain.

At the same time, other men were slowly coming to terms with the evolutionary conception. Among others, George Trumbull Ladd and Bordon Parker Bowne, saw the possibility of reinterpreting the concept so that it would not endanger the Christian faith as they understood it. Gradually, they began to view nature as the method selected by God for achieving his divine purposes. The impact of the growing prestige of science, and the gradual recognition of nature as relm of rich possibilities, led these men to bring God part way to nature. This movement culminated in Partial Immannence, or more popularly, Theism. Absolute Immanence represents a further development of this general trend.

This general position can hardly be called a "school" or a movement." It is, so far as American though is concerned, a tendency more or less characteistic of loosely associated groups of students. Shailer Mathews, Gerald Birney Smith, Henry Nelson Wieman, Bernard E. Meland, Harold A Bosey, Bernard M. Loomer, numerous British and American philosophers and theologians can be listed as more or less in accord with this tendency. Samuel Alexander, C. Lloyd Morgan, Jan C. Smuts and A. N. Whitehead are among the better known philosophers whose thought has been determinative. Since this is not an history of the tendency, but rather an attempt to unearth its basic assumptions, we shall select two men whose writings are most widely known to students of religion: Shailer Mathews and Henry Nelson Wieman. An analysis of their positions will serve to indicate the general nature of this philosophy of religion, and the scope of the problems presented by it.

^{*}The Iliff Review, Vol. VI, No. 2, Spring, 1949

investing the environment of the control of the con

The growth of this theory can be exercised quite briefly. In 1851, core Jarein published "The Origin of Beecles," cong Protestent thinkers conscious some of the implications of his conclusions. The feath thinkers conscious ity of the fible. It was evident to easy that one must adopt the evolutionary viewpoint and reject the apacies arrabion theory presented veriously in the Old Tessument. There appeared to be no any of reconciling the two conseptions. These those those faith was linked up the the the insurant fortical advantable the two severals the conseptions. The new theory pitterly. But one is inclined to think that the trainment fortical at the evolutionary theory, and this latter of presuppresed the thrushouse and it the evolutionary theory, and this latter for each remitte of detection and the consequence of these and the series as the through the latter to the each of the consequence o

At the star time of the men were slowly coming to berns titl the crainty conception. Acon time the crains and forder beauty conceptions among chieses, decree from the concept is thete in forder beauty and content to the sould and content to the content of the content content of the content content of the content of the

This general position can bardly be called a "select" or a servenant. It is, so far as American though is concerned, a bendency more or less characteristic of locaely associated groups of students. Shailer Mathews, General Sirvey Smith, Senry Melson Missen, Bernard R. Meland, Marcild A Borsy, Bennard E. Loomar, once erous Brition and American philosophers and theologisms can be listed as note or less in accord with this tendency. Samed Alexander, G. Lingd Morgan, Jan C. Smute and A. N. Whitchead are among the better known philosophers whese Shought has been determinative. Since this is not an history of the tendency, but rather an attempt to unsurth its basic assumptions, we shall colocit two men whose entitings are most widely known to students of religion: Shall colocit two men whose entitings are most widely known to students of religion: Shall colocit to make the fourth halves of this politon process.

Wha Iliff Review, Vol. VI, No. 2, Spring, 1945

Dean Mathews developed the theory, in some detail, that theology consists in social patterns used to justify the attempt to achieve values religiously. The source of religion was found in man's attempt to escape annihilation. Furthermore, it represented one of mankind's two ways of adjustment to environmental factors. The first is the impersonal approach, represented today by science and technology; the second is a personal approach, represented by religion. "In its ultimate nature the behavior represented by the word religion can be described as a phase of the life-process which seeks by control or cooperation to gain help from those elements of its conmich environment upon which men feel themselves dependent, by setting up social-that is, personal-relations with them". 2 God is that in one's cosmic environment with which one established such personal relations. In more specific language, he defined God as the personality-producing and personality-responsive phase of man's environment. If man is a product of his invironment, and is he finds it possible to establish personal-that is, social-relations with is environment, he needs some name to designate the reality so described. Mathews proposed to use the term which he belived had been used historically for this prupose, namely, God.

But God is more than is stated thus far. Every concept which men have used to denote God has been one which expressed relations whose content was derived from some social pattern. The fact that the concept implied relations proves that it refers to reality, since "only realities can be in relations."3 God is, therefore, definable as "reality conceived in patterns." 4 "Pattern was a basic concept in Mathews' thought. He defined it as "a social institution or practice used to give content and inteligibility to otherwise unrationalized beliefs. "Dunless one is prepared to assert that religious experience is wholly delusive. men have found help in it. In some way, not yet completely understandable, men can establish personal relations with the personality-producing forces in their environment, and find value in such relationship. But men are in part rational. They must find some intellectual justification for this attempt to realize values religiously. They have found justification in terms of analogy. They have used the enalogy of the sovereign with all of the corollaries which flow from it. In this way they found it possible to seek for values in terms of personal relations with, not a person, but the personality-producing forces in the environment. This quest for values could be integrated into their rational world-view by means of a socially acceptable analogy.

According to Mathews' theology, God was personal, but not a personality. The God of traditional through was thoroughly individual and could be pictured in imagination. When an increasingly mature intellectual began to conseive God in unversal terms, individuality became an hindrance. The concept "spirit" was then introduced to denote personality without what had been it necessary correlate, inamely, individuality. But the concept "spirit" gradually lost it status in psychological literature. When it lost it "social acceptability," it had to be psychological literature. When it lost it "social acceptability," it had to be personal literature in the term "organism" in it place. God as organic may replaced. Mathews proposed the term "organism" in it place. God as organic may be personal in that men may establish personal relations with him, but he is not an individual, and therefore not a personality.

This position may be summarized briefly. God is the religious name for the personality-producing and personality-responsive Factor in our cosmic medium. He is within this cosmic medium, since only within it are relations possible. Since God is a reality in relations, he is an experiential reality.

Deen Mathers developed the thicity in some definit, that boundary consists in social patterns used to juncify the attempt to anticer values religiously. The source of religiously the source of religiously the source of mathers are the source of the sourc

Sub that is more than is grated then forey consept which her keys each characte for has been one which cappessed relations where confirm the proves the fact that the concept isplied relative and proves the same notice or relative since "enly replication out is relationary to relative since "enly replication out in the relationary the relative of the relative out is in relationary the relative of the relative of

Abcording to Hathewar theology, and was personal, but not a personality. The trace of hemditional whrough and shorterily individual and could be probated in instrument. When an ironessing pathure intellectual began to commonly the instrument to the common to the instrument to the common in a individuality because when the head to necessary correlative introduced to denote personality who the test appropriate gradually look it at he bed to the personality individuality. Subtitute the connected to the bed to the personal interpretation of the test to the personal in the proposed the test to the personal in the best and therefore the personal personal in the best and the personal in the best and the personal interpretations of the personal in the best and therefore not a personality.

This position may be summarised briefly. Cod is the roligious mass for the surroundity-producing and personally-responsive Factor in our equate median, surroundity within this cosmic median, since uply within it are relations presided. Since God is a reality in rolations, he to an experience reality.

Strain of Victorian Control

The concepts religion and God, in Mathews' thought, lacked specific content. As a life-long friend and colleague once remarked, "they were delightfully vague. God as personally-responsive appars to be a meaningful conception, but this meaning was difficult to determine. Reglgion, as the system of personal or social relations with the personality-producing Factor was likewise, on the surface, a meaningful proposition. But when one sought to isolate the specific values deribavle from this relationship, the answers given were not too precise. Usually, the good Dean has recourse to analogy when pressed at this point. "What delp does one get from the sun? Get out into the sunshine and find out?" So with God: try these personal relations and see what happens!

This is a problem faced by all contemporary religious thinkers. When growing information concerning man and his world provided precise information concerning man and his world provided precise information of the causes of rain, sickness and health, and even of moral failures and successes, the basis for belief in miracle gradually disappeared. With the loss of confidence in the inerrancy of the Scriptures, one could no longer assure that the ills of life will be conpensated for by the blisses of eternity. These changes in belief have made necessary changes in the claims men have made in religion. Despite the usual claim that religion is the only hope for modern man. even Neo-Orthodox thinkers no longer expect God to do what we can possibly do. And the nineteenth century Liberals and their contemporary disciples, relying as they do upon some vaguely defined Law of Progress, have become hesitant in their claims today. Finally, the Communists whose reliance upon a metaphysical principle enbedded in their Dialectis of Economic History, still wage relentless "cold war" as if they believed man had to do most of it himself. Mathews belonged to his generation in his search for a modern interpretation of the function of religion.

This is the problem to which Henry Nelson Wieman has devoted a long and industrious life. His first volume appeared to be wholly devoted to the problem of God defined as that something upon which man was most dependent for his most inclusive values. At the same time, the book was devoted to another problem, namely, the contribution which religion presumably could make to scientific method if human values were to be preserved and enhanced. Wieman feared the appearance of the coldly impersonal scientist whose interest in objective research had killed in him all of the finer sensitivities which make life significant. "Spontaneity, creativity, and mutual appreciation, can never be manufactured by scientific method." Mysticiem, as a primary religious technique, was needed for the creation and development of these qualities.

In a more recent work, "The Source of Human Good" (1946), Wieman defined God as the Creative Event which is the only source of these human and humane values. He approaches the meaning of Creative Event through a distinction between instrumental and intrinsic values. The former is a structure of events whose qualities are more or less exclusive. This structure of events contains its own qualities. Its relationships with other events is relatively unimportant. Intrinsic value "may be defined as a structure of events endowing each happening as it occurs with qualities derived from other events in the structure. 8 The following garagraph sweetises quite well the activity of the Greative Event: "When good increases, a process of reorganization is going on, generating new meanings, intergrating them with the old, endowing each event as it occurs with a wider range of reference, molding the life of man into a more deeply unified totality of meaning. The wide diversities, varieties, and contrasts of all the parts of man's life are being progressively transformed into a more richly inclusive whole. The several parts of his live are connected in mutual support, vivifying and enhancing one another in the creation of a more inclusive unity of events and possibilities. This process of reorganization is what we shall call the 'creative event. It is creative good, standing in contrast to both kinds of created goods we have been considering". 9

The concepts religion and tod, in Machael Changht, lacked ippediate concent. As a life-long friend and colleague once remarked, "they were delightfully vague. Once as personally-responsive app ine to be a meaningful conception, but this meaning was difficult to determine. Regigion, as the system of personal or social relations with the personality-producing Factor was likewise, on the surface, a meaning proposition. But when one sought to isolate the specific values deribavle from this relationship, the answers given were not too precise. Usually, the good Desmines recourse to analogy when pressed at this point. "What delp does one get from the sun? Get out into the american find out?" So with God: try these personal relations and see what happened

This is a problem faced by all contemporary religious thinkers. When growing information concerning man and his world provided precise information of the causes of rain, siciness and health, his world provided precise information of the causes of rain, siciness and health, and even of moral failures and successes, the basis for belief in miracle gradually disappeared. With the loss of confidence in the inerrancy of the Scriptures, one could no longer assure that the ills of life will be conpensated for by the blisses of eternity. These changes in belief have made necessary changes in the claims men have made in religion. Despite the usual claim that religion is the only hope for modern man, even Neo-Orthodox thinkers no longer expect God to do what we can possibly do. And the nineteenth century liberals and their contemporary disciples, relying as they do upon some vaguely defined law of Progress, have become heattant in their claims today. Finally, the Communists whose relignes upon a metaphysical or heatr claims today. Finally, the Communists whose relignes upon a metaphysical in their bialectis of Economic History, at 11 wage relentions to his generation in his search for a modern interpretation of the function of religion.

This is the problem to which Henry Melson Mieman has devoted a long and industrious life. His first volume appeared to be wholly devoted to the problem of God defined as that something upon which man was most dependent for his most inclusive values, it the same time, the book was devoted to another problem, summely, the contribution which religion presumably could make to weigntific method if human values were to be preser ed and embanced. Misman feared the appearance of the coldly impersonal scientist whose interest in objective research had killed in him all of the fineractive time which make life significant. "Spontaneity, creativity, and mutual appreciation, can never us manufactured by scientific method." Mystictem, as a separativitien to be continued by scientific method." Mystictem, as a goal and religious bechingue, was needed for the creation and development of these qualities.

Is a more recent work, "The Dource of Numan Good" (1946), Nieman delined Wol as the Creative Event which is the only source of those human and numans values. We approached the meaning of Greative Event Shrough a distinction between ingiruscomes and intrinsic values. The former is a structure of events show qualities are more of loss exclusive. This structure of events contains its own qualities are more relationable with other events is relatively unimportant. Intrinsic value "may be defined as a structure of events endowing each tapposing de is occurs with the defined from other events in the structure." The islandary of the structure. The position of the structure of the cold genoming accommon to the structure with a wider range of restructure and the contrasts of all the structure of structure of the structu

According to this conception of the Creative Event, human life is in the hands of God. Apart from God, he is beloiss; committed to God, the future is filled with undreamed of possibilities. This means that sensitivity to the workings of the undreamed of possibilities. This means that sensitivity to the workings of the Creative Event is a prerequisite to the achievement of the highest human values. Fixity of belief is as repugnant to Wiemen as it is to Count Korzybski; contentment and pride, as obstructive of human good to Wiemen as to Niebuhr and Tillich. God as creative event has nursed the life of man from earliest beginnings to its present condition. If man will give himself in complete devotion to God, the future is open; if he fails to do so, a new Dark Ages looms before us.

God is thus an essential phase or structure of our cosmic medium. As such, he is absolutely immanent. He is not identifiable with the total universe, but only with that phase of it which is the source of human good. From this poin cof view, religion does not take the place of science or the technologies. It is responsible for providing the conditions within which the highest good is possible. This begins becomes evident in Wieman's consideration of the four subevents which constitute the Creative Event as such: (i) emerging awareness of qualitative meaning derived from communication with others; (ii) the intergration of emerging qualitative meaning with the meanings one already possesses, resulting in personality development; ing with the meanings one already possesses, resulting in personality development; (iii) a resultant expansion and enrichment of the appreciable world as a consequence of the preceding sub-events; and (iv) an expanded and deepened community between those who participate in the creative event. 10

Wieman has provided some specific content for the idea of God which Mathews proposed. The personality-producing and personally-responsive forces now become the Creative Event with its four subevents. Furthermore, he has put specific content into the values which one may receive from adopting "personal" relations with the personality-producing forces. He has answered specifically the charges of both Neo-Orthodox and Neo-Scholastic spokesmen and they alone has a newers to the basic questions posed by modern man. Whether or not his answers are justifiable or acceptable remains to be seen. It must be admitted that together, Mathews and Wieman have proposed to be seen. It must be admitted that together, Mathews and Wieman have proposed

BASIC ASSUMPTIONS OF ABSOLUTE IMMANENCE

The logic of Absolute Immanence, as exemplified in the writings of Mathews and Wieman, rests upto two basic assumptions. The first is: Human needs, including the religious are natural needs, and their satisfaction, in so far as it is possible, results from adjustment and readjustment of the relations between man and his social and cosmic environment. This means that man is organic to nature, that he and nature are inextricable parts one of the other. Man may "hunger" for God, but this hunger is a inextricable parts one of the other. Man may "hunger" for God, but this hunger is a natural hunger whose satisfaction must be found either in the total environment or some phase of it.

The acceptance of this assumption determines in several ways the systems erected upon it. In the first place, if one assumes that religious needs are natural needs, and must find their satisfaction in the relation of man with his existential medium, the demand for extra-cosmic Gods becomes irrelevant. Horton's proposal that we need a God of divine greatness who transcends the whole cosmic process in order to satisfy religious needs adequately, becomes a problem in human psychology and cultural history rather than an accepted truch. It is true that men have sought for the kind of God Horton envisages; their reasons for so doing, however, may not be above suspicion. Men have often sought in religion for the impossible: namely, for powers other than the world to save them from the exigencies of this world. Religion powers other than the world to save them from the exigencies of this world. Religion to their words, has often been a "short cut" to values, to use T. V. Smith's suggestive phrase. Persons with highly developed ethical perceptions have often despaired tive phrase.

pile continue of the continue

God is thus an associate phase or structure of our cossic action. As such, he is absolutely immaned. He to not identificable which the board universe, but only with that phase of it anded to allow actions of the police of view.

That phase of it anded to the secret of the section of the beatrologies. If is responsible religion does not take the place of select of the beatrologies. If is responsible for providing the conditions within which which the four subsvence which considered becomes evident in Whenan's considerables of the four subsvence which considered the Creative according to the secretary desired from communication with others; (ii) the interpretion of emerging qualitative according to a secretary constitute one already possesses, resulting in personality development in the preceding sub-events; are capabled and despaned community between of the preceding sub-events; are capabled and despaned community between those who participate in the creative event. IO

Figures has provided some specific combact for the idea of float which Nathews proposed. The personality-producing and personally-responsive forces now become the Greating Figures and the personality relationship of the Source abendus of Figures and the personal relationship has personally related and may receive from adopting "personal" relationship has personally producing forces. He has answered apreliherly the charges of both Hes-Orthadox and dec-Scholastin epocation and they alone: e agrees to the besin questions and they alone: e agrees he besin questions seed to be seen. The mast be adopted or not his especies, and Figure have proposed to be seen. It must be adopted that especies, helpfore and Figure have proposed to be seen. It must be adopted that especies for any for successing and for adopted answers to the coordinate and successing and for seen.

PASTO ROSTETIONS OF ARSTRUCT BARANESE

The logic of Absolute Invanence, on eraspilited is the writings of Mathema and Movern rects upto two backs assumptions. The first is: Human needs, including the religions are natural mends, and their activities of the collection of the solutions and the social and commit adjustment and readjustment of the relations between man and his social and comic christment. This means thet man is organic to mature, that he and nature are in white notes to of the other. Men may "hunger" for foot but this hunger in the antironment of nature above mature above estimations and to found either in the total environment of nature phase of it.

The acceptance of this assumption determined in sereial ways the apstence erected upon it. In the three place, if one assumes that religious made are aristantial medical and must find their cathelecates in the relation of some with his existential accesses the demand for order-coards foods becomes invalevent. Forters, proposal that we used the desire proposal that we used a led of divine produces who transpersed the choice position order to such as first religious needs recquately, becomes a problem in their men have sought for the interpretation than the transpersed train. It is true that need have sought for the kind of field forten envisages; their reasons for as deless, however, may not be above sumpleied. Man have often sought in religion for the the constitution of the world and access the envisors of the first train the cripments of the form the could be always of the could be always of the course of the first and the present of the present which the paragraph of the course of the sum of the desired the paragraph of the paragraph of the course of the first despends of the paragraph of the paragraph of the paragraph of the paragraph of the course of the sum of the course of the paragraph of the paragraph of the paragraph of the paragraph of the course of the course of the paragraph of the paragraph of the paragraph of the course of the course of the course of the paragraph of the course of the course

of realizing the highest good by human efforts, and have saught in God the the power they themselves lacked. This ideal interest is commendable, but the fact is that we live in a world where imperfection is no novelty, and where men must find their higher satisfactions in moving toward the higher plateaus of moral living.

A second factor responsible for the demand for an extra-cosmic God is the depreciatively judgment placed upon nature or that parts of our total Existentian Medium directly or indirectly observable. Beginning with the Atomists in ancient Greece, men have persistently read out of nature the values experienced there, and have either demied their reality or placed them in some supra-sensible realm where, presumably, they remain their reality or placed them in some supra-sensible realm where, presumably, they remain untouched by the imperfections of this world. God, therefore, has been conceived as untouched by the imperfections of this world. God, therefore, has been conceived as untouched by the existential medium. In the face of these demands, the Absolute other than andapart from the existential medium. In the face of these demands, the absolute environment, "human nature," and related terms. The problem apparently lies in the environment, "human nature," and related terms. The problem apparently lies in the initial presuppositions with which ment approach the realities demands by the ese terms initial presuppositions with which ment approach the realities demands the depreciation rather than in the realities themselves. 12 when this tendency toward the depreciation of the more immediate phases of the existential medium is noted, and corrected, the need for extra-cosmic cources of religious satisfaction may be reduced greatly.

The second result of the adoption of the assumption hat religious needs are natural and may find their satisfaction within the existential medium is a loss of interest in "absolutes." Relativity permeates religious thinking as well as other types. For this reason the demand for absolute power and absolute goodness in God fails to evoke much interest from the Absolute Immentalist. Adequate power, even if it is not absolute, interest from the Absolute Immentalist. Adequate power, even if it is not absolute, is available to man in his efforts to reorganize his habits and his environment. Goodisavailable to man in his efforts to reorganize his habits and his environment. Goodisavailable to man in his efforts to reorganize his habits and his environment. Goodisavailable if one will ness if not absolute, at least inbrinsic and creative, is also available if one will seek it. Rather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it. Rather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it. Rather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it. Bather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it. Bather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it. Bather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it. Bather than seeking for extra-cosmic power and goodness, the Absolute Immenseek it.

This suggestion leads directly to the second assumption basic to the logic of Absolute Immanence. It is the: The "New Mentality" developed during the past four hundred years must become operative in religious thinking. By the "new mentality," we mean as themodern attitude toward cognition. As Whitehead phrased it, man of all ages have as themodern attitude toward cognition. As Whitehead phrased it, man of all ages have as themodern attitude toward cognition. As Whitehead phrased it, man of all ages have as themodern attitude toward cognition. As Whitehead phrased it, man of all ages have as themodern attitude toward cognition. As Whitehead phrased it, man of all ages have as themodern attitude toward cognition. As Whitehead phrased it, man of all ages have as themodern attitude to a such or in "general Principles," but "it is this been interest in clear ization which forms the novelty of our present society." As an interest in clear ization of hypotheses—general principles, if you will—with complete and precise formulation of hypotheses—general principles, if you will—with complete and precise formulation of hypotheses—general principles, if you will—with complete and precise formulation of hypotheses—general principles, if you will—with complete and precise formulation of hypotheses—general principles, if you will—with complete and precise formulation of hypotheses—general principles, if you will—with complete and precise formulation of hypotheses in "stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalists. There is the basic interest in "stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalists. There is the basic interest in "stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalists. There is the basic interest in "stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalists. There is the basic interest in "stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalists. There is the basic interest in "stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalists. There is the basic interest in the stubborn and irreducible of Absolute Tuman entalis

The adoption of this assumption has specific effects u on thelogic of Absolute Immanence. In the first place, it denies all epistemological "short cuts" if every kind. This means that "faith" as an epistemological concept becomes meaningless; that paradox must be viewed as evidence of confusion rather than a way to clear and that paradox must be viewed as evidence of confusion rather than a way to clear and cogent thinking. All attempts to circumvent the normal cognitive processes are viewed with the greatest suspicion, and are asked to present their logical credentials.

jako a tangi madak Darijo adgura, kikali Baraji naka alia membangun ang a kalija. Kiba<u>gusipakiking</u> tu they becaused and the commentation in the commentation and the four terms of the commentations and the commentations are raight riold boil deum mar aren's bus , yall von on ei noishabhegai easib biros e ai evil satisfictions in moving boward the higher placeus of moral living.

A second factor responsible for the desent for an extra result for the deprechies Through the ced made negligible of the to the to the last throughout the bound of the play by the throughout the or indirect, observable. Reginning with the Atemints in ancient Greater paraistantly read out of nature the values experienced th one, and have althor denied thoir reality or claused that is some aupra-sonoible reals where, presumbly they were un warms a second of the laper feetile no of this world. God therefore, her heat conceived an order than andapert form the entainmited medium. In the Swee of the est derende, the Abartem tacomi de antocom us as es dive la pripara est la neliació la la esta de esta de la la la comencia. cavirrenment," "homen nathers," and related became the problem as errawily lies in the secured one of the securities and the management of the securities described by the end total fall fall The best of the bound of the best tried and the second statement to be the contract of the con enlinens, header of the confidental as the property of the company of the company of the confidence and

ියට ගැන සමුතුර යා පරමුණයිනා වීමේ **සහද්විතුණ සහ**ත ත**න්ට සිහු පාර්ම ඉර**ියා තමයි සිත ඒ සියගත <mark>- මානර</mark>යල <mark>ඉන්මි</mark> el especie en la comparta de la comp a de la la la companya de la companya del companya de la companya del companya de la companya de and the control of th of a forest of the control of the co ్ గారం ఇవ్ రమ్లోలోని అంది అంది ప్రాలోని ఉంది. అంది కార్యంలోని మండుకుండి కార్యంలో అంది. మండుకుండి మండుకుండి అంది ప్రాలోని ఉంది. అంది ప్రాలంలోని మండుకుండి మండుకుండి అంది. అందుకుండిని అందుకుండిని అందుక ការស (seem touris) ស្រុក ប្រធាន ប្រធាន ប្រធានក្នុង និងសេច សេចប្រជាពី ក្រុមនិងសេច សេចប៉ែក សម្បីការ៉ា ប្រឹក្សា ប្រធាន (seem touris) សេចប្រាស់ (សេចប្រាស់) និងសេចប្រាស់ (សេចប្រាស់) សេចប្រាស់ (សេចប៉ុន្តែ) សេចប៉ុន្តែ ស Tota Internation to the control of t Inverse Constants barationes Tolers half books balleded in subject administration opinal isabion wilch forms the growing of our protect asately. "If is we interest in elect and presise formulabion of hypotheses-gateral principles, if you will-with complant devotion to public motor, setoh constitutes the duce wertelity," an interest charecourse to eldinuberat bas amoderate" of Jeers and plead end at erest positionary and couloud lo

apen the careful andhomost charification of by potheses. It is clastification and verilestion of hypelikeess which constitutes the new memberithy. uisicadais uiguland no a zdaeide ofid sequ and moliganion side in **maideola af** Temen Cook in the first piece, it denien the appropriate the coeff forth one in the coeff. was a second of the second of has test to us you a most restance of the constituent to constitue and test to describe and test roberts dead the sand thinking all throughous obverse has decreased to consider all againful decreases reviews freign which characters of Landon car into participate capt may aid side basely

自由,最后是一个人的意思。 第一个人们就是一个人们的,我们们的一种不同的人们的,我们就不是我们,他们也不会不会的,我们就是<mark>不是是我们的,我</mark>不是我们的,我们就是

ार्डकार्या प्रत्य क्षेत्रके हे। एका एक्ट्रेंक्ट्रान्डा हैक्ट्रान्डा क्षेत्रकार **इन्हर राष्ट्रकार राष्ट्रका**ण्या

facts" cheracteristic of the creatitional capiricist, but there is also the instance

The second consequence sharpens the issue somewhat. It is that the "new mentality" tends to emphasis behavioral verification as its primary test of truth. This is evident in Mathews' emphasis upon the pragmatic outcomes of religious beliefs, and his refusal to consider theology as in any significant way metaphysical. It is also evident in Wieman's insistence that God is a "perceptual" object, and that religious thinking must proceed by way of "sensory observation, experimental behavior and inference." It is a point which needs more clarification than it has received thus far. At the same time, the significance of Absolute Immanence such as a philosophy of religion depends upon rather close reliance upon it. Once this fails to meet criticism, if the way is open to a return to any of the other schools of thought.

THE LOGIC OF ABSOLUTE IMMANENCE:

The logic of Absolute Immanence rests upon two assumptions: (i) Religious needs are continuous with other human needs, and find their satisfaction on the same level where they arise; and (ii) Religious thinking is also continuous with other forms of human thinking and must utilize recent methodologies in solving its problems.

Dean Nathews, accepting these basic assumptions, derived from them a form of Qualified Pragmatism. He believed the concept God is true precisely to the extent that it proves useful to groups of people. The general principle underlying Pragmatism is this: That idea is presumably true whose consequences in action are in harmony with anticipated action and results. Applies to Mathews' conception of God, it meant that the truth-value of the idea was exhaustively determinable in terms of its religious value to the individuals and groups which believe it. 17

This qualified pragmatism controlled Mathews' study of Christianity. He observed that the conceptions of God held by given groups were always formulated in terms of some social pattern, predominantly political. God was at various times, King, Emperor, Feudal Lord, Monarch, Father. What is the truth-value of these several patterns? To this question, Mathews answered that these social patterns were used in order to justify the establishment of personal relations with the personality-producing and personally-responsive Activity in our cosmic environment. The proper question is not: Does this Activity have the characteristics of King, Monarch, or Father? but rather: Does this pattern help persons to extablish help-receiving relations with reality so conceived? In other words, the question of the objective truth of the referent of the concept God is replaced by pragmatic considerations found in human living.

This logic has been subjected to critical evaluation by various theologians and philosphers. It is, in the main, identical with the logic of recent Theism, discussed in previous issues of this journal, and subject to the criticisms of that logic. 18 We shall have occasion to consider this again, when the significance of the several logics is before us. It is sufficient here to observe that this form of religious pragmatism may be applicable in the field of worship—when one seeks to determine the relative efficiency of various forms of religious techniques, but its relevance to the problem of God, defined as an objective reality, is questionable,

The "new Mentality" 19 described by Whitehead has been adopted as completely by Henry Nelson Wieman as by any other man I know. He defined truth as "any specifiable structure pertaining to events and Kheir possibilities. Truth is not knowledge, but must be potential knowledge." 20. Truth is then a character of events which may be made specified. In its form as potentially specifiable, it consists of truth. When it has been specified, in language or meaningful symbols, then this truth has become knowledge. Truth is thus the linguistically specifiable structures of events which may be apprehended or comprehended by persons.

I the manera of enquality of the control of the entrol of a primary of a of knowle. This is not confidence of a primary of a of knowle. This is not confidence of a significant of a primary of a significant of a

THE LEAST OF A SECRETE DESARRED :

The logic of Abroluke Immunitors resks used her assumptione: (i) Sellgious needs are continuous with this sels Auran needs, and find their satisficities on the same level where they arise; and (ii) Robigions bidabing he also continuous with other forms of human thinking and mant willes recept methodologies in solving its problems.

Dann Nathers, accepting these tasks accomptions, donderd from them a form of Qualified Progration. To believed the economy for the form processly to the extent that if proves restal to group a of people. The great principle anderlying frogrammed in this this: That idea is procuredly true above consequences in action are in harmony with auticipated action on tresults. Applies to fobies to be species of feeling of the intervalue of the intervalue of securities to fobies also be true to be intervalue of the intervalue of the intervalue of secure which believe it.

This qualitied pragmant as controlled Mablems's study of Christianily. He observed that your conceptions of the held by given groups were allege demandabled in terms of succeptions of most patient. Percent pottern, productions in the bruth-writes of these several patients? For the least lead, there are a large of the several patients? In this question of the control were used in order to fresh control of the control of the parameters and the control of the presentation and the parameter and the presentation and the presentations and the presentation of the proper question is good the several of the control of the

This logic to been authorized to cribical evaluation by verbour Mesions and philosphers. It is a present, identical with the logic of recent Thaism, discussed in previous is auce of this end subject to the cribicians of the cussed in previous is auce of this end in the cribicians of the configuration o

The "new Mertality old described by Whiteheed has been a depted as completely by brown allowed Mertaling to supplie the street truck as "eny souchilette street truck as "eny souchilette street truck as increasing to everte and inter mestabilities. Truck is not increasing, but must be potential knowledge. "20. Truck is then a character of special may be made socially specially specially it consists of this week which has been appealed in large age or meaningful symbols, then this week has brown knowledge. Truck is thus the large or meaningful symbols, when this work which may be suppear truck is thus the large or secular specialishes opened are of arouse which may be suppearabled or comprehend in large and the process.

God is precisely such an event. The Creative Event as such is specifiable; it has has specific structures and is a specific structure. When we have specified it or same phase of it in linguistic terms; we have knowledge of this creative event. But knowledge of this Creative Event depends upon the performance of two basic operations. The first is the clarification of the hypothesis under investigation. The second is that of verifying the clarified hypothesis. This process includes three elements — Wieman calls them "tests of Truth". 21 The first is observation; the second agreement among observers; the third is coherence.

Wieman defines observation as a "series of perceptual events in which selective attention distinguishes a structure of interrelatedness running through the series." 22 By perceptual event, he means "everything within and without the biological organism which experiment can demonstrate makes a difference to conscious awareness when the perceptual reaction occurs." 23 This makes specific what Whitehead meant when he said that the new mentality was concerned about the relation of general principles to "stubborn and irreducible facts." These facts become known to persons by means of observation, and Wieman would say, through a series of perceptual events. The perceptual event as defined in contestualistic terms includes both of the object - however described - and the perceiver.

It is evident that Wieman believes God to be a perceptual object or perceptual event. God is known, if he is known, only by way of perception. Wieman is careful to distinguish the automatic and habitual selectivity involved in the perseption of small objects from that which is required to perceive God. The distinction may be made clear by comparing the processes whereby men observe skulls and vestigial remains and that thereby they "observe" evolution. Wieman believes in both instances, the proper cognitive term is "perception." 24, This would appear to confuse "object" and "theory" in ways hardly justifiable. Nevertheless, Wieman has been insistent that only if God is actually perceived do we have cognitive knowledge of him.

Furthermore, such cegnitive knowledge must be supplemented by agreement among observers. This is not "social verification" in any superficial sense of that term; it means that every qualified observer must see approximately the same thing water similar conditions, or doubt is cast upon the veridical character of the observations. Finally, the propositions verified by observation must not contradict others so supported. This is the test of "coherence". We may define this method in the following terms: That proposition is presumably true which can be integrated harmoniously with all other propositions believed to be true. Wieman them believes that our ideas concerning the nature of God must be subjected to three tests: (i) they must be supported by observational data; (ii) this data must be observed or observable by numerous observers in comparable circumstances; (iii) they must be supported by whatever other truths we hold rather than contradicted by them.

Those who are familiar with epistemological literature will recognize Wieman's method as related to Logocal Empiricism. Logical Empiricism, by general agreement, is a new formulation in many variant forms, of the "new mentality". As is true of many new movements, it has extremes which would be denied by Absolute Immanentalists in religious thought; at the same time, it has at least two central emphases which constitute the heart of the logic of Absolute Immanence. The first is the analysis of meaning. Shailer Mathews spent much of his time with the question: Precisely what is the meaning or content of any given idea of God? Wieman has kept the concept "meaning" right at the center of his thought. Others have been less concerned with "meaning" than with "analysis". To them, "vagueness of meaning is the mind's original sin," in the words of M.T.NoClure. In either case, however, the task is that of clarification:

end of the contract of the con

and the second of the first of the second of

Johafficages →## beis

Niemen definant observation as a factores of nerterial suspends in which as epider of the college of the college of the device o

it ha crident that Wichen talicros tolic to be a perceptual object of perceptual of the corporation of the c

Number of the control of the careful and to require the former that the case of the case o

Those who are included and epistentially interested of the continued will care with a second without an explain the continued of the continued

To clarify means to remove ambiguity, imbivalence, vagueness. Positively is means to define precisely or describe accurately. 25

The second emphasis consists in an alamost exclusive reliance upon empirical data as verificatory materials. Mathews instated that the socially-cohesive effects of a given conception of God - "reality conceived in patterns" - represented its truth-value; Wieman asserts that God must be a "perceptual event" and that our knowledge of God must be empirically-derived and observationally verified. This places the logic of Absolute Immanence in the empirical field, and as such, makes it subject to the criticisms of empirical logic in general. Every specific form of legical method has certain weaknesses, and is thus subject to criticism. We may assume, however, that if the basic assumptions fundamental to a given logic are relatively sound, then the method based upon it may be continuously improved until it becomes a useful cognitive instrument. With this in mind, we shall examine the two assumptions basic to the logical empiricism of Absolute Immanence. 26

The first assumption of Absolute Immanence implies that religious needs are "natural" rather than "supernatural" - human rather than extra-human. Mathems believed that there were sources of help in the cosmos for those who established social relations with them. There was nothing particularly extraordinary about these sources of power; they were continuous with the other cosmic processes. Wisman believes that the Creative Event is a course of help to humanity in terms of reorganizing persons and the conditions under which they live. Here again, the help received is natural; it is continuous with other sources, and the values achieved are continuous with other values.

The primary criticism of this position comes from those whom we call Absolute Transcendentalists, or Nec-Orthodox. As we shall indicate, in a future issue, their criticism rests upon the fallacy of initial definition. By this we mean that certain values and realities are asserted by them to be so different from "natural" values and realities that they can find no source within the existential medium. 27 Precisely what can be natural or not is not written upon the object or experience itself. It is a judgment based upon certain assumptions concerning the nature of nature and its qualitative richness. This, then, is a proposition whose truth must be investigated, not a judgment self-evidently true. Since this is the case there are no priori reasons why religious needs may not be accepted as natural needs, and their satisfaction may presumably, be found in the adjustment of intra-cosmic relations. Positive evidence for this conclusion will be presented in a later chapter.

The second assumption of the logic of Absolute Immanence was this: Meligious thinking, in harmony with much of the scientific and empirical thinking of the modern world, must accept the same rigorous logic as other and comparable studies. Specifically, this much that hypotheses must be clarified and stated precisely, and then subjected to behavioral verification.

This assumption rests upon the addeptance of a given category for Deity. If Deity is a transcendent reality as the Absolute Transcendentalists assert, then behavioral verification is irrelevant. If, on the other hand, God is a dynamic reality who is wither directly or indirectly experiential, then the legic of Absolute Lamaneous becomes the only adequate legic. As indicated in another connection, the only method of validating categories for Deity is tradition, or more technically, deduction from previously established theories. 28 From this point of view, God is Heterminer of Destiny", "Creator of Heaven and Earth," or "Creative Event". The legic of Absolute Lamaneous is the proper legic to be used in the investigation of the conceptual nature of God conceived as a dynamic reality in the existential medium. The task confronting the religious thinker is that of perfecting this legic, and using it as effectively as possible. At best, his knowledge of God will be imperfect and incomplete. With these assumptions and the legic based upon them, the knowledge we have should be relatively true knowledge. And this will be real gain.

A comparison of Ladd's "The Doctrine of Sacred Scripture", New York, 1883, Vol. I, pp. 236 ff., with his "philosophy of Religion", New York, 1905, vol. II, chapter 38, will indicate the changes suggested. The theory was not ascepted by Ladd in either of these works as a theory of origins as such; it was reinterpreted theistically in both. At the same time, Ladd's theories of scriptures and of ontology had undergone real change. In the first volume, he sought to defend supernaturalism; in the second, he sought to avoid materialism.

2 Mathews, Shailer, "Social Problems and the Idea of Ged". THE JOURNAL OF RELIGION, XI.

No. 2, (April, 1931), p. 163.

3 Mathews, S., "The Growth of the Idea of God". New York: The MacMillan Co., 1931, p 213 4 Mathews S., The Atonement and the Social Process, New York: The MacMillan Co., 1930,p

5 Ibid., p. 31.

6 The Growth of the Idea of God, p. 233

7 Wieman, H.N., Religious Experience and Scientific Method, New York: The MacMillan Co., 1926, p. 143

8 Wieman, The Source of Human Good, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1946, p. 55

9 Ibid., p. 56

10 Ibid., pp. 58-69

11 The Philosophic Way of Life, Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1929
12 Cf. my "Cognitive Quest for God," THE JOURNAL OF RELIGION, vol. XXIII, No. 2.

April, 1943, pp. 99 ff.

13 Whitehead, A.N., Science and the Modern World, New York: The MacMillan Co., 1925, p. 3 14 Cf. my "Reason in Religion", THE JOURNAL OF BIBLE AND RELIGION, wol. XV, No. 3, July, 1947, pp. 133 ff., for further reading in the place of metanoesis in religious thinking.

15 Wieman, "God is More than we can Think", CHRISTENDOM, I, Spring, 1936, p. 433 and

his "Can God be Perceived?", THe JOURNAL OF RELIGION, January, 1943.

16 Cf. Werkmeister, W.H., The Basis and Structure of Knowledge, New York and London: Harper and Brothers, 1948, pp 40ff. for a summary of such criticisms.

17 Cf. Mathews, THE GROWTH OF THE IDEA OF GOD, pp. 229 ff.

18 Cf. my "Logic of Recent Theism, Part III", Iliff Review, Winter, 1948, pp. 35ff.
Other criticisms of this general position may be found in Robinson, D.S., The God of
the Liberal Christian, New York: D. Appleton and Co., 1926, chapter II; Pratt, J.B.,
The Religious Consciousness, New York: The MacMillan Co., 1920, p. 336; Perry, R.B.,
"What is the Good of Religion?", in RELIGION AND MODERN LIFE, New York: Charles
Scribner's Sons, 1927.

19 Cf. p. 89 above

20 Cf. The Source of Human Good, p. 164

21 Source of Human Good, p. 211

22 Ibid., pp. 211ff. 23 Ibid., pp. 182

24 Cf. Wieman, "Can God be Perceived?", THE JOURNAL OF RELIGION, Vol. XXIII, Jan. 1943, No. 1, p. 26f.

25 The development of symbolic logic represents one phase of this demand for precision, accuracy, clarification. The rapid growth of interest in language and semantics is

attributable, in large measure, to this same demand.

26 A good review of the literature of this logic is found in Hervert Feigl's "Logical Empiricism," in TWENTIETH CENTURY PHILOSOPHY, ed. Dagobert D. Runes, New York: Philosophical Library, 1967.

27 Cf. my "Cognitive Quest for God," THE JOURNAL OF RELIGION, vol. XXIII, No. 2,

April, 1943, pp. 99ff.

28 Cf. my "God as Dynamic Determinant," THE JOURNAL OF RELIGION, vol. XXIII, No. 4, Oct., 1943, pp. 276ff., and "Analytic Approach to the God-Concept," RELIGION IN THE MAKING, vol. II, March, 1942, No., 3, pp. 252 ff.

R. G. Collingwood, in a significant essay, divides presuppositions into two classes: Relative and Absolute. The first are those which are used by the several sciences and disciplines in the investigation of their fields. As such they are used as though they were final. At the same time, each individual who uses them wishes, eventually, to determine whether or not they are true. The second class, or "absolute" presuppositions are of such nature that they are never subject to question. In fact, Collingwood asserts that it would be "nonsense" or "pseudo-metaphysics" even to ask whether or not they could be true.l In this and the next paper we propose to consider the basic assumptions discussed in the preceding papers as absolute presuppositions.

T

exposed two absolute or primary presuppositions. The first and most widely held may be stated as follows: Human needs must find absolute fulfillment either here or hereafter. This presupposition controls the logic of Absolute Transendence. According to this logic, human reason is believed to be incapable of achieving the truth required for human "salvation," and human skill and ingenuity are incapable of achieving the Good Society, the Kingdom of God, or Salvation. Normally, such conclusions would give rise to the question: What basis is there for assuming that goals as defined are legitimate, or may ever be satisfied in detail? The fact that this question is never given serious consideration indicates that the presupposition of Absolute Demand or Absolute Fulfillment is "absolute" so far as Absolute Transcendence is concerned. As a result, these men seek for transhistorical fulfillment of the goals believed unrealizable in human history.

Religious Humanists apparently adopt the mame presupposition in absolute form. They assume that if religion is valid, religious needs must find absolute fulfillment or final satisfaction. Since neither nature nor history provide such absolute fulfillment, religion is rejected as invalid. In neither instance was the presupposition seriously questioned, and this, according to Collingwood, is precisely the mark of an absolute presupposition.2

The second absolute presupposition unearthed in the preceding papers may be called "The Presupposition of Predictable Possibility." This means that the theologians who adopt this presupposition accept a given theology as relatively true.

SELECTION STATES SATT B Aor o Hoaren's

presuppositions accept a given theology as religious from the constructions of the construction of the con

Packable and a construction of the frequency from the first of the operations of the frequency of the freque

IN CLUSTED OF THE PROPERTY TO SOLVE OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PRO

<u>:</u> ... ;

Aberthhost (Tour of the creation of the base of the Base of the state of the state

men in value-receiving and value-conserving relations with the reality called "God". They seek the most adequate and valid interpretations of man and the totality within which he lives and the most efficient techniques whereby religious values may be discovered and realized. Theyrefuse to consider the possibility that either absolute truth or absolute fulfillment of any felt need is possible. Consequently, they devote themselves to the search for the most firmly established facts and most highly verified hypotheses. We are calling this the Presupposition of Predictable Possibility because the cognitive task which they have accepted is that of predicting the highest possibilities which confront man, and the determination of the most efficient means of realizing, to the fullest degree possible, these predictable possibilities. The vigor with which these men reject the possibility of absolute fulfillment indicates that to them predictable possibility is an absolute presuppesihorge is charlule tion.3

If we accept Collingwood's definition of an absolute presupposition as one which can never be transformed into a proposition, i.e., some statement whose truth or falsity may be fruitfully questioned, then these two presuppositions are absolute. There appears to be no conceivable way whereby we can prove beyond reasonable doubt that (1) human needs are absolutely satisfiable, or are (ii) only relatively satisfiable. If the Kantian conception of absolute justice as the basic fact about reality is true, and if God, the immortal soul and heaven are actual realities, then, presumably, man's highest ideals are realizable in the hereafter even though they may not be so in the present. At the same time, the hereafter as defined by Kant and those who adopt the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment, is of such nature that it cannot be investigated directly by man's normal cognitive equipment. Theoretically, there are no conditions known to us whose realization would either prove or disprove the Presupposition of Absolute Satisfaction of human hopes.

The same conclusion appears necessary in the case of the Presupposition of Predictable Possibility. Since it is conceivable that reality may be such as is defined in the philosophies of Plato, Aristotle, Kant, Hegel and even Whitehead, we can never be certain that it is true that human needs are satisfiable only approximately, and then only in terms of the serious application of human intelligence and inventiveness to the system of conditions in which man now lives or may live in some future time continuous with the present. Here, then, are two absolute presuppositions accepted and used by different groups of men, neither of which can be proved either true or false.

The apparent consequence of this conclusion is scepticism or at least agnosticism. If our systematic formulations are based upon presuppositions whose validity can never be determined, then it is possible that any or all of the systems formulated may be false. This feer haunts the adherents of Absolute

row of the first colling and value conserving the dead of a conserving colling colling the colling state of the colling state of a colling state of a colling state of a colling state of the colling state of the colling state of a colling sta

If the section to the state of the state of the state of the state of the control of the control of the control of the state of the control o

The same conclusion appears necessary in the case of the Freensposition of Fredictable Possitility. Since it is conceivable that resitty may be such as is defined in the philosophies of Flate, Aristotia, Mant, Hegal and even Whitchead, we can never be certain that it is true that human needs are satisfiable only approximately, and then only in terms of the serious application of immen intelligence and inventiveness to the spatem of conditions in which man new lives or many live in same future time continue time apposition accepted and used by different groups of man, neither aupposition accepted although there are two areas of man, neither of which can be proved althout there or files.

tunising of an experiment of the state of the section of the secti

Transcendence, an inference which cannot be avoided in the light of their attempts to justify their "faith." Reinhold Niebuhr, in recent work, asserts that there is a limited possibility of proving the truth of the Christian view of life and history as given in the Christian "revelation" by indicating (i) that it provides the only real possibility of clarifying the perennial human predicament, and (ii) that it redeems man from his natural tendency to aggravate this predicament by commitment to false or partial attempts to escape it.4 The specter of scepticism may not appear to haunt the adherents of Predictable Possibility to the same degree only because they have accustomed themselves to the need for a continuous revision of their theories. In actual fact, however, they must accept the same possibility since their primary presupposition is likewise maintained without adequate cognitive support.

II

It may be observed that there appears to be some justification for the use of the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment, at least in so far as human knowledge is concerned. Collingwood asserts that whereas such presuppositions can never become propositions and therefore candidates for truth, they may find some justification if they make life possible and intelligible in a given culture. He then asks the question: What absolute presuppositions were held by Newtonians, Kantians and Kinsteinians? The task is thus an historical one. When an investigator has determined what absolute presuppositions were held at a given time, or are held at the present time, this is all that he can possibly know about the justification of absolute presuppositions. Their validity consists in the fact that they are believed.

This suggests a recent form of epistemology known as the Sociology of Knowledge. The primary concept at the center of this interpretation of the knowledge situation is the social nature of the self. According to the late George H. Mead, "the organized self is the organization of the attitudes which are common to the group. A person is a personality because he belongs to a community, because he takes over the institutions of that community into his own conduct."6 This means, by implication at least, that one must think as the community to which he belongs thinks because it provides the attitudes and concepts which constitute his personality. Thinking is thus a function of community, of the culture and tradition of which the thinker is a product.

This means that the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment, to the extent that it serves as foundation for the religious culture of the western world, becomes a necessary presupposition since it constitutes our primary frame of reference. The late Karl Mannheim, one of the leading exponents of the Sociology of Knowledge, observed that the attempt to impose absolute standards requires a type of culture to which this is congenial. A democratic form of education does not provide the conditions for absolute standards. If such absolute standards are believed

respectively on larrespondence of articles of light of the latter of the state of the latter of the permit of the latter of the

4.4

Is may be concred that there appears to be come jubility outless of the use of the Prosupposition of Absolute Fallillment, at least in concerned. Collingwood asserts the concerned. Collingwood asserts the theory whereas such prosuppositions can never become propositions and therefore conditions for truth, they may that some juralification if they may this possible and intelligible in a given colluster. If they neve held the possible and intelligible presuppositions were held by Terterians, Hautians and Kinstellato the character and constant the character and constant the character and constant the character and constant that a given the character and constant time, or are absolute or present time, present time, this is all that the one possibly know about the present time, this is all the present of a section of a constant of the present that the one possibly know about the the fact of a constant of the present of a constant of the present that the constant of the present that the one possible and the the fact of the present of the constant of the present of the present

Noted any entropy of the primary concept at the center of the primary concept at the center of this interprotation of the primary concept at the center of this interprotation of the incording to the late deorge H. Head, "the organized self is the organization of the attitudes which are common to the group. A person is a personality because he because it that community into his own conduct. "S This means, by implication at least, that one must think as the community to which he belongs thinks constitute and concepts which constitute his personality. Thinking is thus a function which constitute his personality. Thinking is thus a function of the constitute his personality. Thinking is thus a function of the constitute of the contents.

This means that the freezepoultion of the Palitikant, to the ship antito the arteent that it corves as fourther for the religious outside of the vertera verid, becomes a necessary proposition of the constitution of the leading expenses of the fortific of theoreticing, observed that the religion to impose absolute when daried regulates a type of outtant we which the impose absolute attandaried regulates a type of outtant we which this is academial. desirable, it will be necessary to modify the educational system in democratic countries to accommodate it. 7

The exponents of the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment have shown their wisdom in refusing to adopt this proposed support for their position. Knowledge, from the point of view of the Sociology of Knowledge, is always relevant to a given culture and a given period in the history of that culture. Pre-Copernican Europeans and post-Copernicans may belong to the same general culture, but they lived at different periods in it. Consequently, what appeared self-evidently true to the pre-Copernican did not appear so to the post-Copernican. The presuppositions basic to the earlier culture had been replaced by another set, which in turn determined the thinking of those who were dependent upon them. The Newtonian formulation of the basic nature of the cosmos was published in 1687, and provided a new or at least revised set of absolute presuppositions which are still functionally efficient at certain cultural levels in the Occident. They are being replaced, progressively, by newer views.

The conclusion which follows from these considerations may be summarized briefly: Absolute Presuppositions, as Collingwood defines them, are absolute only in the sense that they are not subject to conversion into propositions. They are not absolutely "true" except in so far as they represent what is believed by a given culture to be the final court of appeal in any epistemological controversy. As such, they provide no real basis for the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment characteristic of certain schools of religious thought.

III

Attention was drawn, above, to another type of attempted justification of the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment. This is a form of the pragmatic argument used by Niebuhr in several of his works. He has been a consistent champion of human rights from his early days as a pastor. He has been and is profoundly concerned about human relations and with the sufferings that result from maladjustments at the personal and institutional levels. He traces much of our difficulty to human pride: The tendency on the part of individuals and groups to make themselves absolute. Niebuhr believes this results from their failure to recognize their basic limitations and Inadequacies in both thinking and action. He believes that the only salvation open to man from the sin of pride, and escape from its terrible consequences, is faith in God as the only Unlimited or Unconditioned Being. By implication, this means that every person is limited and conditioned, or, in traditional language a sinner.

This conviction is shared by others who have adopted this presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment or Absolute Demand, even though many of them do not have Niebuhr's wide acquaintance

The relation of the control of the section of the section of the control of the c

្រុម ស. ។ "ប្រសាសម្រេចប្រែក គេបទមាន <u>ដែលការិ បាយការិបាន ប្រែការ៉ាល់ អស់ទ័យ បែ</u>ប្រុស្ស ការប៉ាន់ ។ «១០១៩ ប្រែការប្រាស់ ប្រាស់ ប្រេការប្រាស់ ប្រែការប្រាស់ ប្រេការប្រាស់ ប្រុការប្រាស់ ប្រេការប្រាស់ ប្រាស់ ប្រុកប្រាស់ ប្រាស់ ប្រាស

111

Abtention was drawn, above, to acceder type of attempted justification of the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment, This is a form of the pragmatic orgument used by Wiebeke in sevoral of his works. We has been a consistent champion of buman Fights from his early days as a pastor. The hos been end in profoundly concerned about human relations and with the sufferings that result from meladjustments at the pursonel and instintuitioned tovels, de branch of our difficulty to hame pride: The tendency on the pert of individuals and grape to mort allyser all overlied windolf wolntords seriosment emen these fallura to recognize thair besic limitations or armitalian quactes in both thinking and action. He believes that the enly salvetion open to man from the sin of pride and eccept from Ats terrible compocuences, is faith in God to the outr balanteed or Enconditioned Being, Av impilaction, thin means then every person in limited and conditioned, or in traditional language. . morrile a

ុននៅលើ ប្រជាព្រះបាន ស្រុះស្នា <mark>ព្រះប្រទេស ១ ភូគិ សិក្សាទៅ។ ស្ដា ១៩១៩១៣០៦ សម្ដីហើះ</mark> ឯសារស្នាត់ស្រែសាស្ត្រី មនិក ដែកសំរី ១១ សិទ្ធានាសេរីស៊ីលី ស្រែសាសាសាសិស្ត្រី ^{ក្}តា សេរីសេរីសេ**ប្បស្រែសស្វិ**ស្ត្រ សេរីស្ត្រី ប្រែសាស្ត្រី សិស្ត្រីស្នាស់ សិស្ត្រីស្នាស់ សិស្ត្រីស្នាស់ សិស្ត្រី សិស្ត្រី សិស្ត្រីសិស្ត្រីសិស្ត្រីសិស្ត្រីសិស្ត្រី សិស្ត្រីសិស្ត្រិសិស with the social issues of our day. Some of them are devoted to the problem of personal assurance. They believe that such assurance is possible only to those who have faith in God as Absolutely Transcendent. As a group, therefore, the adherents of the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment are interested in those conceptions of God and in such patterns of behavior as will assure men that their highest aspirations will find fulfillment, if not here on earth, then certainly in some transhistorical realm. Furthermore, they believe faith in God as Transcendent is absolutely necessary if men are to realize the highest predictable possibilities in the human situation, both here and hereafter. Their appeal to the Supernatural is thus, in significant degree, a device for the realization of predictable goals here and now. To that extent, they are basing an absolute epistemology upon pragmatic or relativistic considers the stions.

This is true, also, of the Religious Humanists. Max C. Otto stated it precisely in his proposal that men give up belief in and the attempt at communion with God for the sake of constructive social action. He believed interest in God meant energy directed toward nonutilitarian goals.8

This is sufficient to indicate that the epistemological consequences of the adoption of the presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment is scopticism or at least agnosticism. The adherents of this position freely admit the inability of human reason to justify their "faith". Having made this admission, they apparently fear to rest in this state of scepticism. Accordingly, they appeal to pragmatic considerations to provide some relief from an unsatisfactory scepticism. But it should be evident that one cannot at the same time deny the relevance of human reason to a given problem and then propose to use it to bolster up what cannot, by definition, be so bolistered. They appear to face rather difficult alternatives: They must either admit that they are sceptics so far as human reason and religious beliefs are concerned, or that their attempts to use human reason consists in what the late Morris R. Cohen called "vital lies", 9 1.0., ideas believed not because they are considered logically cogent but because we cannot live without them.

IV

This conclusion does not dispose of either Absolute Transcendence or Religious Humanism. Their obvious retort is: "You, too." The same epistemological flaw which vitiates every attempt to arrive at absolute truth also prevents one from arriving at relative truth. This comment was made some years ago by George E. Moore in his "A Defense of Common Sense".10 He stated that he "knew" that some ideas were "true" and that when he said "true", he meant just that. He did not mean that a "proposition which is partially false may nevertheless also be true". Accepting this meaning of the word "true", it is obvious that neither absolute presupposition enables one to say unequivocally: "This

entime to the contract of the

gbin in the terms of the strict of the Seligion florestries with the section of the strict of the st

interior consistence to indicate that the cyclotecological consistence consistence to the consistence of the consistence of the cyclotecological consistence of the cyclotecological consistence of separation of the cyclotecological consistence of separations of the consistence of separations of consistence of separations of consistence of consistence

77

Fina conclusion does not dispose of either Ausolute Transcondence or Reilgious Numanism. Their obvious refert is: "You,
co." The same epictemological flaw which vittains every attompt
to armive at abative train also prevents one frud arriving at
relative truth. This comment was sent one frud arriving at
E. Moure in his "A Defense of Commen Berso". 10 He etalod train
he "knew" that none ideas were "true" and that shen he said
"true", he seart just that, It if not sean that a "propest fru
which is pertially isles may constitut at a "propest fru
tag this mesenag of the ware "true" is also be true. Accept
tag this mesenag of the ware "true" is also be true. Accept
tag this mesenag of the ware "true" is also be true. Accept
tag this mesenag of the ware "true" of an inverse the said.

is true." Every judgment begins with this conditional clause: "If the assumptions upon which our criterion of truth is based are valid, then, presumably, this judgment is true."

By way of exemplification, we may return for a moment to the God-concept of the late Shailer Mathews. He defined God, in part, as the "personality-producing" factor in the universe. This appears to be a rather modest proposition which few educated persons would be inclined to question. Man is; he either appeared spontaneously or is a resultant in some causal nexus; the most obvious causal nexus is the cosmos, or some phase of it. But even this partial analysis of Mathews! judgment concerning God bristles with pressuppositions: (i) every entity must have some cause; (11) man is an entity and is, therefore, caught up in some causal nexus; (iii) the specific causal nexus within which man is caught up is the cosmos; and (iv) the cosmos is capable of producing life. Many persons find these presuppositions congenial and follow step by step with little or no hesitancy. If, however, one were asked: What is the basis for acceptance of (i) or (iv), the answer would have to be in terms of some other presupposition or assumption.

We are now in position to understand the reason for Colling-wood's distinction between relative and absolute presuppositions. He seeks some way whereby he can break the circle of presuppositions by assuming the unquestioned and unquestionable validity of some presuppositions in whose terms all other presuppositions may be evaluated. He freely admits that an absolute presupposition sition is actually a presupposition "to end all pressuppositions". As soon, however, as a given presupposition is questioned by the culture which has previously adopted it as absolute, it must give way to some other. Thus Newton questioned the pre-Copernican presuppositions because he had already adopted another.

Collingwood's conception of "absolute presuppositions", therefore, needs restatement. Fresuppositions, both relative and absolute, are in fact regulative principles or structural ideas used as frames of reference for specific systems of cognition. The presupposition of the Orderliness of Nature is such a structural idea used in the investigation of nature. Every scientific experiment is at once an attempt to solve some specific problem and at the same time an attempt to determine whether or not, and to what extent, nature is in fact orderly. As Eddington points out, there are at least three types of natural laws: Identical, Statistical, and Transcendental. The first type consists of laws such as the Law of Conservation of Energy or Mass. These, as he notes, are mathematical in character and are based upon the observation of behaviors. The second describe the behavior of crowds. Crowds may consist of atoms or of men. And, as he observes, "much of the apparent uniformity of Nature is a uniformity of averages". Il The third, or Transcendental Laws, are not clearly defined by Eddington. The distinction between the first two types and this third appears to be that between epistemological and entelogical. Identical

Le trus : Every jadysett begins vink this conditions! classes: fif the termpedone upon which err exiterion of truth is besed are valid, then, precreably, this judgment is true;

the Cor-orange of are militarian, we may recurs for a somest to the Cor-orange of the Lass Chailer Weshing. He defined God. In part, as the The Toronalisty-producing! Laston is the third God. Which appears to be a rether modest proposition which for education of the militarian part of the control of the c

We are yes in position to whereth the reactive for theory for the recent for Collising and the recent for Collising and the recent for the respective there.

to be that between opinionalization and entelogical. Grantical រួចទៅ សុទ្ធស្រាស់ស្តីសា ស្តីស្តីស្តី ស្ត្រីស្តី សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ ស្តីសុខស្តី សេសិស្សសាល អូវសាល់ស្តីសុស្សសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ សុខសាល់ Aty of Eathy of is a whitesmity of frost flee ".li The thank of or of hous and, as he observed CERCLIDS the believing of oreset. Croses any consist of evens or of men, And, as he observed, anche of the experient millorneand are based upon the observation of behaviors. Tre recent Theco, as he potes, are wall custical in character laws: Mentical, Statistical, sof Transcendental. The first type consists of laws such as the Lay of Conservation of Energy ington points out, there are at least three types of natural or not, and to what extent, nature is in lact crierly. As Eddoffic problem and at the same time an attempt to determine whether scientific apportment is at ence on attompt to acte come spea structural idea used in the investigation of nature. mperon" The presupposition of the Orderliness of Mainre is such -Ros zo swogsks ofiteede wor sovowsyte sement se pesh svopt and absolute, are in fact regulative principles or structural thereford, needs restatement. Fresuppositions, both relative Collingecod's conception of "absolute presuppositions",

They are used in the attempt to formulate our conceptions of the universe and bear the marks of our interests and selectivity. The Transcendental Laws, on the other hand, refer to the actual movements of the world as such--the ontological realm--which may or may not conform to our conceptions of them. This interpretation finds some support in his statement which follows:

"It may be that the laws of atomicity, like the laws of conservation, arise only in the presentation of the world to us and can be recognized as identities by some extensions of the argument we have followed. But it is perhaps as likely that after we have cleared away all the superadded laws which arise solely in our mode of apprehension of the world about us, there will be left an external world developing under genuine laws of control."12 This means, if we interpret him correctly, that the Uniformity of Nature may mean (i) the actual behavior of the ontol realm as it is in itself, and (ii) our approximate statements of this behavior conditioned by our limited observations and limited concepts with which we formulate our partial knowledge.

The significance of these considerations for Collingwood's conception of absolute presuppositions may now be restated. It is undoubtedly true that presuppositions can be classified in terms of their position in the cognitional structure. Some of them are presupposed by others, and these in turn may be presupposed by still others. Some may, accordingly, be classed as primary and others as secondary or tertiary. But none of them are by this process excluded from critical evaluation. DesCartes! dictum: "I think, hence I am." would appear to be basic for thinking as such. Nevertheless, it has been subject to serious modification. Presuppositions or assumptions, then, are epistemological devices invented for the purpose of furthering man's quest for knowledge. Their validity and significance lies in their capacity to further this quest, and any given presupposition will continue to be used only so long as it is epistemologically useful. When its usefulness is exhausted, or when more efficient ones are discovered, the old will be discarded and the better one adopted.

It should be evident that the presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment has outlived whatever usefulness it may have had. The field of medicine achieves its significant results not by canonizing either Hippocrates or Galen, but by continuous and piece-meal investigations at the frontiers of its knowledge and by continued inventiveness in the development of its methods. Humanity in the Occident has moved from an economy of scarcity to one of abundance not by demanding Absolute Fulfillment of its economic interests, but by careful and continuous application of the principle of predictable possibility. Conquest of plant-disease resulted from the development of disease-resistant plants; the loss of top-soil has been checked by contour plowing; food has been increased by the development of new types of fertilizers;

The contraction of the contracti

The control of characters of control of control of the control of control of

It should be avident what the presupposition of theologo values of the little of the order of the continues of the continues of the significant is near the order of the continues of the forest problem of the forest problem of the continues of t

by increasing the range from which food could be brought to the centers of population. These have all resulted from the application of the principle of predictable possibility to specific problems in human life.

It would appear to be time for men to adopt this logic in their approach to religious problems. The long history of mistaken quests in religion, dominated by the presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment, is too well known and too well-documented to require further comment. Religious thinking must adopt the "new mentality" or fall still farther behind in the long struggle against ignorance and superstition, 13

1. Collingwood, R. G., An Essay, on Metaphysics, Oxford: At the Glarendon Press, 1940, Chapter V.

2. Ibid., p 44

3. Of Ayer, A. J., Language Truth and Logic, London: Victor Gollancz, Letc., 1946 Capter I, for an exceedingly vigorous rejection of Absolute Fulfillment The emphasia of men like Mathews and Wieman upon "tentativity" in religion is another instance of this same vigorous rejection of the Presupposition of Absolute Fulfillment, and evidence for their adoption of Predictable Possibility as their absolute presupposition.

4. Niebuhr, R., Faith and History, New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1949 pp1952 ff. This is developed more fully inmy review of this work in The Journal of Bible and Religion, Vol XVII, No. 4, October 1949, pp 251f.

5. Essay on Metaphysics chapter VI, "Metaphysics an Historical Science."

6. Mead, Mind, Self land Society, (ed) C. W. Morris, Chicago: The University

of Chicago Pless, 1934, p 162.

7. Mannheim, K. Diagnosis of Our Tiem, New York: The Oxford University Press, 1944. Bibliographies covering this probelm may be found in Mannheim Ideology and Utopia. New York, 1936: mandelbaum. M., The Problem of Historical Knowledge, New York: Liveright Pub., Corp., 1938; Mexton R. K., "The Sociology of Knowledge," in Twentiety Century Sociology, ed by G. Gurvich and W. E. Moore, New York: Philosophical Library, 1945, pp 366-405.

8. Otto, Max C., Things and Ideals, New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1924, p 289f The Meaning of Human History, La Salle: The Open Court Publ. Co. 1947 p 130.

10. In Contemporary British Philosophy 2nd series, ed J. H. Muirhead, New York th Macmillan Co., 1925, p 197

11. Eddington, A. S., the Nature of the Physical World, New York: the Macmillan

Co., 1929, p 244.

12. Ibid., p 245 13. Bosley, H. A., The Quest for Religious Certainty, Chicago and New York; Willett, Clark and Co., 1939, is well worth reading in this connection.

and of the most of blood book doling work egant with galless and ye -ileys oul movi bodinger file eveni esedi lecidalizate to preducto estion of the principle of predicted possible possible to specific problem in busing links,

Il vesid nepasr to be time for men to adopt ible logic in their newspape to ealighteness woolkers. The long history of alse taiton consta in religion, dominated by the presupporition of to require labitant content. Addigious talmaing must adopt the araine ipromiso and euperski decima

en Metaphysica, Oxford: At the Cierondon Cellingwood, D. C., An Base, -Freza, 1940, Chepter V.

. 3 Dry, Midi

Cf tyon, a. J., Langungo Truth and Lugic, Londous Victor follancu, Lett.; 1946 Cepter I, for an enceedingly vigorous rejection of Aportue Fallitiment Vas ampleasio of wan like Machewe and Wieman upon "tantativity" in religious is continue instance of this same vigorous rojection of the Propuppedition of hbrodelse Feld Unvenz, end condenies និយា ស្នៃម៉ែន <mark>នាន់ប្រាស</mark>ែល នៅ មិត្តនៅរំបន់ទំនិក ទី១៩១១៩៤៤ គ

as their absolute presupposition. Michale, R., Esth and History, **New York: Charles B**erispos's **Joan**. 19se odk si strove eldt he weivou parat yllak eroer hegoleven et eldt. Hi settige

Voncasi of Dille and theigier, Vol MVII, Me. 4. October 1949, pp 25 if.
E. Messy on Methylysic elacies VI, "dectaphysics an Mictorical Science,"
S. Messy, Mill Boll iand Coelett, (ed) C. W. Melatis, Chinago: The University

of Chicarc F. eas, 1936, p 162. Mandidim, H. Di. gassis of Our Tiem. Hew York: The Oxford University Processive station of the covering this probets asy be found in Millorers. ideology and Utopia, New York, 1916; mandelbaum, 14., The Froblem of Mistorical Inspiedge, New York; Liveright Pub., Corp., 1936; Merica S. N "The Sociology of Knowledge," in Twentiety Century Sociology, ed by G. Gurvich and W. E. More, New York: Philosophical Library, 1945, pp.

Otto, Man C., Mage and Meals, New York: Henry Holt and Co., 1924, p 2899

The Monning of Huden Mistery, La Selle: The Open Court Publ. Co. 1947 p 130. In Contemporary Exists Millesophy 223 costss. ed J. H. Mairbead, New York th Maandilan Co., 1925, p i97

il. Eddingion. 4. S., the Nature of the Physical World, New York: the Macauller. Co., 1929, p 244.

Basq , Nict St

13. Ropley, H. a. The Question Roll ficus Jeckinsy. Chicago and New Yorks Willett, Clark and Co., 1929, is well worth reading in this connection.

Readers who have followed the series of articles in this journal analyzing contemporary forms of religious thinking will have noted that there appears to be a continental divide which determines the direction in which such thinking moves. One side of this divide may be "Finalism." The presupposition which governs such thinking was stated as follows: "Human needs must find absolute fulfillment either here or here-after." ("The Pre-supposition of Absolute Demand", 'The Iliff Review', Spring, 1950, p. 74). This insistence upon the final realization of man's religious and moral interests has a long and honored history. It found early expression in the writings of Plato. It came to agonizing expression in the rather involved writings of Kierkegaard, and now governs the thinking of the Neo-Orthodoxy dominant in contemporary Protestantism.

The other side of the divide may be named Approximation. It found expression in Protostantism in the late nineteenth century and the early decades of the twentieth. The presupposition which governs its thinking may be stated in this manner: Man's religious and moral interests are subject to proximate rather than final satisfaction or fulfallment. We propose to call this the Presupposition of Approximation. It constitutes the framework and justification of the logic of Absolute Immanence. ("The Logic of Absolute Immanence", 'The Iliff Review', Spring 1949, pp. 88 ff).

Both types of thinking begin with a common interest, the religious and moral experiences of persons. The Finalists are convinced that there is no middle ground between absolute satisfaction and no satisfaction of man's expectation of fulfillment. Consequently, they seek for absolute assurance wherever they believe it may be found. Authority is placed in Scripture, the Living Word, an infallible Pope, or in the rejection of reason and the absolutizing of specific subjective experiences called "existential". To the interested observer who does not share their concern with finalism, they appear to be seeking certainty by violent asser tions supported by all types of circumlocution. Those who accept approxi mate realization have learned to live in terms of probabilities. They believe it to be a waste of time seeking for absolute truth and final assurances. The probabilities which guide their thought and action are based upon evidence which is available or discoverable, open to scrutiny by any thinker who cares to investigate, and logical methods appropriate to the problem and relevant data. Such data is normally observable, although introspective data compared with similar experiences of others ar not necessarily excluded.

I

The theories of knowledge based upon the Presupposition of Approximation are many: They rely, in the main, upon two operations. The first is clar fication, the name applied to the several steps preliminary to the actual testing of hypotheses. It includes the determination of (i) the nature of the problem under consideration; (ii) the meaning or meanings of the terms presumably relevant to its analysis and solution; (iii) the development of hypotheses which may be proposed as possible solutions; and (iv) the conditions which must obtain if the hypothesis is to be verified. This indicates the rather complex character of the operations precquisite to the actual process of observation or gathering of data.

^{*} Iliff Review, Vo. XIII, No. 2, Spring, 1956

Freders who have followed the series of symboles in this journal new lipsing contemporary forms of religious thinking will have noted that there appare to be a contine and divide which determines the discultant in which such thinking moves. The side of this divide ray be "Finallist" fine presupplication which governs such thinking was stated as followed "fine and reads must find absolute fulfillisent either here or here-livered fine from the free lift beview for the first suppression of head to be fine fine filling the cities for a second 1950, p. (h) fint the free has a found one case and word interested has been allowed one expression in found coriginal and word interested the writings of Plate. It came to against sing expression is the retire the writings of Plate, and now governs the this case of the retire and now governs the this ing of the retire the second with the contemporary from the this case of the contemporary from the this case of the contemporary from the this case of the contemporary from the states.

The other side of the divide may be named Approximation. It found and pression as Protestentian in the late nineteenth century and the early decades of the twentierl. The presupposition which governs its chirt-log may be stated in this manner: Wen's religions and morel interaction are subject to presincte redies than final satisfaction or faithlined was propose to asli this the Frequence of Approximation. It was titled estimation of Approximation. It was estimated of Absoluter lamanence. ("The Logic of Absolute Lamanence", "The Hilf Teview", Spring 1949, pp. 85 ff).

Both bypen of thinking begin with a common interest, the religions to another equationes of percore. The Finalises are convined what obtains an mainful entered the finishment. Consequently, they such the abbetter and any is expectable, they such the close of the first place of the form of the first place of the probabilities. The first probabilities that as assumence. The probabilities which guide their thought and action are assumence. The probabilities which a swallable or discoverable, open to accupance by any control of the first problem and follows the first problem and follows. Such data is normally observable, although introspective data compared with similar experiences of others are not accessarily excluded.

Ţ

The theories of knowledge based upon the Preduptessition of Approalestion and they rely, in the asin, upon two operations, the first is classication, the news applied to the several steps preliminary to the sties testing of hypotheses, it includes the determination of (i) the sties of the problem under consideration; (ii) the meaning or meaning of activities presume the remains or meaning or meaning of the terms presumably relevant to the smalysic and solution; (iii) the development of hypotheses which may be proposed as possible solutions; the (iv) the conditions which near owners in the hypotheses which near owners of the operation of the conditions of the conditions of the conditions of the condition of the conditions of the condition of the

It may be noted, in passing, that observation is a term with technical meaning. To observe does not mean engaging in aimless inspection or introspection. It consists in seeking out the conditions which will either verify or disprove a given bypothesis. Perhaps a brief analysis of the procedures followed by physicians in diagnosis will illustrate the clarificatory operations. AA patient is before a physician with some discomfort or disability. Examination consists in checking his blood-pressure, his pulse rate, temperature and other routine items. All of this is done to determine the nature of the problem, (i) above. In this process, certain meanings or symptoms will occupy the attention of the examiner. His training and previous experience will have provided him with definitions of such symptoms (ii) above, Also, in this process, certain hypotheses will have occurred to the diagnostician (iii) above. These several hypotheses will then be considered in turn. If the case be one of poliomyelitis, moreor less specific symptoms or reactions must be observed or observable. By this time, the giagnostician has reached (iv) above. He is now prepared to engage in the second operation, that of determining whether in fact the patient has poliomyelitis. Thus far he has been engaged with the clarificatory process including preliminary observation or the search for the conditions which will enable him to conclude his diagnosis. The diagnostician does not merely "look at" the patient; he looks for predetermined items such as pulse-rate and temperature.

The second operation in the logics of Approximation may be called verification proper. There are two levels involved. The first we have called "behavioral verification" for the reason that some human action is required by it. It may be called "experimentalism" when one is concerned with the physical and social sciences. It may take the form of pragmatism, instrumentalism or voluntarism which are developments of Charles S. Pierce's principle that one should "consider what effects, which might conceivably have practical bearings, we conceive the object of our conception to have. Then, our conception of these effects is the whole of our conception of the object." ("How to make our ideas Clear" (1878), in PHILOSOPHY IN AMERICA, ed. by P.R.Anderson and M.H. Fisch, New York: D. Appelton-Century Co., 1939, p. 461). More recently it has been called "Operationalism" in the attempt to arrive at specific definitions of concepts. Operationalism defines the meaning or meanings of given concepts in terms of the operations requires to express them precisely. The meaning of "yard" as a unit of measurement consists in the number of operations with a smaller measure, a foot-rule for example, required to cover its length. The term is extended by some, as for example, W.P.Bridgman, THE LOGIC OF MODERN PHYSICS, (1927) to include 'mental' operations required to determine some meaning. The inclusion of such mental operations precludes the use of "behavioral verification" if taken seriously.

In order to attempt to standardize this situation, I shall speak of Observational or Operational verification as denotative or designative of the primary level of verification proper. Observation appears to be the constant factor in each of the views presented in the preceding paragraph. It is the process by which data (facts) are derived and the method by which one determines whether or not the conditions required to establish an hypothesis are, or are not present. In other words, an hypothesis may be considered established or verified if the results obtained from experiments or operations are congruent with what was required for such verification.

ට යට යුතුවලදීම ස්ථාන්ත වන පවතී වට වඩට නැමේ නතු ආරම්භන්ත වන නිවේ ද යුතුවේ එම මෙම වඩට වා විශාලවේ වෙනි ව th chief constructed and grighted names con the property of a Stitution 2000 ກ່ານ ຄວາມ ການ ຄວາມສະເພດ ສະເພື່ອນາດ ສີດການ ການ ການ ຄວາມສະເພດ ຄວາມ ການ ການ ຄວາມສະເພດ ການ ການ ການ ການ ການ ກາ chappens foird a equates . siesels equi a given a prima a bridge couples of the procedures followed by physicians in diagnosis will illustrate the starificatory operations. AA patient is before a physician with some discomfort or disability. Examination consists in checking his blood-pressure, his pulse rate, temperature and other rowine items. All of this is done to determine the matere of the problem, (i) above. In this process, cortain meanings or symptoms will occupy the athenrics of the examiner. The training and previous experience will have provided him with definitions of such symptoms (ii) shove, Also, in this process, devosin hypotheses will have boowred to the diagnosticies (iii) above. These several hypotheses will then be considered in them if the date to one of poliomyelitis, moreor less specific symptoms or reactions must be ebserved or observable. By this time, the giagnertician has resched (iv) above. He is now prepared to engage in the second operation, that of decreaning whether in deat no the patient or policayelitic. Thus for he has been engaged with the clarific tour porcess including prefers the constitutions while while anable him to conclude his diagnosis. The diagnosts for the petician force werely "look at the patient; is looks for prefer rermined items specient and some eredi benimmer

The Becord operation in the logice of Approximation may be called verification proper. There are two levels involved. The first we bare called "Labarioral verification" for the reason that some human sactor ts required by it. It may be called "experimentalism" when one is concerned with the physical and social sciences. It may take the form of pyregnation, instrumentalien or voluntarion which are developments of Charles, S. Pierce's principle that one should "consider what effounce; which might conceivably have practical bearings, we conceive the conject of our conception of these effects is the third the third the conception of our follows and the choice the the the conception of the object. ("Now to make our follows the choice of the conception of the object." Clear" (1878), in PHILOSOPHY IN AMERICA, od. by P.E. Anderson and M.H. Fisch, New York: D. Appalton-Century Co., 1939, p. A61). More recently it has been called "Operationalish" in the attempt to arrive at specific definitions of concepts. Operationalism defines the meaning or meanings of given concepts in terms of the operations requires to empress then precisely. The meaning of "yard" as a unit of measurement consists in the number of operations with a smaller measure, a foot-rule for example, required to cover its length. The term is extended by some, as for example, V.P.Bridgaan, THE LÖGIG OF MODERN PHYSICS (1927) to in-clude 'mercal' operations required to determine some makning. The inclusion of such mental operations precludes the use of "behavioral verification" if taken seriously.

In order to attempt to standardize this situation, I shall speak or Observational or Operational verification de danotative or designative of the primary level of verification proper. Coscryation appears to be the constant factor in each of the riess presented in the preceding paragraph. It is the propess by which data (facto) and derived and the paragraph. It is the propess by which are necessary and the conditional required to establish one development or not the conditional required to establish an hypothesia are, or are not present. In other world, as an hypothesia are considered acts for verified if the respect of the same are congressed in the standard obtained from expertence or order that are congressed in the standard of the same respective or order than are congressed in the standard of the rest of th

A digression may be in order at this point. The discussion of observational verification has proceeded to this point as though all observation consists in inspection. Inspection means the observance by an observer of something other than himself. The results of the use of Salk vaccine were observed by those who administered the vaccine, and their conclusions, were based upon such introspection. What shall we say about! "introspection?" It has been defined in a preliminary manner "as the knowledge by a subject of his own states and processes and of the self considered as the unity of its several states." (Ledger Wood, 'The Analysis of Knowledge', London: George Allen and Unwin, Ltd. 1940, p. 88). Introspection as a metohs off investigation, 'in limited areas', must be given some consideration. If one wishes to determine whether or not there is such a thing as "imageless thought", his only recourse is to engage in introspection. He may have key words spoken to him while he turns his attention inwardly to discover whether or not images are evoked in response. But this poses a question. By what process does the subject "know" whether or not an image has been invoked?

The Wuertzburg Group, under the inspiration of Oswald Kuelpe (1862-1915), who were pioneers in the attempt to investigate the nature of thought experimentally, used 'Bewusstheit' to designate the process. This term has been translated, perhaps inexactly, as "awareness". But to say that in introspection we are aware of what happens within the subject does not appear to add very mu hto our understands of the process. C. E. M. Joad used "awareness" as the constant factor in his epistemology. He defined is as directional activity on the part of man accompanied by immediate certainty. At one level, awareness was defined as perception, since attention was directed toward matter; at another level it was defined as cognition, the awareness of concepts; at a third level, it became mysticism, the awareness of value, (Matter, Life, and Value, 1929).

One could use in wition to designate this activity, as Bergson and others have done. But as pointed out by K. W. Wild, there are at least thirty-one different descriptions of intuition in the literature of western thought alone. (Cf. "Intuition", 1938. Part III). The conclusion reached by Wild is that there is such a thing as "immediate knowing" which deserves farther investigation. Perhaps the most which can be said at this moment is that man can direct his attention either toward external objects or toward his own subjective states. The former objects are "public" in that several different observers may perceive them at the same time. This fact of multiple observation constitutes their "objective" character. The so-called "subjective" objects of interest, such as the proverbial toothache, the thoughts passing through one's mind, or some feelings he may be enjoying, are also knowable in some sense. They are, however, private in that they are not subject to multiple observation. From personal experience, I am inclined to say that such "subjective" give rise to the same certainty or uncertainty that the objective experiences do. One may have a vague pain or feeling of discomfort, But this does not appear to differ in any significant manner from his observation of objective realities. He may catch a vague glimpse of something or he may perceive it clearly and sharply.

We may end this digression by stating that whatever knowledge we have concerning subjective factors has to be obtained by means of introspection. It must be recognized, however, that such knowledge has no greater claim to finality than has our knowledge of objective factors. In both instances, some interpretation is involved. Those who investigated imageless thought had first to clarify their problem and to specify the conditions whose presence would verify their hypotheses. And a judgment had to be rendered as to whether or not the results obtained were congruent with the predetermined conditions. The only "immediate knowledge" which may be asserted must be restricted to our conviction that we were undergoing some experience. Beyond that, one faces interpretation.

repeation and the color of the point as decree at the color of each of the color of

The Myartsburg Group, under the inspiration of Oswald Maeipa (1865-1945), who rependences in the attempt to investigate the nature of hought superfunctions; as used Hermanist to designate the process. Here have been been restablished, a schemently, as the mannered in the say that in introduction recently as and areas in the process in the subject of the subject to any institution of the process. It is a subject the not appear to add very mad the current or are printed of the process of the constant of the

Doe could neu joi**w**don de lesignete das **octivi**ty, as Bergant as siters laste. done. But on pointed out by II, W. Wild, there are at lens fairty-one division. ele activity closes of intentation in the Hadvatuva of westain Mought eleme. (Off, Matricia) 1930. Part III). The conclusion reached by Wild is that that the rece is such a figure as blancolinis knowing! which decouped lardless investigation. Forteen to the de which car be seid at this mement is that man can direct his attention after tovand grægennt objekte og tovked bis væn subjective sækes. The former objektes ku publice in that beveral different observers may perceive then at the sense thurs. This fact of realtiple observation constitutes their "objective" character. The so-called "subjective" objects of interest, such as the proyerbial toothunks, the changhts passing through one's mind, or some leelings he may be cujpyfug. also knowabie in some sense. They are, however, private in that they are not subject to multiple observation. From personal superience; I am inclined to say that such "subjective" give rise to the same certainty or uncertainty that that objective experiences do. One may have a vague pain or feeling of disconsions. But this does not appear to differ in any significant monner from his observation of objective resition. He may cated a vague gibupse of something or be may perceive it clearly and sharply.

We may end this digression by stating that whatever knowledge we have drader they authorive factors has to be obtained by madus of sourcepaction. It would be recognized, for every, that such knowledge has ro greater claim to finality like has our linewisding of chjeding factors. In both instances, some tweetpretallor is such involved. Those who investigated in claim to finally the factors who investigated in continuity the condition of the such such is configurated in the condition of the results of the establish while the condition of the results of the results of the results of the results of the condition of

functions. As a method, it is limited in its cappe to that which is not subject Solipsism, that it is tresticted to one's subjective life. Even that is subject to some multiple observation. But I am prepared to grant that for short intervals at least, I can conceal from others what I am thinking and feeling and even planning or willing. To this limited area, then, introspection may be a useful intellectual tool. So far as our basic problem is concerned, namely, the cognitive quest for God, introspection os of very limited usefulness. It can provide information concerning one factor in the Existential Medium, namely, the specific individual who is undergoing introspective analysis. He may extend this, by analogy, to all other persons, but hemust recognize that he is using analogical inference by so doing. This may be stated as follows: Two things are alike in some respects: we conclude they are alike in all respects. But this logical method has been subject to considerable question. Its cogency depends upon the number and extent of the similarities in the two objects under comparison. It serves quite well with relatively simple objects provided the comparison is extensive enough. But it does not appear to be valid in the case of such complex entities as persons. One may consult studies such as that of F. V. Smith, The Explanation of Human Behavior (1951) for an analysis of some six systems more or less current, in which the difficulties involved in explaining more or less normal behavior are indicated; or he may read Clara Thompson, Psycholognalysis: Evolution and Development (1950) for a simplified statement of the difficulties faced in the theoretical structuring of one of the "depth" psychologoes. Such studies will indicate the problems confronting the individual who would rely upon introspection for anything more than the relatively simple reports of his own experience.

After recognizing the difficulties involved, let us acknowledge themethod of introspection as a possible approach to the understanding of one phase of our Existential Medium, namely the subjective experiences of an individual observer himself. The question then arises: Is it legitimate to speak of such introspection as "observation"? We noted above that observation is a technical term denoting or designating the search for the conditions which will verify or disprove an hypothesis. To "observe" means to direct attention to the objective referent or referents to determine whether or not they are congruents—more or less—or non-congruent, again, more or less, with the requirements specified as "the conditions which will verify the hypothesis." But "direction of attention to or towards" is precisely what occurs in introspection as well as in inspection. If to observe means to attend to something, then the directional activity employed in the effort to discover whether or not "imagelessthought" occurs may be considered a form of observation.

The question as to the nature of the directional activity employed in introspection is another matter. Perhaps it may be described as "awareness" as the Wurtzburg Group indicated. Or it may be awareness as defined by Joad (p 13 above). Again, one may attempt to state the process in neurological terms in which ideas are implicit neurological processes gradually formed in the process of living. Correlations of such processes with words or symbols constitute the "growth of reason." (Frank Lorimer, The Growth of Reason, 1929) Whatever language one may use, the fact involved is man's ability to direct attention either toward the objective, or public realm, or toward the subjective, the private realm.

Perhaps this is sufficient justification for the use of "Observational verification" to designate the primary mode of verification. Until more adequate terminology becomes available, we shall use this.

្នាក់ នេះ ប្រជាពល ប្រជាពល ប្រជាពល បានប្រជាពល ប្រជាពល មិនស្ថិតប្រជាពន្ធនន នេះ គឺ បានបេត្តបានប្រជាពន្ធនេះ បានប្រជាពន្ធនេះ ស្រុះ ស្រុកស្រាជ ព័ណ្ឌ ខេត្ត ស្រែស្រុស ential Medicing, navially, the specific individual will in underlying parts grains de tri expertent indigaleur groet al est teste estagones foureed tod This way be stated on follows: Two things are entre in some reconsidir we conclude they are affire to all respects. But fide fide Logical Lettic fire bes subject to considerable question. The engancy depends appending mortion end entent of the similarities, in the two objects under accapantson. It serves out: well with relatively simple objects provided the coursuison is antenotys out to Fut it does not appear to be valid in the case of ench complex antities as perfect One may consult studies such as that of F. V. Smith, The Brother than of Elm . . Behavior (1951) for an analysis of some six systems more or less unreant, in which the difficulties involved in emplaining more or less normal behavior and ialicated; or he may read Clara Thompson, Psychoicanalysics Evolution and Development (1950) for a simplified statement of the difficulties faced to the theoretical etructuring of one of the "Lepin" payethologons. Their chaffes you andina properties illera edicionalisticioni edicionalista della propertioni alla considera edicioni edicalisti specifica if the suppliciting masses than this colationary size plants of the tension of ្ទស្សាស់ជាភិបា

Address some gradeng the lighting threat interly of, let us an increasing the protection of a prescription of the suppressed to the unique of a continuation of the suppressed to the suppressed of the suppressed to the suppressed of the suppressed

The question as to the patter of thy dimericant anticty employed in interspection is snother matter. The theps it may be discussived as "awarded as "awarded by the state Wartaburg through indicated. Or it may be awarded as dation indicated.

(p if above). Agein, one may attempt to sits the purayed in accuracy by for it is which ideas are implicit accurated processes grandally throughout the process of living. Tovershattens of real processes with world or symbole or estimate the "growth of reason," (French Lorimer, The Growth of Hospital 1929).

Whatever language one may use, the fact involved is man's ability to direct standion situar toward the objective, or public realm, or tracel the author stander realm.

Perhans this is sufficient justification for the use of PObservetional verification? to designate the primary mode of verification. Until mode stequets terminology becomes available, we that use this

The second level of verification is called Implicative Verification, This may be defined as that fomr of verification which consists of support drawn from other and presumably earlier theories verified in terms of Observational verification. This could be called "corroborative" verification if one wished to do so. Stephen C. Papper used the term in the case of what we have named Observational verification. He distinguished two types: that of man with man, and of fact with fact. He called the first "multiplicative corroboration" and the second "structural corroboration." In the case of testing the capacity of a chair to fulfill its expected functions, he himself could sit upon it. If it proved sturdy enough to sustain his weight, he had some evidence to support the view that it was adequate. He could corroborate his findings by asking some of his friends to try it. In this way, he would multiply his corroborations until satisfied as to the sturdiness of the chair. Or, he could use another form of corroboration. He could examine the wood, the way in which it was constructed, and similar tests. This would consist in what he called structural corroboration, (Pepper, World Hypotheses, 1942, pp 47 ff). It should be observed that in both cases, he is concerned with observational verification. His structural corroboration relies in part upon what we are calling Implicative verification. But still includes actual observation by the thinker concerned of the object under investigation. It would appear, then, he is concerned with the first level of verification. I am prepared, however, to accept structural corroboration as a form of Implicative verification with the provision that it does not exhause the meanings which Implicative verification has,

Another term which is allied to Implicative verification is coherence. One of the fine statements of the Coherence theory was presented by H. H. Joachim in 1906 in The Nature of Truth (Oxford University Press). Building upon the monistic philosophy of Spinoza, he denied the existence of self-contained, independ pendent intities. Positively stated, he asserted that there was nothing independent of mind. Reality consisted in a "significant whole" which he identified with Truth. He conceived this whole to be defined most adequately as a self-fulfilling ideal Experience described in terms of categories derived from conscious experience. Knowledge represents our partial comprehension of this Living, coherent systematic Whole.

In defense of this view, he argued that every judgment is but a particular expression of some systematic whole. Thus "two plus two equals four" may be a simple judgment which a third-grader can "understand" as an isolated statement. But its significance lies in the system of mathematics developed through the ages; and the meanings and questions which may occur to one who reads it will differ in terms of the more or less complete comprehension different people may have of the system as a whole. (Chapter III). From this he moves, by entrapolation, to the theory that Reality itself consists in the system atic whole or which the several limited systems constitute particular or partial statements. And as a consequence, every particular judgment, or for that matter, every humanly formulated system is no more than an approximation to the Truth. This can only beknown by an Absolute knower. But the degree of truth which any given judgment has will be determined by the extent to which it is coherent with the shole defined as a self-fulfilling Ideal Experience.

The use of the term Approximation in the preceding paragraph may suggest that the Idealistic epistemology of Joachim belongs within the same classification as those we are considering in this chapter. In Joachim's thought, truth

ន់ទៅហើយ need ប្រជាពីការ ស៊ី ស្រាន់ការបន់សម្ពុជ្ញា កែល ការ សេះ ដែល ស្រែកសារការ និង ស្រែកម ចិត្តបានការ សតិនី តំហាននានិ នាមេតុស្សនា កែ សេងកែលនេះ សេសសារ គេនិយៈ បើកែសក នៃ ការការសំណែល គេ និងការិននៃ ១៨ ក្នុងសារ fermidava end () la names di la filluma selecut i collum glidammento lan unito mient verfilestim, Tyle could be colled because becast of reulfication if one wished to to so, Stophen I, Poper used the remaining ones of what we have named Obsarvenional verification. He dictingulated two types: that of mon with onenbrus Projestade vice syltheticking the file of beside of the file in the sunt file bas io pilosejo sei guidest la geen odi \overline{m} "la cie ceen of teching in apparati a chair to fulfill his grapented functions, he himself could eft upon it, If it proved sturdy enough to enstain his welght, he had some evidence to suppost the view that it was adequete. Fe could ecrycherate his findings by acting come of his friends to try it. In this way, he would multiply his covrabarations will satisfied as to the stardiness of Mad chair, Or, he could use another form of cornoboration. He could examine the word, the way in which it was denstracted. and similar tests. This would condist in what he salled structural correlection Pepper, World Hypotheses, 1943, pp 47 Ml. It should be observed that in both asses, he is concerned with observational verification. Its statestance correboration relies in part upon what we are califyed lapidative vertilead as But still includes setual chaervation by the thinkey concerned of the object under investigation. It would appear, then, he is concerned with the first level of verification. I am propored, however, to undept structural correboration on constitut for sect il todi noistrong add ditor noistolificor evitabilgat la arrak s ine meanings which implicative verification in a

Another term which is allied to Implicative verification is ociocronce. Can of the fine statements of the Colorance become very preparated by H. H. Joseph. of the 1965 in The Plature of Elath (Deference become the preparate Int. Elath (Deference because Int. Elath (Deference in 1965). And have a self-contained, for more interpretation of this contained. In a second contained this consisted in a Subjective which he is entitled in a Subjective which he is entitled the rise of the contained the contained in a Subjective and a site is a self-contained that Elach He contained the terms of contained in the contained and the contained contained the Elach Elach Contained the terms of contained the contained contained the formal first contained to the Elach Elach Elach Contained to the contained of the Elach Elach

In designate of this view, he sugged that every judgesent he but a particular trapression of seam systematic viole. Thus "the plus two equals large less as the season of seath and the states of the season of the states of the

The resofthe term Approximation in the preceding puragraph may suggest the restantiant of the suggest the the dense chastiscetion as the standard chastiscetion as the center of the chapter, in four dissipation truth.

"approximation" to it. This makes truth itself the ultimate. In the case of the logics of Absolute Immanence, the ultimate, if one may use this term as equivalent to the Existential Medium, is a alert to the Existential Medium, is a cynamic process in which novelty, creativity and differentiation are constant or continuous factors. To this extent, one could never say that everything would be timelessly present to some Infinite Knower. Truth, for Absolute Immanentalists, is the mame applied to all of the verified theories concerning this realm of novelty and creativity. It denotes achievements on the part of thinkers rather than the nature or character of the whole. In a world-view in which novelty and creativity are factors, one must agree with William James who said somewhere that we must always add "and" to every judgment which we make

To return to the problem before us, we may distinguish implicative verification from the Coherence theory bynoting that various theories concerning the Existential Medium may be related to one another. By way of exemplification we may recall LShailer Mathews' conception of God as the personality-producing and personally-responsive Factor in our cosmos. (The Hiff IReview, Spring, 1949, pp 85f.) His argument for this conception may be formulated quite simply. Man is. He appeared on this planet perhaps a million years ago in some primitive form. Helhas, during the intervening time, undergone a long p process of development. Part of this was due to his own intelligent direction of his affairs; part was due to environmental factors in process of change. Part of it was due to his own inherent nature, or to his primary "subjective aim" or aims, stated in Whitehead's language. Perhaps more of it was due to the fact that he is a social creature, and that social existence has a determinative effect upon individual development and growth.

What is the evidence which supports this set of affirmations or judgments? Some of it was drawn from geology and anthropology. Evidence accumulated through the years as a result of research finally led to the "theory" that man has been here, in some form or other, for the length of time indicated. This was verified or confirmed by data gathered by means of patient research. In itself, it does not verify the view that God "exists", but it does point to some form or other, for the created process. Secodly Mathewsbelieved

Secondly. Mathews believed that humanity individually or collectively, cannot be given credit for all of this. The conditions which made possible the appearance of man could not have been arranged by man himself. His appearance presupposes them. Thus there is evidence, if not of some conscious purposaiveness or teleology, at least of a process which made human life possible. And if man is a creature of this cosmic process, then it must be interpreted as capable of producing and nurturing him until in due course of time he could assume conscious direction of his own affairs. And this could be carried into the field of organic evolution, cultural development and personality studies.

There is, the n, a group of interrelated theories, verified more or less fully, which have pisitive implications in support of Mathews' conception of God as personality-producing Factor operative in the Existential Medium. The Evidence for God as personally-responsive is more speculative and less convincing. When these several interrelated theories are related in Mathews conception of God as the personality-producing factor in reality, they tend to confirm or corroborate it. It is this process of relating theories together in ways which tend to support hypotheses which we define as "Implicative verification."

Each of these theories whose implications may be used in corroborative roles must itself have ben subjected to observational or operational verification. There is little cogency value in implicatory verification drawn from theories unsupported by operational verification. The significance of this may be indi-

To return to the problem betore us, we may definicable beplicative earlied califor from the Cohesence theory by made we have various theories concerning to a misterial Medium may be rein of it one another. By may of elemptication we may useful Edmilan Madiowal conception of the as the parsenality-producing and personality-responsive Parton in our contacts. The Diff Madio of the Spring, 1969, pp 661,) His argument for this conception may be formulated out simply, Jean is. He appeared on this planet perhaps a million years ago be some primitive form. He has during the intervening time, undergone a fact of process of development. Part of this was due to big own intelligent direction of his utilities; part was due to anvironmental factors in process of obtained direction and the order of the primary Paubjective standors or aims, stated in Whitchead's language. Perhaps more of it was into to the fact that he is a social creature, and that social entitioned has a determinant and growth.

What is the evidence which supports this eet of affirmations or pulporable.

Some of it was drawn from goalogy and antiropology. National agent that were through the years as a result of vesecutal finally had to the Phieory That want instituted the best horse, in some form or office, for the langth of this final finite was a critical by that gathered by the langth of this of the decreasing the final by the final Cod Panistol, but it does no just to some forms or cherry the constant to four the forms of the constant to be a some

Secondly, Madhame believed that he manisty individually or collectively, estending be given credit for all of this. The conditions which made practitle has appearance ance of man could not that a been arranged by more thin soil. The appearance produces them. The chart is evidence, that a same conditions propose propose propose propose or telectory, at least of a process which made intuition life possible. And it man is a creature of this cosmic process, then it must be interpreted as capable of producing and nutritating him until in due course of time be even; assume consulous direction of his own affects, And this could be coursed into the file field as one interpreted that

There is, the m, a group of inserrelated throwies, verified kapte or loss fully, which have pistive implications in support of Mathews' conception of God as personality-producing Factor aparative in the Enisterated Medium. The Evidence for God as personally-responsive is more speculative and less convincing. When these several interrelated theories are related in Mathema compption of God as the personality-producing factor in reality, they tend to confirm or corroborate it. It is this process of relating theories together is ways which tend to support hypotheses which we define as Waspitonilye verter fittedion."

Mach of these theories whose implications may be used in correlevables roles must itself save ben subjected to observational or apecast may verification. There is little cogency value in trappectory variationalized of this may be infinitely.

the theory of evolution. Theories as to the nature of more limited segments of reality must stand or fall in terms of their observational verification. The more inclusive theories which derive their support from these limited theories may contribute insights or suggest further studies with reference to any of the supportive theories. In other words, their relationship to the latter is one of clarification rather than verification. These may be noted in connection with the theory of organic evolution itself. Once it had been established, it suggested to thinkers in other areas that the same process may have been responsible for cultural or political evolution, or even cosmic. But this possibility was only a possibility. Before anything positive could be said, the slow and patient verification process had to be applied to the hypotheses suggested. Such persistent investigation gradually compelled men in anthropology, to take one instance, to reject the evolutionary hypothesis as applied to their field. The establishment of organic evolution suggested the possibility of social and cultural evolution, but these had to be investigated in terms of observational verification before any conclusions could be drawn.

The God-concept then, as, interpreted here, is subject to implicative verification primarily. It is true that some adherents of Absolute Immanence believe God concepts may be verified in terms of operational verification. Attention was called to Wieman's attempt to subject his conception of God as Creative Event to such operational verification. But the cogency value of this attempt must be questioned inasmuch as similar results may be obtained with different hypotheses concerning the nature of God. (cf. my "Verifiable and Non--Verifiable God-Concepts." The Hiff Review, Fall 1955, pp 8 ff).

TIE

We are now ina position to consider seriously the proposal that the Logic of Absolute Immanence is in fact governed by the Secondary Presupposition of Approximation. If the conceptions of God developed or adopted by IAbsolute Immenentalists find their primary support in implications drawn from operationally verified theories of more limited fields, the certainty of their truth can be no greater than that of the theories whose implications support them. If, as Assolute immanentalists believe, God is the religious name of some phase structure, factor or characteristic of the Emistential Medium in whole or in part, then both the existence and nature of God must be verified as indicated above. This means that the theories used in implicative verificationmmust have been verified operationally, or impirically, yet every impirically verified theory must be held as probable. Bertrand Russell stated this rather well when he wrote that "the supposed absolute concept "knowledge" should be replaced by the concept 'knowledge with degree of certainty p, where p will measured by mathematical probability when this can be ascertained. " (Human Knowledge: Its Scope and Limits, New York: Simon and Schuster, 1948, p 498) (It is always possible in the case of operationally verified hypotheses to find facts which may compel revision of the hypotheses in whole or in part, And the long history of mankind's attempts to understand themselves and their Existential Medium would appear to document this rather thoroughly.

This fact is recognized by those who follow modern Emistentialism. Kierkegas repudiated in detail the "approximation-process" and sought security with the confines of his own soul. Edmund Husserl and the Phenominological school sought to arrive at "presuppositionless" philosophy by setting aside (braketing) the world studied by operational verification and confining themselves to the analysis of "pure consciousness." (E. Husserl, Ideas: General Introduction to Pure Phenomenology, trans, by W. R. Boyce Gibson, 1931). But such analysis is a form of introspection subject to the same approximation process as inspection. (Cf. pp. 13 ff., above). The attempt to arrive at absolute knowledge,

of resisting reactions of the color of the control of the control

The God-concept then, as, interpreted here, is subject to implicative verification primarily. It is true that some adherents of theorems of monomous believe God concepts may be verified in terms of operational verification. Attention was called to Wieman's attampt to subject his conception of God as Creative Event to such operational verification. Edut the conception of this this aftempt must be questioned insommed as similar results may be obtained with different hypotheses concerning the nature of God. (cf. m.y Werthishis and Non-Verifiable God-Concepts, Who lift therew. Fell 1955, pp 2 Mg.

737

We are now ina postition to ecnotive asstoually the proposal that the following of of Agrainta frammargae in in in item gewarded by the Dedendary Eurouppostific of Approximation. If the conceptions of God deviced as educted by Films in lmaroacytellota flad their primary support to mplifondoro februs from one e ationally serviced theories of evera Harlied fields, the containty of Nais tour ame he no greater than that of the theories whose inglications arguett fire... ly enot le serve tuelgilet out et bell prelief étainmensuge suivent le propension de propension de la la la consideration de la consideration della consideration de la consideration de l structure, fector or queracteristic of the Bristential Ma Mem to whole or th Party firm both the extintency and nature of Clod court as version to a lighted of This weens that the throwise wood in implicative veutleast cucumostic of bave been varified operationally or laminically, yet every impirically veribespeary moust be hald as probable. Bertrand Theorems vill stated till rathon or ... waen he wrote that Pite supposed absolute donesp: "later teleficie could be eve ්ව ගතු සමාව වැන් දම්ප්රවේද විස්වු විශාව විශාව සිට සිට සිට සිට සිට සිට සිට විද්යාව සිට සිට සිට සිට විවිධ සිට සිට කාළෙනුනෙක් මුදු කාන්මයන් අත් කොරවාදී ඉත් මින්වාදී හැකියක් දිරුණ වෙන් මින් මින්වාරවාදී විශ්ව විසිදු වැනි වෙන Knowledge: Its Sacre and Lituite. Wew Yorky Sturm and Sciencery (Side w no com mought is ities y limitanego in mano care ni operationally vertice i high and mano of The distance will be as a solution of the billion of the relative as a distance of the contract of the contrac And the long history of manished a attempts to understand themselves and here Enistential Medium would appear to document this rather thurship.

This fact is recognized by those who follow modern Entistentializm, Misting we repuddated in detail the "epproximation-process" and cought security with the confines of his own soul. Edmand Husser and the Ehenominological school sought to arrive at "presuppositionless" philosophy by setting aside (braisette, the world studied by operational verification and confining themsives to the analysis of "pure consciousness," (E. Eusser), dead General Introduction and relieve Cheson General Introduction study to Pure Phenomenology, trans, by W. E. Euges Cheson, 1931). The study study sister spection of introspection subject to the same approximation process as unspection, (C. pp. 13 ff., above). The attempt to arrive at absolute finerwise.

knowledge uncontaminated by presuppositions on the one hand or perception on the other has a long history unmarked by success in any field related to the understanding of man and his several environments. Certainty or finality may be possible in pure mathematics or symbolic logic. In such fields the "objects" studies are pure meanings rather than existential actualities, if we may use this redundant formulation. We are finite beings, and limited both in our intelligence and energy. We may achieve workable knowledge with reference to more immediate situations, and probable theories concerning more inclusive realities, including God.

It is granted that some persons, and one cannot estimate their proportion of the human population at any given time, seek for the security which they believe may be found in absolute knowlege. There are others, and again one is in no position to number them, who have learned to live satisfactorily in terms of the approximation process. Absolute Immanence may not satisfy the desires of the first group. It has been developed by those to whom verified probabilities are more important and significant than unverified certainties. They believe that in terms of verified probabilities they are in touch with realities, and they have courage enough to follow this route in their religious living. For others, the catisfaction derived from unverified certainties is preferable to that derived from venturesome living and thinking. Perhaps these two types of people will never appreciate one another. It is for each man to decide where his loyalties lie. For better or worse, the adherents of Absolute Immanence have taken their stand on verifiable probabilities. Only time can tell which approach has "the" future, An BS POSTIN

IV

In the analysis of the logics of Absolute Transcendence, we concluded that these logics were based upon an entological presupposition which we called "The Presupposition of Absolute Demand." (The Hiff Review, Spring 1950, pp 74ff). In terms of the language used in the present discussion, we may rename this "The Secondary Presupposition of Finalism." Certain presuppositions concerning men and his Existential Medium were accepted as the basis of their thinking. One was the "truth" that God and the "cosmos" were essentially dissimilar realities. It was assumed that there was an endless and "qualitative difference" between them. It was also assumed that this endless qualitative difference ob ained in the case of human reason and "knowledge" of God. Furthermore, it was assumed that human destiny must be fully realized, not here in history but in some transhistorical realm. Taken individually or together, they constitute assumptions concerning man and that in which "he lives, moves and has his being," his existential medium. Involved in each of these separate assumptions is the principle of Discontinuity or Dissimilarity.

The Secondary Presupposition of Approximation is also an ontological presupposition. It was formulated (p. Il above) in these terms: Mah's religious and moral interests are subject to proximate rather than final satisfaction, or fulfillment. When one examines this somewhat critically, he discovers that it consists in positive assumptions concerning both man and his Existential Medium. The first of these places man's religious needs in the same category as his other needs, such as the need for food, water, companionship and the entire list of currently identifiable buman needs. This is a depial of the view that religious needs are of endless qualitative difference from all other human

The Calculation and sold of Cavoda II. (1) be addicated yrashmant and sold of sold of the calculation of the

realized that here to be a sort in the case of a sort of the fight of the sort of the sort

the control and the control and the control and one cannot arbitrate the invarious of the control and the cont

To be dott saft abiditations of the collection o no universagen de best one satte sanddise perseng valueseng valueseng universal oli of Beinfer Wolf yns af espons yd Chineran protain graf gant a ond Todie ed har yddianik ac yddiatau. Leinemboulyne Torewes ein Bas mar te yndeanau dan har yn af thaile yn a bas a bas anna a bas anna a bas anna te bas anna dan a bas anna dan a bas anna a bas anna

needs. Religious needs differ from other needs, but the difference is not such as to provide for complete discontinuity. The second positive assumption is the acceptance of the "new mentality" as more or less adequate (i) for an understanding of these needs, and (ii) for the determination of the conditions whereby they may find partial or proximate satisfaction. The third assumption governs one's view of the nature or character of God as the objective pole in the experiences acknowledged to be religious. If, as indicated in the discussion of "The Logic of Absolute Immanence" (The Hiff Review, Spring 1949, p 88) "human needs, including the religious, are natural needs, whose satisfaction is a result of the adjustment and readjustment of the relations between man and his Existential Medium, then God as the dominant factor in the satisfaction of religious needs, belongs within the Existential Medium as such. Thus the necessity for God as supernatural is denied.

We are concerned with the nature of these several assumptions gathered together as the Secondary Presupposition of Approximation. The conclusion would appear to be that they are all affirmations, assumptions or presuppositions as to the nature or character of realities, human and divine. Perhaps we may state this in terms of a proposition: If man's religious needs are human needs, and if human thinking is more or less adequate as an instrument for analysing them and for the determination of the conditions which provide for their satisfaction and if finally their satisfaction results from some relation or relations with God as defined in Absolute Immanence, then the logic which governs Absolute Immanence is valid. In other words, three assumptions concerning man and his Existential Medium provide the justification of his thinking. Yet these three assumptions are all ontological in character, i.e., affirmations concerning whatever is viewed as real.

Ontological assumptions, as indicated in a previous paper (Hiff Review, Winter 1955 p 3ff) may not be used in testing other antological assumptions. They are determinants of cogency, and as such are not testable by other determinants of cogency at the same presuppositional level. If any set of such assumptions is true, then the logics which they support, are presumable valid logics. But the "truth" of any given presupposition, such as the one considered in this paper, cannot be determined so long as one remains at the ontological level.

caseds. Lestigious mests differ Nomerone receip, but the disterence is not such as to brother to be protested; in the second positive assume prion is the acceptance of the "new mentality" as more or less adequate (f) for an understanding of these needs, and (fi) for the determination of the conditions whereby they may find partial or proximate satisfaction. The bird assumption governs one's view of the nature or cheracter of God as the objective pole in the experimences sciences elementalized to be religious. If, as indicated in the discussion of "The Login of Alientating the religious," The Affil Review, by a factor is a casult of the adjustment and readinatural needs, in the settle factor is a casult of the adjustment and readinatural as the description that is a casult of the settle where they as the description that is a casult or is a casult of the settle of a casult or the Bessel is the result of the settle of the casult or the factor is a casult or is a casult of the casult or the casult or description.

Whether those assumptions are in lent true is not the question before us We are connerned with the nature of these several assumptions gathered to gether as the Secondary Presupposition of Approximation. The conclusion would appear to be that they are all affirmations, assumptions or presuppositions as to the nature or character of realities, burner and civius. Perhaps may state this in terms of a proposition. If man's religious needs are harrowned needs, and if burner thinking is more or less adequate as an instrument for uniform their necessary for the set emination of the conditions which provide for their necessary with God as defined in Absolute immenence, then the logic which governs Absolute immenence is velid. In other words, three assumptions concerning man and his Entstendial Medium provide the justification of his thinking. Yet these three essumptions are all outological to character, his thinking, we these three essumptions are all outological to character.

Ontological assumptions, as indicated in a previous paper (Mill Review, Winter 1955 p Mil may not be used in testing other antological assumptions. They are determinable of cogency, and as such are not testable by other determinants of cogency at the same presuppositional level. If any set of such assumptions is true, then the logics which they support, are presumable valid togics. But the struth of any given presupposition, such as the one considered in this puper, cannot be determined so long as one remains at the outological level.

In a series of articles published in "The Iliff Review" during the past several years, I have summarized the results of my investigation of the assumptions or presuppositions underlying various contemporary theologies. The first of these appeared in the Spring 1946 issue, under the title of "The Logic of Contemporary Humanism." This was followed by three short treatises under the general title of "The Logic of Recent Theism," which appeared in 1947 and 1948. Then, in 1949, the third of the contemporary systems was subjected to presuppositional analysis under the title of "The Logic of Absolute Immanence," and in 1950, the same analysis was applied to contemporary Neo-Orthodoxy in terms of "The Logic of Absolute Transcendence."

Later, it was noted that the assumptions basic to the four positions could be classified in terms of two more inclusive sets of presuppositions: (i) The Presupposition of Absolute Demand or Final Realization, and (ii) The Presupposition of Proximate or Partial Realization. At this point, another problem emerged. It is to this problem that the investigations summarized in this paper are directed.

The analysis of the several logics basic to Absolute Transcendence, Partial Immanence, Absolute Immanence and Religious Humanism, and the two Secondary Presuppositions to which these four may be reduced, i.e., The Presupposition of Final or Ultimate Realization and that of Proximate or Partial Realization, makes one fact quite clear. It is that each of these several assumptions and presuppositions is ontological in character. They make certain claims concerning the nature of the Existential Medium as such. Those who maintain the Presupposition of Final Realization assume that man's religious and moral needs are such, and the nature of "Reality" is such, that these needs must be finally satisfied and their goals fully realized. The exponents of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization assume that Man's needs are such, and the "Real" is such that these needs will probably find only proximate satisfaction. The first group accepts Discontinuity as basic, and limits man's intelligence to efficient functioning only at the lower level. For "knowledge" of God and the ultimate destiny of the soul, one must use more-thanrational means of achieving knowledge, or preferably, certainty. The second group, relying upon the principle of Continuity, deny the validity of such extra-natural knowledge, and build their systems upon methods such as behavioral and implicative vertification. Both groups make certain presuppositions which are ontological in character, i.e., refer to the "nature of the Existential Medium as such." It is these presuppositions which serve as the basis of the cognitional systems developed by both.

I.

The situation is analogous to that of a man who would weigh all of his possessions. Among these possessions, he has a scale which he uses to weigh the other items. When he comes to weighing the scale, he finds himself at a loss. It is possible for him to work out a balance on one end of which he places the scale, and on the other, various items which he has already weighed. In this way, he may determine the weight of the scale. In the meantime, he has assumed that the scale is correct. Even though he can weigh the scale by indirection, his weights all assume the accuracy of the scale itself. Another man, using a different type of scale, performs the same operation upon these goods. He, too, finds himself assuming the accuracy of his own scale. When these men compare their respective weights, they may find themselves with different sets of figures in hand. Now comes the sixty-four-dollar question: "Which set of figures is correct?" So long as they have but the two scales, and there differ, there is no way whereby the correctness of either set of figures can be determined.

An a series of articles published in "The Iliff Revier" during the past several years, I have summarized the recults of my investigation of the assumptions or presuppositions underlying various contemporary theologies. The list of these appeared in the Spring 1946 issue, under the title of "The Logic of Contemporary Humanism." This was followed by three short tractises under the general title of "The Logic of Recent Theism," which appeared in 1947 and 1948. Then, in 1949, the third of the contemporary systems was subjected to presuppositional analysis under the title of "The Logic of Absolute Immanence," and in 1950, the same enalysis was applied to contemporary Neo-Orthodoxy in terms of "The Logic of Absolute Traceendence."

Lader, it was noted that the assumptions basic to the four positions could be classified in terms of two more inclusive sets of presuppositions: (1) The Presupposition of Absolute Demand or Final Realization, " and (11) The Presupposition of Proximate or Fartial Realization. At this point, snother problem emerged. It is to this problem that the investigations summarized in this paper are directed.

by octh. these presuppositions which serve as the basis of the cognitional systems developed character, i.e., refer to the "nature of the Existential Medium as such." It is vartification. Both groups make certain presuppositions which are ontological in knowledge, and build their systems upon methods such as behavioral and implicative relying upon the principle of Continuity, deny the validity of such extra-matural rational means of achieving knowledge, or preferably, cortainty. The second group, "kmowledge" of God and the altimate destiny of the soul, one must use morr-thanlimits man's intelligence to efficient inactioning only at the lower level. For only prominate antistantion. The first group accepts Miscontinuity as basic, and Man's needs are such, and the "Moal" is such that these needs will probably find realized. The exponents of the Presupposition of Pronimate Realization assume that "Reslivy" is such, that these needs aust be finally satisfied and their goals folly notion assume that man's religious and moral needs are such, and the nature of Extistential Medium as such. Those who maintain the Presupposition of Finni Realiis extological, in character. They make cartain claims concerning the neture of the fact quite class. At it that such of these soveral assumptions and precuppositions or Ultimate Realization and that of Prominate or Partial Realization, makes one suppositions to which these four may be reduced, i.e., The Fresupposition of Lind. manence, Absolute lemenance and Religious Humaniem, and the two Secondary Free-The analysis of the several logics basic to Arsolute Franscenience, Fartial la-

...

Among these possessions, he has a scale which he uses to weigh the other items. From he comes to weighing the scale, he finds biaself at a loss. It is possible for him to work out a belance on one end of which he places the ocale, and os the other, various items which he has already reighed. In this way, he may determine the weight of the scale. In the seanthie, he has consumed that the scale is correctly whough he can weigh the scale by indirection, the weights all assume the correctly of the scale itself. Another wan using a lifterant type of scale, carford the same operation upon these goods. He too, finds himself assuming the accuracy of his own scale. When these sea compare their respective reights, they may find themselves rith different sets of figures in band. Her comes the indirectled to care the lone way whenced has correctly as they have but the two scales, and the action has as any whence he lone can be a reduced as called as a lone of another set of alger as can be a finder set of a seales.

This, I suggest, is a crude analogy of the situation now facing theologians and philosophers of religion. The several systems examined are based upon two "scales" which determine the conclusions which they have accepted. According to the Presupposition of Final Realization, reality is obligated to provide "justive" for every living person. That is what Kant believed, and he found it unthinkable to believe other wise. 1 This was, for him, one of Collingwood's Absolute Presuppositions. As such, it was "nonsense" to attempt either to challenge or to justify it. Yet the exponents of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization find it equally "unthinkable" to assume that man's needs can legislate what "must" be true of the Existential Medium as such. Their logic is based upon the assumption that all human needs may find some satisfaction, but that the precise degree of satisfaction must be determined by examination of behavioral and implicative evidence, and not by what "ought" to be true. Both presuppositions determine the thinking of large groups of philosophers, theologians and ethicists. "Facts" have cogency value because of these presuppositions, and not because of any inherent qualities they may possess. Is there, then, any way whereby we may "weigh" these secondary presuppositions to determine which is perferable to the other?

It is evident that the bulk of empirical evidence supports the contentions of the adherents of Proximate Realization. Mankind has made some progress, very real in given areas, progress which can be charted and measured, in terms of the logics based upon the Presupposition of Proximate Realization. But having said this, it must be remembered that the adherents of Final Realization do not deny that progress has been made in these areas in the ways suggested. But they are not primarily concerned with this type of advance. With Immanuel Kant and others, they are concerned with "ultimate goals," "eternal ends," and "absolute values." These represent, for them, another level of Being, a level beyond the spatio-temporal, qualitative relm investigated by means of the methods based upon the Presupposition of Proximate Realization. All attempts to sweep aside their griticisms of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization have been made in terms of the presumed validity of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization itself, and are thus circular or question-begging. This means that despite the preponderance of empirical evedence, the Presupposition of Proximate Realization cannot be used by its exponents as an argument against the adherents of Final Realization "without" first assuming the truth of their own presupposition.

We have, apparently, reached the point where it is impossible to discredit either of the two secondary presuppositions without first assuming the truth of the other. This means that so long as we remain at the ontological level in our analysis of presuppositions, we face either dogmatism or scepticism. One may give up the attempt to decide between them. If we do this, we have accepted scepticism since we have denied the possible truth value of the systems based upon both of them. One may decide to accept one of them "on faith" since both obviously cannot be true. This means dogmatism, namely, assuming the truth of a given presupposition in default of adequate grounds for so doing.2 This was the solution proposed by R. G. Collingwood in his significant "Essay on Metaphysics" (1940). And this was precisely the position in which I found myself about the time he published this essay. The most I found it possible to assert, then, was this: If the Presupposition of Final Realization, with its ontological implications, is true of reality, then the systems based upon it are presumably true. And by the same logic, the systems based upon the ontological foundations of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization are presumably untrue. If, on the other hand, the ontology presupposed by the Presupposition of Proximate Realization is sound, then the systems based upon it are presumably ture, and those based upon Final Realization are presumably untrue.

This, I reggest, is a srude unalogy of the situation now facing thrology and and philosophers of religion. The caveral syctems causined are based upon two "scales" which determine the conclusions which they have accepted. According to the Presupposition of Final Realization, reality is obligated to provide "justive" for every living person. That is what Kant believed, and be found it unthinkable to believe other wise. I This was, for him, one of Collingwood's Absolute Presuppositions. As such, it was "nonsense" to atther to challenge or to jushify it. Teb the exponents of the Presupposition of Proximate Mealisation find it squally "unthinkable" to assume that man's assds can legislate what "must" be time of the Existential Medium as such. Their legic is based upon the assumption that all busan needs may find some satisfaction, but that the precise degree of -ive svidenista and be determined by examination of behaviors and implicative evidence, and not by what "ought" to be hree. Both presuppositions defermine the thinking of large groups of chilosophers, theologians and ethicists. "Pacts" have cogency welue because of these presuccestions, and not because of any isherent qualities they may need is there, then, any way whereby we may "weigh these secondary presuppositions to determine which is perferable to the other?

It is syident that the balk of ampirical syidence supports the contentions of the adherents of Frorimate Realization. Mankind has made some progress, very real in given areas, progress which can be charted and measured, in terms of the logice based upon the Presupposition of Proximate Realization. But having said this, it much be remembered that the adjacents of Figal Realisation do not dany that progress has been made in those areas in the ways suggested. But they are not primarily concerned with this type of advance. With Ismanuel Mant and others, they are concerned with "ultimate goals," "eternal ends," and "absolute values." These represent, for them, another level of Being, a level beyond the epatito-temporal, qualitative relu investigated by means of the methods based upon the Presupposition of Producte Mealization. All attempts to sweep aside their criticisms of the Presupposition of Proximate Boslisation have been made in terms of the presumed validity of the Frequiposition of Froximate Realization titself, and are than circular or question-begging. This means that despite the preponderance of supirical evedence, the Presupposition of Proximate Realization cannot be used by its exponents so an argument against the adherents of Finel Realization "without" first assuming the truth of their own oresupposition.

We have, apparently, reached the point where it is impossible to discredit either of the two secondary presuppositions without first assuming the truth of the other. This means that so long as we remain at the ontological level in our analysis of presuppositions, we face either dogmetism or scepticism. One may give up the attempt to decide between them. If we do this, we have accepted scepticism since we have denied the possible truth value of the systems based upon both of them. One may decide to secept one of them "on faith" since both obviously cannot be true. This means dogmation, namely, assuming the truth of a given presupposition in default of sdequate grounds for so doing. 2 This was the solution proposed by R. G. Collingwood in his significant "Resay on Metaphysics" (1940). And this was precisely the position in which I found myself about the time he published this essay. The most I found it possible to senert, then, was this 'lessupposition of Finel Realization, with its entological implications, is brue of reality. then the systems based upon it are presumbly true. And by the same logic, the eyerems based upon the ontol gical foundations of the Presupposition of Proximate Realisation are presumably untrue. If, on the other hand, the ontolyty presupposed by the Prasupposition of Troximate Resitation is sound, then the systems based upon it are processably ture, and those based upon Finel Reclication are presucebly . Our days

In this state of affairs, either dogmatism or scepticism appears inevitable. With the shoemaker in one of Larsen's stories, one gives up the quest. The shoemaker became interested in manufacturing a properual antion machine. Repeated attempts always left him with the conviction that another wheel would solve his problem. But this "one more wheel" multiplied until he filled his whole house with machinery without making any appreciable progress toward his goal. In desperation, he threw the whole thing out and returned to what he could "know" and "do", namely, cobble shoes. This is, of course, a parable illustrative of the sceptic approach to knowledge. Such sceptics insist that man must deny the relevance of theological or metaphysical research, and confine himself to immediate and practical tasks.

Historically, one may observe this in the development of scepticism as cutlined by Sextus Empiricus (ca. 160-210 A.D.). In his Outlines of Pyrrhonism, he moted, repeatedly, that no affirmation could be made without qualification. Thus food may be palatable under certain circumstances, and unpalatable under others. Changes in one's physiological condition or mental state may change the tasto of the food without at the same time having any effect upon the food itself. This inability to state in final or perfect form the nature of the experiences and the experiences led the ancient sceptics to a denial of thepossibility of saying anything about either. 3. It is this demand for finality in matters religious which appears fundamental to the proctical scepticism of the adherents to absolute Transcendence. "The demon of the absolute" dogs their steps whenever they seek for assurance intellectually. As a result, they tend to absolutize certain past experiences transmitted through sacred scriptures in the hope that they may thus escape ultimate scepticism. But the actural result is little better, namely, dogmatism.

Religious sceptics who do not deny the relevance of Religion as such tend to become dogmatic. The dogmatist affirms the truth of a given system without adequate evidential support. The adherents of Final Realization assert that mankind's religious experience is, in some real sense, absolute. If man needs God. defined as either the Absolute Transcendance school or the Partial Immanence school defines the concept, then this need must be viewed as an absolute. If. for some reason, human persons must be immortal, then this demand of man for personal immortality is also considered an absolute. In default of positive evidence to verify the two hypothesis, the dogmatist asserts the final validity of certain experiences, transmitted through sacred writings, and won these writings and experiences, bases his belief in God as transcendent and the soul as immortal. The question of the possibility of the truth of these two hypertheses is not before us; we are concerned with the dogmatic approach to them Thenever one affirms the truth or validity of any hypothesis without adequate support, he : 's the camp of the dogmatist to the extent that he places assertion above verification.

If the outcome of cognition based upon ontological presuppositions is either scepticism or dogmatism, it appears to be necessary to investigate some other approach to the problem. The school of Analytical Philosophers attempt to do this by confirming themselves to the analysis of language, variously defined. E. W. Hall, in a recent work, investigates the nature of value. He limits himself not to so-called "value-experiences" at the entological level, but to an analysis of value-languages. 4 Without entering into the question of the possible signifiance of this approach, lit us examine what may be involved here. These man are saying that there are at least two levels of cognitional research, namely the entological and the linguistic. In other words, one's interest may be focused upon the symbols one uses or upon that which is symbolized.

The distinction to which the Analysteal Philosophers have drawn attention may be accepted as valid. It may be used in our attempt to find a way out of the deadend-situation in which cognition based upon onthological presuppositions finds itself. To consider this more fully, let us refer to the knowledge situation us such. We note that any given knowledge situation is analyzable into three terms: (1) the Object as-such; or OAS; (11) the Object as known, or OAK; and (iii) the Subject as knowning, or SAK, If we define the ontological realm, provisionally, as "the object as it really exists", 5 then all three phases of the knowledge situation as just analyzed are ontological. The OAS (the object-assuch) is abviously ontological; the CAK (the object-as-known) is also an exist. ential situration, and is thus ontological; even the SAK (the subject-as-known) is part of the ontological aspects of the sutuation. Accepting then, the knowledge situation as ontological, we may distinguish it, for purposes of analysis. from the means or methods employed by the subject-as-knowing in it cognizing of itself and its objects. From this point of view we may define opish as lary as the pritical unalysis of the cognitive instruments employed by cognitive is understanding themselves and their Existential Medium. As an activity sugared in by the subject as-knowing, epistemology is part of the ontological situation broadly defined. At the same time, while engated in thinking, a thinker will make assumptions of two kinds: (i) those which refer to the situation in exist ential or situational terms; and (ii) those which control the methods employed or his attitude toward these methods.

By (i) we refer to the list of assumptions and presuppositions named and described under the Logic of Absolute Transcendence, the Logic of Partial Immanence, the Logic of Religious Humanism, and the Logic of Absolute Immanence, and to the Seconary Presupposition of Final Realization and the Presupposition of Proximate Realization. These we have called "ontological" presuppositions. By (ii) we mean, not the situation, but the intellectual tools employed in the examination process. Epistemological presuppositions, then, are not directed to the entelogical (existent situation as such) realm, including man as Existent and the Existential Medium. They are, instead, presuppositions governing the way he approaches the cognitive subuation, or perhaps, the type of cognitive instruments he shall was I shall admit that "approaches to" the cognitive situation as well as the "medical employed, are presumable included within the ontological situation. At the came time, they represent a different level. They are procedual rather than situations: If these terms appear preferable, one may use them. All reary concerned with home is the distinction between situation and methods of approaching it. And I suggest that there is an epistemological or procedural presupposition which will serve to evaluate the two entological (situational) presuppositions under consideration

III

It has long been recognized in fields of serious study that a good hypothesis has at least two marks or characteristics. The first is fruitfulness. Given two hypotheses, one of which holds out the promise of extending knowledge to a considerable degree, and perhaps opening up new vistas for investigation, whereas the other ow mises little if anything cognitively fruitful, the common-sense attitude adopted by the creative thinker has been to take the more fruitful and reject the less. Take for a moment the debate which raged for years between those who accept organic evolution and those who accepted special creation. According to the second bycothesis, God created Adam and Eve out of the dust of the earth, and breathed into them the breath of life. That was an interesting story now generally regarded as myth. The first hypothesis, organic evolution, has proved to be a fruitful approve to the study of man and many of his institutions. To opened new vistas of resource enabled competent students to predict what would occur, and generally added to the

or just relitado truent these methodes empiral on alternational nerms; and (1)) abuse which constrain the sink are an elemenenter escendi penniot amo kinder (i) tiposo antich mater bij ale ali anbrounty defined. At the same time, while expand in tribbing a solution of in by the subject as knewing, episconology is part of the enterior production of the of legal and the objects from this pair of The State of The State of The State of St twom the means or methods employed by the address as asset to be asset to ledge situation as ontological, we may distinguish it. For personal all and the is part of the ontological aspects of the sutuation. Appending they have a ential situration, and is thus ontological: even the SAX (the subject mediation) such) is abviously ontological; the Dak (the object as known) is also to odder knowledge situation as just analyzed are ontological. The DAS the athere as visionally, as "the object as it really entate", 5 thon all importance of the (iii) the Subject. as knowning, or SAK. If we define the perot plant in the con-Lermas (3) the Objects as such or 045. (2) the Object was not a few factors of the factors of th **ခုေရာက္ေျခရိုင္ေနတည္ေနရာကို မူသည္ အေနရိုင္သိုင္သိုင္သည့္ အခုိင္သည္ကိုင္သည့္သည္ အေနရိုင္သည့္သည့္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိ အေနရိုင္သည့္အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင္သည့္ အေနရိုင** end tituation in watch togeth ton could got trade together and many trade to the tituation in the consider base more failly, by the fixed of the desired for the consider base more failly, by the fixed of the consider base more failly, by the fixed of the consideration of the constant of accepted as velid. It may be and the same changes and the same gua grapromata de apara de la colonia de la colonia.

Ex (i) we cofee to the list of aeguaphions and presuppositions made the larger than tegic of the list of aeguaphions and presuppositions made the larger of the larger than th

333

The two lines because a constraint of a constraint of the constant of the constraint of the constraint

sum-total of human knowledge. Thus "fruitfulness" is a basic mark of a good hype-thesis.

A second characteristic already suggested is its capacity to predict. With the special creation story of man's origin, there was little predictive value. With the organic evolutionary hypothesis, there were many predictive possibilities, such as the several lines of evidence now generally presented to support the hypothesis. All these lines were the result of implications drawn from the hypothesis which in time were discovered to be fully or partially true. Thus fruitfulness and predictive value are characteristics of good hypotheses, as the history of human thought indicates. 6 Several other desirable characteristics of hypotheses are considered by contemporate logicians. The two mentioned are presented in order to clarify somewhat the meaning of the epistemological (procedural) presupposition which we offer as a possible escape from either scepticism or dogmatism.

Collingwood's assertion that it is "nonsense" or "pseudo-metaphysics" to question Absolute or Final Presuppositions is conceivable true if such presuppositions are are necessarily entological in character. We have indicated some of the reasons for the impossibility of deciding among such entologies stated in presuppositional form. But there appears to be no wecessary reason for assuming that presuppositions such must be entological. There are no apriori reasons why they may not be epistemological as well.

We would propose, then, the adoption of a presupposition of Inc. casing Cognitional Efficiency, at the epistemological level, as a possible instrument by means of which we may escape from the circle of ontological presuppositions. If hypotheses may be tested prior to entrance into the verificatory phase of thinking, by their fruitful ness and predictive value, why cannot onthological presuppositions be tested the same way? Again, there appears to be no a priori reasons why they may not. Accordingly, we propose to test secondary presuppositions in terms of increasing cognitional efficiency. Those ontological presuppositions which appear to have greater promise of increasing the efficiency of human thinking are to be preferred to those with lesser promise of cognitional efficiency. This means that the test of the Secondary Presuppositions of Final Realization and Proximate Realization will be found at the epistemological level, more specifically, in terms of their respective possibilities of increasing the efficiency of human thinking.

This, I suggest, is not "nonsence," but "common-sense" in so far as ultimate human problems are concerned. If metaphysics is so defined that its only outcome is either scepticism or dogmatism, then in truth it should be called "pseudo- otaphisics and the sooner it is abandoned the better it will be for the human race. But this not necessarily the case. Granted that scepticism and dogmatism appear to be the only possible outcomes so long as one remains at the ontological level, as soon as one transfers his basis of operations to the epistemological level, there would appear to be available a basis for common-sense evaluation. In other words, the alternative to scepticism and/or dogmatism would appear to be common-sense.

IV

What is the common-sense approach to the problem of ontological presuppositions? Common-sense is not currently covered with much emotional appeal. Some identify it with "naive" realism, and then condemn it as thoroughly as it should be condemned. But we have in mind what George E. Moore meant when he spoke of "common-sense". Basic to his philosophy of Common-sense are certain truism, each of which he knew, with certainty to be true: "There exists at present a human body, which is my body.

awa ngiyeta ke ne mada ke esa diye a a dibabi ji Presence kamunga ji se kalua da se ka a ke kulo ke guna da Abbabisa

A mecond characterist structure englested to its exploitive a position of the special creation stry of ments origin. There are likely product to exclusive educations the organic evolutionary hypothesis, there easy predict the creation is the several lines of evidence are gonerally presented to support the best hostification in time were discovered to be fully or certifully true. "Your are characteristics of good hypotheses, as the instry of total dictive value are characteristics of good hypotheses, as the instry of total thought indicates, before desirable characteristics of hypotheses to sidered by introductions. The two mentioned are presented in order to clarify somewhat the mouning of the epistemological (procedural) presents the muich we offer as a possible escape from either coepision or dogmetter.

Collingwood's assertion that it is "exhause" or "proude antachysics" to possible the Absolute or final Presuppositions is conseivable true if soon presuppositions divided are necessarily entological in character. We have indicated some, of the crist, for the impossibility of deciding among such entologies stated to presuppositional form. But there appears to be now assert reason for assuming that presume at the contological. There are no apriorit reasons why they cay out the coistempological are no are no apriorit reasons why they cay out the coists as well.

We would propose, then, the adoption of a presupposition of Movement to the Siliciency, at the apiscemilagical level, as a possible under which the circle of autological presuppositions. If the result of the case and protot to entraine into the various of this way? The entraine ratue, and cannot universal presuppositions by their result way? Again there assent so to be a protot issaed to the five solutions to the secondary presuppositions to the fillipse analogies of the universal prototions of the actions of the entrained to the test of the fillipse analogies. It is a to be presented to the content of the secondary of the seco

This, I suggest, is not "nonsence," but "common-cense" in so fer or alloweds has problems are concerned. If molaphysics is so defined that the coly content is situated the replicion or dogmatism, then in cruth it should be called "perceived the and the scener it will be for the homan well of the not not necessarily the case. Granted that scepticism and degratism deposition only possible curcomes so long as one remains at the carological level or remains transfers his basis of operations to the epistemological level, their postal case to be evaluated to the case of the alternative to be evaluated as the case of the alternative to scepticism and/or degree would appear to be evaluated some sense.

V 1

Real is the common senes approach to the problem of detripping interespect of the common senes of the contract of the problem of the contract of the contract

This body was born at a certain time in the past, and has existed continuously ever since, though not without undergoing changes; it was for instance, much smaller when it was born, and for some time afterwards, than it is now." 7 This with a series of related facts, Moore accepted as definitely true and known by him to be true. When he faced the questionas to how to formulate these "facts" in proposal form he found it difficult to reach an analysis of his knowledge of which he could be equally certain. 8 But this inability to arrive at equal certainty concerning the analysis of what he knew does not contradict the fact of his knowledge. That is to say, the heart of Common-Sense philosophy is the acceptance of such certainties as are implied in normal experience and are presupposed in normal thinking. It is certain that one would not concern himself with the problem of how one preceives a human hand if there were no experiences of objects, which by common consent, we call "human hands." How the "hand" exists or subsists is a secondary question which presupposed that, no matter how defined, a hand is. Thus, the problem of perception presupposed the perceptual object perceived. Then and only then, do the questions of how this object is believed to exist, and how we are aware of it, become relevant. 9

When we return to our problem, the common-sense approach to the evaluation of Secondary Presuppositions, we suggest that we know that it is better to utilize presuppositions which tend to further the cognitive quest than to employ those which tend to hinder that quest. Knowledge, in other words, is preferable to ignorance. Even the knowledge that one does not know, provided this is true, is better than ignorance of the fact that we are ignorant. This observation, made by Socrates, we submit is something which underlies in some degree, the cognitive activities of every person whose thinking we have analyzed. This is what we mean by the Primary Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency here proposed as the presently known test of Tertiary and Secondary Presuppositions. 10 If it is possible to show that one presupposition hinders, and the other presuppositions further the cognitive quest for God, then it is only common sense, and we suggest, good sense, to reject the former and adopt the latter.

T

If we are to establish the hypothesis that thinking is more efficient under the control of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization, it will be necessary to show (i) that this is actually, in given areas, the case, and (ii) that what is true in these "given" areas may also be true in the areas designated by the cognitive quest for God. We believe it can be demonstrated, with little difficulty, that the growth of knowledge in the western world is a direct result of the demial of absolute claims, and the adoption of the search for proximate goals. The second problem, that of "proving" that this approach may be made to the publishes before us, is more technical, but the evidence is, we believe, sufficiently cogent to compel acceptance of the conclusion suggested. We shall consider the two matters in the order suggested above.

In the first place, the knowledge which we possess of existent realities is relative imposing. Whitehead noted in discussing the attempts on the part of scientists to formulate the basic concepts in their fields of study; "Success is never absolute, and progress in the right direction is the result of a slow, gradual process of continual comparison of ideas and facts". It We are finite creatures, possessed of finite minds, facing what is as yet beyond our complete comprehension. Whether we like it or not, we must live in terms of probabilities. The evidence for this is voluminous, and we shall merely suggest it in terms of one field, namely, medicine.

tura glascotlinop beseine and ha. jseko edd al eali aletret t le negli nea joe kult eligas, bhoash nor williout cadergries changes; it was for instaces, much seeller care to the part, and for some titue of barwards, thun to is now." ? This with a surface ed a cirtued dated go minima survey see declinities of the base of the bord of the bord of on andi [reduct] his "eduat" weed outsimmet of rad at ampideous and beath of their be biser of deide to expelwant at to singless us descr of Jimithis it baset equally asseria. S but this inclifity to earlys at Equal carbulaty casesting the of the deal compositions and to their politicals for the three one is the west of their to elegishe se seidmisdret dour lo symmiqeros edd th ydgwelldd eanel-desmo) to frink edd , ges te is it is a contract the contract of the contract of the contract is a contract of the contract of certain that one work not concern himself with the problem of how one processes A lexica baid if there were no experiences of objects, which by common consent, we all "incer into ?. I have the "burd" exists or substants as according question which presupposed thet, no marker how defined, a hand is. Thus, the problem of perception prosupposed the percupassi object perceived. Then and only time, do the questions of how take object to believed to exist, and how so are stare at it, be-

bhan we rehard to our gradies, the common-manus approach to the evaluation of the contemp fractions with the suggest the trained to it is better to utilize presuppositions which tend to further the organitive quest than to supposition which tend to furthe the context is preferable to ignorance that tend to into one not into provide this is that, is botter that ignorance of the free that we take into a provided this is that, and by Scoretes, ignorance of the free thing which enderlies in each late contities at each the contities as the contities as a provided to the contities as the of every porson about this indicates and prove malysed. This is also no man by the free contities to the transition of the transition of the provided to the transition of the provided to also the provide to also the provide to also the provide to also the provide to also the transition of the former when it is only common over, positions for the old the reject the former and adopt the labter.

7

If we are to establish the hypothesis that thinking is more efficient under the control of the Presupposition of Proximate Mealisation, it qill be necessary to show that this is actually, in given areas, the case, and (ii) that that the true in these "given" areas may also be true in the areas designated by the cognitive quest for God. We believe it can be demonstrated, with little difficulty, that the growth of knowledge in the mealers world to a direct result of the teach of about late whether of the second of the serond or blee, that of "proving" that this second ney be area to be the the teach of the condition of the competence of the conditions of the condition of the two matters in per acceptance of the condition suggested. We shall consider the two matters in the order suggested above.

In the first place, the knowledge which we possess of amistont realities is rain active decreased provided in discussions the attempts on the part of success is suitable to lormalate the basic coaceates in their fields of study; "Eucess is nower absolute to lorge out in the right direction is the result of a alow, gradual propers of continual comparison of ideas and factor. It was are finite crettures, continued as yet beyond our complete continued on this attempt of a succession. Ebelies we like it to stip the line and in the second of the continued of the continued of the second of the terms of the continued of the terms of the continued of the terms of the continued of the c

If one will examine the history of medicine, he will discover that from the time of Rippocrates (born ca. 460 B.C.) to the early part of the nineteenth century, very little progress was made in extending the life-expectancy of mankind. In Rome and the Mediterranean world during the Augustan Age, the life-expectancy of any given individual was approximately twenty-five years. 12 In 1825, for western culture, it had risen to about thirty-five years; by 1925, it had risen to fifty-five years. 13 Since then it has risen to approximately seventy. This means that the life-expectancy of western man has allmost trebled during the twenty centuries of the Christian era. Disregarding the negative factors for the moment, let us note the positive factors believed responsible for the great increase during the past century and a quarter. Acording to Sir William Osler, Canadian born authority in this field, three such factors may be identified. The first consisted in the increase in "creative comforts," that is , is advances in the standard of living. The second consisted in developments in sanitation and hygiene. This factor reduced infant mortality rates by as much as ninety percent in given areas. The third factor was the great increase in the range and efficiency of surgery. These three factors can be correlated definitely with the decrease in mortality and the increase in life-expectancy. Other developments which have occurred since Sir William wrote this (1924) in such areas as endogrinology, psychopathology and pharmacology would now be added to the list.

Why did these changes occur so late? Why did the life-expedancy of western man increase only an estimated ten years during the first 1800 years of this era, and then rise so rapidly during the past one hundred and twenty-five years? Perhaps an analysis of one disease, malaria, will suggest the answer. References to this disease in the Hippogratic Collection (ca 400 B.C.) and in the writings of Claudius Galen (ca 130-200 A.D.) indicate that it was of sufficient importance to engage the attention of serious students of medicine. Despite the fact that both collections of medical writings contain accurate descriptions of this disease in its several forms, neither body of writings offers evidence that either the cause of the disease or of adequate methods of treating it were known. 15 It was believed that stagnant water had some thing to do with it, or that foul air may have been etiologal factor. When large numbers of persons were infected, the air and all that floated in it were suspects. But no ancient authority ever connected mosquitoes, and especially the genus Anopheles, with malaria infection. Some of them approximated this conclusion, unwittingly, when they stated that such infection occurred indamp areas, and from this drew the logical inference that the plants, insects and animals which inhabited these are as were dangerous. Some of their practices too, were apparently effective. They burned piles of wood to keep the pestilence away. The smoke undoubtedly drove the mosquites away, and thus probably prevented some infection, 16

It was not until the latter half of the nineteenth century that the nature of malaria infection was determined and the specific mosquito responsible for transmitting the parasite identified. It is not surprising, therefore, that the physicians of the first century and prior to that were baffled by this debilitating disease. They studied it, and left descriptions which contemporary authorities believe to be quite accurate. They made ingenious guesses concerning the areas where the danger of infection was greatest, but they did not understand it nor could they combat it effectively. Even Pliny the Elder (23-79 A. D.) one of the learned men of his day, admitted that medicine was helpless so far as quartan malaria was concerned. It required years of patient research and experimentation to determine the etiology of malaria, and then to devise methods, often piece-meat for its prevention and cure. And even today, questions still arise with regard to possible revisions of the theories now held. 17

A one will enemiate the biotopy of medicae, by will discover that brown the items of hippocesses (born es, 460 B.C.) to the early part of the cineteensh contary, very little progress was mode in entending the life-emperionary of markend, in Movie and the Mediterranen world doring the Angustan Age, fire live expentacy ed any given individual was approximately twenty-live years. In 1818, for versions culture, it had ris at to about thirty-dive years; by 1926, it had risen to fifty dive rights for Ellis mades that the life-engactement of western man has allenest trabled during the twenty confuries of the Christian ere. Hisrogurding the negative factors for the moment, let us more the positive factors believed Incpensible for the great tuerance during the past century and a quarter. According to Sir William Osler, Canadian born litthowity in dis field, thires such factor may be identified. The first consisted in the ingresse in Mercutive comports, " that is , is advanced in the standard of living. The second consisted in developments in excitation and bygiene. This factor reduced infant marriality rates by an much as mirety percent in given The third factor was the great increase in the range and efficiency of surgery. These three factors can be correlated definitely with the darreads in morfoldty and the increase in life-expectatoy. Other developments which have congred since Sir William wrote tide (192 4) in such areas as endeprinciony. psychopskhology and pharmacology would now be added to the list.

Why did these changes occur so late? Why did the life-supposacy of western man ingresse only on estimated ten years during the first 1800 years of this era, and then rise so repidly during the past one hundred and twenty-five years? Farkeps an anelysis of one disease, maistie, will suggest the answer. Seferalone to this disease in the Ripposyntic Cellection (as 400 B. C.) and in the writings of Clandius Calen (es 190-200 A. D.) indivere that it was of sufficient importance to ongage the attention of sertions students of medicine. Despite the fact that both collections of medical weitings comain coestwite descriptions of this discuss in its several forms, natiber body of writings offers evidence that of ther the cauca of the disease or of adequate methods of treating it were known, 15 Has ha lieved taek stegnant water lad some **thi**rg **to do with it, or this to** uf als may have bes etiologal factor. When large numbers of persons were infected, the air and all that Mosted in it were suspects. But no ancient authority ever connected mosquitoes, and especially the genus Anopheles, with malaria infection. Some of them appreximated this conclusion, unwittingly, when they stated that such infection occurred indexap areas, and from this drew the logical inference that the plants, insects and animals which inhabited these are as were dangerous. Some of their practices too, were apparently effective. They berned piles of wood to keep the passilance away. The smoke audoubtedly drove the mosquites away, sad thus probably prevented some infection. if

it was not until the letter ball of the mineteenth century that the rature of maisria intection was determined and the specific mosquite responsible for transmitting the parasite identified. It is not surprining, therefore, that the physicians of the first century and prior to that were belified by this debilitating disease. They studied it, and left descriptions which tentemporary authorities believe to be quite accurate. They made ingenious goesses concerning the areas where the denger of miscition was greatest, but they did not understand it nor could they enter it effectively. Then Play the filter did not understand it nor could they will enter of the learned was concerned. It say that medicine was implied still experimentation to story and concerning the riches piece-month determine the violety of maderies, and describe mothers with regard of the paratic and core. And even to accurate a situation with regard to paratic anyther of the theories with regard.

This disease is attributed to the presence of a minute parasite which imbabits the red blood corpuscles. These parasites where discovered by Alphonse Laveran (1845-1922), of Paris, who described them fully. Sir Ronald Ross (1857-1932) located the mosquito responsible for transmitting it, the Anopheles, about 1895. The approved method of combatting the disease is that of controlling the breading-places of the parasite-carrying mosquito. This method has made possible the elimination of the disease in some regions, and may result in its complete elimination. Studies in the United States for 1938 indicate that the mortality rate for Malaria, was then the lowest of record.18

This brief sketch of one specific problem is indicative of the way in which numer knowledge grows. It occurs when men become interested in specific situations, and then spend themselves in observing, recording, and testing their result by experimentation, then rechecking whenever any new light or suggestion emerges. Malaria could not have been controlled without developments in such fields as microscopy, which enabled men to discover germ and microscopic life; to developments in drainage and flood control; to the discovery and invention of new drugs and anti-bodies. In brief knowledge in this area resulted from the careful and continuous application of behavioral and implicative verificatory methods to specific problems.

The answer to the first question seems clear. What knowledge we have garnered blooms out human history has been the result of patient observation, and careful reflection upon the results of such observation. The history of science tells the story from one amgle: the attempt of the part of patient men to learn as much as possible about selected areas of interest. The pasic interest does not appear to be "perfect" knowledge, but reliable information; information which serves as a basis for prediction and which is accepted or rejected in terms of its capacity to predict not only ever yet to occur, but also records of events which have occurred. This statement from the pen of Warren T. Vaughan concerning developments in the field of endocrinology indicates the interrelatedness of information as well as the significance of predict bility in the search for reliable information. "True progress, had perforce, to award success in the isolation or separation of the secreted substances in oure form, we contaminated by other tissue extracts; the determination of its chemical constitution or formula; and, when possible, its preparation synthetically in the laboratory is a form identical with that made within the tissues of the body. When this has been deport then we are in a position to study the substance experimentally, just as we study in other drug such as digitalis, morphine, atropin or cascara, by observing the response of animals to its administration and the response of persons who have been shown to be deficient in some one of the internal secretions, to its use as a curative drug The medical research student subjects himself to severe standards before he will class. that he "knows". He not only isolates the substance under investigation; determined its chemical constituents; but he also insists that he must be able to produce it synthetically in his laboratory before he is prepared to test its effect when expense mental animals, and finally upon human beings. It is this process of knowing to so well that he can produce it synthetically which is the heart of the matter. This conhe can predict what will occur if he adds the proper elements under specified conditions. It is patient, tireless work which prepares the way for growth in knowledge in highly important fields such as medicine and surgery. Students in these fields have adopted the "new mentality"; in fact, they have been instrumental inproducing a They are not quided in their thinking by the Fresupposition of Final Sealization, and by that of Parimate Realization. "Success is never absolute, and progress in the direction is the result of a slow, gradual process of continual comparison of idea with facts." This statement by Whitehead, in actual fact, summarizes the process we have so inadequately sketched.

Dr. Bs poole

This much, then, we may accept as true; Knowledge in the field of medicine has advanced steadily, with resulting benefits to long-suffering humanity since research students and practicing physicians adopted the new mentality; since they learned to rely upon the methods of behavioral and implicatory verification in the investigation of the causes and cures of diseases as well as the conditions of health. The same methods were employed in agriculture and food production so that today it is possible to provide not only more food but more adeauate food for a good portion of the human race. The long story of the advances made in adding to human welfare in terms of behavioral and implicatiory verification may be found in any history of the several fields as well as in histories of science. 20 A new chapter is in process of unfoldment when and as nuclear fission may be utilized more fully to serve the peaceful rather than the aggressive tendencies of humanity. But this new age, as the preceding, will make its most rapid strides in terms of the new mentality applied to specific problems for proximate goals. The evidence for this may be found in any handbook describing the discovery of nuclear fission, and its application thus far.

TY

It was stated above, 21 that in order to establish the truth of the hypothesis that thinking is more efficient under the control of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization than under that of Final or Absolute Realization, it was necessary to present evedence that (i) such efficiency has in actual fact occurred in specific areas, and (ii) that the same approach may be made to the areas designated by the "cognitive quest for God." We turn now to this second fact which must be established

It does not appear possible to attack this problem directly. The reason is that "all of the exponents of the Presupposition of Final Realization presuppose that God is in whole or in part of such nature that behavioral and implicatory verification methods cannot be applied to the investigation either of His nature or existence." This apparently makes impossible any reasonable discussion of the problem whatsoever. The response is always ready: "But God is not such a reality as can be so investigated." This assertion can be met and denied, but in order to do so it would be necessary to do the following: (i) define the nature of religion, and establish the definition in cognent terms: (ii) examine in detail the character of the several divine realities which were factors in the experiences of religious behavior studied. The problems involved in this cannot be dealt with simply or briefly.

However, there may be another way of meeting this problem. If the exponents of Final Realization assert that behavioral and implicatory methods of vertification are not applicable to the investigation of the problems related to God, we may ask them what methods they propose to use. If these methods prove to be unsatisfactory, then there is at least presumptive grounds for accepting methods which have proved to be efficient in other areas.

The exponents of Final Realization, i.e., those who accept the logic of Absolute Transcendence, as a whole and the adherents to the logic of Partial Immanence, in part, depend normally upon revelation as the source of their information concerning God. It will be granted by many of them that some information concerning God may be obtained by means of behavioral and implicative reasoning, but it is primarily negative. That is to say, evidence is presented to show that human efforts to achieve either truth or goodness are ineffective. It is also denied that the normal cognitive processes can be used to arrive at satisfactory knowledge of God. 22 As an alternative they turn to revelation.

three miles in the platory of religion is replate when critical circumptors of actions are controls as as a control of actions of actions are controls. The Old and Wer Teachments, as well as religious liberature of all ancient people of actions actions and actions actions actions action from the action of actions actions of all ancient concerning methods information from the extranstural actions action actions action actions action for actions to be action to be action to be actions action actions action actions action actions of restoration from the extranstural actions actions

that infant mortality was very high, and this brought down the level to beenty-files opher if he had not lived to be seventy! At the same time, medical historians sellent the beginning of the third century A.D., apparently assumed one could not be a pittle and Incds beautius, Ungerelasting, in his elives of Uminent Philosophers" (produced south twenty-five years. This does not mean that many persons did not live to be quite to deducatives as yew boired end to yonsicespectable this is an intoitem amon to estate medicine found melcome in Rome. We have indicated, above, the relatively inefficient self in the Italian capital, and began a successful practice. From this time, theory About the year 90 B.C. Ascleptades, a Bithynian physician, established inc to win many patients. As a result, Oreek medicine received a bad name smong the He proved to be too fond of his knike and caubery .D.8 812 thods smod mi solteward Archagathus, a Greek physician, established his was certainly not far advanced. precarious as do the Melanesain peoples. Medical science, if we may use that terms Augustan Age (ca. 44 B. C-A.D. 68) faced a health situation almost as mysterious and This situation does not differ greatly at another cultural level. The Romans of the

Confronting such a situation where they faced diseases and injuries with little instrantion and practically no pharmacology, the Romans of this period turned to made and religion for help. Gods and demons were generally credited with responsibility for both nealth and disease. The Homans had at least seventy-three gods who fanction for both nealth and disease. The Homans had at least seventy-three gods who fanctions the tracest of hesith 25 with the setual diseasest throughout their history in matters of hesith 25 with the proper information might be received was a lavorite healthng Cod where in dreams the proper information might be received, was a lavorite method. Frayer and facting were also used 20 Oracles were consulted in times of method. Frayer and facting were also used 20 Oracles were consulted in times of method. Frayer and facting were also used 20 Oracles were consulted in times of spidemics and the advise received was accepted as both authoritative and supermander the Sibylline Oracles advised bringing haklepios, the Greek God of healthng to now in 293 or 292 B.C. to stem a severe pestilence.

Divination, augury, and astrology were all used in the attempt to tap experancional sources of information in serious mathers. Battles were fought or mere avoided according as the divine prognosis was favorable or unfavorable. Metanoesis was an easential factor in the behavior of early and ancient civilization as much as aclast tific method is in ours. With inadequate means of arriveng at reliable knowledge to taking situations where knowledge was desperatly needed, savege and ancient people facing situations where knowledge was desperatly needed, savege and ancient people had recourse to metanoetic devices of many types.

Let us grant that metanoesis trovided for both savage and ancient peoples some rational alications of mysterious event was placed within a magical or religious context, and to that extent become meaningful. Let us grant, slad, the or religious context, and to that extent become meaningful. Let us grant, slad, the some of the ideas presumably derived from metanoesis served a socially integrative

purpose. If a given disease is the result of the displeasure of the god febris, for instance, and there are prescribed ways of removing this displeasure, then the group will be integrated about this process for the time being. Both removal of the mysterious and the resulting socially cohesive activities must be considered valued At the same time, the question of fact must eventually arise. Did any of the meta noetic devices provide reliable knowledge concerning (i) the nature of malarial infection, (ii) the etiological factors responsible for it; or (iii) the ways whereas the disease may be controlled? And the answers to these several questions must be in the negative. Reliable knowledge was not obtained in that fashion, and every to today will admit it. Furthermore, what about the status of the reality of the godden Febris, a personification of fervers, especially malarial fevers? She not only see the disease, but cured it when certain conditions were met 27 Again, it is generally agreed among contemporary Occidentals that such an individuation of a disease while accompanying etiology and prognosis cannot be given serious consideration. The whole complex of ideas loss not belong within the context of realable knowledge.

The conclusion to which the facts apparently drive one is that the use of metamore in the past did little if anything to further mankind's attempts to understand each himself or his environment. There are those who believe that metamoesis actually hindered the quest for knowledge and this may well be the case. It is unnecessary for us to pass judgment upon that matter. We are concerned with a broader ons: "Did this approach further mankind's quest for knowledge; did it increase the cognitional efficiency of human minds or not?" And the answer must be either in the negative or neutral. It is evident that this was not the way to learn more about malaria; the attempt to find its etiology in a given God was undoubtedly a misquise quest. Knowledge of such entities or events comes by means of slow, presistent and patient observation of conditions and comparison with the demands of a given hypochnamely, in terms of behavioral and implicative verification. But the other question still remains: "What about knowledge of devine realities?"

What happened in the case of savage and ancient peoples? Did the metanossis of the Trobriand Islanders, for instance, further their quest for knowledge of God? They attributed diseases to sprites, demons and other supernatural beings. Among them we "tokway," a wood-sprite which lived in trees and rocks. It was believed to steal for from the fields and yam-houses, and to inflict slight ailments upon persons. A second group consisted in "mulukqausi" or flying-witches, believed responsible for a rapid and violent diseases. The third of the supernatural or extranatural realistics accepted as responsible for diseases was the "Tauva'u", whose activities resulted in epidemics.28 It is difficult to see what, if any, contribution to the growth of beard erge such hypothetical entities made. Obviously, they do not represent actualities as they are conceived by the Trobrianders. That diseases occurred is factual; that such diseases may now be diagnosed and in most cases cured is also factual. But the process from mystery to understanding does not appear to have been the read through metanossis; it was instead the result of research and investigation by men trained in the new mentality.

The belief on Dea Febris does not appear to have furthered our quest for knowledge of God today. This godiess would not be listed among the sources of our present Godiconcepts. That she may now be considered an early attempt to relate the healing factor in our existengial Medium with God as now understood by many people may be true. But so far as furthering our present theological knowledge is concerned, we see little if any value in this conception. She may possibly have furthered our information of the disease of which she was an individuation, but medical authorities would find this difficult to believe.

V1f

It it be granted that ancient metanoesis made little if any contribution to the growth of contemporary knowledge concerning God, what can be said about the methods proposed under the Presupposition of Final Realization? Such God-concepts are by definition based upon some form or forms of metanoesis. This is the only conclusion possible in the face of their assertion that God is a reality not subject to investigation by the normal behavioral and implicative verificationy methods. In so far as God is transcendent; that is the relations between God and the cosmos are governed by the principle of discontinuity and and qualitative difference, methods other than behavioral and implicative must be used in the attempt to determine either the nature or existence of God or both

However, the exponents of God as Absolutely Transcendent are smwilling to rest in ultimate inexplicability. They therefore proceed to tell us a great deal about God. The source of their information is revelation. Revelation is by definition a modern form of metanoesis if revelation is defined as a method or means whereby information is made available to man in other than natural or normal ways. Perhaps a brief analysis of H. Richard Niebuhr's discussion of revelation will help to make this point clear. He begins with the view of historical relativism which asserts there is no way of thinking about God except from the standpoint of some historical community. "If the historical community." ical limitations of all thought about God demand that theology begin consciously with and in an historical community, its limitation as an inquiry into the nature of the object of faith require it to begin in faith and therefore in a particular faith, since there is noother. Because God and faith belong together the stand point of the Christian theologian must be in the faith of the Christian commi directed toward the God of Jesus Christ. Otherwise his standpoint will be that of some other community and another God. There is no neutral standpoint and no faithless situation from which approach can be made to that which is inseparable from faith, "22 From this standpoint, Niebuhr can define revelation to mean "that something has bappened to us in our history which conditions all our thinking and that through this happening we are enabled to apprehend what we are, what we are suffering and doing, and what our potentialities are. What is otherwise arbitrary and dumb fact become related intelligible and eloquent fact through the revelatory event. To the extent that revelation furnishes the practical reason with an adequate starting point it may be said to be validated, 130

Thus far, revelation would appear to mean (i) the adoption of historical relativism as presumably true, and (ii) the discovery within the tradition of the western world of some event which serves to organize and illuminate the problem of human destiny. Historical relativism does not appear to serve very well the demands for absolute certainty, and we shall soon see that Niesbuhr recognized this fact. The second suggestion, the use of an occurrence to organize and illuminatelarge bodies of interpreted experience, is, of course, what Miss Dorothy Emmet described as the use of analogy in metaphysical thinking. A given analogy is useful, and serves, to the extent that it can organize fruitfully large bodies of data. But Niebuhr attempted to draw much larger meaning from his analysis. He asserted that the event which occurred was a "self-disclosing of that eternal knower" who knows us in our knowing of ourselves. Revelation is the moment in which we find our judging selves to be judged not by ourselves or our neighbors but by one who knows the final secrets of the heart; revelation means the self-disclosure of the

per and the control of the control o

However the espanding of God as Absolutely distinct account one on it is a to rest is editionate inequificability. They therefore properties the expression deal about Cod. The source of their information is reversion, the selection to by definition a modern form of metamogals it serelation is during the method or means whereby intornation is made symble to man to start the natural or energy were. Ferbane a brist analysis of H. Riches of the residence of the second will bely to make this point eleat. He was the second of the make this point eleat. plaw of Metorical relativism which as series the year in way of the conon an adi i a di ammana inglitereta amak adamingbance adi maal igisale bull is at fighterious of all thought about God demand that the slopes regionaless of and and and opposit us he applications of a software sectors in the software sectors of the The contract of the contract o ्री कर है के कि कि कि कि का महाकरी किसी की नहीं करवाता कि भेड़ कि कोई कर देवाँ करें। है कि कि कि कि कि कि कि क र की प्रतिक के प्रतिक कि एके ते अने कार्य के किए । अध्यक्ति के कार्य के किसी के किसी के एक कार्य के स्वराधिक के t with the continue has been been a little of the property of the property of the contract of कर ने प्रोहित एउटकेरीत के के उस के कि कि सम्बद्धा है अपने अस्वर्ध स्वापन स्वापन सकता है कर है। इ र्वाष्ट्रपात है है के लिए के में के लिए के में के लिए के में कि में कि में के में के में के में के में के में en en el marcha de la company de la comp the broading of the control of the control of the prompt find in deposit one siding the fini two gradules of the control of the c Theretals of unitarial rains.

relarious as proparably true, and the description of the adoption within its continued of the nesseru would be some when which between a organize sufficient of the nesseru would of some when which between a organize sufficient of the new barries which is a continued of the demand of the second suggestion, and the deal root of the burn and interpretable of the term of the demand of the desire of the demand of the demand

judge. "33 This "finding" is "realized in us only through the faith which is a personal act of commitment, of confidence and trust, not a belief about the nature of things. "34 Perhaps a summary of his argument from this vantage point will clarify the position before us.

Niebuhr accepts the view of historical relativism, and upon this basis arrives at an ultimate commitment. He believes one can only understand or judge in terms of the values of his tradition. Accordingly, by an act of faith or commitment, he accepts what is central to this tradition as final in both valuational and epistemological maters. For him as a member of the Christian church, the decisive event in Christian history was the advent of Jesus Christ. This, then, becomes the norm in whose terms all important matters are decided. The Christian's experience of God must be interpreted in terms of the Biblical concepts, as these are illuminated by the life and teachings of Jesus. Niebuhr is careful to dissociate himself from the Ritschlian Christology in which Jesus is given the value of God. For him it is the self—disclosure of God interpreted in terms of the life and teachings of Jesus chiwb constitutes the final certainty for the Christian.

If this analysis of Niebuhr's theory of revelation is fair, then revelation may be defined as the absolutizing of a given historical tradition, and especially of certain specific events within it. And it must be remembered that this absolutizing is based upon the acceptance of historical relativism, which presumably, desnies the possibility of any such absolutizing. If one will consider Barth's statement in the opening paragraphs of his contribution to a symposium on the same subject, i.e., revelation, he will see that Barth has specifically accepted the Christian tradition, especially its Biblical phases, as such an absolute. It is something which the Christianspossess and unless one is a member of the "possessing" community, he has no right to speak or judge. 35 Reinhold Niebuhr, in his study of competing conceptions of history, accepts "the Christian view" as final, and devotes more than half of a book in this area to the development of the relevance of this view to the final understanding of human life.

The question before us is not whether in actual fact the specific events in Christian history constitute the central truth about reality. It is this: What effects does the absolutizing of a phase of human history have upon the problems of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency? Let us note, first, that this absolutizing of the Christian tradition constitutes another statement of the ontological presupposition of Final Realization. As such, it is not subject to validation or verification, since, as we noted in the early sections of this article, ontological presuppositions cannot be verified or disproved. They constitute assertions concerning the nature of reality which determine the nature of data. They are, therefore, determinants of cogency, and as such are not properly transformable into propositions.

Another problem emerges in this attempt to build an absolute system upon the grounds of historical relativism. Is is that H Richard Niebuhr has not analysed historical relativism adequately. According to historical relativists, the historical situation has the following effects upon cognition.

region in the first translation of the second of the first properties of the first of the first properties of The first translation of the second of the first properties of the first of

Stickney of an eigenver committee in the indirection of the control of an eigen of the control of an eigenver committee in the indirect of the control of th

If the accidence of Allebaharle sheary of revealables is held to held the content of the same in the content of the content of

The question is fair una fe not wis then in extend that the epocall unit of the epocal of the second of the contral free bit should be selected as a few or the contral free best of the confidence of the confide

A, order and desired the first of a first of a property of a substitution of the substitution of the substitution of a property of the substitution of the substitutio

In the first place, the historic situation determines the questions which appear relevant and important. This we should grant. Secondly, the concepts which are used in the attempt to resolve these questions are also produced by the culture and the tradition within which the questions arise. This we are prepared to grant, in part. But it lmust be remembered that if traditional concepts to not serve adequately, new concepts as well as new methods are invented. So important is this that some sociologists would make invention a key--concept in interpreting cultures. As one sociologist stated it: "The essence of culture is invention, "37 Unless one is prepared to assert that cultures are static, he must accept invention of concepts as well as of instruments as a factor in cultures and the traditions which develop within them. If this is accepted, the basis for the absolutizing of given events within a tradition becomes questionable. Finally, and perhaps most important, is the fact that some problems must be solved in the same terms in every culture. By way of an example, one may consider the discovery of nuclear fission and the development of the atom bomb. It will be granted that the discovery of nuclearffission could not have occurred when it did in any other culture than that of the west. It was an outgrowth of the development of modern physical science, and no culture other than the west ern had reached the stage where this was possible. Furthermore, the fact that its first application was in terms of an atom bomb was determined by the conditions in the western world. If there had been no world war II, it is highly doubtful that an atom bomb would have been developed. But the exigencies of the situation facing both Germany and the Allies determined that the first use of nuclear fission was for destructive purposes. This imuch is true of historical relativism, in this specific instance. But when one asks the question: Did western culture determine the nature of atomic fission, and the specific condition under which an atom bomb was developed, the situation is different. Lat us answer the second part of the question first. It is probably true that the state of western technology determined the type of atom bomb developed. Given a different form of technological society, it is possible that a different type of bomb would have been invented. My information is too meagre at this point to make any judgment here, It is merely pointed out that the type of bomb actually made was probably determined by cultural conditions. But when one asks whether or mot the nature of uranium is due to cultural conditioning, the answer appears to be definitely nagative. Atoms have presumably existed from the first formation of matter, and their constitution has apparently remained unchanged since, If nuclear fission is to occur, the conditions for such action will be the same whether atoms are secured in China, Russia or the United States, or, for that matter, whether they come from a half millionlyears ago, or in some still unknown tomorrow. Historical relativism is true in certain phases of history or culture, particularly where man's responses to specific situation (are important. Historical relativism ceases to be relevant, to any significant degree, when the factors investigated are non-psychological in character

If this summary be true, then historical relativism may be considered a determinant of God--concepts to the extent that (i) society determines which concepts are believed to be most satisfactory, and (ii) those which are to be subjected to critical investigation. If, however, God is more than a satisfactory idea utilized within a given religious tradition, factors other than historical relativism may become important. In fact, even the "satisfactory" God-concept may become satisfactory on grounds other than historical conditioning. 38

A third question concerning the possibility of building an absolute ontological presupposition upon historical relativism emerges from the obvious fact that competing traditions may coexist.

The first Faller on the electric process to the property of the electric process of the electric process. The Bullion of the company of the analysis of the first of the contract of the company of the contract of the Andrews represent the state of the first transfer of the state of the state of the state of the state of Partie the comparison of the c na diki da e ili girlering di rotte di ana ana di ana di ana di diki kara e di kila di kila da di di kila di d पुरे पुंचे हैं है व अने अपने जाते हैं जा कि पुरे के अपने की पुरे के किए के अपने के किए के अपने के किए के किए के strated in a fire condition of the contract of a contract of the contract of t 💤 gerest thetuniketes aralskurie, he whas parables of colors (or colors) well es of ingression and bag entidies of relief sea an against in as How velop within them. If this is accepted, the basis for the basis for giren e esta while a tradition becomes caescolobie. Figody, was o'y'b' most imperiment in the Lest that some problems much because in for verms in overy collines. By way of an openicity may color be disc society of actions likelyan and the diametropical in the called the colored and the colored to the colored to Constantification of the contibus publication of an inclination of the coverage of the contibus contibus and contibus contibus and contibus contibu out to the real of the last the last while of the basis of the books of the basis o doselogament of modern physical solomes, and no culture of the line of the งที่ ที่อย่างการ ซบ และดัง carod races กร โด acces al ยอด กอร์ที่อยรับเลย ใหญ่ที่ Aft tella the couditions in the wastern world. If there red been 20 70 Try 42 1 the c and the construction of the property of the second second and the second second in the second second and the second second second in the second secon erroller och dig fill det aller Han kolendered dreid gedale i det derple, udd har nedelse glæse a de la la computable de la récesa de la referencia de la computación de la computação de la referencia de la computação de l is cray of circulation with the evertain. In this operation is also been also been also been a erfig te crote tip y their addression and resident of the consistence will also be and exist. De la constitución a con limbre hacite un delida religión confidencia delibração esta bom de trojiji, ki je gjeloji i i i i i i i kaj kalori 1980 aliki ne majak kaj dijuli ji jada je kilo jeli rizkuzonĝa. a cristo a del portego como la gratica desergar, alesto de particista se de la de constituida locata en Al व्यक्तिक विशेष्ट के विश्व हैं कि जिल्ला के स्वत्य प्रकार के कि विश्व के कि विश्व के कि विश्व के कि विश्व के विश्व कि ्र Mining देश महिल्ला के अपने के के कार कार के के का अपने के कि के कि के कि tie. All and the fight were extracted to talk he regarded the contemporal of collective and ිස්ත්ස්ත්ත දම්වීවට අවෙත්ත සම්පේත ල්ට්න අතුරු ඒවාගෙන් එය පලදුන් පිට්ලි විකින් දෙ**න වි**ස්තුර්**රතු** දුර්ගේෂයාද Trader del de d'ad lecteral edere rés mada del ficel destada de la lactificación de la cultura de medita. Talendo del de la semple como de la secologición de la como de la como de la como de la comina de la comina de The french of the fill little or love to what the little was not a fire of the reflection in a constant win global , and this year from the electric of terrosque and collections on their box. Less , collection to ិស្សិស្ត្រី ដីតែការស្នេត្រីក្រុស មជ្ជិនភា ២០០១១**នៅ ប្រឹក្សាល ១១**៧ គ្ន**ា១១១២ ល**ៀងទី ១៩និងស្ថិត ម**ន្ទមាននូវស អ៊ុ** arrie e lestes recom elle lesteret de Chire a Robble er des Chires de de Chire de Constant යන්ද සට විසිට දුම්වල දුම්වලවීම් විසිට කියේ. **ස භාය**න්ට විපාලය ඉසම්වූ කුණුවයන්ම දුම්වෙමණ සමේට එස්මී or is reproduced and conformation, which is the foreign difference and a conformation flags. Profilement to the profile manager and interpretation to be to be a first profile of the first specified and the contract of t la kalalaria vars cira, mevalus ad os escibios dale lasta lasta francosti. Lassos ocumi esc. Takkan un la la la kangkangkangkangkan da bebeginasan kesangsah bis sasiwa Jeongsah musa

,最终就是一定的理解。是是我的证明,但是特别的**我自然**是我们的自己的。 经分别的

A property of the contract of

्रिक्ष विकास स्थापित । अनुस्ति । अन्यविक्षास्त्र । अस्ति । अस् विक्षित्र स्थापन क्ष्मिति । अस्ति । अस Catholic Neo-Scholasticism and the Crisis theology developed on the European continent, even though they have their centers in different cities. Yet both belong within the Christian tradition in which H. Richard Niebuhr believes it possible to find an absolute. If Neo-Scholasticism accepts the Aquinian-Aristotelainism as its absolute, and the Crisis-theologians find their absolute within the New Testament seen through Reformation eyes, we apparently have two absolutes validated by the same tradition. This would

appear to be quite embarrassing since the first commandment of Absolutism is: Thou shalt have no other Absolutes before me.

There are, then, grounds for serious questioning of the attempt to base absolute ontological presuppositions upon historical relativism. Neither Karl Barth nor fleinhold Niebuhr withild appear willing to accept H. Richard Niebuhr's proposal. Reinhold Niebuhr seeks to justify his adoption of the Christian tradition as absolute upon pragmatic grounds: It offer the only possible resolution of the predicament baced by western man. 39 Karl Barth apparently attempts no other justification than strong assertion. 40 But our preimary interest here is not which, if any, of these attempts to vindicate the Presupposition of Final or Absolute Realization is valid. We have indicated our belief that it is impossible to do this. Our question lies elsewhere What effect upon increasing cognitional efficiency does the adoption of the Presupposition of Final Realization have? If this question is faced squarely there would appear to be but one conslusion, namely, that any attempt to impose finality upon human thinking has a detrimental effect upon the thinking of those concerned.

Charles Guignebert, commenting on the Catholic Reform which followed the Protestant Reformation as follows: "Nevertheless a terrible imprudence affecting all the future, had ben committed at Trent under the influence of the Jesuits, who were immutably persuaded that they possessed absolute truth. Not only had Tradition been declared equal to Scripture (which definitely cut short any attempt at reform of the Church teaching in the Protestant direction) but the Council had also defined and formulated teverything contained in the faith from this traditional point of view, and had ranked its work done under the authority of the Holy Spirit." It he concluded his indictment of this action by noting that "for this reason we may maintain that if the efforts of the Council and the Jesuits saved the Catholic Church in the great crisis of the Reformation, they prepared her decadence and overthrow in the future by deliberately depriving her of the indispensable faculty of readjustment to the changes going on around her, by means of which she had hitherto insured her survival."

The quoting of authorities to the effect that the Catholic Reformation meant the stifling of research except under Church guidance or within the intellectual framework adopted by the Church, is not in itself the kind of proof we seek. One may find many instances of attempted repression of freedom, and the actual realization of such aims in the history of the Roman Church in Guignebert's final chapters, and of course in a study of the apologetic attitudes of the Church itself in the face of this changing world. The history of Protestantism is not without its own pages describing the suppression of freedom of thought and in some instances of the destruction of those who dated to oppose repression. Indicative as results as these instances may be, the cognitional basis for this lies in the adoption as final of a given intellectual framework or system.

្រី នៅ ប្រទេស ពេលប្រទេស ខេត្តប្រទេស ខេត្តប្រទេស ប្រែក្រី ប្រឹក្សាយ ប្រទេស ស្រុកស្ថិត ប្រទេស ស្រុកស្ថិត ប្រទេស ស នៅ ស្រុកសម្រី មានស្គ្រី មានស្គារប្រើការប្រទេស សមានសមានសមានប្រើប្រទេស ប្រែក្រី ស្រុកស្រី ស្រុកសម្រី ប្រេក្សសិ ទៅសេក្សសិក្សាសិក្សា ប្រើការប្រឹក្សា ប្រឹក្សាសិក្សា ស្រុកសមានសមានសមានសមានសម្រេស ប្រឹក្សាសិ

appear to be quite unbarrassing sings the liter promondraud of Barol discretical field of Barol discretical field in the colors of the colors

There are, then grounds for serious distributing of the other process absolute mentages of the constant of the manual property of the mentages of the constant of the mentages of the mentages

Charles Cagnebor, cammedial of the Consideral Relator which and the constant of the Consideration of the Considera

The generally of a chooristeen to the earliest that the Catholis Relicions realist the arbitrary of a chooristeen to the choir of Catholis Better as a state of the live of the choir of th

A brief excursus at this point may be in order. On August 4, 1879. Pope Leo XIII published his enclyclical on "The Restoration of Christian Philosophy, according to the Mind of St. Thomas Againas, the Angelic Doctor," 45 Leo XIII stated the case for an adequate philosophy not only to keep people from error, but also "guard with religious care all truths that come to us by Divine tradition, and resist those who dare attack them,"44 He then extoiled the Scholastic philosophers, and St. Thomas as the acknowledged master of them all. In fact, he wrote at the Council of Trent, the Summa of St. Thomas "lay open on the altar, with theHoly Scriptures and the decrees of the Supreme Pontiffs, that from it might be sought counsel and reasons and answers." 45 He concludes his letter by recommending strongly that all of the leadership of the Catholic Church should apply themselves to the restoration of the wisdom of St. Thomas, "and to spread it as far as you can, for the safety and glory of the Catholic Faith, for the good of society, and for the increase of all the sciences, who had the teachers whom they were to select should be charged with the same responsibility. This meam, in effect, that the Thomastic philosophy received the highest commendation and support which required that it be given serious attention wherever the Roman Catholic Church extends its sway.

In his discussion of Absolute Presuppositions, Collingwood formulated three which have, historically, determined the course of modern science and the course which has, in return, been developed by the same science. The first is the Newtonian formulation: "Some events have causes," The scool is the Kantian, "that all events have causes," and the third is the Einsteinia that "no events have causes, "47 m The question, then, which should be raised is this: Where in these several presupposition; does the basic philosophy of science of Thomas Aquinas belong? The answer to this aquestion may be determined by observing that the Thomastic system was thoroughly teleological in character, and that the end toward which all things moved was God. In the Summa Contra Gentiles, he assems that "all things are directed to one good as their last end." Even evil is placed within the context of universal teleology. This is done by asserting that evil is found within some good, and the good is always a cause of something, 49 Furthermore, God is not only the end toward which all moves, but by His providence He "governs and rules all things," (Ch LXIV). The conclusion, then, is that given the period in which he lived, Thomas Aquinas would assert with Kant that "all events have causes," and God is the Final End or Causes.

If this analysis of Aquinas is sound, then the acceptance of St. Thomas as the philosopher whose system is to govern men in their scientific thinking means the continuance of universal causality as final. But, as Collingwood pointed out, the Absolute Presupposition that every event has a cause is no longer operative in much modern scientific thinking. Such thinking is governed by the Einsteinian presupposition that no events have causes, in other words, the element of necessity presupposed by Kant no longer obtains. The distinction between cause and law is important, in the case of cause, events occur because it is necessary for them to do so. They are within a telesological, causal nexus, and are thus determined. In the case of modern physics, for example, events are observed to occur is specific ways. They act according to "law" and not as a result of cause. The absolutions of

อได้เรียงโดยสมาเสราสาร์ ที่เกี่ยวการสารสารสารสาร์ การที่สาราบการสำราจ เกาะสุดสาร์ ใช้การสาร लेका **व्यक्ति** गरेकुलु का अने के एक के अन्य के सामग्रह है। एस पूर्व कार्यों के वार्तिक के के बहु की करका के कहा है <mark>से स</mark>ामग्रह ក់ស្ពេក្ស ក្នុងសាស្ត្រីខេត្ត សត្វក ខ្លួនការសម្រែកសាលាស សាស្ត្រីសម្រេច ភាព ប្រកាសនៅ សាស្ត្រី **សម**និ ាស្តី ១៩ 👀 (១៩១៩ ខេត់នៃ ១៩១២), វិធី មានស ១១៤ឆ្នាំ ១៩ ៥២ ទៅ**ទី២១ ខែ**ងក្នុង សមាន សត្ថិ (២៨១១) Conference of the first of the control of the second of nder Gereinsche Gelfflebergerein zur Gie in **bericht**en auf der ist einerhalberichten der Anstalle und der Anderthere with the finite the written to the Confiction of the States of the States of the Bomes "lay appe weeks alter, and the flory feetpeners to be determined. Bugaresine Bucklick, who a frank thinxuplation eaught and angelicentional will represent The first of a green with the design of the control ම්බුල විලකුර්ණය සම වේකා විලක්ව සිටින වෙන්න් ඉදිරුණින් සාදර්ග වෙන්නෙන් වී වන වන වේකා යනුවන r si je siring gran dar kai ili bengga mi kadir jakanorii, jaka da mabkir kali ik kan kan kan jaka ja ir ir si the estem and great at the Cartosia is a will be the the start of the care of an area. าน เรียย คา กรวจการกษร แนวรับ อาษารมหรัด ค่ามาพระทับสาราชสมา ^{อัส}ร์ และเพาะรับที่ กล้าที่ ได้ด*ีโด* โด กรรมมาพระกั entrolle and absorption of the same of the control of the control of the approach safety of the the Tyangeriae bus and despite regain on the highest commercial at the structure. าง รายหนึ่ง กรสสเด็จ สร้างเอา เสรายหายเปลี่ยวสละ สมเด็วกาง สดงรัฐ อยู่ วีมี สมเด็จโรรสัมหูหล่า สังนิสัมพ ysovo, edi edunine šovsii)

is in in the currence of Aproxite Francepositions, Hollmytvood format in the F erifical Amerika, historiakanika, in determentene bibis monera on reminingen mentenen en en en en en en en en ිට වී වෙන සංඛ්යාව අත්ව ලැබී විදේකුම් මෙන් මෙන් සහ සහ සිට සුව සමුදුම් මෙන් විද්යාවේ වෙන්වේමා සම්මාන්වේම e de la film Marit delega cas mariedades de la la casa propiesta en la casa participada de la casa de la casa d i di Germania mengilikanan ingganaran di di di dangan kelaban ang kelabang di diberangka Milanda, ala er Miller in the contract of the contract of the contract in t l dig alliford i olio producti producti programa di scri per i deletti. Ni pregisti programa di bale les-පත්වල් වැට ප්රවල්ණ වණාදුරුව පත්ව වර්නු කුණිස් අවශ්ර වූණ පිරි**ණා**දුවේ විය. වෙසුක්රීලය ස්කර්පණණුසේව करीपुर पर १७५५ । एक अन्य अन्य अने अने अने अने पूर्व किया है । इस प्राप्त के अने के अने के अने कुलीक ്യാ അത്തെ സ്തുസ് നടിച്ചും സ്വര്ഷത് കാര്യാന്റെ അവരെ അവി സംവര് കുടക്ക് എഡ്. അക്ക് വര്യാക്ക് അവിക വിള്ളിക്കോട്ട് അ and the second of the control of the ကြည်း လေလို့သို့သည်။ ကြည်းရွှေသည်။ လူနှင့် ကြို့ ကြို့သည်။ ကြို့သည်။ ကြို့သည်း မြောင်းများသည်။ မြောင်းများများ ကြို့သည်။ ကြို့သည်။ ကြည်းရွှေသည်။ လူနှင့် ကြို့ ကြို့သည်။ ကြို့သည်။ မြောင်းများသည်း မြောင်းများများများများမျာ ាការប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមិន បានប្រជាពលរដ្ឋ មានប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមាន បានប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមិន បានប្រជាពលរដ្ឋមាន មានបានមានបានប្រជាពលរដ្ ្រាល់ ស្រីក^{ារីស}្គារ ស្រីសារ្យាធាន និង ស្រីសារ ។ សក្សាធាន ២០ សម្បីធ្វាប់ សារស ស្<mark>តិបានស្រី</mark> ការបាន សំពីនៅនៅ ් වර්ම වෙනත් වැන්න වන වන වන නොවන සිට වන ද්වාත වන වෙනවීන් දැන්න යුදුව වෙනුවෙන වන යුදුම් කරම් වැන්නයෙන al language and the second of the second of the second and the second of the second of the second of the second The second of the second of acceptable, he set we see the second of the

The control of the co

Aristofle's Physics and Book Kill of his Mataphysics meant that the contymed progress made possible by modern physics would appear to be seriously hampered. If not prevented entirely, The Aquinlan-Kanitan moventuries: would mean additional complications to an already complicated situation. is this which presumably prompted a recent historian of schooce to serve "More important for us is the fact that the whole of the scheme of Accident was framed in accordance with A-latotle's logic and science. His logic known already through compendiums, acquired a wider influence when a comp symbesis of knowledge was attempted. Based on the syllagism. A problem of to give rigorous proof from perfectly certain premises. If led addrain to the idea of Knowledge derived from insuitive axioms on the one side. as a authority ... that of the Catholic Church -on the other. It was singularly ill adapted to lead men to or guide them in the exploratory investigation of nature. "51 This historian of science is staring what should be evident to all serious students, namely, that within every system as in every egg and sulture there are strains which develop and for which some type of adjustment must be provided. The ideal of perfect knowledge, with the assumption that finality could be achieved, would mean the end of the type of approach which has made modern science and its practical application in technology possible.

The story of the detrimental effects of the absorbing of Aristotle upon the development of experimental science is too well known to require retailing Perhaps the earliest of these was that in which Galileo demonstrated expenimentally that the weights of given bodies does not determine the velocity with which they fall. "Bodies were thought to be intrinsically beavy or light, and to fall or rise with velocity proportional to their beariness or lightness because they sought their natural places with varying power. In 1591, Galileo, repeating an experiment of Sevinus, dropped a text-possed weight and a one-pound weight together from the top of the leaning Tower of Place and showed the incredulous onlookers that, heavy or light, they struck the ground simultaneously, "52 The story of the attack of the shurch of his day upon Galileo, and the Protestants sharing with the Roman Catholics in these attack, is still depressing reading. It is a sad commentary upon the intoierance which too often springs from the attempt to make any system abso lute. Ane one cannot say that the world has outgrown such afternors. The attack upon the teaching of organic evolution in various states in the United States during the third decadeof this century; the supression of thought in Italy under Fascism; in Germany under the national Socialists, and the present suppression of thought in Russia under the doctrine of the absolute ness of the Communist idealogy, are examples in the so-called onlighteness parts of the earth whenever the adkerents of Finality become associated will political or economic powers now available to man. The fact would remain A established that the Presupposition of Final Realization constitutes a danger the growth of knowledge so essential to the welfare of the human race.

It may be objected at this point, that the Presupposition of Proximats Residentials has its own absolutes. It is assumed, by Collingwood, that certain presuppositions are treated as absolute by contemporary scientific thinkers. Today, the Einsteinian presupposition that "no events have causes," is accepted presumably, as such. However, as we noted above, such presuppositions are accepted and utilized precisely because they are the best available which appear to further the cognitive quest of the most connected. This was stated precisely in Einstein and infeid's discussion of the growth

"你一里说,这一个人,只有我说,这个人的特别,我们是我们的意思是我,这都对抗,我不会说,都们这都不断好,我们 on kindra den in dit bilik in di bakti delti in glindak, ki den kom kan ki baka kalabara kan bili. o talisto por el el cològneco como parte del cològne del cològne del decentralización de se se se se se se se c . Per la la companya de la companya ក ខេត្តកំណែកខាងរាប់ សុ ក្រៅ. 🕡 ការរបស់នេកក្រីបិកសេច និងសេ **គ្នានៃ សុ ស្តា ១ភ**ែងរបស់**និងស្តេ**ំនេះសំ សេស**រៀ**វបា in 1830 de la companyo de la compaño e "alim deligió del communicació me de describer de la compaño de del com kanawa shishady shirmagh sanapasathan sa sarah sat ni shiro ballasi bali sa misha Received of Legisland agency at the referred of Egreed and the explicit or a good warm to be a continued as a granden det di General de activa accuració de la come de la come de la terral de la come de la co the files of Magazing demand there the bod in a line of the constant of and arrive collection of the Collection of the object of the order of the order of the object of to its lay bear well in the coligion will be received thing to be been beel or foods ba askine. ^{Mil} Role disperius af erferen fa eta elegan pero esta de la constanta de la constanta de la constanta no errons dices manus e orios cidife valido, vience, parellida encirsa ila ci and entered there are strains arithmeters and in the first with the some tree p adjustraces massas on provided. The their of portest asserts as maked by the fact section in the time the control of the entire and section of the control of the c artical light for disparty at thus possible explant phase and childwideso appello , wild hand what are the the

or contract the same and the problem of the color of the colored and the article of the contract of the colored and the colored of the colored and the colored and the colored of the colo -19 of the first of market thing and all supplies the consisting by his market by the consisting of the con-Barbaga da aretusta er traktusta er maneta a alakti da variak (ila bilan da era 🔻 👉 a alakti ar างได้ เล่าได้ เกาะ โดย เการับสาย พริสาราสามาราชานามีโดยสาราชาวาราชานาราชานาสสาราสสาราสสาราสสาราสสารา on the control of the Carlo Color of the Afgrost of the carlo Africa for the good folia, and i kindele militar e mingrapisasi iraa si maa baardi ka ya magayah ahirar a kiin araba moreba mili issaan and the continuous group of a soft of a secretary burst, a best conjugate grade and and and កំពុស បានសង្គម នេះមាន អណ្តែលបានជា ឬមាននៅ ១ និះ សារបស្រាយការប្រការស្រាន់ ស្តី កើតសង្គម ។ សង្គមិលីសិវិ in the second is approached the is in sparence in a stable to all appearable given become a series of these កសាល់ សាលាសាល់ ប្រើអ្នក ប្រសិទ្ធិការប្រសិទ្ធិ បានសម្រាប់ ស្រាសាស ស្នើ ប្រធានិ<mark>មិនទោប់សំ សមិ</mark>ទ្ធិ និងសំពង់ទេ **បិសា**ស សាលាសិទី សាលាសាល់សេសសំណើម សាសាសាស ស្នើសាសាសាសាសាសាសាសាស្តី ពីសាស្ត្រី សាលាស្តីនិងសេសាសាសាសាសាស្ត្រី បានសមានិស្ · Presidential Control (Control of Subject and Control of Control ាលពីស ១០១ ១៤០ ខេត្ត នាមារសារមណ្ឌល ខេត្ត បាន ១ ១៩៩៩ ១ ១៩ និង ១៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩៩២៩៩៦ ដើម្បីស្ថានី ទៅសារដើ្ត ्रे नहीं र १८ १ के १८ १८ वर्ष वर्षा १८ विद्वार के स्थान के लिए हाल पर सङ्ख्या है। दे का क्षेत्र के लिए से क्षेत्र के अपने स्वार के अस्तर स्थान के सामा the first the first of the expression and become of the first first and first some and are some n en erig og er en en fretiggen erreit eggen ert er gjengen er erig græne en er græterer til ertæreter blet til and the contract of the contra ានស៊ីកាស់ ២០១០ ក្រោយនៃប៉ាក់ សម្រី សកាន់នៅនានៅការធាតិការ ក្រុងពេល ក្រុងពេលនៃនៅនៅកែនេះ ព្រះនៅនៃនេះ 🛱 ១០២៣៣ ក្នុងធានី anno sanas in anno in anal com a mois mealar anno anal eil eil eil each an an seo an leannach agus in arainn a the referred to black a mile of references and a graphical advantage definition of the second before the resum or the confirm of a confirmation of the file of the confirmation with the file of the confirmation of the besidence of the confirmation of the con to the following the field of the content of the content to the content of the content of the field of the fi reduction of the control of continued decided by the first course, confidenced by the best of his maker ्रकार । पर १५५ में १८५ जिलार के साराभक्षा असर कहा है सर राजकार समें इस अनुसरकार क्राक्कि के उनके <mark>कराड़ु अर्थीं</mark>

of physical science. The aim of every theory is to guide us to few facts suggest new experiments and lead to the discovery of new phenomena and laws. 154 And to this could have been added. They sets of presuppositions. The aim of scientific and critical thinking is thus two fold: *(i) the determination as precisely as possible for the nature of the objects under consideration; and (ii) the development of more efficient methods of so doing. It is not that of arriving at finality. It is believed, by such men, that finality presupposes what they do not discover, namely, a static universe. If the evidence collected pointed toward such an existential medium, then presumably they would accept the conclusion and utilize it as fully as possible. The evidence does not point in that direction. Consequently, wany efforts expended to prove this would be considered thoroughly detrimental to the aim of providing much needed knowledge to help man in his attempts to arrive at a more satisfactory existence.

VIII

A second device adopted by the adherents of the Presupposition of Final Realization to escape from the dogmatic consequences which threaten them is their recourse to myth. According to Paul Tillich, a myth is a history of the gods. This, according to his analysis, is a minimal definition, but one which must be included in such definitions. The Arecent interpreter of Bultmann states the latter's position as to the nature of mythological thinking as none in which the divine appears as human and the other-worldly at this-worldly. The Christian mythology, then appears to be a form of thinking in which some story, situation or event is believed to suggest more than is told, and which must not be interpreted literally. It is a truth, not a fact.

It is obvious that this is a specialized use of a concept which has long been used in anthropological research. Its meaning in such studies is more general. Myths consist in stories told for various purposes, per haps some of them are tales told merely for the enjoyment of the narrator and his audiences. In many instances they have value in placing the present situation in some context which, for the culture, is meaningful. A study of the myths of the Trobriand Islanders, 58 and those gathered by Paul Radin from his studies of the American Indians, 59 will suggest that whereas there is mormally a reference to the extraordinary, it is not true that the extra dormal is necessarily divine. Magical powers are often referred to in these stories. Sociologists tend to view myths as forms of social control. Stories are told which employ emotions to further the socialty-integrative and socially-useful institutions and to develop loyalty and devotion to the social group itself. 60 As one sociological text states it, "Every social order is held together by a system of myths, a term we use to designate the value-impregnated beliefs and notions that men hold, that they live by and live for. No society can maintain a degree of stability unless the myth upon which it rests -- the myth of law, or power, of freedom and so on--remain as fundamental values for man. "61 These sociologists widen the definition to include the basic beliefs of a society which would be quite difficult to justify if one studied primitive groups. There is a distinction between myth as Malinowski and Radin consider the matter, and the common-sense beliefs which govern some, at lease, of the activities essenequipment of the control of the cont

11:

A excomé device adquiré un the adurtments of the Previngos i les this is a Resident ou to descript from the dogarthic ronsingues and which there is a literal fra their encourses which there is a subject of the second of the part of the second of the part of the second of the seco

rapa i a i a i di ක්රාලයක් රතුවාය හැද ය. පාලන ඉහළ විද්යාවල් වේ.සමහාන හා සේව සම්මේද අපන්ර යන වැඩි විනි මින් මි and table to the origin occurrence in a reservoir to a proper and the regular reduces and bread appet ීම් ලිංගාන ලෙද පරන්නය පත් ම්වර සහයෙන ක් ණි සමුවට සේදීම් ලිය නියදීම් वेबहुँ व स्थापका की परिवास केला को किया नहीं कर सामित होते हैं के हा से का अवस्थान है पर से को हो है जा कर स्प en eg frit gerrejder och e tilber i rege vinder och betar grædbild græde til en framelike et blik bra ា ក្រុងស៊ី១ ស៊ី នៅក្រុមនៃការបាន ១០ នូងច្រើងត្រូង សពីស៊ី១០១ នៅក្រៅការ ងលេខមាន នៃនៅការ ស្នាប់បាននៅធ្វើក្ ាសក្នុង ខ្លួន ស្រាស់ កម្មាន ប្រការ ស្រែក្រុង ប្រកាន្ត នៅក្នុង ក្រុង ប្រការប្រការប្រការប្រការប្រការប្រការប្រការ ក្រុង ស្រាស់ ភាពស្រុកស្រាស ស្រែក ^{រាស}់ ក្រុង ស្រាស់ องโดเดินน้ำ เกิดวิที (เทียวไม่) มีการต่อง เมื่องเหต่องในเพาะเกิด เกิดรู้แนว เครื่องกาย รูปโดยเพาะเนื่อเกิดพิมพ์ ालकर भी रहा चारतील के बाह के उपनार पूर्व के प्रोतिक हैं। एक नहीं के मिला का लेका है की देश का का का अधिक के कि कार्य है हो कहा कि अध्याप है कि अने कहा के पूर्व की को है है कि है है के अध्याप एक का कार्य कर अध्याप की आहे. ក្រុងសេនិកទូនិកាស់ នេះ ខេត្តិតិ និងសិនក្រុមិន និងមា**ននិងឈ្មោះ សេងខ្លែញ នៃ និងសេចក្រុមិន ភេឌ**ន និងសេ**ទសេសី ខ្លែង** 🕻 ්තර්යක^ම් මෝජනය දුරුවන් අතුර්යන්ගේ කිරී කිරීම මෙන්වන්ත්තේ දුරුදිනවේ දුරුවන්ගේ මිනම් මහ<mark>ම්මෙන්මු</mark> අත පරිතිය සිදුවෙන් මුදුවෙන්නේ සිදුවෙන්නේ සිදුවෙන්නේ සිදුවෙන්නේ දුරුවන් වෙන්නේ සිදුවෙන්වන් සිදුවෙන්නේ මිනව සිදුව ින කොදුරුවේ නැතිවෙන් දෙවැන්නේ සහ දෙවැන්නේ සහ දෙවැන්නේ සහ වෙන් කොදුරුවේ දර නැතිවෙන් මේ සම්ප්රා විශ්ය නිවාර්ත ව e di l'Est estre és ir enui per une ete ir i harenge conditent la come de elle alle en les elles di elles inte ිට්රිස්තරම විධාර විශාලයි ම පම්වර්ත්තණ කොලා වර්ගයට පරිදිව දැන්නු වෙර්රී මුණුව දැන් නිවේර් මණින් දැන් නිවේර් මණිණ about the contract of most be degree submanded by the bound of the conference of the submander of the contract of the conference of the co on a grafie of the configuration and a finite contract the configuration of the configuration ම් ව්රයාලම්ක ප්රවේශය කුණුව මෙන සිටල්ම පරිමෝන්ට් ස්වාර්දාවේ රාජ්ද <mark>පාර්ගම්</mark>න ද ලම් සිද්දාවිතාවලට වි රාජක සිස්ස්වර්ග ាលពី និធិ ជា ភាព ខេត្ត^{ន្តែ} ប្រការស្រាស្ត្រី នៅ នៅគេនៅបាន និសាស្រាល ខាងស្រាស់ ស្គាស់ ស្តែន និស្តាស់) ស្នង សម្រេស rough to the process the state of them are retreated there who was altered was altered and well work รมราชาธิ แล้วได้ ขาว การศาสดย (ค.ศ. 44) เดิม การหมาย ขาวและ หมาย ค.ศ. 46 ใหม่ใหญ่ และของ ค**ระวันสมาย แล**

tial to social existence among the Trobriand Islanders and the American Indians.

At the same time, the definition presented shows the interest in social control in this area characteristic of many sociologists.

If one examines the writings of Christian theologicans who seek to utilize myths in the formulation of Christian doctrine, one will discover that whereas the potential truth contained within a given myth is emphasized, its functional value soon comes to the fore. Reinhold Niebuhr believes the solution of our present deplorable situation depends upon the re-instatement of the Christian view of history, because the word "myth" in preference to "saga" or "drama". But his interest, like that of Niebuhr, is personal and social, not cognitive. Or perhaps one should say that his primary interest is placed upon the soteriological rather than the epistemological values found in the Christian tradition. From a somewhat different theological standpoint, Bernard E. Maland adopts "myth" as an indispensable instrument in his attempts to provide a framework within which Christianity may recover some of its pristine power.

With this attempt to recover whatever socially-cohesive and personalityintegrative power Christianity has bad at any of its creative periods, one must express profound sympathy. Previously we have noted that religion has at least three phases or aspects. The first is function: the contributions which religions have made to individual and social existence. The second is interpretation or reinterpretation; the attempt to understand as fully as possible thenature of the individual person, the culture of which he is a part, and the nature and existence of God or divine beings. The third consists in techniques or overt behaviors designed to further mans quest for the values believed available in religion in terms of the accepted conceptions. Myth, as defined by the persons mentioned above, belong to the technique phaseof religion. As such, it is pragmatically useful device designed to further the religious quest. But any attempt to make myth cognitively determinative of the truth of the concepts which it may contain is subject to the criticisms leveled against the adherents of Partial Immanence. The argument from myth is pragmatic. Its value lies in what it can do to transform theories into functional beliefs. Any attempt to deduce the nature of God from what is pragmatically useful faces the devastating fact that different cultures find pragmatic value in conceptions of the nature of God which are diametrically opposed to one another. At another level, the "myth" of Capitalistic Democracy is confronted by the "myth" of Communist ideology. and one appears to be as functional as the other. Yet, each contains elements which deny important elements in the other. Both cannot be true reports of the realities considered. There would appear to be little if any cognitive value in myths, no matter how important a social or personal full tion they may hav in different cultures. A myth becomes relevant only after the primary cognitional task has been performed.) Otherwise, it may, as Whitehead points out, become an obstacle in the way of intellectual progress. 65 There does not appear to be any way whereby we can escape the necessity for (i) clarification of our hypotheses concerning God, even those embedded in myths, nor for (ii) the verificatory activities required

adilitati talah jarah salata milika jarah hali 2006-200 pitatan salah tida di Aulah, dan salah salah salah sal Salata

နှိုများ ကြိုင်းကြိုင်း မြင်းကြိုင်းကြိုင်းကြိုင်းကြိုင်းကြောင်းကြိုင်းကြောင့် မြင်းကြိုင်းကြောင်းကြောင်းကြိုင သူ့ ကြိုင်းကြိုင

if our examines the well nigs of Carestant docatego and said seed at all a myths in the forestion of Carestant docates are will all accessions whereas the potential truth comeans within a given royi bis arraying a test in the sign of and value soon comes to the total defended within a little of the forestion of the forestion of the contract of the Carestan view of the allowers of the Carestan view of the use the word implies a day of the respect of the seed of the care and and contract of the said of the care in the social and contract of the state of the said and contract of the said and the said of the carestances formed in the carestance that the said of the carestances in the said of the carestances in the attempts to provide a dopt in the attempts to provide a dopt in the attempts to provide a framework within which Otel their may recover some of its pristing power.

With a tier of the property is a commental with a comment of the c integrative power Christianity had had all visus areaving historican musical calor and bound sympathy. Prominosty wilder 1000 tolars tolars िर्मान के विकास १९४० के अपने के अने प्रत्य के अपने कार्य के कार्य के कार्य के कार्य के अपने के अपने कि अपने कि and the collection is a collection of the sufficient and collections and social and the collections are the collections. ración a a recenir de demontes ado deponentes o catalismo de constituir de la constituir de la calidad de la c the form or their like funkting from the cale to broke it older see so little in is a para, and the intere and enteriore of that or differ beauter. The Twite teditiet of docateable rollyndad trayer so ecoplant of oil ataliano belief to the contract of a factor of the contract of dimensylvana. Myth, an hained ly the persons incalled his court Figuralization of ignition of the original terms of the constant of being food प्रदेशके हैं है है के रह के में से के कार्या का कर करीब है जिस के कर कि के अबका स्वाप्त कर के के से से से से स of Klantini in inkie o kuip piin dika dik tendaga balah kimaladalah embadalah ners las i from in evil enles etc. habitates et digne most inamagna aff transierm insories into loneropoli ireliais. All alticiani in divisio delivers of Cod Arom v Locals prégables et la calife de la calife de la la la deve de la la la la calife de la calife d distribution of the extension will be in consequenced the contraction of the same of CoO with are diametrically apposed to one somilar. At arother level the best from of Wayins Herse Dumperracy in gruing mated by the Angric Commission of Commission of - ใน Podavisou กับควา เรียที่ " หายในกายใน ครับ และ เป็นการกระทาง อยู่ การกระบบสุด คกก ไม่และ inament benefit deny inappitation property in the steps . Intelligence in the contract bit first reports of the rustillies densities of the ed. There would appear in it the R and and the commentary of the contractive with the state of the same and the first of the first that the efore the energians in different countries. A myth decompose on his other etter die germary engeliebel tesk ina bese herfariariet. Offer giefe de are The organization of the control of the atominuous singular the control of the con र १ विद्योजनात जिल्लाम कर्ण पूर्वित्रणकर्षाल पृष्ट प्रायाणक क**र्व यह** प्रधाननपुर होता. यसक्ति वर्षा वर्षा है ^{हिल्}ले सहक्राह्म veressing for the stable at the corresponding process of the stable of the corresponding to t the first radial as my considered at the fit of the confidered with the ball of the same

to prove of disprove the inch of the hypotheses alsoliked, in the case of the prove of the constant ever sead training the fight of the large of the Presupposition of Plant Reslication ever sead that they see selected to the large of the large of the pregnants properly the belief withing the of pregnation of man to justify the belief withing the constant of the constant of the large of the

The presupposition of foctensing Cognitional Buiclence, then, would see to require a rather tearestal consideration by those who seek to serve the cause of religion today. If we mest rely apan myth or licitum is order to maintain, pur religions behavior, then the religions structured in a link of the conceptions of the care the british by licitors. This was true of early man, the can early bope to arrive at true and more adquate conceptions of the intelligence as fully and treely as it is possible to a like recolves to use his intelligence as fully and treely as it is possible to of the conception to the like the intelligence as fully and treely as it is possible to of the conception to the conception of the conception of

X

A misuaderstanding may easily occur at this point. We have argued intradoption of the Primary Presupposition of increasing Cognition of the Primary Presupposition of the Primary Presupposition of the Province of Strandary President of Strandary Presidentian of Strandary Presidentian of Strandary Presidential Resiliants and Proximate Resiliantion may lead some readers to consider this but another skitchment of pragmatism, defined as the logic of efficiency. Perhaps we can here arrange Presuppositions as the logic of efficiency. Perhaps we can here arrange Presuppositions in their proper order as conceived thus far, the better to consider this extintions.

isci cogent, yas anem or betwher at notifieogqueerq lasigolomo amos eanis enri eaw aid? areaso and tabarcash of radika asu of aldiseogmi saw it anoisteogmeary leaksol ous so tovel add is bankamer and as gad or tadd trabbre amenad oals if in fi date as y Meet to equita edi gaintecance encitynness. , e., t. eachiecqueerq received the thing hed become weit there were deal if and is the section of andianidasA stamizor In tait bus antisalissA taut I to antiteoqquesry satt generalizate, anotikogquasari yashacos2 owi otot bastasyro se binga , anotikoqqua these toes deer desemblicate, which we propose to cell liver but her from the proposed that those held by the thinkers who meette. We discovered, upon further smaly and s cognitive queet. The cogency of a fact is determined by the best received Total and the same previously, become data when bossesses as elos I -Turpoduos Afrengosposer "sr grur "modos omapras soreu gorga reup 30 The Logic of Religious Humanism, may be considered in terms of theamstrain The Logic of Partial Immagence; The Logic of Absolute Immagence; and complex, namely. Cod. The four: The Logic of Absolute Transcenderer: sporosches to the vederstanding of the Objective factor in the religious We began this arelysis with an investigation of four confermposation continue

Let us re-examine this for a moment to indicate what we mean, he one accupies the view that Easilty must be such as to satisfy fully made presentably legitimate religious interests, as Morton did in arguing for God as transcendent, then every fact which suggests the insidequary of the Existing Inchests, to satisfy the inferests, to satisfy the transcendent, then every fact which suggests the insidequary of the Existing Meses interests, the most satisfy the Existing Meses interests, the man and known in the collection of the Californian Meses interests, and the other hand, one accepts the view that the other hand, one accepts the claims. If, on the other hand, one accepts the view that the other hand, one accepts the collection which is the other hand, one accepts the collection of the other hand, one accepts the collection of the other hand, one accepts the collection of the collec

சிக நிறையை சிறி எறுக்கை விவர் இருக்கு கிறிய வில் நிறும் நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய விறியில் இரு நிறிய சிறிய சிறியில் நிறியில் நிறியில் நிறிய சிறிய சிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய கொணியை சிறியில் சிறிய நிறிய நிறியில் நிறியில் நிறியில் நிறிய நிறிய நிறியில் சிறியில் சிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய நிறிய சிறிய சிறிய சிறிய சிறிய சிறிய சிறிய சிறிய சிறியில் சியில் சிறியில் சிறியி

The properties a relies of free easing Cognisional Ladrence of the contract of

200

A saidered crait crait and fund and and if course or if is paint. We have everyond to the above of adoption of the explantation of is a course of all algorithms of the explantation of is a course of the explantation of the exp

්යාප්ර වැන් රාහනයට වෙන වනවේ සිට යන් මෙමුණ් මෙන්. එය එහිමේ දීම්ප්රේණ මෙන්නේ දීම්ප්රේණ වන මෙන්නේ වෙනවේ මෙම් ្សារ ស្ត្រីស្រែក ស្រី សំរី ១៧ស្នែកិ ខែសំរបស់ស្រី ម៉ែកិសនិយៈព្រះស្រាស់នេះក្រុងស៊ីរ គំនៅ <mark>បទិស</mark>ន៍បាន<mark>សំព</mark>េះមួន ការស្រាក់សំខាន់សម្រើសម្រើក្រុងជាការបាននិង្គាល់ នៃការ៉ាន់ទៅកែកអីរី នៃ**ពេលវិ**ស្សារិសាសមាន នៅស្មែកមាន To a consideration while each to a grade each to a grade the first constant lake he to be a signal with ting a not the first considerate and only a considerate the application of the consideration garante de la plantación de la como de como que la como de la como dela como de la como and the same careful and the company of the same that have by a substantial and the careful and the following the following the following the careful and the following th om, elikolik likik kili ya Gresomo eseka mkalesir bilan junggapa keliki, iliyase ya bekik namo a along the forest and the state of า 1 ในการเปลี่ย์ โดยโดย เกษายนตาย และ ตั้นใช้กาย และเหมือนเพลาก ของเหมือนตั้ง ก่อง ก็แต่นั้น ข้อเก็ and the state of the contribution of the second property of the seco a digulario del carillach e com por tall obacie portali balanchi de propieta de la l าราคา เกิด (การีโดยตาวิตากาศสอบ พระวาทุกที่เสราจากคน พละกาทุกที่เหตุดตาว และเกา (พระกาทุสัยผลกูมุมเคยที่ผู้ ាសាលា ទី២ ២០០១៤ ១៩៦ និង នៃស្នានីនាយាសាយ ១៤២ ២០ ផ្លាល់ថា ១៩ ២៩៩៩ នៃ ម៉ាន់១៦ ១៤២៩៤២៨ មាននឹង ៦៩ ១៧ដី ាលពីការ ការប្រៀប ការការប្រាក់ ការប្រាក់ស្វែកការប្រាក់សំព័ត្តសម្មាល កំណត់ ស្លាក់សំព័ងសម្បាក់សមស្ត្រីសមវត្តិសម - ทายการการการการการการการการการการที่สุดครามเกาะที่สุดครามเกาะตัวเกาะตัวเกาะตัวเกาะตัวเกาะตัวเกาะตัวเกาะตัวเก TROPHOS CONT

្រោះ ប្រជាពលប្រធាន ប្រធានប្រជាពលប្រជាពលប្រជាពលប្រជាពលប្រធានប្រធានប្រជាពលប្រធានប្រជាពលប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប សមានប្រជាពលប្រធានប្រជាពលប្រធានប្រជាពលប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប សមានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រ សមានប្រធានបានប្រធានបានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានបានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានបានប្រធានបានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រធានប្រឹងប្រធានប្រ protean, that many of them will find only partial or proximate realization at best, then all such facts indicate areas in which further investigation must be made to determine precisely howfully such interests may be met, and, if the evidence available indicates only partial satisfaction, to seek the fullest possible value available under the conditions which exist.

This means, that so long as one remained at the level of oitological presuppositions, the intellectual outcome had to be either dogmatism or scepticism, in some form or other. This led to the proposal that we leave the ontological level and seek for a possible criterion at the epistemological level. The Primary Presupposition of increasing Cognitional Efficiency was then proposed, at the epistemological level, as a way out of the unacceptable choice of either dogmatism or scepticism. That ontological presupposition which offers the most fruitful and efficient road to man's intellectual quest for God should be selected, and the others rejected. The question, then, is this: Is this pragmatism, or the logic of efficiency, as criticizedd when willized by the adherents of Partial Immanence?

Unon analysis of several "pragmatic" systems, as used in Partial Immanence we discover that the basic assumptions or Tertiary Presupposition consisted in the claim that man's needs are determinative of reality. By this we mean that in default of positive evidence to the contrary, whatever man needed must be assumed to exist. If man needed, or so he believed, the existence of God as wholly or partially transcendent, and if evidence to the contrary was lacking, it was considered legitimate to accept the presen of needs as evidence for the existence of God so defined. This presupposition is outological, making certain claims concerning the nature of man, the world and God. Furthermore, it was justified by its moral and religious effects. If Protestants believe God must be personal, both transcendent and immanent, in order to live as they believe they should, then--in default of positive evidence to the contrary -- belief in God so defined was considered justifiable, 66 Using the same Tertiary Presupposition, the Bahaists can calim that their conception of God is also justifiable; and presumably, Mayahana Buddhists can do the same. The logic of efficiency as defined in the Termany Propuggosition of Partial Immanence is thus a logic of efficiency in living, not necessarily in thinking. In fact, it was common to say that "Life is deeper than Logic." The presupposition then places primary emphasis upon efficiency in living as defined by given groups

The Primary Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency, as outlined here, finds its justification in the efficiency of thinking. The question of efficiency in living is deferred until this has been determined. The difference between pragmetism as the logic of efficiency and this Presuppotion lies at this point: The Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency presupposes that efficiency in living depends, in the long run, upon reliable, that is, accurate information concerning the realities upon which life depends, and upon the nature of life aself. Where efficiency in living is made primary; and reliable knowledge secondary, efficience is living suffers. The so-called "imaginary environment" of the savages, peopled with ghosts, witches and magical entities, may have served the immediate needs of the folk who believed in it. But this orientation to fictional realities turned their attention away from the actualities upon which their existence depended. This was true also of the healing gods of ancient civilizations. Belief in these healing gods may have assuaged the anxieties of persons in immediate situations, and to that extent served their needs. At the same

ម និងស្ត្រី និងស្រាស់ និងស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រី និងស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រ ក្រុមប្រជាពលរបស់ និងស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីសាស្ត ស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រីសាស្ត្រីស្ត្រីសាសស្ត្រីសាស្ត្

This means from as long on one retrained of the lone of species a pening of a presequentions, the intellectual one or other. This had to be either deprecies as a large one converged of the presequent of the presequents of the preseque

Course of the control of the second of the second of the second of the control of the control of the control of and a surple extra gradition of an electrical and electrical particles and the first contract of the confidence The Control of the configuration of the control of ting to the property of the section The same to the second of the second section of the plane of the second of the street of the second The result of the second of the second second of the secon regions and the description of the construction of the substitute parkings by and the article of the experience of the photographic appropriate polymers and graphic of the congressions of the and the constitution of the contract of the co Property of the control of the control of the property of the control of the cont ি । এই সংগ্ৰেম কৰি । এই এই ইন্ট্ৰিটি কৰি সভাৰ । এতাই এক ইন্ট্ৰেই হ'ব বিশ্বস্থিত । ইন্ট্ৰেই ইন্ট্ৰেই ইন্ট্ৰেই ර ක්රීමය වෙන්න වෙන් මෙයින් සිට වන රාජ්යම් දුර්ම එවෙනි. ම නාම එරිම ඉතිරීමට මෙන්න් මුදුගැල් මින කිරීමටම අත මෙන්න ම ම පතින් මෙන් මේ සුත්ත මෙන්වී සංවේදය මෙන් වෙනුවේ මේ මේ දුරිණ වෙනුවේ සුත් ගුණුවේ. සුත්ම වෙන්ර් යු සම ាក់ក្រុម ខេត្ត ទីក្រុម ខេត្ត នេះក្រុម និងសុខ ខែសុខ នាំខេត្ត ១០២១ ក្នុងក្រុម ២៤១៦ ខេត្ត និងក្រុមិនក្រុមនេះក្រុម သည်။ မောင်မြောင် မြန်မျိုးမြို့ မြို့သည်။ ကသည်သည်။ သည်သည်။ သည်မြောင်းတွေ အတွေးကိုမောင်းမောင်းများသည်။ အများများ ကြောက်သောကို သည်။ နေလေးများကြောင်းသည်။ သည်။ မြောက်သည် မြောက်ရှိသည်။ မြောက်သည်။ ကြောင်းကို လည်းသည်။ ကြောင်းနေသို့သည် အသေး မေအာက်သည်။ ကြွောင်းလုပ်နေတွင် ကြောင်းသည် မြောင်းများမှုနှာနှံ့နေနဲ့ ကြောင်းကို လည်းသည်။ ကြွေးသည်။ မြောင်းများသည် အသေးသည် ကြွေးသည်။ ကြွေးတွင်းသည်။ မြောင်းကြောင်းများများနှာနှာနှံ့ ានប្រទេស ប្រើប្រទេសចេញ សម្តី សមាន ប្រើប្រជាធិបាលគឺ ប្រធានាស្រាស់ ប្រើប្រើប្រើការប្រើប្រទេស មាន **មួយសេចប្រ** ्यात्र राज्य हिन्दु र क्षेत्र स्थानिक वर्षा कर्यों कर सुक्षानकों में केंग्न जनसूत्र अने सक्षेत्रकार वृद्धकारको स्थानकों के

A CONTROL OF THE PROPERTY OF T

At the same time, such belief diverted attention from the actualities upon which health depended. This prevented them from achieving that control over pathological factors which today enables western man tolive nearly three times as long as they did. Values, in the long run, depend upon increasing man's knowledge of himself and his Existential Medium. Such knowledge must be the first charge against his time and efforts. In due course of time the knowledge gained will result in the increase of his values; if not those of the particular individuals concerned, then of their children and their descend ants. This is not pragmatism, in the narrower sense of efficiency in living. It is the intelligent quest for human values viewed in the perspective of the centuries, as conditioned by more adequate and reliable knowledge of realities.

The Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency is thus oriented toward the verifiability and the verification of the congruence of concepts with the realities they symbolize, designate, or denote. As such, it is located at the level of the efficiency of human thinking rather than that of immediate practicality. It is a type of "practicality," which characterizes pure science, critical philosophy, and reasonable religion. As such, it should become parts of the intellectual arsenal of religious thinkers who would first understand what God is before they ask what values God may have for them. The question of divine values is certainly legitimate, but it does not appear that it can be raised until we know what God is.

The ask remains to show positively that the use of the Presupposition of Proximate Realization and the methods subsumed under it can bring us closer to reliable knowledge of God. It is evident that the Presupposition of Final or Absolute Realization, demanding as it does both absolute knowledge and complete fulfilment of man's religious interests, has not produced the type of reliable knowledge acceptable to modern man. For him, God-concepts must be verifiable and verified, in so far as this is now possible, if he is to find religious values in them. For better or worse, he must have reliable knowledge if he is to find the values which religious institutions presumably provide for him.

An the second many sould be into a control of the c

The Presupposition of Ingreasing Cognitional Efficience, define or arresponent toward the verificability and the verification of the congruence of coescepts with the restities they symbolize, designate, or denotes. As small, it is a located at the investory of the efficiency of burnad thinking mather that our minediate practicality. It is a hype of "practicality," while of a constrainty, is a constant pure science, artifical philosophy, and reasonable religions, as analy, it should become paint of the intellectual assessi of religious philosophy would fank understand what God is before they ask what velues Cod may have about them, "The coescion of clinical values is acquainty togicanater, but always to a phenomenal is an intellectual in the latest that it is not become what they are latest when the latest is not become what they are

From the Residence of show possible the use of the Free sign states are at the Free signs of as a free sign of a confidence of the free signs of a confidence of the free signs of the free states of the free signs of the signs of the free signs of the signs of the free signs of the signs of the free signs of the free signs of the signs of the signs of the free signs of the signs of the signs of the signs o

- Kant, Kritik of Judgment, (trans. J. H. Berhard), Longon; Macmillan and Co., 1892 pp 377-392.
- 2. S. C. Pepper, World Hypotheses, p 11.
- Sextus Empiricus, Outlines of Pyrrhonism (Eng.trans.by R. G. Bury).
 London: William Heinemann, Lid., 1933, Ipp 35ff.
- 4. Everett W. Hall, What is Value?, New York: The Humanities Press,
- Ledger Wood, The Amalysis of Knowledge, London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., pp 22f.
- 6. Cf. An introduction to Reflective Thinking, by Columbia Associates in Philosophy, Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1923, Chapter III for an informative discussion of this matter; also, H. A. Larrabee, Reliable Knowledge, Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1945 Chapter VI.
- 7. G. E. Moore, "A Defence of Common Sense," in Contemporary British Philosophy, ed by J. H. Murhead, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1925, Vol II pp 194f.
- 8. Ibid., pp 216ff
- 9. For ananalysis and criticism of some phases of Moore's "Defence of Common Sense," one may consult Arthur E. Murphy's chapter in The Philosophy of G. C. Moore, ed P. A. Schilpp, Evanston and Chicago: Northwestern University Press, 1942, pp 299f.
- 10. The order of presuppositions is considered in Section XI of this article.
- 11. A. N. Whitehead, The Aims of Education, New York: Mentor Books, 1929, p 108.
- 12. Cf. E. I. Carr, " Achievements in Cancer Control," The Journal of a the Michigan State Medical Society, (Jan 1936) p 19, for this estimate,
- 13. Fielding H. Garrison, An introduction to the History of Medicine, (4th Ed.) Philadelphia: W. B. Saunders Co., 1929, p 802.
- 14. Sir William Osler, "Medicine, History of", The American Encyclopedia, (1924), XVIII, p 571a.
- 15. Hyppocratic Collections EpidemicsI, viff,
- Cf. Kind, "Malaria," Pauly-Wissows Real-Encyclopaedie der Classischen Altertims Wissenschaft, (New Ed. 1928), XIV, p 838ff.
- 17. Some & the preceding discussion of the advances in medical science appeared in my article "Reason in Religion," The Journal of Bible and Religion, XV, (July 1947) pp 134 f.
- 18. Thomas Parran, "Public Health Service," The Americana Annual 1940, pp 654a.
- 19. Warren T. Vaughan, "Medicine and Surgery," The Americana Annual, 1936, New York and Chicago: Americana Corp., p 435b.
- 20. The summaries published in the Annuals of authoritative encyclopediae or in the published reports of the various fields may be consulted for specific achievements and dates as well as the problems under investigation. For a general view of the advances in the several scientific fields, one may consult books such as that of W. C. Dampier-Whetham, A History of Science, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1929.
- 22. Cf. my articles on The Logic of Absolute Thanscendence, The lift Review, Winter, 1950, and The logic of Recent Theism, in three parts, Winter, 1947, Spring, 1947, Winter, 1948, The Hiff Review.

TO THE WAS TO BE SEEN AS A SECOND OF THE SEC

ender in de la company de la c THE REPORT OF MILE PRINCIPLE

THE PLANT STREET OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPER

Constitution of the second of 0 -25 -25 -12-0

The same between the same of t · ·

e 1744 1759

غوا. 1 اسر

The supplication of previous formal of remains of Mercan Microsoft Colleges of Microsoft Colleges of Colleges of Mercan Microsoft Colleges of previous formal Microsoft Mercan Colleges of previous formal of the Colleges of previous formal of the Colleges ب میدا درون

Editor of Toy

TARS TO STANFORD STANFORD This toppy, ed by J. M. Marked Ithis forth 100 person to be two polyments of the Millian Co., 1925, 1925, 1954, 20 of the Millian Co., 1925, 1925, 1936, 20 of the market step, 19, 3, 3, 10 of the Market step, 19, 3, 10 of the Market step . . أمحلت

多年 经基金 医脱氧性骨骨 经存货的 医人 BUNKER A STORY CONTRACTOR er San San

14 4 G

. i.,

43

23. "Metanoesis" is formed of meta, whichmeans "after" and "other than," and noesis, a Greek derivative meaning rational thought. We define the word to mean all attempts to arrive at knowledge by other than normal natural or rational means. Cf. Bernhardt, "Reason in Religion." op

cit., p 133.

- 24. Cf. W. H. R. Rivers, Medicine, Magic and Religion, New York; Harcourt, Erace and Co., 1924, and B. Malinowski, The Argonauts of the Western Pacific, London: George Routledge and Sons, Ltd., 1922 for descriptions of this phase of Melanesian life. W. A. Jayne, The Healing Gods of Ancient Civil izations, New Haven: The Yale University Press, 1925, is an exhaustive study of the healing functions of ancient religions, combined with consideration of the metancesis used in this connection.
- 25. W. A. Jayne, The Healing Gods of Ancient Civilizations, pp 373 88.

26. Ibid., pp 477

27. George Wissows, Religion and Kultus der Roemer, Muenchen, 1921 zweite Auflage, C. H. Becksche Verlagsburchhandlung, pp 245f, Cf. also W. H. Jayne, op. cit., pp 462f.

28. B. Malinowski, The Argonauts of the Western Pacific, London: George

Routledge and Sons, Ltd., 1922, pp 76f.

 H. Richard Niebuhr, The Meaning of Revelation, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1941, pp 37f

30. Ibid., pp 138f

31. Dorothy Emmet, The Nature of Metaphysical Thinking., London: Macmillan and Co., Ltd., 1945, pp 189ff.

32. W. E. Hocking, The Meaning of God in Human Experience, Part IV.

33. R. Niebuhr, op. cit., pp 153f

34, Ibid., p 154

35. Cf. Revelation (edited by John Baillie and Hugh Martin), New York: The Macmillan Co., 1937, pp 4lif.

36. Reinhold Niebuhr, Faith and History, New York: Charles Scribber's

Sons, 1949, pp 102-243.

37. C. A. Ellwood, Cultural Evolution, New York and London: The

Century Co., 1927, p 44.

38. Harald and Kristin Schjelderup, Ueber drei Haupttypen der religioesen Erlebnisformen aud ihre psychologische Grudnlage, (Germaniranslation from the Norwegian by Herr Max Leixher van Gruenberg), Berlin and Liepzig: Walter de Gruyter and Co., 1932, consider early childhood experiences as basic determinants of the God-concepts held in later life, and present some evidence to substantiate it. Cf. my critical review in The Journal of Religion, XIII, (July 1933), pp 346ff

39. CF his Faith and History.

40. Cf. His contabution to Revelation, op. cit.

41. Charles Guignebert, Christianity, Past and Present, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1927, p 412.

42, Ibid., p 416

- 43. The 'Summa Theologica' of St. Thomas Aquinas, (Literal translation by Rathers of the English Dominical Province; 3rd. edition), London; Burns, Oates and Washbourne, Ltd., 1929. The Encyclical appears as an introduction to the first volume.
- 44. Ibid., p xv
- 45. Ibid., p xxvi
- 46. Ibid., p xxxi
- 47. An Essay on Metaphysics p 54

ងស៊ីសីសសួល ប៉ុន្តែក្រុម និងស្ថាននៅសេចប្រជាធ្វើការ សេចប្រកាស្តាន់ សេចប្រកាសន៍ នេះ បានសេចប្រកួសស្រាប 溪 🧸 නිසුම් අතුන් වන අතර වෙන අතුන් සිදුම් සහ අතුන් සහ සහ සහ සහ සම්බන්ධ Wes ස්ක්රීම් ස්වීම් සිදුම් සිදුම් සිදුම් සි ်မြို့များနှာနှင့်များသည်။ ကျာတ်သည့် အူလို ကရွှေးရှိသည် အတောင် မြို့ပြေသည်။ ကို မြို့ပြေသည်။ မြို့ပြုပြုချက်သွား သည် မိုးများများ องสำหรับ (เพียงที่ เลี้ยงที่ สายสามารถ (เมื่อง เกี้ยง เลี้ยง (เลี้ยง) (เลี้ยงสามารถ (เลี้ยง) (เลี้ยงโดย (เลี้ย

Marking or Brand and Ca, They as B. B. Millimbell, The Kringbelle didia Westers Parator, tunding drospe ka nicope and figure. Util. 1892

for dependence of the open of Melangeson like W is a large of the remain the fight gift greatest with remains of traditional greatest to be a second gradition. त्तरहरूपियां एक क**ंग्र**ामे प्रियमिक्ष किल्ला है के किल के स्वत्तर के प्रस्तिक के किल्ला के किल्ला है । के **दूसक**्रियोग **म** religiona, consolved van codelecturation is the the lateral and each teach

The dealing floor of Receint Civilizations, on left the 25, W. A. Talone

26, Bid., 16 676. the sage Wistonian Religion, but the the this known is the best term.

waretie Auffeijeg C. W. Weitigele Verlag in ritherdtier g. 90 75% Viv. alsh W. H. Remen op all phale

B. Mathias abit The Arridacis of the Western Pickste, Condent to e or Rochtensk and kees, likka 1922, pp 1460

23. B. Alchord Historiaco The bloomics in Berchleich, New York Marinal for the American States

this target high

The and the control of the control o Mercolden op Co., john 1945. op 1956

of the comment of the livery of the first in the first of the first of the comment of the commen

The colline of the second of the colline of the second of

MIRC JOIN

THE PARTY OF THE SECTION WHEN THE WAS TO SECTION TO SECTION OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR The grant the continue of

मा राजा की । वह सामित्र में क्षिया है के क्षेत्र पुरिताय के कुलि है है के मान वेशांव को कार्य की स्थाप Jores (949, pp 1820-24)

T. A. Dillood, falleration of the parties of the color of

recordingly and according to the second control of the second control of the second second second second second ा १७% १०० १. स्ट्रांटर्जि होन्यात्रकोश भारते दृष्टिन्त्रहोत्त्रात्री स्वयं अभूतेर स्वतंत्र स्वतंत्र अवक्रास्टरेको कार्यको हसी ាំ នៅទទ្ធនាស្សារីសាម៉ាស់ ក្នុងសំណាង ប្រើប្រែក្រៅប្រើសុខការបំព័ន្ធនាស្វារីស្រាស់ នៅក្រុងសំពី ស្រាម នេះ នេះបំព័ន

and honeign and have a self and the first of the control of the co

is, CP til Palan et Henrich

টোৰ্য, স্থানিক ব্যৱস্থানিক লৈ বিষয়ে এই সীৰেন্দ্ৰ নিৰ্ভিত্য কৰিছে। বুৰ্তি চাৰ্যা হৈ এই সিক্ষাৰ সিক্ষাৰ বিষয়ে ইচিছ কলচালে চাৰিক বুৰু কৰিছে কৰিছে বিষয়ে কৈছে সৈতে চিত্ৰী কৰিছে নিত্ৰী সিক্ষাৰ কৰিছে । তিন্দ্ৰ সামৰ বিভিত্ন ব Macrolles Cé. Civer, e Sie

A 15 16 The Charles Historian Comment of the a come to a compact the form of the property of the business for the first parties we wish as in la calega de la la la la la la la competada de la l

មិនក្រាស់ 🚾 នៅ គឺមាន 🖟 និង និង និង និង 🥫 ខ្ពស់ និង

LAWY HILL THE

ा १५ सम्बद्धी द्वारा सङ्ग्रेषी । यह इतिहस्त्री है । इति

48. Summa Contra Gentiles, III ch XVII. Quotation from Anton C. Pegis, The Basic Writings of St. Thomas Audinas, New York-Random House, Inc., 1945, II pp 27f

49. Ibid., chapter XIV

50. An Essay on Metaphysics p 50

51. W. C. D. Dampier-Whetham, A History of Science, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1929, pp 94ff

52. Ibid., p 143

53. One may still read with profit Andrew D. White., A History of the Warfare with Theology, New York and London: D. Appleton and Co., 1896, particularly chapter III of volume II.

54. Albert Einstein and Leopold Infield, The Evolution of Physics, New

York, Simon and Schuster, 1938, pp 76f

55, Tillich, "Mythus and Mythologie: I. Mythus Begrifflich und religionpsychologisch," Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart, Vierter Band (1930) p 363.

56. Ronald G. Smith, "What is Demythologizing?", Theology Today,

vol X, 1953, p 35.

- 57. Cf. E. Brunner, The Mediator, (Eng. trans. by Olive Wyon), New York: The Macmillan Co., 1934, pp 377 ff.
- 58. Cf. B. Malinowski, Myth in Primitive Psychology, (1926) for a selection of those he gathered in his extensive research in this area.

59. Paul Radin, Social Anthropology, New York and London: McGraw-Hill

Book Company, Inc., 1932

60. Cf. the reading on this subject found in Robert E. Park and Ernest W. Burgess, Introduction to the Science of Society, Chicago: The UNiversity of Chicago Press, 1924, chapter XII; Kimball Young, Source Book for Social Psychology, New York: F.S. Crofts and Co., 1927, chapter XVII W. I Thomas, Source Book for Social Origins, Boston: Richard G. Badger, 1909, Part IV.

61. R. M. MacIver and Charles H. Page, Society: An Introductory Analysis, New York: Rinehart and Co., Inc., 1949, p 152.

62. Reinhold Niebuhr, Faith and History, (1949) chapters VIIIII.

63. R. L. Shinn, Christianity and the Problem of History, New York; Charles Scribner's Sons, 1953, pp 15-29.

4. Bernard E. Meland, The Reswakening of the Christian Faith, New York

The Macmillan Co., 1949, pp 69ff.

65. A N. Whitehead, Modes of Thought, NewYork: The Macmillan Co.,

1938, p 79

66. Cf. my articles on "The Logic of Recent! Theism," in three parts, The lift Review, winter, 1947, Spring 1947, Winter, 1948; for a more complete discussion of this basic assumption.

รงที่ เลาสิทธิ์ของเกียกสำหัด เลย เดยเลโร สมัย เลยีย

THE STATE OF VIOLET SERVEN y zaroub (Williamigraphia) y Williamie Marchellen Page 1918, pay yaki

281 g . Wall . 5 1 4 15

on the vice of the property of the party of the property of th Westers with Thomson, Note Total and Loubent D. Appertunt for like applier to it asigni refrainciens as a 1981.

14. Albert Witterier and Loopold and id. The Eredition of Physland No.

Fark, Sixod and Scausier, 1978, 10 201

with the field the state with the same and the same and the same of the same o pagencing and . " Dec Religion to Coestantian and Community and Community. The tier

Reside C. Sadit, "What is Occurrenceinded" Theology Cotor ed X Ispa a fee

Cf. E. Evicee, The Medieror, (Tox, track) by Other Wyord Deed Karly The Managhban Co., 1994, pp BFF M.

Of B. Malineways, Mark in Atlantace Progratogy, 1910 for a eriestick of those is gribered in the excessive research in this error

Faul Radin, thecial Asthyopology, New York and Lordon Mc Braw Mill

Book Congress, Inc. 1832

The reading as the fact and double to be been it because if the terms and W. Burgasa Serthurros as the Euleman sit follows of Society (Chicagor Serthin) erroll of Consept Wester (1921) element after after after a three to be also be conserved to ිසිය කුසුමය දුර්තිව්ව දෙසිට මයන දේඛාත්තදීම කිදුරීව ප්රකාශ පොලීම දු මුත්ගන්නදා වීම මෙම ස්ථා කළය with the figure of the control of the following production of the first the control of 网络海绵 人名英格兰

of Markingtons and Charles II Tage, Andre A As Corollina and As (Markington)

क्षेत्र है देखना है है से स्वरंभिक्ष के होती की गा जा भारत है है की है है है

Partie acceptante (règle) presentation tour application references the statement

Beech and W. Burtsed. Ede Were annesing or the Constant Constant Constant. The Massaltine Constant and State and William

ar, y in wateriand, togice for a gage, Direction to a light of the

ation the continue of the trace of the trace of the committee of the continue of Par Hall Burrar roman in the figure of the first with the figure of the first of the roll of ्यक्रिक्सिस्य सम्बद्धाः स्थानकर्ताः स्थानकर्ताः स्थानितः । १०० । १०० । १०० । १०० । १०० । १०० ।

The application of the Primary Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency, discussed in the Winter issue of The Iliff Review, 1955, suggests that those God-concepts which refer to immanent or partially immanent objective referents are to be preferred to those which are wholly or absolutely transcendent. It appears to be possible to investigate the existence and nature of the former, whereas it does not with the latter. And, insofar as some verification of specific concepts can be achieved, we shall be able to add to our reliable knowledge in this field. The task of this article, then, is to examine the several conceptions to determine which are in fact theoretically verifiable, and which are not.

I

We have assumed that the object of our quest is a reality in some sense other than the cognitional subject. In Ledger Wood's language, God has some form of "referential transcendence", which means that God is in some real sense other than human thinking or human thought. We are not concerned with God as an ideal accepted for its religious value but with no objective referent. Wood's suggestion contains a distinction which we need to consider. It is the distinction between "epistemological" and "ontological" object. The epistemological object is the conceptualization of the ontological object to which the former refers. Our analysis of the foundations of religious knowledge is confined to the epistemological object as such. In this analysis we hope to determine the conditions under which the ontological object may be investigated fruitfully. But such fruitful investigation cannot be undertaken until the problems at the epistemological level have been resolved.

Contemporary Christian theology contains references to God as epistemological object at three levels. An analysis of these three levels should permit us to answer the question before us, namely, precisely which God-concepts are theoretically verifiable?

The first form of epistemological object may be designated the perceptual.) The meaning of "perceptual" object depends, of course, upon the definition of "perceptual". The perceptive process contains or includes the following elements: (i) The presence in the perceiving organism of receptors, i.e., structures subject to sensory stimulation; (ii) some form of stimulus capable of exciting the various receptors; and (iii) some interpretation of the stimulus. Perception is possible only under conditions which provide for excitation of receptors. Since receptors are located both within the organism and at the surface, the source of stimulation may be either within or without. In either case, perception can occur only upon the excitation of some of these receptors.

There may be some question concerning the excitation of receptors by memory images, but this is not a matter of primary

and which are not; ceptions to determine which and in fact theoretically restfirble; The seal of this spitche, then, is to transmo the several conwe shall be able to atd to cur reliable knowledge in this field. for as some emplitoseton of specific cooperate can be achieved. OF \$DO CONNOT! NEOROGIE IF GOOD DOE MIDD BOO COURTE ywo" fisca It appears to be praciple to impretigate the autotomes and mature Committee and Elling and a linear that the States God company at the Tight Resident Library and the Character Charac AND STANFORD THE ON THE BUTTERS BEFORE TO THE TO NAME AND THE

blems sh the aplighenological level have bean recolved. anch fruitful terestigation cames be undertaken until the prothe entelogical object may be investigated finitional. Ru upyr marghara na sele to garonnyna spa eengypjona mugan shijes Ruserradis in confined to the epietonological offers as such, Tormar reform, Our exalgais of the foundations of religious is the compaying that to of the entelogiest object be which the emologies? 'end "ontelogies!" chiset. The epistemological régast အတွေးခဲ့တာ ဂိမ တြင်မရ ခဲ့လုိလတ်မြော်များကို "ကြို့သည်။ နည်းခဲ့ ရတို့ခြောင်တွေသည်ဟုတ်က ညခဲ့ပည်ခဲ့သော် မြန်မျှနေ သည်မြဲမောက်မေ အမြဲမရ ခဲ့လုိလတ်များကို အျပင်ရှိနှစ် မြောက်ခဲ့သည် အများကို ကြိုင်တွေသည်။ မောက်ခဲ့သည်။ မြန်မျှနော God an em adoal succepted for the religious raline but rifer no human thinfing or human shongall We are not noncemed rith ence", which nesus that God is in some weat news piter than Woodys language, Ged mus some forme of "reformatial tremscend" in nome sense other than the oughtstonel subject. In Bridger He pare certied that the object of our group it a rostary

namely, practably which God-concepts are theoresically verificable? . Chree Levals chould permit us to snawer the question before us, as epartemological object at three levels. An enthymic of Marke consemborach granacyan apacyckh contains references to do-

of account of those receptors. In either case, perception can cour only upon the explication ince, the source of stimulation may be efther within or without. receptors are located both within the organism and at the surconditions which provide for excitation of receptors. Since pretation of the attimitue. seconditor is possible outlinear capable of exciting the various receptors; and (111) some imporetures subject to sensory atimelation; \$1) some form of atimular elitain the percelulation of receptora, i.e., simple process contains or includes the following elements: (1) The of course, upon the definition of "pereputati". The perceptive the perseptual. The meaning of "perceptual" polect depends, The first form of epistemological object may be dealgnated

receptors by memory Smages, but this is not a matter of primary Tiece may be some quention concernang the castering of

A The Little Assistant Wolf Mill No. 2 Tall, 1959

concern at this point. The memory is, presumabley, a revival of past excitation of receptors. This means that the final source of stimulation was the excitation of interoceptors or exteroceptors. A similar problem emerges from the effects of the secretions of the ductless glands upon the several receptors. In this case, the excitation is due to some chemical process which can serve as a stimulus in the same manner that light excites the optic nerve. In any event, the necessity of some form of stimulus to excite the receptors appears to be a constant factor in the perceptive process.

From this point of view, we may define a perceptual object as any object or event capable of exciting receptors. God, then, as perceptual object must be such that some of the receptors are capable of being stimulated by this "object" under given conditions. Some theologians define God as precisely such an object. Several years ago, A. C. Knudson stated that God may be a perceptual object. Experience of God, however, depended upon the presence within man of certain mental structures which make such perception possible. He identified the experience of God with "the feeling of absolute dependence", with "instinctive faith in the reality of the ideal, a religious a priori" 2 Disregarding in this connection the questionable character of the Kantian analysis of mind basic to Knudson's proposal, it should be observed that neither "the feeling of absolute dependence" nor "the instinctive faith in the reality of the ideal", constitutes an object capable of exciting any receptors of which I have knowledge. As perceptual events, they would appear to be quite indefinite and leave one with little if any specific information concerning God as an objective factor. I once climbed Long's Peak in northern Colorado, and from the top looked down its east face. Looking down some two thousand feet of the perpendicular wall of rock, I felt something akin to Schleiermacher's "sense of absolute dependence". But I did not thereby immediately rise to the sense of the absolute otherness of God presumably accompanying this experience. After a while, and under the influence of my religious training, something similar this idea occurred to me. But this was an inference from what was to me a compelling and significant experience rather than a direct or even indirect perception of God. I perceived a vast empty space ending in jumbled rocks at the bottom, and bounded on the near side by sheer walls of rock. From this perception, I "felt" something akin to awe. Also from this experience, I may have inferred something about the greatness and majesty of God, "Faith in the reality of the ideal" may be an inference from some or many experiences, some of them undoubtedly perceptual. But faith as such is an attitude of the person rather than an object of perceptual experience.

H. N. Wieman has also insisted that God is a perceptual object. In an early book, he asserted that "either God is an object of sensuous experience, or else He is purely a system of concepts and nothing more". 3 At the same time, he recognized the obvious fact that God is not an object such as we normally

្រុះ ប្រទេស ប្រសាស ប្រទេស ប្រ

ියක්ටුකාල විසිය මුතුම අතරු පුරු සම්බිත්ත වුණය සිතිය දිදිවිත විසින් විසින් විසින් විසින් විසින් විසින් විසින්වි පසුරවේ දුවු එමට වැනි ආපාරකම්වලයා සුහරුවෙන්න විධාන්ත විධා මෙමින්නුවෙන්, වියාපාරකම් විධා විවාහ අව වැනි විධාන සි ်ချုပ်သည့်သည်။ ခုသို့ မြိ**စ် စက်လွန် ပိုည်းသူ ပိုင်လွန်း မိုတို့ ရှိန**်းသည် လောင့်မှာမှ သိမင်းမျှင်းများသည် မြေ na gran i indiklasi je bigi i ki bina kamban grana i ki ku inipat was ලිකු ක් ක්රීම් දැක්වෙන කිර<mark>ල් නොක්රෙන</mark> මහත් දුන්**න නොකුතුන**් ක්රීම දැන්නට දැන්නට නික්ෂුව organistic of the life for the large A. the little can be able to the contract of the contract of the contract of ්, නැහැන වලින ලබන ගැන්නේ ද **කියව**ින්ත කියනත් මතුර්ල් විය දෙම ලිබීම ව්යෝදනල පෙන්න් ශ<mark>ර්ණ</mark> ក្រុមប្រជាពល នៅ នេះប្រើប្រជា**នៃ**។ គេ នៃ និងនៅក្នុង ដែល ដែល នៃ និង មួយ នៃ នៅ នៅនៅនៅ នៅ នេះបាន នេះបាន នេះបាន នៅ នៅ The expectage of the commentation who endead analytically acceptance in ក្រុមក្រុមការ ក្រុម ប្រឹស្សាយសេចបញ្ហា ស្តេចស្ត្រីស្លាស់ ខណ**្សសំនេះ ទៅ ២**ស្សាស់ ក្រុម ខណ្ឌស្នាធិប្បធាននៃ មាននៃប្រទេវិធី - calabag si to losdo lo golikel suv modited sapi karasi od yeaparen, Leagha out និង មួន នើមក ខ្នាន់ គឺ ការប្រែក ខ្លាន់ មកនិងការប្រធាន ខ្លាំង l à Fille de la congene l'appa qu'il inte le plidique sue de ce vers mave impostation. Ak parkospinal svedes, ther folla speech as the ్రార్ కారుమున్ని ఇంది పటికే ఉంటిని తీవులో, ఆత్రించాయినలో ఉంటమ్రావుడు దహిస్తున్నారికి కొన్నట్లు Saw yawa face. Souking down some two thopsome floor of the som pendicular asil of rock, I felt seachhig suir ac Spilelonacity asense of absolute dependence". But I did not thoughly insudicasely rise ic the sense of the absolute charmess of God processing scoompanying this experience. After a while, such mader that in-Iluence of my religious training somewhire similar dida idea courred to me. But this see an inference from that see to me s compailing and significant experience rather than a direct or even indirect perception of God. I perceived a vast empty space ecclus in familied rocks as the bottom, and bounded on space evenue in placer walks of ruch. From the nevesption I "folt" something akin to awe. Also from this superiorce nay have this mentering show those printeness and he well of god. "Faith in the reality of the ideal" may be an interence Prom some or anny aspectaness, some of than andoubtedly persected But faith as such is at athirds of the person rather that an object of peraphtual expectence,

H. M. Wieman has also inclaved that God is a percoptual object. Is an early book, he assemied that "elther God is an object of sensity a superberce. Or else He is purely a system of concept of sensity a system of concepts and cotains more. So is the same time, he recognised the circustant field is not abject as or concelly

perceive. To meet this objection, he stated that God was a reality of such nature that he cannot be perceived in terms of our normal perceptual selectivity. So God could only be perceived when we broke through the habitual selectivity and became aware not of any segment of stimuli, but of all. The state which he described would appear to approach that of meaninglessness, since to be sensitive to every stimulus at the same time would apparently mean specific awareness of none. I doubt very much that such an experience could be called perceptual since one of the essential factors in perception is integration of the meaning of a specific experience with preceding experiences and a meaningless experience hardly permits this to occur.

Wieman soon became aware of this, and redefined his conception of perceptual event. He then defined it as "a structure of interrelated events some of which must be perceptual events".4 According to this definition, every event which contains some perceptual events must be called a perceptual event. By the same logic, every event which contains some inferential meanings must also be called an inferential event. Thus the criterion of perceptual event proposed by Wieman lacks precision; The same object may be called either or both perceptual and inferential event or object. And, if one wishes to include other factors normally involved in such experiences, any given object or event may be called "physical", "physiological", or even "social". If such an inclusive definition of perceptual object is accepted, it is doubtful that there are any objects or events which may be called non-perceptual.

In the light of this discussion, perhaps we can clarify more fully the meaning of perceptual object or event. Let us examine two objects or events. The first consists of the vestigial remains found in a human body; the second, that which is called organic evolution. It is evident that the vestigial remains within a human body are each capable, under specific conditions, of stimulating various exteroceptors. We see, feel, or even smell given organs, such as the vermiform appendix. It fulfills the conditions required for perception under the normal meaning of that term. It is a concrete object embedded in the body, subject to sensory experience, and to interpretation as a more or less functional organ.

What about organic evolution? It is by definition an attempt to interpret not only given vestigial remains, but also a large number of perceptual objects and events, some present and some known only through writings, archeological remains, and other types of data. We do not sense organic evolution; we sense objects which when related meaningfully to other experiences leads to the inference that a process of perhaps a million years in duration may be called organic evolution. Organic evolution is thus an inference drawn from perceptual experiences for the purpose of placing these experiences within a meaningful context. I suggest that the vermiform appendix, on the one hand, and organic evolution on the other, constitute sufficiently different

perceive. No meet this objection, he shated that the vene a realist of such mature that he cannot be perceived in verma of our rormal perceptud selectivity. So ded could only be perceived when we broke through the habitual selectivity and became arare not of any begment of stimmis, but of all. The obstencial which is selectivity and lagionary of the observes, since to be analtive to express that of the same fine would approach that of the same there would apparently mean apecific everyments of none. I doubt very much that such as emperious could be unlied perceptual since one of the assential factors in perception is integration. She meaning of a specific experience with proceding expensions of the meaning of a specific experience with proceding expensions.

Minima soon became aware of this, and redefined his donospetion of perceptant events. No then isfined it as "a structure of intercitated events was mad be perceptual events", according to this definition, every event which contains some perceptual events dues to the perceptual events dues to the sema logic, every event which contains even distanted interceptual event, that the orthogonal and inferential event. That the orthogonal event of perceptual event fine perceptual event fine entitle event proposed by Wieman Jacks president fine entitle event proposed by Wieman Jacks president entitle event event and laterestable event object of the experimental entitle of latered entitle event according has be included in each experiment of perceptual of the event exceptual of the fine event perceptual of the event of perceptual of the event of perceptual of the event of each of the event of event of event of each of the event of event

In the light of this discussion, pechsys we can elective more fully the meening of perceptual object or event. Is us examine two objects or events. The first consists of the vestificial remains found in a human body; the second, that which is ealled organic evolution. It is evident that the vestigial remains within a human lody are each capeble, under specific conditions, of atimulating various exteroceptors. We see, feel or oven smell given organs, such as the vermiform appending la infille the conditions required for perception under the normal meaning of that term. It is a concrete object embedded in the body, subject to sensory experience, and to interpretation as a more or less functional organ.

What about organic evolution? It is by definition an attempt to interpret not only given vertigial remains, but also a large number of perceptual objects and events, some present and some prove only through writings, archaelogial remains, and other types of data, We do not sense organic dvolution; we sense objects which when related negatingfully to other emperiodes londs to the inference that a process of perhaps a million years in duration may be onlind organic evolution, then an inference of properties organically in the property of the antistical content. I suggest of placing the authority of the content. I suggest the content, and antistical sources of placing on the content, or the one hand, and

epistemological objects to warrant giving them different names in the interest of clarity of thinking.

God does not belong within the category of perceptual objects as just described. Among the objects sensed and perceived, there is none which is given the name "God" by any serious observer. Many are prepared to say that event X refers to God, but not that this is God. This means we must pursue this analysis further if we are to arrive at a tenable theory of God as apistemological object.

II

The distinction between organic evolution as an inference from observed facts and the specific facts observed suggests a second type of epistemological object which we shall eall inferential or heteroscopic. A microscopic object is so small that it cannot be seen by the human eye without instrumental aid, specifically one which magnifies the minute object to observable proportions. A macroscopic object is, on the other hand, of such size that it can be observed directly by the unaided eyes of man, even though some such objects are so far away that help is required to bring them within range of observation. In both cases, microscopic and macroscopic objects are observable by means of instruments now available. But there are other "objects" which are not observable by any presently known instruments. They are sometimes called "scientific" objects to denote the more ultimate constituents of the microscopic and macroscopic objects.6 I am not certain that they are precisely what I mean by heteroscopic object. Further analysis may reveal the connections between "scientific" and "heteroscopic" objects.

(We may approach this matter quite readily by noting several God-concepts which have been developed historically. According to Aristotle, God was the Prime Mover who was real but not observable. The percelyable consisted of the world of men and events considered as "moveables". Such moveables were not considered to be selfsufficient. Every moved presupposed a mover. The final or ultimate Mover was, of course, the Unmoved Mover of the Physics. 7 It is evident that this Unmoved Mover was not a constituent of either the microscopic or macroscopic world since both were in process of movement and change. The Unmoved may be said to have been operationally present within these two worlds inasmuch as he was the ultimate cause of all movement in But in either case, whether as Unmoved Mover as such, or as operationally immanent within the moveables, God was not an observable or perceptual object. He was an inference believed to be necessary since Aristotle assumed that every moving object must have been moved by something other than itself. Aristotle's Unmoved Mover is thus an example of God as heteroscopic object.

C. Lloyd Morgan, in his first series of Gifford Lectures, stressed the fact of emergence, the appearance of the new or novel. "Emergence" was his name for the process responsible for the appearance of different levels within the Existential Medium.

The control of the co • : . . A Carrier Constitution of the constitution of . 등 목보 고 # 1 목 4 목 4 작 4 3 (*)

in di Indi someredini na as rolicioses alongio neseled noificili soft and and selession and and and and as a selession and anoses and as a selession and anoses and as a selession and assession assession assession assession assession and assession and assession assess

Linever gritton yd girbaen erico renden eine fosconos yss on the bedeen y Kiselnceel Begolinet greed evan holde organista egenno-bebled de nen den bedeen y Kiselnceeld Begolinet greed erw hol gelderald e siderwee on the new to bine est of revel entry heoreg on settere estas on revel entry house on the siderwee saven to best leno eldan entry house of the best bine entry house the settere and the settere entry house estas entry house head and day house entry house entry house entry entry house entry entry house entry house entry house entry entry house entry entry house entry house entry house entry house entry house entry house entry entry house e

42402839 nounical brotth to control that are the the control of the control He stated his basic conviction in these words: "For better or worse, I acknowledge God as the Nisus through whose Activity emergents emerge, and the whole course of emergent evolution is directed." By Upon analysis, one discovers that God as Nisus is an interpretation of many facts and interrelated theories. First is the observed fact that there are differentiable levels in reality beginning with matter, then rising to life and mind. It is the "fact" that these three levels are more or less discernible, and that the evidence points to the temporal priority of matter with more ultimate constituents, followed in time by life, and finally, by mind, which gave rise to Morgan's theory of emergence. But the fact of emergence was not considered by him to be ultimate. He believed that there must be that in the nature of reality which is responsible for the emergence of emergents; and that "Nisus" or "striving" was his name for this ultimate factor.

It is evident that "God as Nisus through whose Activity emergents emerge" is not an observable or perceptual object. What is observable is the phenomenon of levels: matter, life, and mind. Even life and mind are hardly observable in any gross sense of perception. At the same time, they are in part determinable by instruments available today. They constitute the perceptual objects to be explained. With these perceptual objects before him, Morgan inferred the "existence" of God as Nisus responsible for their emergence. That this Nisus is not observe able or perceptual would appear to be confirmed by the fact that other students of nature explain the three levels of phenomena in other terms. The Nisus is thus an heteroscopic object, an object of such nature that it is not subject to perception as are microscopic or macroscopic objects. Whereas it is never observable, its existence is inferred from that which is observable. Thus heteroscopic objects are presumably actual and existent non-perceptual realities whose presence is inferred from an analysis of perceptual data.

From this vantage-point, we may ask whether or not God as heteroscopic object is a "scientific" object as defined by Ritchie and Broad. They define scientific objects as the ultimate constituents of microscopic and macroscopic objects. Protons and electrons could be so defined when they wrote as such ultimate constituents. If the Existential Medium as a whole may be considered a macroscopic object characterized by the emergence of emergents, then perhaps God as Nisus could be considered a scientific object. At the same time, it is doubtful that Morgan would consider God a fourth level: Matter, Life, Mind and then God. God was rather that Activity responsible for the emergence of the three extant levels. It would appear preferable, if one is interested in precision of definition, not to extend the meaning of "scientific object" to include what we have designate as heteroscopic.

God, as epistemological object, may be viewed as an heter oscopic object. As such, God could be considered to be real, existent, determinative, yet of such dimensions quantitatively

The state of the second control of the secon

ANTICATION OF THE STATE OF THE

as both for to testson les yam ou office-ogsterr cist mous es both to the testson les yams of the second of the se 2011年2月

species on benefit of you display indisplays the day of the constraint of the benefit of displays of the force of the forc

by any currently known instruments or procedures. As heteroscopic object, God is an inferred reality, an inference based upon and considered necessary by perceived objects or events. If, in some far-future, we are able to transform and perfect our methods and instruments, God as heteroscopic object may become a perceptual object. Before this can occur, however, I predict we shall have to develop a qualitatively new approach to the whole subject. At any rate, we are in a position today where the most we can say is that it may be possible to find evidence to support the claim that God as heteroscopic object exists.

III

A third type of epistemological object is more difficult to define. In our examination of the God-concepts in the class called "Absolute Transcendence", 9 we noted that the exponents of such concepts asserted that there was no way whereby God could be known by any form of observation or inferred from any such observation. They reasoned in this manner because they believed that God as absolutely transcendent belonged to another order of reality than that of the human or the material. God so defined is both more-than and other-than man and the cosmic process. As an epistemological object, God is discontinuous with other forms of epistemological objects.

Man's "knowledge" of God so defined comes through revelation or what we have called metancesis. We may have knowledge in the usual sense of the historic figure within whom God presumably incarnated himself; we may have similar knowledge of the documents within which we find information concerning Jesus Christ; and we may have such knowledge concerning the presumed effects of faith in God so defined in the life of the church and of Christian persons. But we must rely upon faith in revelation for both the nature and existence of God as absolutely transcendent.

It is somewhat difficult to find a term which would characterize this type of epistemological object. It may be possible to use "faith object" to designate this category, but this would lead to confusion since object—of—faith may refer to goals of life or to certain documents which contain the theology called by one church at least "The Faith". For what it may be worth. I shall propose another term metascopic to designate such epistemological objects as refer to objective referents which are other than either perceptual or heteroscopic objects. God as metascopic object would thus be an objective referent whose nature is not continuous with perceptual or heteroscopic objects, and is therefore not subject to the same type of behavioral and implicative verification.

The challes were the remaining of procedurations of the care of th

III

A third type of apistemological object is move difficult define. In our examination of the God-concepts in the class called "Absolute Transcendence", I we noted that the erponents of such concepts areas that there was no way whereby God could such concepts are of the erponents be known by any fowar of observation or inferred from any such observation. They reaconed in this manner because they believe that God as abother cycler of resilty when they erpassendent belonged to shother cycler of resilty when that of the kneed or the material. Our seek is both norse that other than and the count or ceek as existencingless of other than and the count, or ceek for existing existencingless of others that are discontinuous viul other

While Ilmovies got of God to defined comes through terminous vertain which we have collected metanocoff. We may have browned a lattice which stance of the interior of the interior which wher God grantles to account to action within which we find information concerning for the focus and we may have tuch through edge concerning the presumed affects of faith in God so defined in the jile of the church and the Christian persons. But we must rely upon faith in revelation for both the nature and existence of God as absolutely transcentions.

It is somewhat difficult to find a term which would choracted to this type of opistemologiest object. It may be possible to use "faith object" to designate this scategory, but this would lead to confusion since object-of-faith may refer to goals of lead or to certain documents which contain the theology called by one church at least "The Faith", For what it may be worth. I shall propose another term, metascopic, to designate another serm, metascopic, to designate another opistes to designate which epistemological objects as meder other than either perceptual or interceopic objects, ded as mother than either perceptual or interceopic objects, ded as mother for the same type referent chose and is not continuous with perceptual or interceopic objects and in therefore not subject to the same type of behavioral and implicative verification.

There are some similarities between heteroscopic and metascopis objects. Both are beyond observation by any currently available instruments of observation and research. We defined the heteroscopic object as one whose dimensions and qualities are such that they cannot be perceived by our normal perceptive processes nor by any extension of them instrumentally. At the same time, heteroscopic objects are continuous with perceptual objects. Metascopic objects, on the other hand, are impercible and non-inferable from any perception and by definition will be forever so. In other words, there are no theoretical possibilities that they will ever be either perceptual or heteroscopic objects. God as metascopic object is known only as He reveals himself to man. The knowledge-process is from God to man, and not from man to God.

We the have three epistemological objects: the perceptual, the heteroscopic, and the metascopic. The problem before us is that of determining which of these several epistemological objects is subject to verification, and to what degree. In an earlier paper we outlined the verificatory process as we define it in this connection. Verification consists in two broadly different operations. The first is clarification, or the analysis of the problem and the determination of the conditions required for its solution. The second is verification proper. Clarification includes at least four steps: (i) the determination of the nature of the problem at hand; (ii) definition of the terms relevant to the understanding of the problem and its possible solution; (iii) discovery and explication of hypotheses and (iv) determination of the conditions which must be fulfilled if a specific hypothesis is to be considered verified.

The second phase of the verificatory process is verification proper. By this we mean the activities or processes incolved in (iv) above. A simple illustration may serve to clarify our meaning. If a safe has been robbed, police normally seek to determine the method of operation involved. Robbers specialize in specific methods of opening safes, or otherwise pursuing their trade. The argument then is as follows: A given method of operation presumably means that burglar X committed this crime. Verification consists in part in examining the scene of the crime to determine what method was used. If it coincides with that nromally employed by some known criminal the police can then hunt for him, and gather further evidence required to convict him.

Verification proper consists in two possible forms which may be used together or independently.

The first is behavioural verification which consists in activities, observational in character, to compare the requirements for establishing the hypothesis with the actualities in the relevant stituations. The second, or implicatory verification, consists in comparint the results of other instances of behavioral verification with those obtained in the present case.

In the case of the safe robbery, part of the verification consists or depends upon the psychology of habit. A given safe robber develops the habit of pobling saves in a given way. Accordingly, we may expect him to continue to use this method. At the same time, it is doubtful that any other person would develop precisely the same habitual method. These conclusions have resulted from investigations in the area of the psychology of habit, and have implications in police work and also in the philosop of religion.

There are noon straintines bear out harrostens, ad melescopy disservation and necessary of the residence of the control of the second of the control of the second of the

We the processor three optotemological objects, the perceptual, the beta of optimisment of the metascopic. The problem before us is that of determining which of the serveral epistemological objects is subject to vertification, and to a tel degree. It is not the artifer paper we outlined the vertificatory process as we define a to absence than a found on the analysis of the problem and the descrimination of the foreign of the problem and the descrimination of the conditional entired for its solution. The second is vertification proper. Clarification leaded at least four steps: (i) the desermination of the nature of the problem and the problem of the terms relation to the understanding of the problem and its presentation of the foreign of the terms relation of the opening of the problem and its problem of the problem and the problem of the considered or the point of the problem and the problem of the considered or the appendix of the considered or the co

The second phase of the variibatory process is verification proper. By the meanthe activities or processes incolved in (iv) above. A simple ill strateon may sorve to destine in mealing, if a safe has been robbed, police betweeth sorth each consistent in method of operation to selved. Robberts specialize betweeth sorth each of opening safes, or otherwise pursuing their trade. The argument there is a consistent and a given method of operation presumably means that burglar X committed this in a Verification consists in part in examining the suens of the crime to determine whether method was used. If it coincides with that aromally employed by some known criment to police can then have been entered to covere criments.

Verification proper consists in two possible forms which may be used together or independently.

The first is behavioural verification which consists in activities, cheervaniousian cheracter, to compare the requirements for establishing the hypothesis with fir actualities in the relevant stiuntions. The second, or implicatory verification, consists in comparint the results of other instances of behavioral verification with fire obtained in the present case.

in the case of the sade nobbery, part of the verification consists or depends por the prechology of helds. A given safe nobber develops the babit of nobbing saves on a given way. Longressingly, we may expect him to continue to use this method. The same thing, it is doubtly that any other person would develop productly the ratio he bired method. These expectivations has a resulted from lavertigations in the static payelalogy of babit, and have limptlessions to polite wears work and also in the pathon of religion.

The necessity for insisting upon verification of God-concepts has been presented in previous papers. 10 So long as one remains at the level of ontological presuppositions, there is no escape from either scepticism or dogmatism. Un willing to accept either alternative, we examined the possibility of finding a test for ontological presuppositions at the epistemological level. From this analysis, there emerged the Final Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficience. was adopted on the grounds that (i) it provided a possible means of escaping sceptiosm and dogmatism, and (ii) places religious thinking in a position where growth in reliable religious knowledge may occur comparable to that in other areas. But the adoption of this presupposition commits one to the adoption of the secondly Presupposition of Proximate Realization in preference to that of Final Realization. The latter tends to have a stultifying effect upon research, whereas the former has demonstrably added to the efficiency and fruitfulness of human thinking. This means, then, that the test of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency commits us to the task of verifying positively any God-concept we may expect to adopt. With this summary of the argument, we turn to an examination of the possibility of verifying some or all of the epistemological objects considered above.

The first of these epistemological objects was the perceptual. Rather than discuss its possible verifiability in a vacuum, we shall analyze Henry Wieman's conception of God as Creative Event as an exemplification of this category. Though I am not convinced that he has made good he case that God as defined is a perceptual object, we shall waive this point and investigate his concept in his own terms

It is possible with Wieman's conception of God to engage in experimental behavior to determine whether or not the results predictable from the concept are realizable. One may engage with other persons in an attempt to increase his sensitivity to social and other situations; he may integrate his new insights derived in this manner with those he previously had; he may then approach anew the world of men and events to determine whether or not they have been transformed as a result of the sharing of insights with others. When he has made these attempts, honestly and over a sufficiently long period of time to permit determinable results to occur, he can reach his conclusions on the basis of this form of behavioral verification.

in chapter Three of The Source of Human Good, (1946), maynot give rise to perceptual experiences such as are denoted by "blue" or "sharp". At the same time it may result in what Hocking calls "negative mental after-images." By these Hocking means that a given experience may leave one with the general conviction that the experience was either satisfactory or unsatisfactory. If We may presume that those followed by a positive mental after-image would be considered creative experiences whereas those which leave negative after-images would not be so considered. I doubt that these experiences could be called "perceptual." They are undoubtedly experiences involving human behavior at some levels, and to that extent can be considered as forms of behavioral verification. In any case, the experience of God as Creative Event contains as a minimum, (i) some perceptual events, and (ii) some determinate and presumably determinable modifications in personality. In so far as both factors are present, God as Creative Event constitutes an hypethesis subject to behavioral investigation.

ရေး ကားမြော်လေးမှ ကို အိုကိုယ်ကျားသော သောကို ပိုင်းကြီး မော်လေးများကျား မောက်သော အစားအော် အတွေ့ အပြုံးသည်။ မိုက်မြော့များ<mark>များသော် ပို့သေ</mark>းကြီးသည်။ မြောက်မြော်များကို မှာသောသည့်မြော်သည်။ မြောက်မြော့များများ မြောက်များများ and the second participation of the properties and the second participation of the properties of the configurations and the second participation of the properties of the prop प्राचित्र के क्षित्र के लिए प्रकृषिती करूच्या जिल्ली करावित करा। अस्ति किलागान स्थानिक क्षा कर करावित करा कर के The property of the state of the second section is the second section of the second section of the second section is a second section of the second section of the second section is a second section of the sectio ar - Televia FA Lexaintiga Chyalesa vaat ilo oo ble angren A Televi Bari keyri ana en èste graduse to except till exact to be because it is the state of the energy of the bedgets new surplicent and daymaniara, and fill places veligions bearing in a majorior aliene growth in this as very glove, heropyledge oray and ur comparison in the modes ෙම මීට පත්ත්තුවරය මිස්ද යම මටට අවධිප්තමයට සෙට්,කිරීපට අතරුණය ද මටවට මිට පත්වල් සිටි. මෙව් වෙසි areodd y Presoppoethol of Producte Rosibadien is prefeirige et early or First Restlession of the letter residence and this is a specific to be suffered as the contract of t a unud in resultifficat has youldtollis this to belibs yilleviesement of a semiral add reducting, This means, then, that the less of that easing Togoldon's Extressent committe us to the tost of verifying preciously any God-conscept we can espect to adopt. With this semigrary of the argument, we man to an examination of the posetbility of verifying some on ell of the aplatemological objects considered about

The first of these epistemiological objects was the persential factor to the feast of factor to a discress its possible vertilability and sacromy we shall surify a Menty Wiscost's contention of God as Greenive Head so an exemplification of this estapony. The factor made pool is said that followed has radio pool is said that followed has radio pool is said that followed in the content content object was stad water this pool and incominguic his convent to he content.

It is possible with Wieman's conveption of Gul to organs in expendingment in married or organization of the reservance of entire of the consent are situable. One may engage with other persons in an attempt to increase the relationship of entire to such the relationship of the manner with those he previously had; he may then approach arese the residual points and events to determine whether or not they have been transformed as a new and events to determine whethers. When he has reade these attempts, and a the sharing of insights with others. When he has neede these attempts, and occur, he can reach bis conclusions on the hasis of this form of helevioral verticalism.

I should be observed that the creative experience which Wiems, describes to chapter Three of The Source of Funian Good, (1946), massed cities resent to perappeat experiences such as are denoted by Iblue? or "sharp". At the same tund it may result in what blocking calls "magative mested after-image? Or By have the may read that the experience was either easiefunctory or specialished by a positive medial site with the general conviction that the experience whereas these modal sitevinuage would be non-thered treative sites whereas whereas those which leave magative affers integers world up the successive sites and a provider of the successive sites and a provider of the successive sites and a provider of the successive affers as some levels, and to the resent to considered as forms or behavioral verification. In any case, the repeate can be considered as forms or behavioral verification. It some paragraph at every constitution of the considered as forms or behavioral verification. It some paragraph at every constitute and personal to senter a both factors and present. Cod as Creative Event constitutes and by an allow to behavioral investigation modifications in personal cases.

Results such as this constitute instances of low cogency value. There are many different hypotheses which could include both perceptual events and determinable modifications of behavior to reach definite conslusions that God is precisely the Creative Event described by Wieman. Madame Blavatsky could have justified her rather weire God-concept in much the same way. At the same time, it should be noted that the Creative Event, sketched by Wieman, is probably a religious name for that which sociol ogists call "the social process." As described by Max Lerner and Talcott Parsons, the social process is, in the main, equivalent to the Creative Event. Creative Event that Wieman has utilized a sociological concept and from it developed an attractive religious conception, the important matter is that his view of God finds support in current sociological theory which Madame Blavatsky's conceptions do not. There is support for his theory from other fields which makes it necessary to accord it some degree of truth-value. God as Creative Event is thus subject to both behavioral and implicatory verification.

Turning now to the next type of epistemological object, we may select the late Shailer Mathews' view of God as personality-producing and personally-responsive factor in the cosmos as a low level heteroscopic object. By low level heteroscopic object we mean one with limited extensionality, i.e., its coverage is quite limited in terms of the total Existential Medium. Wieman limits the extension of his concept primarily to this planet and its human population. Mathews extends the meaning of his concept to include all that Wieman means by the Creative Event as well as the total evolutionary process and those phases of the Existential Medium more or less directly contributory to it. This increase in extensionality places Mathews' Godconcept within the class of heteroscopic objects. At the same time, his view iof the heteroscop object is much less inclusive than is true of views such as C. Lloyd Morgan's.

It is obvious that God as personality-producing and personality-nurturing factor is subject to behavioral and implicatory verification. There are large bodies of solid data and numerous verified theories to support the hypothesis that human personality emerged and was nurtured to its present stage by various vactors involved in the Existential Medium. Among them may be listed the theories concerning the origin and formation of the earth; the emergence of life and the theory of organic evolution; and the various theories concerning the nature and development of personality. All of these may be cited as implicative support for Mathews' view of God. Thus God as heteroscopic object at this level is subject theoretically, to behavioral and implicative verification.

V

The next level of expanding inclusiveness of God as heteroscopic epistemological object is emplified in various recently formulated God-concepts. The late Jan C. Smuts used the term "holism" to designate the basic characteristic of the Existential Medium as a whole. He defined holism as "a process of creative synthesis, the resulting wholes (being) not static but dynamic, evolutionary, creative, "13 This creative process functioned at all known and presumably knowable levels of the cosmic process. The conditions required for the verification of this hypothesis are all natural processes. As such, they are presumably subject to behavioral and implicative rification. If the evidence available supports this view, then Smut's hypothesis must be given serious consideration along with other similar views concerning the basic structure of reality which we may call God. If the evidence does not, then this attempted interpretation must be discarded and further hypotheses developed and investigated. Whether or not be proved his point is not before us now. What is important is that he presented an hypothesis whose truth or falsity can be determined by behavioral and implicative methods of verification or disproof.

ေသာေတြကို သည္။ အေလးကို ကေလးမွာ ေရောက္မွာရွိသည့္ သည္။ လည္းသည္ ေရေသည့္ ေလးလည္း ေရေသည့္ လုံးရေတြေလး သူက လည္းမြားေတြက ရက္သြင္းရွိေရေသည့္ ရေသည့္ အေလးသည္ သည္။ လြန္မရာ အေလးမွာ သည္ အေလးသည္ လည္းမွာ သည္ ေရြးေတြကို မွ လြန္းသည္ကို ျမတ္ေနြးသည့္ရည္ အုိ႔ရသည္ ရွိသည္အတြင္း ေရေသည္ အေလးအေနြးနည္းေတြ ေခေတြက ရက္ေတြ အေနြးမွာပဲ ေရာက္မွာမွာ o ordina o ordina Gradiji so ori komologia arekiti semena idio je ra sali gili bedanazila pipoliti A Control of the second of ද විස් වුවර්තුවයට වෙන ක්වාදයට මහතරමුවක් ද කාරවානයෙන් ද කාට වුවාදකාවටත් මේ කොලා වෙන දායම්මේක්ෂ වෙන විමි la la elevante. El la la recumula del qui becle nuolo ele, Puerono a la coe estat decres estac El cuertesta de la lace el serbaro de el come maiente, por un mentre esta estaco estaco estaco estaco estaco e sisse Wiennan has hillson a schiological com national isom it min appeal on ein and and it is religious concector it is improvable inserter to the tile brown of this bad work or process to the election of the contribution of the contributi a good for bis theory from other jetts which maked it recessary to occupi d acom de greet of trip busy teel. One as throats in the entire with subject to be into the constant of the constant of the ladžiatilita r projavilgazi

的复数人名 化自己 化油油管管 医鼻孔切开 医鼻孔

ីនៃខេត្តបំនេះ ១០១៤១ ក្នុងសេត្តសារសម្រៀន នៃបន្តែន**ាលខាងខ្លែងសារ ១៤**ប្រជាពល **មា**ក្រុម មានស្នាន់ នៅសារសម្រាប់ នៃស Sholler Mathewal there of God as personally on colours, and personally everyon to iauros in the cosmos na a low lavel betweenchie bigari. Tily low trint liciaria age object we arean and while limited extendionally, i.e., the arterage in golds the limiters in terms of the test Extractation McGlum, - Wiczen Carics the extension of the events of le formatig to this places and be bounded population. Madhews enteres the appropriate god us liner to the All bridgers) will be areast signed to the about of the score at the to al evolutioneny promesa and those phoses of the Extatential Medien were our incodicactly contributory lott. This increase it calendron hay please been bely please been oned too. ි දෙස් කිරීම වැන්න මෙන්න මෙන්න මෙන්න මිසි. මැස් කෙරු මෙන්න සම්බන්න මෙන්න සම්බන්න වෙන්න වෙන්න මෙන්න මෙන්න මෙන්න า มาไว้ เหลือง สุดเหลือง เพื่อเลื่อ ระสาร ระโดยเลื่อง เลืองใหญ่ไม่ คากระสามา สามารถ สามารถสามารถสามารถสามารถสา

od gadrona i gadan**o e**nnej kao yakaabere, gadanen en alkenenneg oa delli sadi sadinde kalinda eki i o v surce se denoviorel and imphibalory verrilenter. . Thereis are level as the consecutive of ng menulik di ajagongga adi kanggal or kabupadi balilinay kocalerdi bis siah biyos atherity control and was mariored to 25 armsept again to by including the formal variable. in the Entering Medium, Among them may be illested the theories of a correction origin and formulier of the earth; the emergence of its ead the theory of organic evolution ; and the varions theories concerning the potere and development of payso ality. All or these may be uited as implicative support for Mathews! view of fock This God as beleroencode object at this level to subject theoretically, to beta-loret ardinariaatica varitaalikani bus

The next level of espanding fuctuativeness of Cod as boteroscopic opiciencelegical object is empified in various recently formulated God-concepts. The law thin C Bands used the term "hollsm" to designate the basic miseacterfule of the Edwinter Medium as a whole, the defined boils mas hap process of greathe synthesis, the resulting wholes the lagt not static but dynamic, evolutionary, creative, all This ereftles processiqued at all luova and presunably inovable levely of the cor min prodess. The nonelitions required for the vertilication of the hyporheate are will methical processing. As such, they are presonably subject to beasslord and high of verification, if the evidence socilable supports this elem, then Unice hypothesis must be given serious consideration along with other similar siews noneer risk for bagile structure of weality which we may util Corl. Hithe evidence does uplo the i regulare à receptant pri septant les sebennades et la des ses soltentes et le respecta al la respecta a l'ég රේ පුරුම්ම - අතුන එය සහත්වයේ එහැද සුව 100 ගත තවර එය එයදුරු එක් වන වන අයුත්ව දුම්විය එයදුරුව සේවය සිදුර erwalibed is a estador so riber estador ababitos y o a a Bedraceuro en estadores कार उन्नर्स के स्थान कर ताम के हैं। ताम के स्थान के साम के साम के साम के साम के साम के हैं। ताम कर हैं। ताम क

This conception of God as the Holistic factor operative at all levels in the Existential Medium includes what Wieman describes as the Creative Event, primarily at the individual-social level, and, by Mathews at the socio-cosmic levels. This then is a third level of extensionality which includes the two preceding. And it is a conception of God which brings religious thought into creative congruence with other forms of contemporary thinking.

There are man formulations of this approach to the God-concept in contemporary philosophies of religion, Basic to most of them is the conviction that God is "The Determine of Destiny," in Praitis interesting language, God is thus the dependable Factor or the Dynamic Determinant operative in the Creative Event at one level, in the creative and differentiative process whereby the earth and its inhabitants came into existence and continue to change and to stabilize; and presumably, in the farthest reaches of the microscopic and macroscopic phases of the Existential Medium,

Perhaps a moment's consideration should be given to the suggestion that God is differentiative as well as integrative, it was noted some years ago by Hugh Hartshorne that every type of creativity included both differentiation and integration. This is so obvious that it should have been noted and accepted without question. It but the destructive phase of creative activity is usually overlooked or underemphasized. Hartshorne, noted that every form of reconstitution presupposed some elements of disintegration or loss of individuality on the part of supposed some elements of disintegration or loss of individuality on the part of the elements which together comprise the new emergent or whole,

Human life depends upon a constant supply of food, But food is, in the main, organic. This means that eatile die to provide meat; plants die to provide vegentable matter, and so the process continues. Even personality growth makes its demands upon others. The words attributed to John the Baptist concerning Jesus that "He must increase, but I must decrease," (John 3:30) may be said concerning all who take seriously their social responsibilities. There are tools which are enseted from all who "serve" mankind. It may be true that there are compensations, but it must be recognized that they are "compensations" namely, that which provides in some measure for loss or privation, It is quite signitizant that the symbol of Christianity is a Cross, reminiscent that one died for many. (This means that God as Dynamic Determinant at all levels in reality must be defined in differentiative as well as integrative terms.

These several definitions of God as heteroscopic object all have their objective referent in the Enistential Medium in whole or in part, Since this is the case, concepts such as these are subject to behavioral and implicative verification. The conditions for such proof or disproof are here, and every philosopher or religion who accepts one of these views must accept with it the responsibility for engaging in the verificatory activity indicated if his view is to be more than an hypothesis or guess. And to the extent that this responsibity to be more than an hypothesis or guess. And to the extent that this responsibity to be more than an hypothesis or guess. And to the extent that this responsibity to be more than an hypothesis or guess. And to the extent that this responsibity to be more than an hypothesis or guess.

IA

The third type of epistemological object which emerged from the analysis of contemporary God-concepts was the metascopit, We noted that metascopic objects are not subject to verification by any established methods of verification, since by definition they are objects at a different level of reality than perceptual or heteroscopic, God as matascopic object is not continuous with the rest of the or heteroscopic, God as matascopic object is not continuous with the rest of the Existential Medium, Accordingly, the methods appropriate to the investigation

And the control of th

Fines to convey formulations of this expression to the food-users of a content-pot any pithosophies of religion. Heads to most of the following the continer of the Content of Content of the Content of

Perbuge a mord-unish consideration should be given to the suggestion first foolis differentiative as well as integrative. It was noted some years are by lings flow flowed that every type of creativity multipded both differentiation and have gratico. If its is so covious tint it should have been hoted and sovermed within a covious cint it should have been hoted and sovermed without or creation. If no destructive place of creative contacts is assent overlaping or modernaquestacing in the contact and suggestion of reconstitution are supposed some elements of distinct and or lose of individuality on the part of elements which together comprise the new emergent or whale.

Human his depends upon a nonstain supply of food. But food is, he the reporture or gradie. The means that each elected of the provide mean; plants the is provide maked fable matter, and so the provide antichnes. The matter fable matter personality grows matter for demends apon others. The words antiched to job the lapits contained fable files which gril who take seriously their social maskodines. There are foods which are also true from all who verve' markind. It may be true the factor are compensations, but it must be recognized that they are 'compensations' namely that which provides in some measure for loss or privation. It is quite right facant that the symbol of Thristianity is a Cross, reminiscent that one died for many. This means that God as Dynamic Determinant at all levels in reality must be defined in differentiative as well as integrative terms.

These several definitions of God as heteroscopic object all have their objective geforant in the Entstantial Medium in whole or in part. Since this is the case, condens such as these are subject to behavioral and tangil cetive verification. The conditions for such proof or disprecient here, and every philosopher or religion who accepts one of these views must accept with it the, an proposalbility for engaging in the verificatory activity indicated if his view in to be more that an hypothesis or guess. And to the entent that this responsibility to take perform solid foundations for xellering to have a tringent of the responsibility and foundations.

 $\mathcal{L}J$

The district type of spistemologies object which store god from the surface of the surface of the surface of some confermal and the surface of the surface o

of the Existential Medium do not apply to God. Perhaps we should restate this by saying that no positive verification is possible under the conditions specified by the exponents of Absolute Transcendence. They will admit the use of the clarificatory phase of verification, but deny the possibility of positive behavioral or implicative verification. At the same time, some of them sought to avoid remaining at the level of pure assertion or affirmation, and engaged in negative behavioral and implicatory verification. Niebuhr has noted that the evils of the world supported his view that God must be other-than the world of men and events. If man's religious needs must be finally and fully satisfied. as the exponents of the Secondary Presupposition of Final Realization assert, the all the evidence cited by Niebuhr must be accepted as verifying his conception of God. (If, on the other hand, the oltological presupposition basic to his work is rejected, as we found it necessary to do when tested by the Primary Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency, then his evidence may be cited as substantiating the view that God is both differentiative and creative. The evils may be evidence of the differentiative phase of God's work. Others who belong to Niebuhr's general group, such as Karl Barth, reject even Niebuhr's tentative efforts at verification. They insist that God is wholly metascopic and thus ultimately beyond all verification or disproof. God must be accepted on faith; belief in God is a matter of will rather than rationality. It is purely a matter of saying "Yes" to the revelation or confrontation of God. This surely means that God as metascopic object is not subject to verificatory methods. To this extent, then, the late Douglass Clyde Macintosh was correct when he, spoke of such theology as "reactionary irrationalism, "15

VII

The theoretical verifiability or non--verifiability of perceptual, heteroscopic and metascopic objects would appear to be relatively clear. The first two are subject to verificatory investigation; the third is not. But the issue is not so clear-cut when one considers the God-concepts presented in the class known as Partial Immanence. According to their general philosophical positions, they would consider God as epistemological object to be heteroscopic. Bowne affirmed that the distinction between the natural and the supernatural was no longer tenable. The question, for him, had moved from the ontological to the casual level His primary distinction was between primary and secondary causation. 16 W. M. Harton approached the metascopic level when he asserted that God must be conceived of as "surveying and controlling the cosmic process from a point of restlying above and beyond it. "17 At the same time, he recognized the direction in which his thought was moving, and sought to return to the heteroscopic level by insisting that there was, by inference, an environment beyond the cosmic whose activities were responsible for the changes which occurred here. far as Bowne and Horton may be considered representatives of the general posttion of Partial Immanence, God as epistemological object must be classified as heteroscopic for this school of thought.

At the same time, there appears to be an element of radical dualism in the thinking of some, if not all, of these theologicans and philosophers of religion. The following rather lengthy quotation from Bowne will indicate this trend:

ar ille ille de la compacta de la c សម្តីស្រាស់ស្ត្រាស់ដែលមាន មាន សម្តីសម្តីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្តាស់ ស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្តែល សម្តី ដែលល្បាយមែន ស្ត o en grant finales (tale cui le francesa, o nea l'Estatoe, A les el mesos, a décès de bese ෙසින් නියන්දීම අතුරුව වැන්නේ දෙන දැන්නේ එන්න සිට එක් ස්වෙන්නේ දින්නේ දින්නේ එන වෙන්නේ දින්නේ සිට ඉන්නේ සිට ඉන් barrard or implicative verbicacion. As the same fine carrie of this adjeclogical bas geoliseastilis to dolisiaees, suo lo level eil se genalemen biore of in megastva belgvidriki ond implaskovy verkikesmon, sklebubr bas roksk kair ge esits of the vicinia apparad his view thet Cod must be otherwher the world was in men and accres, It man's religious needs mustibe Gardly and fully latisfied as the exponents of the Secondary Prosequestion of Fleet Resination overs all the evidence cited by Webbhy with be accepted as veraging his concept of God. If an the other band, the blological prescipposition bus we to be the til is rejected, as we frend to be electered do when is served by the Brings of Bol soppy eliber of hereneing Corridored Bifickenry, these his evidence may be as substantiating the view that fled in both differentiative and evalued in evils may be evidence of the differentiative phase of God's work. Others wil balong to Waddubris geimaral grang, anch as Karl Barth, rejest er ud Wisburr tentadiva efforma at varification. They fusiat that Cod is wholly mistarmola in thus ultimately beyond all verification or dispreas. God must be excepted in eather beitef in Cod is a matter of will rether than reticealize of bod of initial eather manter of soying "Yes" to the revelation or confinanted on of God. Hole eart means that Cod as metascopic object is not subject to varidicatory mather. Folik's extent, then, the late Bouglass Glyde Macintosi was core-t wher he to such such the close of the coloury it raisonal families.

$Y^* Y$

The theorethy is confiinfil to or non-serificality of perspect, birth times and and anciascopia objects mould appear to be reletively clear. The first we are subject to verifications of torestigation; the third is not. But the best sure of clear-equi when une reneidera the Cod-concepts ផ្ទះខែមកវិចិត ហើម -look ku និក្សា Partial Immanence, According to their general philorophical co-hilos than would consider God as epistemological object to be hele coscopic. Bowns and that the distinction between the nate tall and the supernatural was no longer able. The question, for him, had moved from the ontological to the cuspol has He primary distinction was between primary and secondary causaling, in W. M., Korton appreached the melascopic level when he esserted that God meet t conceived of as "scryeving and quarrolling for cosmic process from a poin a restlying above and beyong in " the tile same fine, it trecognized the fire as in which his thought was moving, and sought to require to the betweeneps. Here by insinting that there was, by inference, an covironnest beyond the opposit whose nutivities were mesponsible for the changes which agguered here, far as Bowne and Morton may be considered representatives of the general part tion of Partiel immenence, God as apistemological object must be classified heferoscepic for this school of cancent.

At the same time, there appears to be in els nem of radical dealism is to the the same time? I said the think of there the logicals and philosophers of radice. The fullowing rather langthy and atlor trom Bowns will indicate the trend:

123

- that takes place in the organism can be reduced to some form of movement and grouping of the physical elements; and no reflection on such grouping and movement will ever reveal thought and feeling as an analytical ennsequence. Moreover, all physical causation consists in producing new movements and groupings of the elements. Antecedent movements and groups are the effect, Hence thought, which is not a physical movement or grouping, lies outside of physical causation.
- the self or soul, which cannot be identified with the physical elements, which is the abiding subject of thought and feeling? Again, no. Capital facts and the most cogent kind of reasoning unite in enforcing this answer. However, mysterious and inscrutable the physical elements may be, the mental life cannot be viewed as a resultant of their inter--action. It is, rather, demonstrably impossible without the one and abiding self.

This question and answer procedure was continued much farther. The two questions and answers cited indicate the argument as he presented it in his book on metaphysics. He believed there was an absolute incommensurability between the physical, including the organic, and the mental, the mind or self. At the sametime, he sought to avoid this by denying that such "incommensuarbil. ity" meant a radical dualism. It was rather a method of approach. If one began with thephysical, he could never hope to arrive at the mental as a consequence, However, if he began with the mental, it was possible to arrive at the physical, The distinction between the mentaland the physical was then asymmetric rather than completely discontinuous. One may begin with the mental and find some continuity with the physical in that the categories of the former may include the latter. He could not begin with the physical, and using its categories as primary, find place within them for the mental. Bespite the seeming dependence upon the metascopic, it appears that the God-concept of the Partial Immanentalists belongs at the levelof heteroscopic objects. As such, it is subject to behavioral and implicative verification. The difficulty with their present verificatory methods, lies in the excessive cognitive weight they attribute to man's mental life. Despite the present inadequacy of their methods, there are no a priori reasons why the hypotheses presented in Partial Immanence may not be investigated fruitfully by more adequate verificatory methods,

These types of epistemological objects are now before us. The first two, perceptual and heteroscopic, are definitely subject to behavioral and implicative verification. The third, the metascopic, is not subject to such verification or disproof. In terms of the Primry Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency, common-sense demands that we adopt assumptions and procedures which offer increase in realiable knowledge rather than those which tend to stultify thinking. This means that the perceptual and heteroscopic levels are preferable to the metascopic. It would appear to represent a step backward to rely upon assertion when verification is possible, unless, of course, one considers truth unimportant in religious living. With Santayana, he will then assert that religion is poetic in nature. "Religion remains an imaginative achievement, a symbolic representation of moral reality which may have a most important function in vitalizing the mind and in transmitting, by way of parables, the lessons of experience. But it becomes at the same time a continuous incidental deciption; and this deception, in proportion as it is strenuously denied to be such can work indefinite harm in the world and in the conscience, 1120 Santayana would consider God to be an imaginary object whose sole justification was its

The first of the second of the

egy Canada and it is cannot be enderstood wisher a new-reign which and the constituent of the constituent of

questions and arewers tited indicate the argument as be presented to it in bit book on rudsplestra. He belleved there was an absolute insomment urraniller netween the physical, including for organic, and the restal, the restal or ---At the summer of the solution of this by designed and the bound of the commensus the ity Prosessi a radisti, dodini a vos sorber a midbos es aperosent. Is one in second enterpasson en la fefence out en enlette on acced varies bluce ad libertepingsde distri-However, if he begon with the messal, it was ponsible to arrive at the phythan The dissipation desired the mentaland the physical was then a grave tide and and take a e near Brill and leinna selvetile algol year a O percentage of the leighand made lations. Me could not begin with the physical, near caing in caregories at 9110 ting place while them for the mental. Despite the elecating deposition of the od sakil sociosurmi. Isomeli oda le aganem boli eda teda emegga iki, nigovestem in value de la levelat become appearable objects, "As early a in Asbert all the egral end inquirective verification. The diffically with their present some relication methodes like in the excessive roganisve weight they are hibrite to movie more Despite the present inadequary of their methods, there are no a pains reason. why the hypotheses presented in Partial humanence may not be incestigated frestally by mose adequate verificatory methods.

These types of epletemological objects are now before as. The libe trans perceptual and heteroscopie, are dofficitely subject to behaveoral and impliestive verification. The third, the massempic, is not select to each verification Stadison or disprecial decrease of the Primary Presupposition of harresting Cognitional Efficiency, common-sense demands that we adopt usa supplorit procedures which offer increase in realiable knowledge rather throughout which send to stability thinking. This means that the perceptual and here near oping quis à masarque or resupe bloor d' piquessant of solderabers or represent backward to refy upon assertion when vertication is possible, culess, of conone considers which astaportent is religious living. With Secences, he will then assert that ruligion is postic to astare. "Religion remains et magurit t achievement, e symbolic reproceatelion of morel reality which ruly been a more impostat lecetion in vitations the coin and and personantities, by way of parables, the iceasure of experiounce. But it becomes at the sume thrive a corrivation incodensel denigion, and this dense, in preparitor is prepared as it is servance aly denied in social can work redefinise name to the world and in the constitute of Eschoolse social deponded on the section grammy object whose week justifications were the

pragmatic value in dramatizing some of the basic issues of life. But in so far as God was considered to be an object, perceptual or heteroscopic in nature, the results would be harmful to the believer. Whereas Santayana does not consider God to be a metascopic object, his attitude toward verification would be much the same as those who do. In neither case does verification appear important or significant.

If religion is one of the serious concerns of life, then it does not appear to be feasible to treat it as poetry or "imaginative achievement," There is a reality to life which makes necessary the discovery of the actual for its sustenance and maintenance. Reliance upon metascopic objects would aappear to be unwise, tosay the least. If God natters, that is, if God's existence or character makes a difference, then the conceptions of God which we accept in our religious living should be those whose truth has benn investigated as fully and critically as possible, Imagination may point the way to fruitful investigation. It is no substitute for hard work at the verificatory problem.

programs suite to accountiate manifely manifely bear to a possible of the process of the feature of the second of

If religion is one of the serious concerns of life, when it does not appear to be feasible to arcet it as posity or "imaginative architerances," There is a reality to life which makes necessary the discovery of the enture for an enture. The makes necessary the discovery of the output for an ename and manuteness. Religious that is, if food a significance or be unvise, to say the least, I God matters, that is, if food a significance or character makes a difference, then the conceptions of flod which we appear to our religious living should be those whose truth has been investigated as a life and critically as possible, imagination may point the way to religious and critically as possible, imagination may point the way to religious. It is no substitute for hard work at the verificatory problem.

- Ledger Wood, The analysis of Knowledge, London; George Allen and Unwin
- 2. A. C. Knudson, "The Apologetic Value of Religious Experience," The Journal of Religion, vol XV, Oct 1935, p 457
- H. N. Wieman, Religious Experience and Scientific Method, (1926) p 10. H. N. Wieman, "Perception and Cognition," The Journal of Philosophy, (Feb. 4, 1943), p 74.
- Cf. W. H. Berhhardt, "The Cognitive Quest for God," The Journal of Religion (April, 1943) pp 94ff., for further criticism of this review.
- Cf. A. D. Ritchie, Scientific Method, (1923) pp 40ff., and C. D. Broad, Scientific Thought, (1922), pp 331 ff.
- 7. Aristotle, The Physics 258b, 10ff.
- C. Lloyd Morgan, Emergent Evolution, New York: Henry Holt and Co. 1923, p 36.
- Cf. W. H. Berhhardt, "The Logic of Absolute Transcendence," the Hiff Review, (Winter, 1950)
- 10. Cf. W. H. Bernhardt, "The Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional Efficiency," The Hiff Review, (Winter, 1955) for a more complete discussion of this phase of the argument.
- W. E. Hocking, Human Nature and its Remaking, New Haven: The Yale University Press, 1923, pp 184 ff.
- Cf. Max Lerner, "The Social Process," The Encyclppedia of all Social Sciences, New York: The Macmillan Co., vol XIV, 1934 pp 149ff., and Talcott Parsons, Essays in Sociological Theory, Glencoe, Ill: The Free Press, 1939 pp 46ff.
- Mr. Wieman's comments on this view of his God-concept may be found in Religious Significance of Creative Interchange," The hiff Review, Spring 1955, pp 19ff.
- Jan C. Smuts, Holism and Evolution, New York: The Macmillan Co., 1926 13. pp 86ff.
- 14. H. Hartshorne, "An Empirical Approach to a T, cory of Character," in Religious Realism, (ed D. C. Macintosh), New York: The Macmillan Co., 1931, pp 133ff.
- C. D. Macintosh, The Problem of Religious Knowledge, ch XIX.
- B. P. Bowne, Personalism, Chapter III. "The Phenomenality of the Physical World."
- W. H. Morton, Theism and the Modern Mood, p 161. 17.
- Ibid., pp 163f 18.
- B. P. Bowne, Metaphysics (Revised ed.) New York; Harper and Brothers, 1898 pp 344.
- 20. The Philosophy of Santayana, (Ed Irwin Edman), New York: Random House 1942, p 151.

on grafin godini od Mariek bara o reremiy govigaliji persenii ji ji ji od

- gangakatin 18 maranga katan Magalabarah Pagalabarah Makanati Maranati Marati Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Mal Malabarah Makanatan Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah Malabarah
- de 1622 W. M. de l'hand and The George Comercial and Comercial Comercial Comercial de Comercial
- o, (18, A. H. Edmond, Salendaria Washed, 1992) pp. 4611 . And C. C. Barrer Substitution I amount, 11972), pp. 150000
 - 7. Amedic, The Parada 298b, 1361.
 - B. C. Llayd Morgan, Briefgont Lalebow Dies Varb Besty Mole con for 1972, p 35.
- 9. CK. W. H. Berthardt, "The Logic of Absolute Trayscadouse." the U. Review (Winter) 1930)
 - [6] Cf. W. 15. Becaused: The Presupposition of Instanting Committees: Exclusionery T. Phy Matt Reptew, (Winter, 1913) for a more considered discussion of the physics of the avenuess.
- W. E. Hoering, Human Venture and its Remaining, Man Harest Dec. On University Press, 1923, pp 184 %.
- IZ. VII. Max Lunzum, ⁴ Fine Botim Provens, W.The Boupellepheim of the Council Setendam, Man Korke The MetroHlun **Co**., wolkty plass or literal Vetack Nancos, Beere, Beere up Beatlopical Resources, Western Proses. We viscone, We viscone. Proses 1927 pp 4644.
- - 13. In C. Smera, H.Beza and Evolution, New Latte The Macority described to the particular described to the particular forms.
- - ib. C. D. Madinoch, The Problem of Haligious Unowledge, all MIX,
 - 16. B. P. Bowne, Personalism, Cyapter II. The Pachomenelty of the Physical World."
 - 17. W. H. Moreon, Tyelsm and the Modern Mood, pibl.
 - is, Whid., pp 162f
- 19. B. F. Bowne, Metaphysics (Rowised ed.) New York: Harper and Exerted:
 - 20. The Philospyby of Santayana, (Ed Irwin Edman). New Yark: Racdom House 1942, p 181.

The last issue of the Illiff Review which was probbed to applays is and review of my work in the Illiff School of Theology during the past twenty-five years, offers me the opportunit, to glance base at the problems which have been of primary interest to me. The invitation of the editor, Dr. Harvey H. Pottholi, adds incentive to opportunity.

1.

Three subjects have had the major part of an attention. The first was the tacory of the nature of religion. I had been taught many theories during my rather lengthy period of graduate study, and had read many more. In actual fact, the question as such never rose to the level of the problematic at any point prior to my election to the chair of Christian Theology in 1929. As I began to prepare my courses, a question emerged which should have come to attention long before: On what grounds can I justify the adoption of any one or more of the many definitions in use? Most of them were either interesting or appealing, but neither "interest" nor "appeal" appeared to me to be adequate grounds for acceptance of one and rejection of others. There was the question of fact which had eventually to be faced: What has been the nature of religion throughout the many centuries during which manking has been religious, or what has been acknowledged to be religious?

These questions led me into many areas of research beginning with an analysis of the problem of possible verification of definitions. Dr. Charles S. Milligan, in his presentation of my definition of religion in the last issue of this journal, has sketched the direction and conclusions of my work in this area. Let me say that he has understood very clearly precisely the problem which I faced, my approach to it, and the method and data employed. I can think of no finer statement of the position than he has presented. Furthermore, he has himself engaged in research in the same area. The results were published in the Iliff Review under the title: "Navaho Religion--Values Sought and Values Received."

To those who are fortunate enough to have copies of those two issues, let me recommend the rereading of these two articles. They will indicate his research capabilities and also provide additional support to the theory of religion presented. His analysis of my position combined penetrating understanding and sympathetic interest. It is not often that this combination is used in the evaluation of another man's work.

Dr. Henry Nelson Wieman's article covers the same general problem, namely, the analysis of religion and its specific application. He has selected one "non-manipulable" and subjected it to clear and precise analysis.

^{*} The Iliff Review, Vol. XI, no. 2, Spring, 1954

terbi din in anti pira di la dispertantan anti di mangan anti di di di mangan anta di mangan di mangan di mang ි අතර විසින් වීට දෙන්නුවින්නේ මෙන් මෙන්නේ මෙන්නේ මෙන්නේ විසින් වෙන්නේ විසින් මෙන්නේ විසින්ව අතර වෙන්නු විසින් සිටින්නේ දින්නේ සිටිනේ සිට සිටින්නේ මෙන්නේ සිටින්නේ සිටින්නේ සිටින්නේ සිටින්නේ සිටින්නේ සිටින ာရှင်များကြောင့်များမှု မေတော် ရှိတို့ခဲ့ကို သိတ်တော်သော သည်။ ပြုံတော်မြောက်သည်သည် သို့သည် မြောက်ပြုများကြောင့် ្រៅក្រស់រូវ ក្រុំព័ន្ធ សុខាធិនជាពន្ធមានស្រាញ សុខភា មិន ស្ថិតស្រី មេគីកា ១៨ គុណពេលសុខភាគ នៃពេក ra i ligar biran girandakin yakin kuku kungi ingiranda anti udi sakidurka ra si ្រុមស្ត្រី ស្រុខ និងស្ត្រី ស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រ ក្រុមស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត្រីស្ត o en lighte in the leading lighteen had been been en ender the filtrestate for the leavest ည်း မြင့် သည်သည်။ ဦး ဦးနှစ် ရည်နှစ် နေရှင် ပြင် စီလို့တွင်တွင် စုစ်ချို့ချို့သို့ ပြီးသုံး အသည်မြောင့် မိနှစ် ្រស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ និយ្យ នៃប៉ុន្តាស់ប៉ុន្តាស្ថិត ទៅសង្គ្រាស់ស្នាធានក្រុម ទៅស្ថិត ទៅសង្គ្រាស់ និង និងនៅ និង និងនៅ ក្រុមស្រាស់ស្រាស់ ស្ថិតសម្តីអស់សំ ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ សិកស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ សេចកា និងសេសសង្គ្រាស់ និងសង្គ ទៅស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ ស្រាស់ គឺជាសម័យ នៃស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ស្រាស់ សិកសា ស្រាស់ សាស់ស្រាស់សមិស្សាស់ស lated that thought in Ed., becall on the first later beam additional for the

မြောင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းကို သည်။ လူချင်းသည်။ မြောင်းရှိသည်။ လူချင်းရှိသည်။ လူကျောင်းသည်။ ရောင်းမှ မရှိသည်။ မောင်းရှိသည်။ မောင်းမေး ထို့ချင်းရှိသည်။ လေသနောက်သည်။ မြောင်းရှိသည်။ ရောင်းသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ ပြုပေးကြာ မြောင်းရှိသည်။ ရောင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းသည်။ မောင်းရှိသည်။ မောင်းချင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင် နေသည်။ မောင်းရေးသည်။ ကြို့သည်။ မောင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းရေးရှိသည်။ မောင်းချင်းရှိသည်။ မြောင်းရေးရေးရှိသည်။ မြောင်းရ

Haranda (nachada baran b

Regionalista (el asociam fili a rigne (rista bibliata hallosta di distributa e e estihad to the telephologon education to be found you be unitable to the file oge so to be organized with at specifically a weekspall out to be built There is some of all if we seed find said as most press we saturately ្រាស់ នៅ នៅ នៅ ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រាស់ និងស្រាស់ ប្រជាព្រះ ប្រជាព្រះ ស្រាស់ នៅក្នុងស្រាស់ នៅ ប្រជាព្រះ នៅ នៅ នៅ នៅ នៅ ers y solesmy plancia ymer beedamelen ese en felif jur om 784 propied which I faced, my approach to it, and the metrod and date detaction date exployed. I can think of an ilase statement of a continue than in the areadated. Furthernors, he has himself busseed in vessures in the same area. The respits were published in The Lilii seview under the tities derane Reitgion -- Values South nad Weluss Received. "L

To those the are fortunate enough to here copies of those two issues, lot no roomeend the rereading of those two articlers They will indicate his reserved copeditivies and also provide additional support to the theory of idilyion presented. His curly sin el my nerition combined pentarting understant and and apapalantic interest. It is not eften that this couldnestion is used in the eviluation of another men's work.

Liveren, emer seit arrob einfarn almennik met foll (rinell til agen elkloses and but anighter to aleximos edt , viener , meldore becomes a made to the inspector and becomes as it is a sold and it att grans medicere las monte of th

ARCH CLEAREN SELECTION CO. THE LOCAL CONTRACTOR OF THE CO.

fraittal and prodective lies the event, or drestive interaction, ment of the condess of treative bront, or drestive interaction, and the condess of the time broaders of the time time from which expands the range of what the human mind "transformation which expands the range of what the human mind and brotherly love; rears an ideal more noble than asn has ever and brotherly love; rears an ideal more noble than asn has ever of this process as the apprene non-manipulable, and pro oses that of this process as the ever of this process and further its goals.

If I understand has whence non-manipulate this process that of or drestand has process and contained in the contained in terms in the contained in the

DAME LOVEL. and as neitrofurnmed to senseeing prictic learnes to make a sump to be selected likewise determines what is to be neclected; person. This imposes the necessity for selection, and selection is one forming what is or spoken, and that every person can ot talk with every other rolled for the resson that everything cannot be printed, televised the interests of democratically determined ends. It will be conin the main, that communication is something which by its very nating will be controlled, but that the very t consider objectionable advertising. Sociologists would agree, tent of beteefdus anisd emit emes ent to tuchtiv moisivelet siv determined to prevent one from viewing certain athletic events at tolest installib grev a mori alimaxa na sala ot theld. similar restraints upon what we read, see, or hear. own country, certain interests would appear concerned to exercise countries from possibly creative interaction with us. In our with iron Curtain countries. It also keeps the peoile of those Courtsin serves not only to keep Americans from iree commingation in pursuit of their own, and often selfish ends. Thus, the Iron the fact that some people control the grocesses of intersation to two sword ameldory inesery ywo to end . eldelu insmnon ton al schievable, under flvorable conditions. But the social process human level in whose terms the values sought by Mr. Wearn are and tenotional in elections the process of interactional the Event or trective Interaction is importantly equivalent to what At I understand Mr. Wheman correctly at this point, the dreative

while I cannot accept the suggestion that Orective Interaction is in actual fact a non-manipulable, I believe Mr. Wieman has made a suggestion whose value must be investigated, He is saying incasence, that there may be processes or realities which can be controlled, but which should be treated as thouch they were uncontrolled. In other words, he is saying that we should include within the category of the non-manipulable not only what we cannot controlled or result in great had interaction, which when controlled can result in great had time to dive this suggestion the consideration which is great may but it is great to mean that the controlled or result in great had time to dive this suggestion the consideration which it merits, but it is insight to mean the controlled or result in great had time to dive this suggestion the consideration which it methes had the consideration which it methes but it is the consideration which it methes in the consideration which it methes it that the top it is a greatful to mean the controlled or the standard or the controlled or the controlle

ကြားလို့နှင့် ရပ်သူ လေးပါရသည်။ အိုလိုင်းရေး ရှိနှင့်တွေ ရေးသူ့ နေရေးသည်။ လို့သည်။ လို့သည်။ လို့သည်။ လို့သည်။ လိ ကြည့်နေရေးရေးရှင့် ညှင်းမြေးရေး ကြာလုပ်ကြို့၏ ခို့သော် နေရာန်းရေးသည်။ လူ့နှင့်သည်။ သို့သည်။ မြောင်းရေးရေးသည်။ ကြည့်နေရေးရေးရှင် ညှင်းမြေးရေးရှိသည်။ ကြို့သည်။ ခို့သည်။ လို့သည်။ လို့သည်။ မြောင်းရေးရေးရေးရေးရေးရေးရေးရေးရေးရ had and the made office of he insulate as became the fit yet before twis romad for A. office body bodilizassis symmetry differ by escaled even a l aling sear typ the seld-liming range searche the area on a care of the uneacan pelundianest with its waven and minist povienne apply for isleon oft accircul bas fill wil ob (4

territori territoria di propini d

lf I buderstand has Hieman correctly of bule follows the Greet Avent or Dructive Laberactica is innocionally equivalent to men is thorn as the Social frozens, the process of interactions but ers usest, in it to soot south with amost eache at isvot damed sobbuvolis, waller flyvorplic coeffilms. The the coefer gropese o or all alegant allege of the east of the east of the contract of the east of ව වැරදුවල් සම්බන් බව සමසම්බෙතුවල් කම්වූ වරකුවිස්තව මිස්විස්තිව **විශ්ය** විශ්යයි විශ්යයි විශ්ය on කට යා යා , පෙරුරට දක්විතක (ියම්බ්බ්රියෙක් යාත්තිව පිළම (කිස්තු ක්රමුණ්ඩ විතර එරිපය්තිවේ) මේ ප්රතිකාරය සිට කිසුවා නොකිස් කිසුවෙන් කුතුම් කිසුවා දක්වීම කිසුවා කිසුවා කිසුවා කිසුවා සිට one . Mantela de propieta come tra contrato de la contrata del contrata de la contrata de la contrata del contrata de la contrata del contrata de la contrata de la contrata del contrata de la contrata del cont openies - The little deligence of the little contraction of the contraction of the contraction - bangopoda wao da bisan aigaasini ulaiyob qarhabu hwa ្នុកស្ត្រ ខ្លាំ ម៉ាញ៉ា បាន ខ្លួមមាន ភូមិ មេដុ ១១ ស្តី ទី២០ នៅក្រុម ស្តីប្រជាពី ម៉ាម៉ាង ២០៣០១៤១ by the same terms and exact the figure of work distinct the court of ក្រុមនេះ ។ ២១៩៩១ នៃ ប្រក្បាន ក្រុមបាន ក្រុមបាន ស្ថិន ស្ថិន ស្ថិន ស្ថិន ស្ថិន ស្ថិនបានសារាធិបាន នេះ ប្រែក្រុមបាន z -the limit of a_i^{\dagger} and a_i^{\dagger} . In a function of a_i^{\dagger} and a_i^{\dagger} and a_i^{\dagger} ្សានទទាល់ថា (ប្រាស់ ស្រីស៊ី) ស្រីដើម៉ាស៊ីមានទទី សេក សេចាដែលប្រាស់សេចាប់ នៃសេហ៍ ខ្ពះជំទេង មេចថា ២៤ ក្រុមស្រីការបញ្ជាស់ សេចាស៊ី ស៊ីត្តសាមស្វីញ ប៉ុន្តថា ខ្លាំងសេចិត្តសេចមួយ ខ្ពស់ មេចាប់ the fellific later benieves by the fire benieves a contract to be a contract the tyours planning of income the desprive dust he asea and yet hellend ្រស្នាប់ ខែ១០២០ ខ្លាំង សារីស្ថិ ជាស្ថិតនៅ ប្រសាព្ធខេត្ត មួយទូវទី ជាពេល ពិទីនា ប្រើបេប្បទិស្ស person. This is passed the medecuity for selection, and soluntion is ope form of controls. The princiale thich december what is to be solocted licevice determines whet is to be actioned, lit in adf to point of monaco la usuado en a dia lo lantaca lo maca a soud Joyol Joyel.

toling I cannot accept the buggestion that Orestive Interpretation as in actual fict a non-manipulable, I believe Mr. Liepen has made a sugjestion where wells must be investigated. In activation incapence, that there may be processes or realistics which can be controlled; out which should be treated as the the the ten ape bentrollable. In alber words, he is anying the bound about Ancher within the entegory of the non-manipulable not only what we cannot meen bluou at the locate for bluoule or full cale for locate or doine tottonesses are bred as dreative Internotion, and beifortaceng alef tod (ersh tasmy al theor are beileringe asd ben besult in great good. It was not had thus to live the the surjec . The confederacy, we I dod positions of doler molderofiemon sed acid if note, religible on it evil Hiere but any tout eine well escall , bittamol

the recent poster filed related the reserve to the last tests of the journal is in actacl that a size complet of problems. Dr. Hervey B. Fothoff, editor of the lift having and professor of Christian Theology of the flowlty of The Illim School of Theology, has presented them in clear and procise fashion. His task was quite difficult in that he had to gather the materials he used from a number of magazine articles published over a period of more than twelve years. As indicated in his article, the primary problem in the reinterpretative phase of religion centers in the God-concept. This problem has a deceptively simple appearance. But when one begins to formulate hypotheses concerning the nature of God, he becomes aware of the fact that he faces a bewildering array of data all presented by various thinkers as relevant. If he bonders these facts long enough, he will discover that they cannot be organized into a self-consistent corpus. Some of them appear relevant if the concept Deity (which I use when discussing the category to which all God-concepts belong) denotes or designates what is of use and or enjoyment to human beings, or the sources of both, but do not appear relevant when one considers Deity to decione the of denote the Dynamic determining Factor operative at all known levels of the Existential Medium.

When one approaches the selection of his category for Doity he soon becomes aware of the fact that categories cannot be vindicated directly. By direct vindication I mean gathering or presenting facts to prove something true or Talse. But so long as Deity is X, that is, undefined, there are no data. A fact becomes a datum only when integrated within some hypothesis. If one does not know whether X refers to the source of human good. or to the Dynamic Determinant, he cannot honestly gather data He does not know what constitutes evidence for or against any proposition he might formulate. It thus appeared to me that one must accept a given category in terms of postulation, i.e., acceptance with uo attempt to prove, or dogmatism, i.e., acceptance interms of assertion rether than proof. It then occurred to se that what cannot be proved directly may be vindicated indirectly. From this the path to the method of "Deduction from Previously Established Concepts" was relatively single, as was pointed out by Mr. Potthoff. One first establishes his definition of religion, and the process followed here is outlined very well in Mr. Willian's article mentioned above. When the evidence indicated that religion is a complex form of individual and group behavior where-by individuals and groups are prepared intellectually and emotionally to find value in situations destructive or disruptive of one's goals and interests by means of a reinterpretation of the Existential Medium in whole or in part, as well as by means of overt behaviors or techniques, the basis for the determination of the category for Deity was available. Diety is precisely that in one's Existential Medium in whose terms such threat or notential destruction can be parried or integrated into a new pattern of life. Then conceptualized, God is the Dependable Factor of crative at some or all levels of the Existential Medium whose presence makes possible the new life, the revised situation, the emergent valuesystem. As described so well by Mr. Potthoffand reviewed so

and Parigon (1904), the more result to the control of the Paris and State (1904), the control of and the configuration of the region of the contract of the con ្រុមស្រុក ប្រជាពលប្រជាពលប្រធានក្រុមសម្រេច ប្រធានក្រុមសម្រេច ប្រធានក្រុមសម្រេច ប្រធានក្រុមសម្រេច ប្រធានក្រុមសម ស្រុកស្រុក ស្រុក សម្រេច ស្រុកសម្រេច ស្ទី សមានការប្រធានក្រុមសម្រេច ស្រុកសម្រេច សមានការប្រធានក្រុមសម្រេច សមានការ សមានក្រុមសម្រេច ស្រុក ស្រុក ស្រុកសម្រេច សង្ឃាត់ស្រុកសមានការប្រធានការប្រធានការប្រធានការប្រធានការប្រធានការប្រធាន volvo esti tera paulegodo la restrera e volt beru un sistrotes el dustantes la volt beru un sistrotes ella dustantes el composito de la compos to the notificial the palacing gradies in the retained piece it in more of religion or the late and a second of the contract of the contract na aprilar ere estevamen, sentembre altitura glavita artitura ramense vi jang ka sawasa ada galindadaen sasomaggi sabikusan the fact of the figure of the stand of the standard and the standard of the second and the standard and the second and the sec president if vertices bilibers in reservant if he frequency នូមក្តីក្រាស ក្នុង ប្រធានធ្វេង និងសៀវ និងកាន់សេវក្សា នេះក្នុងស្ថិត្ត ក្នុងស្ថិត្ត និងក្នុងស្ថិត្ត និងក្រុងក្នុ ත් ඉත්තුයන්ත කරන් වුය දිදයන්තරණය සහජන වෙන ඒ, ස්තර්ල්න) ලන්තිවේ. එද ගෙන්ලන් ගයින් . of the manuscritical no settines (quelse averagion-sed lie de the සිසින් සෙවුම් ගත් සෙනු<mark>ම්වූහ.සෙන් විශාවක් විශාවකයුට</mark> ගතු විවස් සිසින් ස්වේශාවකයන් විශාවකයන් විශාවකයන් සි or control of the the opening of the control of the tantibol Isabbasualkh self be eserat

on flat chel energeuse and he selventar that seconder, a doc design ed that en nedgo, as and that that whit he exemple above a nece an you par restor a mover to a contraction to a read the contract to the contract See Dolvy is an an inchestion of the contract becourse a debice cally which have perhaus withing come by contracts. on executi en outside affr of exerce if wedsein word for sent and the or or the lymanic betweenings of chart hards of the specific processing the contract of nas desa aut natur road deauratelies erthodes aes les dentroles au proposition he might formulate. It thus appeared to me that one must accept a given caregory in terms of postulational leas soceptance with me attempt to prove, or degration, i.e., soceptence interms of assertion wither than proof. It then concrete to directly. From this the orth to the method of "Lecthich from irrerionaly betablished Concepts" was relatively sho be, as was pointed out by Mr. Potthoil. One first establishes bis definition or religion, and the process foliosed sire is collined very well in dr. dilityer's exclude mentioned chove. Thus the evidence indicated that religion as a neighbor term of individual and group benevior where-by individuals and groups are propered hatellecousily and emotionally to find value in timestions decarrier or disruptive of one also, and la course or distributed and distributed on the course of the of a reinterpredution on the Existential Wellen in white or in edt geoupinions to oncivaded trave to cauca de es liev as drae dashe ton the determination of the ertegery for Deit include vailable: Diety is prochouly that in one's Drickential Hadina in whose seras auch invoct or saloutial distruction the be agrated of tablerated into a new passers of time of the costs ospinalizat, dod is the Danamiable Income throughten or alle or deep point servere confunction. Additional to elevel its shiple the new life, and revised distributed on against the Ter becautived instanciascia and parties on the tribles and action nativities in the solution of the solutions of the solutions of the solutions of the solution of the solution of the solution of the solutions of the solutions of the solutions.

The most stop in the analysis of the problem or God, namely the organization of the data prescribed by the category for theme defined as wata-determinant, had long been in the foreiront of my attention. In fact, this is the place where my thinking began shortly after the problem of the definition of religion caerged. I delivered a series of lectures to the annual gathering of the Congregational clergy of Nebraska in 1950. The purport of these lectures was that of unearthing the basic assumptions which controlled the logicused to vindicate the systems discussed. Perhags this excerpt from the second lecture will set the problem. "Empirical theologians in America may be divided into three distinct groups. These groups may be design nated as (i) Theists, (ii) Ecclesiastical Humanists, and (iii) Absolute Immanentalists. They agree that theology must be basen uson experience, but differ radically with reference to the meanings to be given to the major concepts in the field. While many reasons may be suggested to account for these differences in meaning, the fundamental reason is perhaps the initial ausumptions with which each theologian bugins. In-volved in every theology is a logicalmethod, and basic to every logical method ere assumptions, more or loss consciously held, which determine the types of argument which give rise to the conviction that trath has been reached. These basic assumptions are the watersheds that determine the direction in which the theological stream shall flow. It is to these basic assumptions that we first direct our thought"

As Mr. Fotthoif indicated in his review of the development which occurred since 1.30, these "basic assumptions" have grown into levels of presuppositions, three of which have been subsected to rather extensive research. A rereading of his article will indicate the complesity involved in attempting to investigate critically the beliefs which we hold concerning God as conceptual object. In 1930, I used Occam's presupposition that explanatory principles should not be multiplied unnecessarily as a test of basic assumptions. It was some time later that I discovered that Occam's razor was itself an ontological assumption, and could not be used to test other ontological presuppositions and assumptions. This led to the development, about 1.40, of an epistemological presupposition, The Presupposition of Increasing Cognitional military, in whose terms it an ears possible to break out of the circle of ontological presuppositions. Softil it was possible to do this, either shopticion or dogmatism appeared tobe the only outcome of the investigation.

Even after the research had been completed, tentatively, at the categorical and the conceptual level, there appeared still more work to be done. When one has conceptualized God, he has made possible a basis for productive relationships with God. At the same time, it became evident that no religious

remini legal ya kalipada legir Wa alippinee esii eskuluka İsal sair ្នា ទូក) ខុកសន្តមានមានមានក្រុង ២៩៧វក្សានាក់ស្ថិត្តនៅស្រុក ៤០ ៣០៨៨១៦៨៣១៤០ ១៧៤ the back through the bull most graph both the statement of the second both south and a i gradianiam pro seprim impola oda el biloj jam il mi oprocisionia ye la ficilità de la milalmatah citi ta padeleri sia elaterate givengo asi Transcription is a city of the control of the contr and and little of the course of the vigoreto lescolfage agree of the general and the general control of the first of the second control of the second cont to days off establisher of beaution of cases for the system of in pagestes traccol suria novo agricove estra elemanto i bustaconsti og hoself was no error. A vi soust pleased theoretically considere and image which their views distinct execuse. These groups and to a chief wave of (\pm) in the (\pm) is a chief water ($\pm)$ inchrese ($\pm)$ inchrese ($\pm)$ ibroidic Imrancribilista. They recombist that the contract uncarraphismos, but differ redically with refrence to the ensile? Fight and all adjudence uplies ent of newly ad of again communication and the common of being as at you and the transfer with and the property of the following and measure for the following and a graph was the

appliant plant of the color of

in français de los estados de la companha del companha del companha de la companha de la companha del companh

"dagaçed wur doomib damil

anom ployed and To weiver ald al bedroibed Tiodyfor . TH at waken occurred since 1/30, these "books csemmethood" have brown adre read even dol w to servi tions, the elevel wall scoted to rather extensive researce. A remending of his arthold will indicate the complesity involved in after ting to investing to oritically the beliefs which we hold concersing God os cansertual object. In 1930, I need Occas's presupposition that explanatory principles should not be multiplied unbecessivily as altert of basiq assumptions. It was some time inter took I diccovered great coass fesige totue ha thesti asm reser a "mased tahi and could not be used to test other ontological grusuprolitions and ossumptions. This led to the development, about 1.4, of an contribution lost presup ostition, The Presupposition of the creasing Cognitional Efficiency, in whose terms it appears possible to break out of the chrole of antilogical presspond tions. Entil it was possible to do this, either significance dogmetion eppeared tobe the only outcome of the investigation.

[.] పైపుత్వికి కూరించి . ఎందికు గ్రామంల కొళ్ళికే తరిన దేత్వివరించిన ఈమెక్ ఇంటికీ ఇక్కించిని మొక్కి మొక్కి పేస్తు — అంకే కేందుకు ఈ మారుకేళ్ , కేందారం ఓట్టుకి కారణపైన ఉది. తీడుకు క్రామిక్ష్ముత్తున్ని చేస్తున్ని చేసి - పైపుకు తీగు పైపుకు పరిచేశాడుకు ఉన్న కారణపైన ప్రక్టికే ఎక్కువడ్ అదే ఎన్ పోరుంది పోశులు పైక్కిత్ మారుకు కార్స్ క్రిమంట్స్లు మారుకు మారుకు కారణపైన ప్రక్టించిన ఈ కోష్ట్ మందికు చేస్తున్ని మందికు తీడుకు ముక్ - ఎక్కుక్కి క్రిమంకారు. మారుక్కి ప్రక్టించికుండి కారణపైన మందికి అందికు చేస్తానికి కార్కి సమీత

colleague un un couplitabhed institution; lie ville, et a chuponion in a social situtation, in another the intend may you come a surpson who removes a diseased organ (In each of these relationed as some specific front of the of or person serves as a determinant of the person as a whole. I suggest that the same is true on our relationships with God. For purposes of analysis, I have called this "the Individual-Particular" level of the problem of God. It is at this level that GOd becomes functional in religious experience. The skill of the religious leader or technician becomes evident at this point. To what extent can he analyze the religious needs of the person or congregation before him so that he can present that phase of God's total nature which is relevant to the satisfaction of the specific need under consideration? To say; "God will take care of you," may be true, but it is no more designative of how this will be done than it would be for a Physician to say to a patlent "Medicine will cure you" It is not "medicine" per se that cures one. It is a specific medicine designed to cure a specific form of morbidity which is needed. In similar fashion, it is not God per se that one seeks in time of trouble, but it is God in precisely those phases of His total nature which bear upon the situation in hand that is needed.

It is at this point among others that Ar. Potthoff himself has been making a distinct contribution to religious thought. For some eighteen years, part of them as part-time professor, and the past two as full-time professor, he has been making God "real" to his students in The Iliff School of Theology. "Making God real" must not be interpreted in any purely emotional or sentimental sense, but in precise terms with reference to specific religious situations. This has been only a part of his tast, but it has been and is a very important one which promises to bear fruit not only in a more effective ministry but also in mor efficient religious living on the part of the ministers themselves.

It is at the Individual-Particular level, also, that Dr. J Edward Carothers has made a significant contribution. As pastor of several large and important churches in the East, he has continuously explored the avenues whereby religion could become a vital factor in the lives of the individuals who constituted his congregations. His discussion of the implications of a modern philosophy of religion which appeared in the last issue of this journal is indicative of his mental accmen and unerring lasight into what is relevant and wast is trivial. When the question of the transcendence or immanence of God is raised, he is not bothered by the fact that tradition or no perular interest may invor one view or the other. He faces the question of truth and significance. If the evidence indicates that immanence is clover to the truth than transcendence, he accepts this and asks the next question: What religious sig_{-} nificance has God as absolutely immanent within the Existential Medium for himself and his congregation? If you will turn to his article again, you will discover that he has viewed this conception of God in specific situations which have confronted him and his linge congregation. He has not permitted differences of opinion, variation from traditional concepts, or the

Company of the control of the company of the control of the contro grands a row doed in Clevel that we will the rows to modifical actions. of the contraction of the contract and the contract and the contract of the co odijen od i jaklog grad du nusurre gouopod adžotaleje vo pobos. whee to abore and he cases and Libraria as loss ad two free s 198 io ossig finis direkoto uso of fedi oz mis gratos daltos discosti organiser to **nolinatelit**an elle og **inevelex et dotaw ex**ydent fåroð early need this book says of Yachtereblesto mean been of the and bed to originalise became on at it ind good of you ".set when some that it would be need at a color of and each ecolors indicin confedditam" fod at Mil Tuoy emig filw amtelball Arok autos eno. It la a apeciala medicino dasigned to unge a preopilon, pailmis al cabasa at ablas transcript or location con a control of the is to mee Ged par se that one recks in time of two and and is God im prochesty those photes of Mis total unitare which with upobase of take bond of motified as eds cope

it is this point away others that her Potting allocky and been reling and distinct contribution to relations the public and the same eighteen pears, part of them as particles of the factor of the factor of the factor of the particles themselves.

is et tank ludithelen elevel melanterelendiktelen ludit sein li Edward Carothers has made a significant contribution. As pastor of several large and important churches in the Ast, in has continuously explored the evenues whereby religion could become a vitel inchor in the lives of the individuals plo conatituted his congregations. His discussion of the taplications of a modern philosophy of religion which appeared in the last laure of this journal is indictive of his nortal somen and whatring of the word freezewaler of today oint trained juittour When the question of the transcencemes or immaner of God 1s xalsed, he is not pothered by the isot that that txxditton or |o
angle xwier imberset mey leror one view or the ciner. He laves the question of train and significates. If the evidence indicates that immanace is ilouer to the erath than transcondence, he accepts this and eak the next questions has this this after Liftrestable end midwhy transmal yfestyloeds on bod end consolitin of rent fliw set to exclusioninco aid ins theelin tot privak his article spain, you whill discover that no feet where to its Bodeberras eros Hodern anograeurio biliporon mi ibb de negligades မရှင်နေရီမှာ အလေးသို့နေတြကောက် အသင့် ကိုသည်။ တွင် ပြုပည်နော်သည် ကို လေသည် သည်သည်။ ဆည်သို့ အသိနေး အသိနေး ခြောင်းရှား ခြေသည်။ သည်။ သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သည် သို့သည်။ သည် မြိမိမို့သည်။

which has attended his misistry through the pware, and the increasing densities upon him by the church at large indicate that he has found something which he believes has both truth and value, and that he knows how to apply it in the critical situations in life. Some phases of his thought have been developed in articles in The Iliff Review. 4

III.

Turning now to another phase of my work during the past quarter century. I wish to commend Mr. Serman M. Stanage for his clear analysis of my approach to ethics. His task was made quite difficult because I have thus far not published much in that area. He was compelled to draw heavily upon lecture notes. At the same time, he demonstrated his ability to get what was said in more or less informal class situations and to organize this with the published materials so as to provide a very good statement.

Thefield of Christian ethics has been a matter of real concern from my early introduction to it in Garrett Biblical Ins titute under Professor I. G. Whitchurch. The matter became acute when as a representative to the Student Volunteer Convention in Indianapolis in 1924, I faced critically the identification of pacifism with passivism. The passivistic approach to the matter seemed to me to be wholly unrealistic, a position I stated rather truculently in two articles in student publications at the time. At the suggestion of my good friend, Dr. Arthur W. Nagler, I undertook an examination of John Wesley's pacifism while a student in one of his courses. As a result of that study I learned that wesley was thoroughly pacifistic with reference to the protection of his own person, but that he supported the English in their prosecution of the Revolutionary War. Some very fine "hymns of hate" may be found in the collection written by the two Wesleys. Even then, I was convinced that man was essentially rational and good, basic beliefs of nineteenth century Idealistic ethics. Until Sept.1, 1939, I remained rather firmly rooted in that tradition. But the failure of the Munich Conference and Hitler's drive for power forced me to reconsider my estimate of man. I then became aware of the significance of power, namely, the capacity to control, in individual and group behavior. Some research convinced me that the possession of power has a corrosive effect upon man's ethical perceptions. This was, of course, a logical outcome of my earlier rejection of passivism as a mode of life. It has led to the development, now in process. of an ethic of responsible power to which Mr. Stanage has called attention in his recent article.

As Mr. Stanage pointed out, ethical systems which deny the relevance of power have been developed by leaders of minority groups. The leaders of majority groups either learn how to use power responsibly or they are supplanted by those who do. The leaders of social institutions must recognize the fact that power is, and that it will be used either directly or as a threat, but in either case to control. WhenChristianity was a minority movement, itsleaders could neglect power, but it is not that in the modern world. If the Christian leaders of national states,

LII

Furning new to apother phase of my ward during the leaf question of with to proceed and typically also to exercise the with to commend wir. Series if it that the read the approach to ethics. His their was area of have thus far not published not in the recall was compelled to draw heavily upon leature notes. It was same time, he demonstrated also ability to got the test baid in more or less informal class site times as to serve the published materials so as to ordifice their constant.

Theilold of Christian ethios has been's makied of fast cast cara from my early invendention of it is inclured this fell all of the s titute ander Profescor II d. Waitenarch. The action become soute when as a representative to the Student Voluntual Comvession in Indianapolis in 1924, I foced critically the lawsame old ividated sett ". melviaged dilw metilose to moid solitie of their a cultuitizence willedwood for em or begreen neather of intibur incheta al actions and no vitre secret reduce leading tille. At the suggestion of appearance it is sold friends the could be to Region, I undertook an examination of Both Genlagta (Notligh) the old to fluggi a say the subject to ere at the buta a clima i naryarikan ifong naturakan kinuryahi kawangalesa asat berital K indication of the open correct the correct the continuous for the continuous side. Capilsh in their prospection of the Perchations in the Capil very figure Translate Translation and the best force of the colline of the translation with the second colline of og che vic Weslegs. Byen then, I sis convinced this than wit essentially rational and good, basic beliefs of ninetropia centuralistic ethics, Until Sept. 1, 1939, I remaind rather thank rodied in that tradition. But the fallure of the Hunich Conteronce and Hitler's drive for power idraed has to reconsider as each timete of men. I then became aware of the significance of powers, ashely, the especity to control, in individual and prosp schovier Jone reservan convinced me that the possession of power has a orrestve effect upon ments ethioal perceptions. This was to course, a logical outcome of my scriler rejection of paceivion as a mode of life. At has led to the develorment, how in process? of an elmic of responsible power to which Mr. Stanege has called actention in his recent articles.

As Mr. Stanege pointed out, ethical systems which dong the relevance of nower have been developed by leaders of throughy groups. The loaders of throughy groups either lastn her to use power responsibly or they are sagulanted by those who do. The leaders of social institutions must recognize the fact that the fit will be used either directly or as a through he in either directly or as through the function series of the power, but it is near the for the control meglest power, but it is not that the the control meglest power, but it is not the the the first control as the control of the

ers Christian or to Louing a lawy ore sile wife put in it not enough. Hen is responsible for himself and to God his is also responsible for others, and in more than acculive term of the will be used, and it is the Christian's responsibility of see that it is used for good return than for evil.

This ethical conception is related to the problem of the adopte the agarnotic category, God is defined in terms of goodness, or the source of goodness. But this leaves the problem of power unresolved. The Dynamic Category views God as Dynamic Determinant and would thus appear to provide a better theological ground for the type of ethic of responsible power desperately needed to to this problem of an Ethic of Responsible Power I hope to despect much of my free time in the years ahead. Given the limited amount of published naterials, and relying quite heavily upon book-reviews and class -lectures, Mr. Stanage has presented an excellent analysis of this problem as it appears in my thinting at present. Mr. Stanage is now engaged in graduate work in the philosophy department of the University of Colorado. He has been interested in research in N. Hartmann's Ethics, and has published a Preliminary statement of his findings in The Iliff Review.

IV.

Twofurther statements in the recent issue of this journal are left for final consideration. They are by President Harold F. Carr and Dr. Francis W. Brush. I am honored to count both among my friends, and they were more than generous in their tributes. I have Known President Carr from the time I arrived on the campus of Nebraska Wesleyan University where he was considered one of the finest and most generous of men. His experience as head of The Iliff School of Theology during the past years confirms in the minds of faculty and students alike that these traits are still his, and that they have grown through the years as he has. Dr. Brush has been professor of Philosophy in The University of Denver since 1945, and as proved himself to be an excellent teacher. He taught a course for me a year ago, and men who had the privilege of studing with him are unanisous in their reports that he is an excellent teacher who knows how to clarify ideas and make them vital. He is collaborating with me in a course in Metaphysics this quarter (Spring, 1954), and is deepening the impression we had of him previously.

There is a statement in his article which rather fascing ted me. He wrote: "Having taken a course in philosophy of religion you find yourself stack with a philosophy of life."6 I am convinced that this is symptomatic of what has has ened to scores of his students: They took a course in philosophy with him and found themselves stuck witha philosophy of life. Andthey are better women and men as a result. Perhaps I should take advantage of his discussion of my teaching methods to outline briefly what could possibly be called my philosophy of education. So far as my memory serves me, I have never attempted to formulate this

gright tenichte weg dan det besteler albudithonen dentabe diele yed negons ens li selingisot etc gd pedenosit greet selle eco The contract of the contract of the best of the best of the contract of the co ින්සන්ය අමුතුයනු වන ල්ලිම්ම්රිස්ත්ත්ත් කියන් මහණයකට පිළිතුරු මෙන්වී ද ස්ථාශම්බත්තම් සිටිය ප්රයාධාන confirmed at the population of the contract of and gould thus angods to provide a bather theological act whome ind in a color of the of medgenetical menter decidence of a color of the To this you san is a sthic of the operate Tower i have reducted vote such of my free time the the serie aband. Given the Line saping of published motorials, and retains quite heavily upo hour-reviews and class -lockures, hr Dredege her grundited an creation arctyria of this problem as it is present that the if al second discussing with income and a second in the second in philosophy densitatent of the University of Bolemose. He say po drilling and bus contribl a meanurall in at dorspare at before that President little of hit and borth aid to the bottota treatminer

71.7

Fairpet, phi to pract theour and at ethemotors rodinations are loss for final confidention They are by Frasident har life Gray and Dr. Francis W. Brush. I sa hypored to count buts elelfill artenes, and there were then growing the blacks braitas Espais on Austrano ansolisare un final isoni I . cornilia on the compas of Rebrasts Westeyen University where he was con-Sidered one of the linest and most generous of meas. His areperience as herd of The Hill School of Theology Auting the past years confirms in the minds of faculty and students nice that these traits are still his, and that they have grown through the cars as he has. Dr. Brush has been grafes or of chilosoft use the University of Denyer since 1945, and as proved bimsels to or an excellent teacher. He taught a course for me a year age, and wen who had the privilege of sheding with his are unand out in their reports that he he amendent teacher who whove now to. clarify ideas and make them within He is collaborating which me in a course in Leternhysics this quester (Spring, 1930), and is desponing the impression we had of min proviously.

There is a statement in his article which rather factor to the mass. He urota: "daving telep a operse in prilosoph of railion you that pourself state with a philosoph of like, "6 I am consistenced that this is specificated of whit has happened to scored of his students: They took a course in philosoph with him and found thomselves atook withe philosophy of ills. And they are retier women and man as a result. Perhaps I should to so discussion of my teaching methods to builting what could not student my teaching methods to builting the what could not student my philosophy of according to builting and what could not revise as an are what could not revise as an are more according to saling an about the first table of an are more according to first table of according to the course when as an arms of a course of an arms as an arms of a course of a cour

social situation in such a situation is primaril, a cital, the a confidence in such a situation is primaril, a cital, the a confidence in subject and students do not fuse, it is his function to a social, bo I have never involved myself in controvercies as whether a carriculum should be "student-centered" or subject-centered." In all of the teaching in which I have been involved has been an attempt to see that students and subjects were perhy introduced and some type of creative interaction resolved.

A second conviction which has characterized a toaching, it its best, may be atted as follows: Successful legrain, is a function of success in learning. Perhaps this is badd, stated but its lightfunce will become clear if one considers levels of aspiration. It has been determined, experimentally, that rate mathematicate mazes if they are started at rather simple or mentary levels. Having learned how to traverse a simple maze, their level of aspiration has been lifted, and they try more last tricate mazes with good prospects of success. If, however, they are first presented with intricate mazes, and fail, they are even simpler mazes with loss prospects of success.?

I learned this lesson as a youth. I did some gardening, and had a pony whom I valued highly despite the fact that he had a crippled leg. Mitched to a spring-wagon, he hauled me back and forth to and from the garden located in a hollow a mile from bone one day, after a heavy rain, I drove to the garden to bring home a load of corn and vegetables. Without considering the pony's strength, I filed all of the wet vegetables upon the wagon that it would hold. Then we started for home. The pony could pull the wagon on level ground, but the road included a hill, not high but very wet and muddy. The horse tried the hill, but soon found the load beyond his limited resources. Being young, I thought slappings with the reins would add strength to the long. Freently, he gave up completely and would not even bull the empty wagon up the hill.

In some real sense, this experience has guided my teaching. A most any student will learn, in he is given a fair o portunity to do so. If he is given table beyond him at first, his experience may parallel that of my pony. Given tasks within the range of this abilities, he increases his levels of educational approached. Under such circumstances, even mediocre students can make surprising progress in what is admittedly a highly technical field of study. I am sure that this conviction has been a major lactor in whatever success I may have had over the years that I have been teaching. And I appreciate Dr. Brush's remarks since they provided me with this opportunity of presenting this much of my general philosophy of education.

Prentics Cox, who served as my office assistant for more than a year, managed to find not of the materials I have profished through the years. This has not been easy, since much that I have published appeared in numerous journals and reports. Since the issue of the Review devoted to my teaching was prepared without

The following the second description of the second
A Second conviction paid that characterized a tacking to best, may be the sed as 1011000; Saccopally learned the runner to select and the runner to select and the runner to select and the select and the land of the selection. It has been determined, excrimentally the runs rather action intricts a makes in they are started at rather angle of adapting learned how to traverse a chapte assertable their travers of aspiration has been lifted; and they are travers as with good proceets of success. If, however travers and they are seen singles are sever as a singles are suith lear proceed of success.

I learned this lesses as a youth. I did some probable to me, whom I valued of a string-waspe, he hasted as he had a forth a forth to and from the carden housted in a hollow a saile are one forth it and from the carden housted in a hollow a saile are not one fay, after a heavy wrin, I drove to the garden to being the a hold of corn and vegotables. Then of considering this your astreasth, I lied all of the wet vegetables a on the wast that to would hold. Then we start to me. The pany could sait the wegen on lovel ground, but the read included a hill, voting but very wet and mucky. The horse tried that hall, but soon lovel the loss beyond his limited resources. Being young, I thought the loss beyond his limited resources. Being young, I thought also he give an completely and would not even pull the empty cently, he give an completely and would not even pull the empty had hill.

La some reel sense, this experience has Author m, to colus. Most any student will learn, is he is given a fair o portunity do so. If he is given teams beyond him at lirst, his emperience may parallel that of my pony. Given teams within the range of the abilities, he increase his levels of educational sufficience of the graph can circumstances, even mediocre of other such circumstances, even mediocre of other such circumstances, even mediocre of the full property in what is admittedly a highly technical field of etudy. I can sure that this conviction has been a major actor in whatever shows I may have had over the years that I have been teached a high this opportunity or presenting the lace that provided he with this opportunity or presenting the mean of a general philosomy or educating the mean of the mean of the parallel of the control of the mean of the me

erentius dom, who served as as claimed audistant for auro trade a ser, ausaged to ilma lock as ile ausariets I have etaliched thrust to cours. This has not seen day, class made take I ausage publicated to served in apareseas prompte and recepts. This was illed of the recent fevents to be objective were arguers seas alger for question of a similar specified and it helped the occasionally without too much consideration for completeness. Bespite that fact, he managed to get everthing except one rather long article on preface to Theology, which appeared in Religion in Life, Vol. 7, Summer, 1932, pp. 358-373. It contains an early analysis of the theological field in which are many suggestions that have been developed morefully since that time. The bibliography as a whole indicates the conditions under which I have done most of my research. I have never had an extended period of time to give to research and writing. Nost of what I have written was done within limited time-periods, usually after having done a day's work in teaching or administration. Perhaps this is as good a way as any. It makes for the development of limited objectives, and for a return now and again to the same or similar problems. This provides the conditions for growth. I am sure that Mr. Cox's work in gathering to-gether this bibliography will be of real service to me whether of not it is of interest to others. And in fairness to him and to the others who contributed of their time to the production of the Winter 1954 issue of The Iliff Review, let me say that most if not all of them had to do this under the same type of conditions as I myself have worked through the years. My grateful thanks to all of them.

In conclusion, let me say that this is the first attempt I have made at "I-writing." I am not in favor of it as a general practice. Perhaps I can be forgiven this one offense in twenty-five years. Should I be about at the end of another quarter century, I may try it again. Who knows?

or. Potthoff has published some of his materials in thisarea in several articles in The Iliff Review: "some Comments on the Doctrine of Forgiveness," Vol. I, Winter, 1944, pp. 22-30; "Some Comments on the Doctrine of Sin," Vol. III, Spring, 1946, pp. 56-61; and "Theological Preaching in the Liberal Pulpit," Vol. II, Spring 1945, pp. 207-217.

4 " The Love of God in Absolute Immanence, Vol. II, Spring, 1945, pp. 202-206; "Motivation in Religion," Vol. IV, Fall, 1947, pp. 124-129; and "The Physical Consequences of Frustration," Vol. III, Fall, 1946, pp. 110-114.

5 "An Introduction to Harmann's Ethics," Vol. III, Fall, 1950, pp. 133 ff.

5 The Illif Review, Vol. XI, Winter 1954, p.68.

7 Of. Kurt Lewin and others, "Levels of Aspiration," in Hunt, (ed) Personality and the Behavior Disorders, (1944), Vol. I, pp. 333 ff.

pr. Totthorf has published sone of his materials in thisarem in several articles in The Hiff Review: "some Comments on the Doctrine of Forgiveness," Vol. I, Winter, 1944, pp. 22-30; "Some Comments on the Doctrine of Sin," Vol. III, Spring, 1946, pp. 56-61; and "Theological Preaching in the Liberal Pulpit," Vol. II, Spring 1945, pp. 207-217.

4 " The Love of God in Absolute Immanence, Vol. II, Spring, 1945, pp. 202-206; "Motivation in Religion," Vol. IV, Fall, 1947, pp. 124-129; and "The Physical Consequences of Frustration," Vol. III, Fall, 1946, pp. 110-114.

5 "An Introduction to Harmana's Ethios, " Vol. III, Fall, 1950,

b The Illi Review, Vol. XI, Wanter 1954, p.68.

of Kurt Lewin and others, "Levels of Aspiration," in Hunt, (ed) Personality and the Behavior Disorders, (1944), Vol. I, pp 33 ff.